Paṭṭhāna (Conditional Relations) in Burmese Buddhism

Thesis submitted for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD)
King’s College London
(UNIVERSITY OF LONDON)

By
PYI PHYO KYAW

2014
Abstract

This thesis explores the living tradition of Abhidhamma in Burmese Buddhism, examining its pervasive role across all dimensions of Buddhist practice in Burma. Until very recently, little attention has been paid to Theravāda Abhidhamma in Western scholarship, and virtually none has been written on it as a living tradition. In this thesis I focus on the Paṭṭhāna, the seventh text of the Abhidhamma Piṭaka, which deals with the functioning of causality and uses the mathematics of enumeration and combinatorics to do so. This is the first thesis to undertake a critical, in-depth study of Paṭṭhāna both as an analytical system and a living practice. This thesis applies multiple research methods to analyse the theoretical aspects of Abhidhamma and its study, and to explore the living expressions of Abhidhamma, revealing its ongoing and multidimensional significance in Burmese Buddhism.

Chapter One draws together different ways of explaining causality in Theravāda, exploring how the Paṭṭhāna provides a more complex and comprehensive explanation than found in the more familiar, more studied doctrines of kamma and dependent origination. Chapter Two explores the fundamental and pervasive importance of Abhidhamma within Burmese Buddhism historically and in the present, relating its significance to the sociopolitical context of Burma. Chapter Three traces a long history of extensive composition of Abhidhamma and Paṭṭhāna literature in Burma, paying attention to specific works by well known abhidhamma teachers and different branches of Abhidhamma learning and teaching. Chapter Four analyses the pedagogical methods and memorisation techniques applied in Paṭṭhāna study and gives detailed explanation of the individual conditions themselves. Chapter Five examines the Paṭṭhāna through analysis of the mathematics, demonstrating not only the types of mathematics being used to further understand the nature and depths of causality, but also close parallels between the mathematics of the Paṭṭhāna and the mathematics of ‘combinatorics’.
Dedication

For my mother.
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>7-8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A list of tables and figures</td>
<td>9-10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviations</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>INTRODUCTION</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aims of the thesis</td>
<td>12-15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Abhidhamma</td>
<td>15-19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Abhidhamma in Burmese Buddhism</td>
<td>19-27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structure of the thesis</td>
<td>27-29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other studies of the Abhidhamma</td>
<td>30-32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methodology</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- An interdisciplinary research approach</td>
<td>33-37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Research ethics standard</td>
<td>37-39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Sources</td>
<td>39-42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Romanisation of Pāli, Pāli loanwords in Burmese language, and Burmese</td>
<td>42-46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Use of terms</td>
<td>46-50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER 1: THERAVĀDA UNDERSTANDING OF CAUSALITY</strong></td>
<td>51-53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1. The law of kamma</td>
<td>53-60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2. The law of dependent origination (paṭṭiccasamuppāda)</td>
<td>60-75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3. The law of conditional relations (paṭṭhāna)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3.1. Holistic understanding of causality from the Theravāda perspective</td>
<td>76-78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3.2. Dual role of Abhidhamma: analysis and synthesis</td>
<td>78-84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3.3. Structure of the Paṭṭhāna: an overview on the basis of the 6th council edition of Burmese Pāli canon</td>
<td>84-94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3.4. The teaching of the doctrine of non-self (anattavāda)</td>
<td>94-101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4. Summary</td>
<td>101-102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER 2: THE SPECIAL PLACE OF THE PAṬṬHĀNA AMONGST BURMESE BUDDHISTS</strong></td>
<td>103-104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1. Understanding the Abhidhamma from the Burmese perspective</td>
<td>104-112</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.2. The Burmese sociopolitical context and the popularity of the Abhidhamma

2.3. Patṭhāna in ritual and protective practices: the most powerful abhidhamma text safeguarding from natural and supernatural threats

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.3.1. The non-stop chanting ceremony of the Patṭhāna</td>
<td>125-128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.2. The Patṭhāna recitation for oneself and others</td>
<td>128-140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4. Summary</td>
<td>140-141</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CHAPTER 3: AN OVERVIEW OF THE LITERARY HISTORY OF PAṬṬHĀNA IN BURMA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1. An overview of Abhidhamma literature in Burma</td>
<td>142-161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2. Patṭhāna literature in Burma</td>
<td>161-165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3. Taung-myo<code>: the city of abhidhamma nya</code>wa</td>
<td>165-173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4. Summary</td>
<td>173-175</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CHAPTER 4: BURMESE PEDAGOGICAL APPROACHES FOR STUDYING PAṬṬHĀNA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.1. The importance of the Abhidhhammatthasaṅgaḥa (Thin”gyo) in Burmese pedagogical approach to Abhidhamma studies</td>
<td>177-179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.1. The Abhidhhammatthasaṅgaḥa as a primer for Abhidhamma studies</td>
<td>177-179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.2. The study of the Abhidhhammatthasaṅgaḥa: the art of memory</td>
<td>179-192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.3. The Abhidhhammatthasaṅgaḥa and the ayakauk technique</td>
<td>192-196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2. The Abhidhhammatthasaṅgaḥa and the Patṭhāna</td>
<td>196-201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3. Pedagogies of Patṭhāna studies in Burma</td>
<td>202-207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.1. The 8 leading conditions and the 9 categories of conditions</td>
<td>207-218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2. Burmese pedagogical approaches to the study of the Patṭhāna</td>
<td>218-227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4. Summary</td>
<td>227-229</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CHAPTER 5: ENUMERATION OF PAṬṬHĀNA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.1. The Saṅkhyaśāra in the Patṭhāna</td>
<td>231-233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.1. Single enumeration (Suddhasaṅkhya)</td>
<td>233-237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.2. Common enumeration (Sabhāgasaṅkhya)</td>
<td>237-239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.3. Multiple enumeration (Ghaṭanāsaṅkhya)</td>
<td>239-247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2. The Burmese pedagogical approaches to the study of the Saṅkhyaśāra</td>
<td>248-263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3. The Saṅkhyaśāra and the mathematics of combinatorics</td>
<td>263-274</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.4. Summary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONCLUSION</th>
<th>275</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Appendix A: Transliteration and Transcription Systems</td>
<td>276-283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix B: Survey questions Identifying the Conception and Ritualistic Usage of Paṭṭhāna (In English and Burmese)</td>
<td>284-287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix C: Details of informants</td>
<td>288-292</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix D: A list of selected Abhidhamma teachers mentioned in the thesis</td>
<td>293-303</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix E: The fourfold classification of dhammas on the basis of the Abhidhammatthasangaha</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix F: 49 varieties of conditions and the 9 categories of conditions as given in the commentary of the Paṭṭhāna</td>
<td>305-309</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix G: A catalogue of selected paṭṭhāna texts written by the Burmese from the 16th century to the present</td>
<td>310-312</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix H: The Pāli text in the Pucchavāra presented in a table designed by Pa-htan&quot;theik-pan Hsayadaw of Sagaing</td>
<td>313-322</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix I: Glossary (Pāli-Burmese-English)</td>
<td>323-324</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>325-334</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

335-362
Acknowledgements

For the research that has gone into this thesis, I owe my gratitude to many people, some of whom I wish to mention here. I would like to express my heartfelt gratitude to Professor Kate Crosby, my supervisor, for her invaluable guidance and encouragement. She was never lacking in kindness throughout my study at SOAS and at King’s College London. Her tireless support and patience has enabled me not only to complete this thesis within three years but also to broaden my academic training and research interests, including Abhidhamma, meditation, mathematics of Theravāda Abhidhamma, memorisation, and Buddhist Art. I owe much to her, especially for the provision of detailed and constructive feedback.

I am also indebted to many others. Ven. Dr. Khammai Dhammasāmi (Oxford), my spiritual teacher, always offered me valuable suggestions and steadfast support for my academic pursuit in Buddhist Studies. I also owe a great deal of gratitude to my Abhidhamma teachers, particularly In”sein Hsayadaw Ven. Tilokābhivaṃsa (Yangon), Ven. Paṇḍīṭabhivaṃsa (Oxford), Shwe-sin Tipiṭaka Hsayadaw Ven. Dr. Gandhamālālaṅkāra (Mingun), Sunlun Tipiṭaka Hsayadaw Ven. Sundara (Yangon), Sayagyī Daw Pavanatherī and Sayagyī Daw Kusalavatī (Sagaing). They have not only taught me Abhidhamma but also answered my endless questions on Paṭṭhāna, its innumerable methods, and Burmese pedagogical methods with compassion and patience.

I thank all my informants for their generosity, willingness to participate in the research, and responsiveness to all my questions. In particular, Bamaw Hsayadaw Ven. Dr. Kumārabhivaṃsa (the Chairman of the State Saṅgha Mahānāyaka Committee), Rector Hsayadaw Dr. Ven. Nandāmālābhivaṃsa (the Rector of ITBMU), Ven. Rajadhammābhivaṃsa (the late abbot of Masoeyein Taik–thik), Yaw Tipiṭaka Hsayadaw Ven. Sīrinandābhivaṃsa, Tipiṭaka Hsayadaw Ven. Silakkhandhābhivaṃsa, and Tipiṭaka Hsayadaw Ven. U Abhijātābhivaṃsa have given time from their busy schedule to answer my questions, and share their experiences in the study of Abhidhamma willingly and patiently. I am most grateful to Dr. U Thaw Kaung (retired librarian, University of Yangon), Saya U Nyunt Maung (retired librarian, University of Yangon), Saya U Mya Than (Co-founder and Pro Rector of IIA), Professor U Hla Myint (ITBMU), Saya U Peter Nyunt (Perth, Western Australia), Dr. William Pruitt (PTS), Dr. Elizabeth H. Moore (SOAS), Dr. Mike Charney (SOAS), and Dr. Atsuko Naono (SOAS) for
pointing out interesting and important avenues for my research and for their conversations relevant to the subject of this thesis. I am also thankful to Saya U Tin Win (APA), Sayama Daw Khin Yu Wai (Maṅgala Byūhā Association), Sayama Daw Hla Hla Win (APA), Daw Nyunt Shwe (APA), Daw Ni Ni (APA), Sayalay Daw Yujanañāṇī (Delhi University), and Daw Soe Yu Paing (Yangon) for their repeated provision of information—sometime via email—on Abhidhamma and its pervasive culture in Burma.

I wish to thank all the monks at the Oxford Buddha Vihāra, Oxford, and all the nuns at the Sakyadhīta Thilashin Sathintaik, Sagaing, for their moral support as well as for providing calm, quiet atmosphere, which allowed me to undertake my Abhidhamma study, memorisation, and writing. For providing her enthusiastic silence and calmness, I thank ‘Puppy’.

For their great love and unfailing support I would like to thank my parents, brothers, sisters and friends here in the UK and in Burma. I owe them all for their kindness.

Pyi Phyo Kyaw, King’s College London.
## A list of tables

Table 1.1. Detailed analysis of the dependent origination on the basis of the Visuddhimagga and the *paṭṭicasamuppāda* cycle drawn by Mogok Hsayadaw

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Detailed analysis of the dependent origination</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>The skilful triplet (<em>kusalatika</em>) expressed in terms of the main four methods of the <em>Paṭṭhāna</em></td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>The three basic components of the <em>paṭṭhāna</em></td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>The <em>ayakauk</em> of the conditional relations related by the root condition</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>A detailed analysis of the unskilful <em>cittas</em> in Pāli and English</td>
<td>187-188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>All the twelve unskilful <em>cittas</em> in terms of different types of feeling (<em>vedanā</em>)</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>The classification of the 24 conditions according to the nature of conditional relations between different kinds of <em>dhammas</em></td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>Conditioning states and conditioned states for the object condition on the basis of In&quot;sein Hsayadaw’s pedagogical textbook on the <em>Abhidhammatthasangaha</em></td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>An explanation of the 24 conditions in the <em>Paṭṭhāna</em></td>
<td>203-207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>A comparison of conditioning states and conditioned states of the root condition and those of the co-nascence condition</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>The three items, i.e. the conditioning states, the conditioned states, and the not-conditioned states, of the root condition on the basis of the PNT</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>An overview of conditioning and conditioned states of the root condition and the co-nascence-predominance condition</td>
<td>252</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Non-delusion (<em>amoha</em>) and investigation (<em>vīmaṃsa</em>) as conditioning states and the corresponding conditioned states.</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>The 4 types of conditional relations related by the root condition and the co-nascence predominance condition.</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>Pairing between conditioning state and conditioned state in the <em>Pucchāvāra</em> of the skilful triplet.</td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>Combinations of skilful triplet (<em>kusaladhamma</em>)</td>
<td>271</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# A list of figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>The <em>paṭṭiccasamuppāda</em> cycle, known in Burmese as <em>mogok-paṭṭiksa′tha′mokpat-sakwaing</em>”, developed by the Mogok Hsayadaw in 1960</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>An overview of the structure of the <em>Paṭṭhāna</em> on the basis on the 6th council edition of the Burmese Pāli canon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>An ongoing process of intensification of <em>Abhidhamma</em> culture in Burmese Buddhism</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abhidh-s.</td>
<td>Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AN.</td>
<td>Anguttara Nikāya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APA</td>
<td>Abhidhamma Propagation Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>As.</td>
<td>Aṭṭhasālinī</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dhp.</td>
<td>Dhammapada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dhp-a.</td>
<td>Dhammapada-aṭṭhakathā</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HPA</td>
<td>Htan&quot;ta-bin Hsayadaw’s paṭṭhāna ayauk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITBMU</td>
<td>International Theravāda Buddhist Missionary University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ja.</td>
<td>Jātaka</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mahānid-a.</td>
<td>Mahāniddesa-aṭṭhakathā</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mil.</td>
<td>Milindapañha</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MN.</td>
<td>Majjhima Nikāya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paṭṭh.</td>
<td>Paṭṭhāna</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paṭṭh-a.</td>
<td>Pañcappakarana-aṭṭhakathā</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PNT</td>
<td>Pa-htan&quot; Nya’wa Thon-saung-twe by The&quot;in&quot; Tha-tha-na-paing Hsayadaw Ven. Sūriya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTS</td>
<td>Pāli Text Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SN.</td>
<td>Saṃyutta Nikāya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vibh.</td>
<td>Vibhaṅga</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vism.</td>
<td>Visuddhimagga</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vism-mhṭ.</td>
<td>Visuddhimagga-mahāṭikā</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
INTRODUCTION

Aims of the thesis

This thesis examines the living tradition of *Abhidhamma* in contemporary Burma, exploring its pervasive role in Buddhist scholarship and practice there. Although *Abhidhamma* is sometimes described as Theravāda philosophy or metaphysics, it encompasses more than this: it systematises and draws out the implications of Buddhist doctrine, particularly causality; it addresses psychology, ethics and cosmology, as will become apparent in this thesis. Until very recently, relatively little attention had been paid to Theravāda *Abhidhamma* in Western scholarship, when compared with other writings on Theravāda or with writings on Sarvāstivāda *Abhidharma*. Until now virtually nothing has been written on it as a living tradition. The thesis will, therefore, use textual, socio-historical, and anthropological research methods to assess the multiple roles of *Abhidhamma* as a living tradition in Burmese Buddhism. The focus of the thesis is the *Paṭṭhāna, Pa-htan*” in Burmese, translated into English as ‘Conditional Relations,’ the seventh text of the *Abhidhamma Piṭaka*, which is regarded by Burmese as the most important of the *Abhidhamma* transmissions. It deals with the functioning of causality and uses the mathematics of enumeration and combination to do so. This thesis therefore also uses a further research method, mathematical analysis, to examine the use of mathematics in the elucidation and exposition of causality in the *Paṭṭhāna*. Because of the complexity yet pervasive uptake of the *Paṭṭhāna* in Burmese Buddhist study and practice, a further dimension of analysis that pervades this thesis is the examination of pedagogical and mnemonic methods. This thesis therefore applies multiple
research methods to analyse the living tradition of Abhidhamma and reveal its ongoing and multidimensional significance in Burmese Buddhism.

By ‘living tradition of Abhidhamma’, I refer to the many applications of Abhidhamma, such as its study, the production of texts on it and its application in indigenous Burmese medicine, apotropaic practice and meditation, all of which have a long history and continue to thrive in Burma. The Burmese Abhidhamma tradition can be traced back to early periods in the history of Burma, and has come to be seen as a distinctive feature of Burmese Buddhism by both the Burmese and observers of Burma. The pervasive role and ever-increasing popularity of the Paṭṭhāna amongst Burmese Buddhists is indicative of what I see as an ongoing intensification of Abhidhamma culture in Burmese Buddhism since perhaps the early 19th century, i.e. the ‘Abhidhamma-isation’ of Burmese Buddhism.

The Paṭṭhāna explicitly describes conditional relations between combinations of dhammas, i.e. elementary components that make up the experienced world, which are related through combinations of conditions (paccayas) (see 1.3. and Chapter 5). The name of the Paṭṭhāna reflects the focus on multiple conditions. Its commentary, i.e. the Paṅcappakaraṇa-āṭṭhakathā, gives three different etymological explanations of the term paṭṭhāna, the first of which provides the most literal and least interpretive analysis of the term. It analyses the term paṭṭhāna in terms of the prefix ‘pa’ and the word ‘ṭhāna’: ‘pa-kāro’ hi nānappakārathaṃ dīpeti, ¹ ‘the word pa, indeed, illustrates the meaning ‘of many kinds’ (nānappakāra); ṭhānasaddo paccayatham, ² ‘the word ṭhāna has the meaning ‘cause”. The term paṭṭhāna, thus, is understood as ‘of many kinds of

¹ Paṭṭh-a. 343.
² Paṭṭh-a. 343.
causes’. In other words, the *paṭṭhāna* text explicated conditional relations between many kinds of causes and their effects.\(^3\)

The *Paṭṭhāna* is regarded by the Burmese as the most important and efficacious of the *Abhidhamma* texts. This is because it is seen as the embodiment of the Buddha’s perfect wisdom (*sabbaññutā-nāṇa*). The Buddha’s omniscience is understood to be the result of the perfections (*pāramī*) that the Buddha-to-be has fulfilled over innumerable life times, i.e. the workings of karma (*kamma*).\(^4\) The *Paṭṭhāna* is thus understood to present the workings of *kamma*, encapsulating the omniscience that only the enlightened have attained. According to the tradition, the *Paṭṭhāna* is also believed to be the first *Abhidhamma* text to disappear in the process of the decline of the Buddha’s religion (*sāsana*). Thus, the Burmese Buddhists have come to regard the *Paṭṭhāna* as the great defence against the decline of the Buddha’s *sāsana*. The importance and efficacy attributed to the *Paṭṭhāna* implies that it has been applied in a range of Buddhist practices from the ritual practice to the scholarly study of it to the Buddhist meditation. The study of the *Paṭṭhāna* is pervasive within the scholarly circle of both monastic and lay literati. It is also widely applied in meditation practices and used ritualistically by both monastic members and lay people.

---

\(^3\) The second explanation of the term *paṭṭhāna* in the *Pañcappakaraṇa-aṭṭhakathā* gives it as *vibhajanaṭṭha* (*Paṭṭh-. 343), ‘the ability to go into detail’, relating *paṭṭhāna* to the causal root *paṭṭhāpeti*, ‘to display or set out’, citing it in a list of terms that mean to explain in detail or explicate which is found in the *Saccavibhaṅga-sutta* in the *Majjhima Nikāya* (MN. 3.291). Since the *Paṭṭhāna* explicates conditional relations between skilful *dhamma* etc., which are related by the 24 conditions singly and in combinations (see Chapter 5), the term *paṭṭhāna* is understood to mean *vibhajana*, ‘analysis’. The third interpretation of the term *paṭṭhāna* in the *Pañcappakaraṇa-aṭṭhakathā* is much more interpretive and difficult. The commentary in this third instance interprets *paṭṭhāna* in relation to the verb *pa + ṭhā* to set out, or go. It gives the example of a place where a cow has stood as being a *paṭṭhātagāvo* (*Paṭṭh-. 343), ‘[a place] frequented by a cow’. It then relates this to the *Paṭṭhāna* in its depth and divisions as being the place where the omniscience of the Buddha has been able to range without being obstructed (*nissāraṇa*), i.e. without constraint. We find another term, namely *gamanatthāna*, ‘accessible places’, in the third interpretation. The term *gamanatthānā* here implies a place or a text where the Buddha’s omniscience finds its perfect match. This relates to how the *Paṭṭhāna* is regarded by the Burmese as the embodiment of the perfect wisdom of the Buddha. This idea that the *Paṭṭhāna* is an accessible place, or a text, where the Buddha’s omniscience finds its perfect match is also found in the commentary on the *Dhammasaṅgani*, the *Atthasālīni*. There the word *gocara*, which literally means ‘where a cow roams’, in the sense of ‘scope’ or ‘fitting place’ for the Buddha’s omniscience is used to capture this idea. See 2.1. and 2.2. for a detailed explanation of how the Burmese interpret the *Paṭṭhāna* as the most fitting text for the omniscience of the Buddha to be able to range without constraint.

Scholars in the field of Buddhist Studies have acknowledged the *Paṭṭhāna* as a key text in order to facilitate the understanding of causality from Theravāda perspective. Moreover, observers of Burma have long recognised the pervasiveness of the *Paṭṭhāna* in Buddhist practices and rituals in Burmese Buddhism (see below). Despite the crucial roles of the *Paṭṭhāna* to our understanding of Buddhist causality and Burmese Buddhism, this thesis is the first to undertake a critical, in-depth study of *Paṭṭhāna* and the living tradition of the *Paṭṭhāna* in Burma. In particular, the thesis will focus on the vital role of the *Paṭṭhāna* in Buddhist scholarship in Burma. The present study aims to explore how and to what extent the *Paṭṭhāna* is studied by monastics and lay people in Burma. It focuses on pedagogical approaches and innovations for the study of the *Paṭṭhāna* developed by the Burmese ābhidhammikas, literally means ‘learned in Abhidhamma’, over the long history of Abhidhamma studies in Burma. Along the way, we shall explore a diverse literary history of Abhidhamma composed in Burma over the centuries. In order to discuss the development of various pedagogical approaches to the study of the *Abhidhamma* we shall also discuss the philosophical aspects of the *Paṭṭhāna* and the workings of the conditions. The thesis thereby explores how the practitioners of *Abhidhamma*—past and present—apply the most sophisticated possible technology, i.e. mathematics of combinatorics, to plumb the depths of causality.

**The Abhidhamma**

*Abhidhamma* is the systematisation of Buddhist doctrines through detailed analysis of the elementary components that constitute the process of experience (*dhamma*), and the way the *dhammas* interrelate. The third division of the Pāli Canon is dedicated to *Abhidhamma* and is called the *Abhidhamma Piṭaka*. The *Abhidhamma Piṭaka*
consists of seven texts, namely the Dhammasaṅgaṇī, the Vibhaṅga, the Dhātukathā, the Puggalapaññatti, the Kathāvatthu, the Yamaka, and the Paṭṭhāna. The first six texts of the Abhidhamma Piṭaka, except the Puggalapaññatti, are predominately concerned with the analytical role of the Abhidhamma in which entities and concepts such as ‘I’, ‘you’, ‘son’, ‘woman’, ‘tree’, etc. are analysed into discrete constituents of the reality, dhamma. Beyond these discrete constituents no further analysis is possible. The ultimate breakdown of entities and concepts into their indivisible components, i.e. dhammas, exposes their voidness of anything that might qualify as ‘self’ (attā). Simply put, the dhammas are empty (suñña) of self in that they are conditioned. The conditionality and interrelatedness of dhammas are explicitly described in the Paṭṭhāna. The Paṭṭhāna thus offers a synthesising function by describing innumerable numbers of conditional relations between dhammas that can be related through the 24 conditions and multiple combinations of conditions (see 1.3. and Chapter 5). The Paṭṭhāna explicates the conditional relations between dhammas by describing what causes and effects are involved, and how they are related. Thus, the Paṭṭhāna explicitly shows how dhammas obtained by analysis are nodes in a vast web of interconnected, interdependent processes.\(^5\) Therefore, the Paṭṭhāna is the focal teaching that clarifies the nuances of the Theravāda philosophy, causality, and the ‘doctrine of non-self’ (anattavāda).

The Abhidhamma also covers a range of subjects, namely philosophy, psychology, ethics, and cosmology. The Abhidhamma may be regarded as a philosophy because it proposes a perspective that deals with the nature of the reality. According to the philosophical system of the Abhidhamma, fundamental constituents of reality are the dhammas. Along with the philosophical aspect, the Abhidhamma explains the experiential world in terms of psychology. Psychology—from the perspective of the

\(^5\) Bodhi 2010: 9.
Abhidhamma—involves an elaborate analysis of the mind in terms of various types of consciousness (citta) and mental factors (cetasika). Citta is the process of being conscious of something, and thus has the characteristic of knowing or cognising an object. Cetasikas arise together with citta, and have intrinsic characteristics that determine the ethical quality of citta. The Abhidhamma also shows how the different types of consciousness and their associated mental factors connect with each other, and with material phenomena or matters (rūpa)\(^6\) to make up the ongoing process of experience. The Abhidhamma distinguishes states of the mind on the basis of ethical qualities such as the skilful (kusala), the unskilful (akusala), the beautiful factors (sobhana), and the defilements (kilesa).\(^7\) The Abhidhamma’s system of the mental states and material states is described in a hierarchical manner that corresponds to different realms of existence (bhūmi) in the Buddhist cosmology. As Abhidhamma literature continues to be developed, correspondences between mental and material states and specific realms of cosmos become more systematised and explicit. By way of example, in the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha, known in Burmese as Thingyo, the 11-12\(^{th}\) century terse summary of Abhidhamma system by Anuruddha, specific types of citta are arranged in accordance with the different realms of the cosmos. For instance, various types of citta are classified corresponding to the realms of sensuous world (kāmaloka), and the realms of non-sense pleasure, which include the realm of material (rūpaloka), the realm of immaterial (arūpaloka), and the supramundane (see Appendix E). This abhidhammic classification of cittas also corresponds to meditative states of the mind. For example, the types of citta pertaining to the realms of material and immaterial correspond to specific types of meditative absorption (jhāna). This implies that some of the meditation practices give successful practitioners, who have attained various

\(^6\) On occasion I use the word ‘matter’ in the plural against normal English usage in order to convey a multiplicity of rūpa, which cannot otherwise be done with a single term in English.

\(^7\) Bodhi 2010: 4.
stages of meditative absorption (jhāna), access to corresponding realms of the cosmos. For instance, the four highest levels of the Buddhist cosmos, the immaterial realms (arūpaloka) are accessed through the parallel formless jhāna.\(^8\) Another implication is that through meditation practices various stages of insight and the wisdom of the supramundane paths (magga) and fruits (phala) can be realised. Thus, all these aspects of the Abhidhamma, namely the philosophical, the psychological, the ethical and the cosmological, are integrated into the framework of a course of action for liberation (nibbāna).

A full-blown analysis of psychophysical experience in the later Abhidhamma literature has led to a fourfold method of classification of the reality, namely the four ultimate realities (paramattha-dhammas). They are: consciousness (citta), mental factor (cetasika), matter (rūpa), and nibbāna. The first three, namely citta, cetasika, and rūpa, comprises conditioned dhamma (saṅkhāra-dhamma), while the last is the unconditioned dhamma (asaṅkhāra-dhamma), also known as the unconditioned element (asaṅkhata-dhātu). The three kinds of conditioned dhamma, i.e. citta, cetasika, and rūpa, can be analysed further, and gives a list of 169 conditioned dhamma. There are 89 varieties of consciousness (citta).\(^9\) There are 52 cetasikas. Finally, rūpa is analysed into 28 material dhamma (see Appendix E). For example, in the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha, this scheme of the fourfold classification of dhammas is made explicit. The Dhammasaṅgaṇī indicates further additions of dhamma are possible. The commentaries and later manuals of the Abhidhamma\(^10\) nonetheless prevent an infinite development, limiting the number of dhamma.\(^11\) As we shall see in the later chapters,

---

\(^8\) King 2007: 85.
\(^9\) According to a finer method of classification of citta, there are 121 varieties of citta.
\(^10\) The later manuals or compendia of the Abhidhamma are known in Burmese as a-bi’da-ma let-than”kyan”, which literally means ‘little-finger manuals’.
\(^11\) Crosby 2014: 188.
this fourfold classification of dhammas is an important aspect of the Burmese pedagogical approaches to the study of the Abhidhamma.

The Abhidhamma in Burmese Buddhism

This section will explore the multiple ways in which Abhidhamma is ubiquitous amongst the Burmese Buddhists. For instance, the study of Abhidhamma appears at the heart of the Buddhist scholarship in Burmese Buddhism. Moreover, Abhidhamma serves as a basis for indigenous medical texts, ritual and protective practices, and meditation practices. I aim to show main roles of Abhidhamma in Burmese Buddhism. This section, therefore, will provide a useful background for our investigation of the significance of Abhidhamma in the Burmese cultural and sociopolitical contexts in Chapter 2 (see 2.1. and 2.2) and the detailed analysis of the literary history and scholastic study of Abhidhamma in later chapters.

It is well known amongst the Burmese and observers of Burma that the study of Abhidhamma holds a special place in Burmese Buddhism. Scholars such as Mabel Bode, Niharranjan Ray and Roger Bischoff point to the 17th century as the time when the focus of Buddhist scholarship in Burma had shifted significantly toward the study of the Abhidhamma and composition of the Abhidhamma texts.12 Visuddhābhivamśa et al. – writing on the history of Abhidhamma Pīṭaka from a Burmese perspective – list 333 Abhidhamma texts13 written by the Burmese in Pāli, Pāli-Burmese translation (nissaya) and Burmese from the early Konbaung period (1752-1885) to the 1980s.14 This is far

13 Here, the Burmese word kyan” is translated as ‘text’. See the section ‘Use of terms’ for a detailed explanation regarding this translation.
14 Visuddhābhivamśa et. al. 1987: hsu. Ven. U Visuddhābhivamśa, also known as Pa-htan” Hsayadaw, from Masoeain Sathintaik, Mandalay, along with two other monks, wrote a brief history of the Abhidhamma Pīṭaka in their introduction to the Burmese translation of the Dhammasaṅgaṇī. For full introduction, see Visuddhābhivamśa et. al. 1987: ka’-hsei.
from being an exhaustive list of *Abhidhamma* texts written in Burma throughout its history.\(^{15}\) For instance, Erik Braun observes that a scholarly debate surrounding the *Paramatthadīpanī* written by Ledi Hsayadaw Ven. U Ṛṇa\(^{16}\) (1846-1923) in the early 1900s alone sparked the production of over forty commentarial texts.\(^{17}\) It seems that most of the *Abhidhamma* texts composed in Burma are commentaries on and/or translations of the canonical and post-canonical *Abhidhamma* texts. For example, we have Pāli-Burmese *nissayas*, i.e. Pāli-Burmese transliteration works, on all seven texts of the *Abhidhamma* Piṭaka, and on commentarial texts such as the *Āṭṭhasālīni*, the commentary of the *Dhammasaṅganī* attributed to Buddhaghosa in the 5\(^{th}\) century Sri Lanka and the *Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha*. On the basis of the list of *Abhidhamma* texts compiled by Visuddhābhivāmsa et. al. and my own survey of the contemporary literature on the *Paṭṭhāṇa*, there are no less than 105 *Paṭṭhāṇa* texts (see Appendix G). The selected *Paṭṭhāṇa* texts, as shown in Appendix G, can be divided into five genres: (1) Pāli texts, (2) Pāli-Burmese *nissayas*, (3) miscellaneous i.e. *Paṭṭhāṇa* texts written in Burmese, (4) study guides, and (5) popular books. Of these five, the last two genres have been identified by me. I shall assess the place of some of these texts in the literary history of *Paṭṭhāṇa* in later chapters. Here, I would like to point out that in modern-day Burma there is a high demand for the production of study guides and popular books on the *Abhidhamma* texts. This is because a large number of monks, nuns and lay people study *Abhidhamma*, including on intensive residential courses and in weekend classes. Moreover, increasing numbers of people are sitting the

---

\(^{15}\) Since there has been no detailed study of the Pāli literature of Burma, except Mabel Bode’s work published in 1901, let alone the vernacular Buddhist literature, it is impossible to give a satisfactory picture of the literary history of *Abhidhamma* studies in Burma. Moreover, the ongoing production of books on *Abhidhamma* in Burma makes it more difficult. A comprehensive literature review of both pre-modern and modern *Abhidhamma* texts produced in Burma is desirable and still needs to be done.

\(^{16}\) The Ledi Hsayadaw was an influential Burmese monk. He is well-known for his scholarly works and vipassanā meditation method. It is believed that the British authorities in Burma arranged through Rangoon University College, then under Calcutta University, to award D.Litt to Ledi Hsayadaw in 1911, the same year he was conferred the *aggamaha-pandita* title. Ledi Hsayadaw was among the best known scholars of his generation. He wrote 105 books in total in both Burmese and Pāli.

\(^{17}\) Braun 2008: 138-139. See 2.2. for detailed discussion on the debate.
Abhidhamma examinations sponsored by the state and by various associations of Abhidhamma such as the Abhidhamma Propagation Association (APA) (see 2.2. and 4.1.). Success in these examinations is rewarded through position and prestige. For instance, the APA holds annual oral and written examinations on prescribed syllabi from the seven texts of the Abhidhamma, which are open to monks, nuns, laymen and laywomen. Successful candidates in these examinations are awarded with honorific titles. For example, lay people who successfully completed both oral and written examinations with distinctions on all prescribed syllabi are awarded a special title ‘Mahā-ābhidhammika-visiṭṭha-ukkaṭṭha-kalyāṇa-ñāṇadhaja’. The majority of people who have passed the examinations then become Abhidhamma teachers at the APA or at other Abhidhamma associations. The sheer number of Abhidhamma texts in Pāli and vernacular language in Burma and the unparalleled popularity of Abhidhamma studies amongst the Burmese reflects the distinctive predilection the Burmese have for the Abhidhamma and the centrality of Abhidhamma studies in modern day Burma.

In addition to the living tradition of Abhidhamma studies, a brief survey of the available indigenous medical texts provides some basis to suggest that since the mid-nineteenth century Burma, Abhidhamma has been used as a theoretical foundation in the indigenous Burmese medical systems and medicine. In particular, one of the most well-known indigenous medical groups in Burma called the A-bi’dama Taungtha Hsei’pyin-nya-ahpwe’, the ‘Abhidhamma Taungtha Medical Association’, also known as the ‘Taungtha Medical Association’, draws upon the Abhidhamma in developing their medical system and texts. The most influential medical authorities emerged from the Abhidhamma Taungtha medical association.18 However, no systematic study of their medical system has been done by modern scholarship in the English-medium.19

18 Naono 2009: 122.
19 Apart from a brief mentioning of the Taungtha medical group in relation to the weikza tradition in Burma in the Japanese-medium, there is no scholarly study on that group and their medical knowledge
Although a detailed study of the indigenous medical systems is desirable, it is beyond the scope of this thesis. I nonetheless mentioned that Abhidhamma has been appropriated by medical practitioners in this way since it indicates that Abhidhamma is regarded as authoritative beyond the religious context in Burmese society.

The important functions attributed to Abhidhamma by the Burmese have led to other implications for Buddhist practices. In Burma, as in Thailand and Cambodia, the protective power of Abhidhamma is important. In Cambodia and Thailand, the set of seven sacred syllables drawn from the Abhidhamma, namely saṅ (for Dhammasaṅgaṇī), vi (for Vibhaṅga), dhā (for Dhātukathā), pu (for Puggalapaṇīṭi), ka (for Kathāvatthu), ya (for Yamaka), and pa (for Paṭṭhāna), are recited as protective chants. I so far have not come across the use of these seven syllables at all in Burma. Yet, I have encountered several people, including laymen, who chant the whole Abhidhamma Piṭaka as part of their devotional practice towards the Buddha and as a protective practice. In terms of communal recitation of the Abhidhamma Piṭaka, there are at least a couple of lay groups who volunteer in organising and taking the responsibility of reciting the whole of the Abhidhamma in Yangon. Several of my informants are actively involved in such groups and volunteer to undertake organisation of and participation in non-stop chanting ceremonies of the Abhidhamma. The non-stop chanting of the whole Abhidhamma takes about 8-10 days.

Out of the seven Abhidhamma texts, the Paṭṭhāna is regarded as the most efficacious ritual text and thus it is the most popular Abhidhamma text amongst the Burmese. The Paṭṭhāna is widely recited not only as a protective chant (paritta) by Burmese Buddhists, but also as a part of the path of esoteric knowledge, namely the

---

in the English-medium. I thank Atsuko Naono for providing this information. (Personal communication 27 June 2013.)

21 LW2, LW3, LW4, and LW9 shared their experience of the Abhidhamma recitation ceremonies in and around Yangon.
Nearly every Burmese Buddhist knows at least the short list of 24 conditions (paccayas), \textit{hnik-hse'lei pyit-si} in Burmese, given in the \textit{Paccayuddesa}, the ‘Enumeration of the [24] Conditions’, of the \textit{Paṭṭhāna}.\textsuperscript{23} These 24 conditions may also be chanted using beads for nine times\textsuperscript{24} for nine days as a preparatory to in-depth esoteric practices.\textsuperscript{25} My survey of \textit{Paṭṭhāna} literature written in Burmese reveals that this list and a slightly longer version of \textit{Paṭṭhāna}, i.e. the \textit{Paccayaniddesa}, the ‘Analytical Exposition of the Conditions’, are present in almost every Burmese chanting book. The knowledge of the 24 conditions of the \textit{Paṭṭhāna} is pervasive amongst the Burmese people. Bischoff – in his short introduction to Burmese Buddhism – reports such phenomenon as follows.

The twenty-four conditions of the \textit{Paṭṭhāna} can be found printed on the fans of the bhikkhus [i.e. Buddhist monks], on calendars, and on posters. In some monasteries, the bhikkhus are woken every morning by twenty-four strokes on a hollow tree trunk, while the bhikkhu striking the tree trunk has to recite the twenty-four conditions as he does so. Even little children learn to recite the twenty-four conditions along with the suttas [discourses] of protection [i.e. the paritta or pa-yeik].\textsuperscript{26}

As with the recitation of the whole \textit{Abhidhamma Piṭaka}, the recitation of the \textit{Paṭṭhāna} occurs at both individual and communal levels. The communal recitation is called \textit{a-than-ma-se” pa-htan” pwa}, ‘non-stop chanting ceremony of the \textit{Paṭṭhāna}’, because the chanting occurs continuously for between one and seven days. The Bamaw Hsayadaw Ven. Dr. Kumārabhivaṃsa (1929- ), the Chairman of the State Saṅgha Mahānāyaka Committee of Myanmar, explains that it is the power of truth statements, i.e. the truth of interdependence and interrelatedness of things stated in the \textit{Paṭṭhāna}, that makes it efficacious.\textsuperscript{27} In Buddhism, the importance of truth

\textsuperscript{22} See Table 4.5, for an explanation of the 24 conditions.
\textsuperscript{23} Bischoff 1995: 47.
\textsuperscript{24} The number nine is regarded as auspicious and efficacious by the Burmese Buddhists because it is seen as a representation of the nine qualities of the Buddha.
\textsuperscript{26} Bischoff 1995: 47.
\textsuperscript{27} Kumārabhivaṃsa 06 June 2009.
statements can be traced back to the canonical texts such as the *Aṅgulimāla Sutta* and the *Suvannasāna Jātaka* (Jātaka No. 540). The power of such truth statements may be harnessed to benefit oneself and others (see 2.3.2.). Moreover, the *Paṭṭhāna* is regarded as the embodiment of the Buddha’s omniscience, the *Buddha-sabbaññutā-ñāṇa*, by Burmese Buddhists. Although the Buddha, according to the tradition, attained omniscience under the Bodhi tree, the outward manifestation of his omniscience – i.e. emanation of six colours of rays from the Buddha’s body – occurred only when he contemplated the *Paṭṭhāna* (see 2.1.). This account is interpreted by the Burmese as indicating the power of *Paṭṭhāna* to reveal and enhance one’s good *kammic* results.

According to Khin Hla Tin, a laywoman Abhidhamma teacher from the Dhamma Byuhā Association, recitation of the *Paṭṭhāna* helps to bring out hidden good *kammic* results of the previous *kamma* in present life and/or past lives. According to the theory of *kamma*, there are two broad categories of *kamma*: synchronous or proximity *kamma* and asynchronous *kamma*. The former produces immediate results without any interval of time, while the latter yields *kammic* results in the present or subsequent lives, whenever opportunities for such results occur. In the case of the asynchronous good *kamma*, recitation of the *Paṭṭhāna* acts as a condition for their good results to arise. The *Paṭṭhāna*, thus, is thought to bring out the best, but hidden, aspects of the Buddha’s omniscience. The Burmese therefore believe that the recitation and contemplation of the *Paṭṭhāna* will uncover latent good *kammic* results. It is then claimed that it is with this faith (*saddhā*) in the Buddha and his omniscience that

---

28 MN. 2.307-2.315.
29 Ja. 2.132.
30 As. 12-16.
31 In the *Paṭṭhāna*, there are two kinds of *kamma*-condition (*kamma*-paccaya), namely the co-nascent *kamma*-condition (*sahajāta-kamma*) and the asynchronous *kamma*-condition (*nānakkhaniṅkakamma*). See Chapter 1 for a detailed discussion of the law of *kamma* in relation to the law of conditional relations (*paṭṭhāna*). Also, see Bodhi 2010: 312 and Karunadasa 2010: 272 on details regarding two kinds of *kamma*-condition.
32 An example of this type of *kamma* given in the *Paṭṭhāna* text is that the volition (*cetanā*) in the 89 consciousnesses functions as a conascent *kamma* condition for the simultaneous arising of the *citta* and *cetasikas* associated with the volition, and the conascent material phenomena.
Burmese Buddhists recite paṭṭhāna and paritta texts. We shall explore the ritualistic usage of the Paṭṭhāna in detail in Chapter 2.

In addition to its essential role in scholastic tradition, indigenous medical systems, and apotropaic practice, Abhidhamma makes its appearance not only in prescriptive meditation manuals written by the Burmese, but also in sermons given by Burmese meditation teachers – either monastics or lay teachers. Patrick Pranke writing on Buddhist saints (arahants) and wizards, weikza in Burmese, in Burmese Buddhism observes that the very earliest ‘how-to’ insight meditation (vipassanā) books written in the mid-eighteenth century by a scholar-monk named Medawi (1728-1816) are couched in the language of Abhidhamma. Moreover, Braun, working on the Ledi Hsayadaw’s biography and works in relation to the modern vipassanā movement, remarks that “Abhidhamma, in Ledi’s view, is a vital part of the practice of meditation which is open to all and from which all, at least to some degree, can benefit”. My survey of books and sermons by vipassanā teachers – both monastics and lay teachers – from Burma reveals that they employ Abhidhamma related terminologies and concepts such as yok-nan, ‘materiality-mentality’ (rūpa-nāma), khanda, ‘aggregates’ (khandha), ayatana, ‘sense-bases’ (āyatana), dat, ‘elements’ (dhātu), and thik-sa, ‘truth’ (sacca) etc., when explaining the three aspects of the noble eightfold path, namely morality (sīla), concentration (samādhi), and wisdom (paññā). One of many vipassanā teachers encouraging meditators to have detailed knowledge about mentality (nāma) and materiality (rūpa) in Burma is the Pa-Auk Hsayadaw Ven. Ācīṇṇa (1934- ). For Pa-Auk Hsayadaw, whose meditation approach closely follows the 5th century Sri Lankan meditation manual by Buddhaghosa, the Visuddhimagga, the ‘Path of Purification’, a meditator cannot progress to vipassanā practice, even after

---

31 Pranke (forthcoming 2014).
32 Braun 2008: 338.
33 Kyaw 2010: 42.
having successfully practised the concentration component of the meditative path, without the knowledge of what mentality and materiality are.  

Some meditation teachers such as the Mo’hnyin’ Hsayađaw Ven. U Sumana (1873-1964), the Saddhammaransī Hsayađaw Ven. Ashin Kucďalăbhivăṃsa (1921-2011), the Anicca Hsayađaw Ven. Indobhăśa (1922-), and the Dhammaransī Hsayađaw Ven. Ashin Sunanda for example explain in their writings and sermons that having the knowledge and the understanding of Paṭṭhāna will be helpful for vipassanā practices. The exact relationship between the theoretical knowledge of Abhidhamma and the practical sitting is not clear to me at the moment. Nonetheless, my reading of their works so far suggests that knowing the theoretical knowledge about how things are related through conditions (paccayas) as described in the Paṭṭhāna (see Chapter 1 for more detail) is to help a meditator in depersonalising one’s meditative experiences. For example, when a meditator, who perhaps does not have theoretical knowledge about the teachings in Abhidhamma, re-experiences unpleasant feeling or thoughts such as anger during his/her meditation session, he/she may perceive it as ‘I am angry’ and thus personalise the experience making oneself more angry. If, on the other hand, one has been listening to sermons on the Paṭṭhāna and thus knows about the causal relations between the chains of experiences, i.e. the train of thoughts (cittas), he/she may see it as just anger arising, and perhaps may be able to trace back to cause(s) of such feelings without personalising the whole experience. Hence,
Dhammaransī Hsayadaw, a vipassanā teacher from the Mogok vipassanā meditation tradition, writes that the main purpose of teaching Paṭṭhāna prior to meditation practices is to demonstrate that there is no ‘I’ or ‘being’ or ‘self’, except conditional relations between things and thus there is only ‘non-self’ (anatta). Thus, a meditator may apply such understanding of the depersonalised conditional relations when encountering specific experiences during meditation sitting as well as in daily life experiences. Some scholar-monks such as Mo"hynin" Hsayadaw and Bamaw Hsayadaw highlight the meditative qualities of devotional practice such as Paṭṭhāna recitation. Bamaw Hsayadaw’s sermons emphasise a gradual, progressive Buddhist path whereby people are encouraged to listen and recite the Paṭṭhāna as a preliminary stage of meditation practice. Based on such devotional practice, one is then able to meditate and internalise the teachings of Paṭṭhāna. In sum, the Paṭṭhāna is pervasive in Burmese Buddhist practices. Its roles in both the mundane (lokiya) domain, i.e. scholastic study and ritualistic usage, and the supramundane (lokuttara) domain, namely meditation, are indications of the inclusive nature of the Buddhist teachings.

Structure of the thesis

The thesis is structured to explore the theoretical aspects of the Abhidhamma, including scholarly study of it, and the living expressions of the Abhidhamma—historical and present—within Burmese Buddhism. The theoretical and the living expressions of the Abhidhamma in Burmese Buddhism are not discrete areas, and their integral nature is demonstrated throughout the thesis, within each chapter and

---

39 Sunanda 2011: 119-122. Here, I have translated thon-nya-ta in Burmese, suññatā in Pāli, as ‘non-self’, rather than ‘emptiness’ in order to avoid confusion with the Madhaymika’s usage of emptiness (śūnyatā). Moreover, I have shown elsewhere that the term suññatā is understood as ‘non-self’ amongst some Theravāda meditation traditions in Burma and Thailand. See Kyaw (2011) for an analysis of the Theravāda understanding of the term suññatā.
across chapters. This may lead to some odd shifts as we move in and out of the theoretical discussions on the *Abhidhamma*, while surveying the living expressions at speed. This integrated structure aims to demonstrate that the *Abhidhamma* and the scholarly study of the *Abhidhamma* are indeed the living practice in modern day Burma.

The place and role of the *Paṭṭhāna* in the context of Theravāda understanding of the theory of Buddhist causality is explored in Chapter 1. The interconnectivity between the three laws of causality, i.e. the law of *kamma*, the law of dependent origination (*paṭiccasamuppāda*) and the law of conditional relations (*paṭṭhāna*), is discussed in detail. This chapter aims to provide the necessary conceptual background to and fundamental aspects of the *Paṭṭhāna*, i.e. an overview of the structure of the *Paṭṭhāna* and basic elements of the *Paṭṭhāna*, as the basis of further exploration of causality from the perspective of the *Paṭṭhāna* in later chapters. Chapter 2 investigates the sociopolitical and historical context of Burmese Buddhism for the development of the *Abhidhamma* tradition and its ongoing intensification in Burma. It looks at the establishment of a formalised, examination-orientated monastic education system and its strengthening since the Konbaung period. It also explores how all beings in the Buddhist cosmos, seen or unseen, namely humans, gods (devas) and spirits are believed to be agents in transmission of the *Abhidhamma* and preservation of the Buddha’s sāsana. The chapter analyses the Burmese understanding and conception of the efficacy of *paṭṭhāna* and the recitation of it. Chapter 3 surveys a wide range of composition of *Abhidhamma* and *Paṭṭhāna* literature in Burma over the centuries, examining specific works by well known *abhidhamma* teachers, including the lay *abhidhamma* teachers. The chapter explores an ongoing process of innovation and adaptation in the methods of writing, presenting and studying the *Abhidhamma*. It also examines the development of different academic traditions of *Abhidhamma* learning.
dedicated to their own innovative methods of analysis, teaching and pedagogical philosophy. Chapter 4 examines the development and innovations of the pedagogical approaches to the study of the \textit{Paṭṭhāna} developed by the Burmese over the centuries. To assess a range of pedagogical approaches to the study of the \textit{Paṭṭhāna}, it is important to explore essential components of the pedagogical approaches, namely the role of the \textit{Abhidhammatthasangaha}, the traditional mnemonic methods and the workings of the conditions (\textit{paccayas}). All of these aspects are discussed in Chapter 4. On the basis on personal engagement in the living pedagogical traditions of Burmese \textit{Paṭṭhāna} study, I explain different methods of memorisation, recall and application with examples of specific teaching sessions. Chapter 5 explores the application of the mathematics of enumeration and combinatorics in explicating the complexity and depths of causality in the \textit{Paṭṭhāna}. It focuses on the section of the \textit{Paṭṭhāna} that is explicitly about the mathematical approach, namely the \textit{Saṅkhyaśāra}, ‘enumeration section’, in the \textit{Pañhāvāra}, ‘investigation chapter’ (see Figure 1.2.). It explains how enumeration is used as the basis for generative expositions of the conditional relations with specific examples. It also discusses the Burmese pedagogical approaches to the study of the \textit{Saṅkhyaśāra}. The chapter then investigates different types of combinations of conditions (\textit{paccayas}) and combinations of \textit{dhammas} being used in the \textit{Paṭṭhāna}. In so doing, it aims to illustrate an ongoing process of innovative mathematical and pedagogical approaches by the \textit{ābhidhammikas}—past and present—to unravel the most complex doctrine of Buddhism, the doctrine of causality.
Other studies of the *Abhidhamma*

The following studies of the *Abhidhamma* in the modern Western scholarship have been important. Over the years, scholars such as Bhikkhu Bodhi,Robert Buswell, Lance Cousins, Padmanabh S. Jaini, Rupert Gethin, David Kalupahana, Yakupitiyage Karunadasa, and Karl H. Potter have written on the development of *abhidhamma* thought and the *Abhidhamma Piṭaka* from the perspective of textual history. It is generally assumed by scholars that the *Abhidhamma Piṭaka* in its current shape was formed at a far later date than the Buddha’s death, perhaps between 200 B.C.E. to 200 C.E. There is no specific consensus regarding the dating of the *Paṭṭhāna*, although scholars tend to agree that it postdates the Buddha. Kalupahana, writing on the Buddhist causality and philosophy of relations in the 1960s, points out that the Buddha and his immediate successors were not interested “in the way or manner in which things are related [i.e. the *Paṭṭhāna*] but only in the things themselves which are so related [i.e. dependent origination]”. This is because, according to Kalupahana, “the Buddha must have thought of the futility of discoursing on the analysis of the various ways in which phenomena are related one another”. Hence, he regards the *Paṭṭhāna* as having developed out of scholasticism in response to various Brahmanical and philosophical schools postdating the Buddha’s death. Cousins, when discussing the development of the theory of the consciousness process

---

41 Buswell in Potter et al. (eds.) (2006).
43 Jaini in Potter et al. (eds.) (2006).
46 Karunadasa 1996.
47 Potter in Potter et. al. (eds.) (2006).
in the *Abhidhamma*, suggests that the *Paṭṭhāna* “cannot be later than the second century B.C.”. Bareau, however, dates it in the first century C.E.

The works by Wijesinghe S. Karunaratne and David Kalupahana include discussion on the *Paṭṭhāna* in relation to Buddhist causality. Karunaratne’s Ph.D. thesis on the development of the theory of causality in early Theravāda Buddhism (submitted in 1956 to the University of London) includes a chapter on the *Paṭṭhāna* entitled ‘The theory of Paccayas [i.e. conditions]’. Karunaratne discusses Buddhist causality in terms of both the theory of dependent origination (*paṭiccasamuppada*) and the theory of conditions. He also describes the structure of the *Paṭṭhāna* and the 24 conditions of the *Paṭṭhāna*. Kalupahana working on the issue of Buddhist causality with respect to the philosophy of relations, i.e. *Paṭṭhāna*, traces the development of the theory of *paṭṭhāna* from the Buddha’s time to after the Buddha’s death. Kalupahana, like Karunaratne, sees the theory of dependent origination and the theory of conditional relations as the one supplementing the other because the former describes the things that are related, and the latter shows the ways in which things are related.

In recent years, Erik Braun and Jason Carbine have contributed to the scholarly study of the *Abhidhamma* in relation to Burmese Buddhism. Braun explores the role of Ledi Hsayadaw, in the late 19th century and the early 20th century, in mobilising lay people to pursue the study of the *Abhidhamma* and to employ such theoretical knowledge as a basis for the practice of insight (*vipassanā*) meditation. Carbine’s book on Burmese monasticism explores various developments of the *Shwe-

---

51 Cousins 1981: 44.
52 Bareau, cited in Potter et al. 2006: 337.
53 Karunaratne 1956.
56 Erik Braun 2008.
57 Jason Carbine 2011.
kyin gaing”, the ‘Shwe-kyin sect’, one of the Burmese Saṅgha sects, since the late 19th century. He draws on sermons dealing with the Paṭṭhāna by the Mahagandayon Hsayadaw Ven. Janakabhivaṃsa (1900-1977) (henceforth Mahagandayon Hsayadaw), one of leading members of the Shwe-kyin sect, in order to explore the relevance of Abhidhamma to the quest for “final nibbānic rupture”, i.e. final liberation.

The translation of the first volume of the Burmese sixth council edition of the Paṭṭhāna by the Late Mula’ Pa-hтан” Hsayadaw U Nārada (1898-1983) (henceforth Mula’ Pa-hтан” Hsayadaw) was published by the Pāli Text Society (PTS) in 1969 and 1981 in two volumes. Mula’ Pa-hтан” Hsayadaw also wrote a guide to the Paṭṭhāna entitled Guide to Conditional Relations (Part 1): Being a guide to pages 1-12 of Conditional Relations Paṭṭhāna, which was published by the PTS in 1979. The second part of the guide to the Paṭṭhāna was published by the Department of Religious Affairs in 1986. These two volumes of the guide aim to explain the workings of the conditions (paccayas), and to guide the students through the Paṭṭhāna from the perspective of the Burmese Abhidhamma tradition. However, they are written with minimal explanation of the context of the topic under discussion, and with very little annotation or commentary. Thus, the material in these works is somewhat technical and possibly difficult to access without prior knowledge.

While I have drawn on some of the published scholarship where appropriate, a great deal of material and discussion in this thesis is based on my fieldwork, and my own study of the Paṭṭhāna within the Burmese Abhidhamma tradition. Since there are virtually no scholarly studies undertaken on Abhidhamma as a living tradition, published citable material written in English is limited. I therefore have drawn extensively on my informants and secondary sources written in Burmese.

58 See 2.1. and 3.1. on Mahagandayon Hsayadaw’s works.
59 Carbine 2011: 139-168.
Methodology

An interdisciplinary research approach

As a methodological framework, I draw upon Michael Gorman’s approaches to the study of ancients and medieval religious texts. Gorman identifies three main approaches to the study of texts, and they are:

1) the synchronic approach – i.e. analysing a text in its final form at a given time;
2) the diachronic approach – i.e. analysing a text by focusing on the origin and development of the text across time;
3) the existential approach – i.e. discerning the contemporary meaning, instrumental and experiential nature of a text by using synchronic and diachronic approaches.

Each of these approaches includes a number of methods, and each method aims to address particular issues when analysing texts. The synchronic approach for example includes several methods, including ‘literary criticism’, ‘genre and form analysis’, and ‘social-scientific analysis’. Literary criticism is used to determine contexts and the significance of a text in relation to the contexts in which the text is written and/or read. Literary criticism also analyses various literary aspects of the text as literature. Genre and form analysis is used to determine the genre, structure and movement of the text at a given time. The term social-scientific analysis refers to the method in which the text or its community is analysed through sociological or anthropological models and methods. Some methods belong to more than one approach. For instance, genre and form analysis of the text can be undertaken across time in order to assess the development of a particular genre or literary style over time. Gorman’s overview of methodological approaches thus covers textual, socio-

---

60 Gorman 2009.
historical, and anthropological methods for critical study of religious texts. While Gorman’s work is written from the perspective of Christian theology, the methods and approaches outlined are applicable to the study of Buddhist texts. Andrew Skilton has taught the applicability to Theravāda literature of the entire spectrum of methodologies discussed by Gorman, which he has used as a course book in teaching Pāli studies at SOAS. I therefore learnt of these approaches when attending the Pāli course at SOAS during 2009-2010 academic year. I therefore draw on these approaches as a basis, and adapt them to address and investigate the living tradition of the Abhidhamma in Burmese Buddhism.

The following paragraphs discuss how specific methods are relevant for the thesis, and therefore, how they are applied in the current research. Application of both diachronic and synchronic approaches to the thesis will include a range of methods, namely literary criticism (including contextual analysis), narrative criticism, genre and form analysis, and social-scientific analysis. This means that the canonical and post-canonical Abhidhamma texts, and how the Burmese Abhidhamma tradition relates to and uses these texts in Buddhist scholarship and Buddhist practice will be analysed across time and at a given time.

From the perspective of literary criticism, the Paṭṭhāna will be considered and analysed in the broader context of Buddhist causality and the doctrine of ‘not-self’. A close reading of some sections of the Paṭṭhāna will be undertaken at relevant points in the thesis. Examples and quotations of the Paṭṭhāna in this thesis draw heavily on the Pañhāvāra, the ‘investigation chapter’, of the skilful triplet (kusalatika) because the Pañhāvāra of the Paṭṭhāna gives the most detailed description of the conditional relations between dhammas. It does not mean that other sections of the Paṭṭhāna are ignored. For example, a detailed analysis of the Saṅkhyaśātra, the ‘enumeration chapter’, and the Pucchavāra, the ‘question chapter’, are discussed in relation to the
mathematical aspects of the Paṭṭhāna. The thesis also uses mathematical analysis, that of combinatorics, to assess the use of mathematics in the exposition of causality in the Paṭṭhāna.

To understand the place and roles of the Paṭṭhāna in contemporary Burmese Buddhism, I undertake contextual analysis of the Abhidhamma texts composed in Burma. I shall discuss the socio-political climate of Burma since perhaps the late Konbaung period in order to understand the presence and the development of such works in both monastic and laity domains. Throughout the history of Burma, Burmese kings and governments have been portrayed as great patrons of Buddhism – following Asoka as an archetypical king. In particular, Burmese kings and governments since the Konbaung period have established formalised monastic examinations on the Abhidhamma and other Buddhist texts. Such movements have been portrayed (and viewed) as a great act on the part of the ruler. Thus, various crucial points in the history of Burmese Buddhism are relevant for the thesis. For example, consideration of Burmese socio-historical perspective will be useful when analysing the Paṭṭhāna commentaries written by Burmese commentators between the 17th century and the present time.\footnote{The choice of this period is not arbitrary. According to Visuddhābhivaṃsa \textit{et. al.} (1987: san), the earliest Paṭṭhāna Pāli-Burmese nissaya – i.e. translation of the Pāli into the Burmese, known to us is written in the seventeenth century.}

As a part of narrative criticism, the thesis considers various narratives related to the origin of the Abhidhamma. While the canonical Abhidhamma texts do not have such narratives, the commentarial Abhidhamma texts describe how the Buddha contemplated the Abhidhamma four weeks after his enlightenment, and then preached it to gods in Tāvatiṃsa heaven in his seventh rains-retreat. Such narratives have been incorporated into contemporary literature on the Paṭṭhāna. Themes of the narratives
which have appeared in the commentarial and modern *Abhidhamma* literature include:

1) emitting rays from the Buddha’s body, which relates to the omniscience of the Buddha;

2) repaying debt to the mother of Gotama Buddha;

3) decline of Sāsana and that the *Paṭṭhāna* as the first text to disappear from the world;

4) protective and acquisitive power of the *Paṭṭhāna*.

I shall look at such stories and thematic lines as a part of contextual analysis, exploring possible reasons for an ever-growing popularity of the *Abhidhamma*.

I shall undertake genre and form analysis of *Abhidhamma* texts produced in Burma with specific examples. The aim is to determine the genre and form of the *Abhidhamma* texts composed in the Burmese language and to describe the structure and movement of the text. For instance, the survey of the *Paṭṭhāna* texts written in Burma can be categorized into five different genres, namely (1) Pāli texts, (2) Pāli-Burmese nissayas, (3) miscellaneous i.e. *Paṭṭhāna* texts written in Burmese, (4) study guides, and (5) popular books (see above and Appendix G). As we shall see in Chapter 3, there are different types of nissaya texts. Of these different types of nissayas, a particular style is used in writing expositions on the *Abhidhamma* in a mixture of the Pāli and Burmese languages. These analytical expositions of the *Abhidhamma* are called *abhidhamma ayakauk* texts in Burmese. I shall, therefore, do a close reading and analysis of these ayakauk texts on the *Paṭṭhāna* with specific examples (see Chapter 3). Such analysis will provide clues as to changes in form of the *Abhidhamma* literature, especially on the *Paṭṭhāna*. As I shall demonstrate in later chapters, the form of *Paṭṭhāna* texts composed in Burma has transformed from analytical expositions, i.e. ayakauk texts, to examination-orientated pedagogical textbooks in response to changes in Burmese monastic education systems.
As noted above, I also adopt anthropological methods in this thesis. The aim is to have an understanding of how Burmese Buddhists perceive and relate to the Abhidhamma and the Abhidhamma texts, and how they incorporate the Abhidhamma in the Buddhist practices in contemporary Burma. I, therefore, undertook fieldwork in Burma in July 2010, and September 2011 to September 2012 (see below). I observed and participated in non-stop chanting ceremonies of the Paṭṭhāna, and attended Paṭṭhāna courses at various monastic institutions and lay Abhidhamma associations. I, thus, studied the Abhidhamma texts with traditional teachers. In order to understand motivations and nuances of the place of Paṭṭhāna in Burmese Buddhism, I also employed questionnaires (see Appendix B) and qualitative, semi-structured interviews.

In sum, the methodological framework used in this thesis integrates multiple research methods, namely, textual, socio-historical, anthropological, mathematical analyses. Moreover, the current thesis considers both contemporary and historical aspects by using synchronic and diachronic approaches.

Research ethics standard

The following research ethical standards have been taken to ensure that the research for this thesis was conducted in accordance with clear ethical standards. The aim of such standards is to foster the values of openness, fairness, integrity and responsibility on the part of both the researcher and the subjects. By subjects, I mean the immediate informants as well as the tradition itself, i.e. the Burmese Abhidhamma tradition, which constitutes both living and inanimate artefacts.

1. In terms of ensuring data integrity, during fieldwork, I recorded the interviews
with the consent of the participants. Where recording was not possible, for example informal meetings and conversations, they were recorded as soon as possible.

2. To ensure that the research is of highest quality, detailed research methods and fieldwork plan were designed well in advance. I adhered to the plan whenever possible, but adjustments to the plan were made where appropriate. For instance, I sat oral examinations on some sections of the Paṭṭhāna and the Mātikā held by the APA in Yangon in September 2012, although it was not in my fieldwork plan.

3. To conform to intellectual copyright laws, I explained the purpose of this research to all informants, asked their consent prior to all interviews and informed them that they may withdraw from the process at any time. In some circumstances, for example medical research projects in the UK, it is appropriate and necessary to get signed consent forms. In the context of my research, Burmese people are unfamiliar with the concept of signing a consent form or transferring copyright through formally signed forms. Thus, explaining the concept of copyright and procedures entailed in attaining copyright in the western sense to them would consume a lot of time. Moreover, given a different socio-cultural context, signatures have a different meaning in Burma. Therefore, I obtained informed verbal consent from research participants.

4. To conform to Data Protection Act and privacy laws on the one hand, and to achieve research aims on the other, I have maintained anonymity of the
majority of informants, while revealing some informants’ identities as and when appropriate. In the case of anonymised informants, I have assigned informant codes, which reveal important information regarding affiliated organisations, occupation/position, location and demographic details (see Appendix C). Non-anonymisation is necessary for important individuals associated with specific Buddhist institutions. For instance, I interviewed prominent Hsayadaws, such as Bamaw Hsayadaw (the Chairman of the State Saṅgha Mahānāyaka Committee of Myanmar) and Tipiṭaka Hsayadaws during my fieldwork (see Appendix C). Here, it is crucial that key teachers and individuals are mentioned in the thesis.

5. I have ensured that all data and information are well protected during and after my fieldwork. This aims to avoid harm to research participants, particularly in the context where socially and culturally sensitive issues may be raised.

6. In order to avoid conflict within an organisation and between various organisations, the interviews were conducted in non-offensive manner. I avoided suggesting or asking questions that might have caused misunderstanding between informants during my interviews.

Sources

This thesis draws on both primary and secondary literature on Theravāda Buddhism, Burmese Buddhism, and Abhidhamma. I use the root texts in Pāli regarding the Abhidhamma, particularly the Paṭṭhāna. Printed commentaries and expositions on
Abhidhamma, Burma, and Burmese Buddhism from different time periods written in Burmese have been used extensively in the thesis. The majority of these texts were collected over three years. The secondary literature, i.e. the Western scholarship, is also consulted where appropriate. In particular, for the translations of the Paṭṭhāna and discussions on its nature, I have consulted a range of sources, namely Burmese-Pāli nissayas, expositions in Burmese, translations in English, and scholarly works on Abhidhamma by Bodhi and Karunadasa.

The thesis is also based on fieldwork undertaken in several towns in Burma: Yangon and Pyay (formerly Prome) in lower Burma, and Mandalay, Sagaing, Monywa, Khin-oo and Pahkokku in upper Burma. The data was gleaned over three trips made to Burma from July 2010 to September 2012. During the first trip in July-August 2010 (which was primarily undertaken as fieldwork for my MA dissertation on Buddhist business practices in contemporary Burma), I visited two teaching monasteries which are well known for the teaching of the Paṭṭhāna, namely the In"sein Ywama Sathintaik in Yangon and the Pa-htan” Theikpan Sathintaik in Sagaing. These visits served as a preliminary fieldwork for my PhD research. The preliminary trip made it possible for me to establish connection with abhidhamma teachers in Burma. I was therefore able to attend a traditional, intensive Paṭṭhāna course taught by the In"sein Hsayadaw Ven. U Tilokābhivaṃsa (1938- ) in April-May 2011. As a result of this preparation I was able to receive traditional training on the Paṭṭhāna and the Abhidhammatthaṣaṅgaha taught by In”sein Hsayadaw during the second trip. During my third trip from September 2011 to September 2012, I collected data from various teaching monasteries, nunneries, and Abhidhamma associations (see Appendix C) in the above-mentioned towns. I also participated in lessons on the Paṭṭhāna taught by monks, nuns and lay abhidhamma teachers, and in non-stop chanting ceremonies of the Paṭṭhāna at nunneries and the Abhidhamma Propagation Association (APA). The APA held the
forty-fifth oral examinations in the first week of September 2012. I took the oral examinations on the following sections of the *Abhidhamma*: (1) the *Mātikā*, a list of *dhammas* given at the beginning of the first book of *Abhidhamma* Piṭaka; (2) the *Paccayaniddesa*, the ‘analytical exposition of the conditions’, and (3) the *Pañhāvāra-vibhaṅga*, the ‘classification section of the investigation chapter’ (see 1.3). It involved committing a total of 55 pages of Pāli text to memory, and then reciting the text from memory in front of an examiner during the examinations. The thesis is thus based on material from primary and secondary literature, data gleaned from fieldwork, and my participation in the traditional study of *Abhidhamma*.

The total number of informants in the data sample was 71. I have used a combination of data collection methods, namely questionnaire, semi-structured interviews, and participant-observations. Out of 71 informants, 45 informants were surveyed using the questionnaire, while 14 informants were interviewed. Others were surveyed through a combination of the three methods.63 The use of the questionnaire on a larger sample was to reveal the general trends regarding the perceptions and beliefs regarding the *Paṭṭhāna* and its efficacy (see 2.3.) held by individuals, for example. The overall picture is then supported by the in-depth interviews and participant-observations with a smaller sample size. The aim of using these three methods is to cover breadth and depth regarding a range of roles of the *Abhidhamma* in Burma, and the scholarly study of the *Paṭṭhāna* by the Burmese. A combination of these methods has also allowed me to adapt the fieldwork plan so that I was able to glean data from a range of informants with different attributes. For instance, I planned to distribute the questionnaire to all informants. It was not, however, an appropriate approach to collect information from prominent Hsayadaws such as Bamaw Hsayadaw, In"sein Hsayadaw, and Tipiṭaka Hsayadaws etc. as they are usually

---

63 See Appendix C for the details about the use of different data collection methods.
very busy. Plus, it would be inappropriate and disrespectful towards them. Therefore, I mainly used interviews as a method to glean information from prominent monks. I also use their public dhamma talks and lectures on Abhidhamma, in audio and/or video format, as sources of information. I collected information from student-monks and student-nuns from various teaching monasteries and nunneries through the questionnaire. I also interviewed some of the student-monks and student-nuns in order to compare information gathered from them and that of prominent informants. This is to ensure that data collected presents an unbiased picture. In terms of lay people, the majority of my lay informants are from the APA and the Myat-ratana Dhamma School based in Yangon. My data sample includes informants who have not attended any Abhidhamma classes.64

In examining the living tradition of Abhidhamma in Burma, I also draw on my own familiarity with Buddhist culture in Burma over the past 20 years, and my language expertise in English, Burmese and Pāli.

Romanisation of Pāli, Pāli loanwords in Burmese language, and Burmese

Romanisation of Burmese poses several problems. First, a feature of the Burmese language is that “the Burmese script symbols do not exactly match the sounds of speech”.65 The discrepancy between Burmese scripts and sounds of speech is reflected in a Burmese saying: ‘yei’taw’a-mhan-hpat-taw’a-than’, literally mean ‘write correctly [i.e. according to Burmese script symbols] but read phonetically’. Second, romanised script imperfectly represents elements of Burmese script and sound.66 One of the implications of this is that several Burmese characters are represented by a

64 LM7, LM8, LM9, LW14 and LW15.
roman character and hence several Burmese words may be represented by a single version of romanised Burmese (see Appendix A). To minimise ambiguities stemmed from such linguistic features, I provide Burmese words in both Burmese script and romanisation of Burmese words in glossary of Burmese-Pāli-English terms (see below).

Along with the issues highlighted above, there is a range of purposes for which romanisation is needed and no single system can satisfy these needs. Scholars of Burma and Buddhism, librarians and linguists etc. have employed a range of romanisation systems of Burmese in their works. Okell’s authoritative and practical book, *A Guide to Romanisation of Burmese*, identifies numerous romanisation systems. In general, there are three systems applied in the romanisation of Burmese script: transliteration, transcription and combined method. The transliteration methods represent each letter and symbol of Burmese script by a corresponding symbol in roman script irrespective of pronunciation. The transliteration method is recommended by Charles Duroiselle in his paper on Burmese philology. Scholars such as Than Tun and Melford Spiro have used the transliteration method. This method of romanisation has also been approved by the Library of Congress and the American Library Association in 1997. The transcription method, which represents the sounds of Burmese speech irrespective of its Burmese spelling, is used by a number of scholars, for example Gustaaf Houtman, Michael Charney and Khammai Dhammasāmi, in Burma studies and Buddhist studies. The combined methods, which shows both the pronunciation of a word and reveals its spelling in Burmese script, was devised by Minn Latt in 1958, but only a few scholars adopted this combined

---

67 See Okell (1971: 7-14) for an overview of all the systems used by various scholars and institutions.
method in their work.\textsuperscript{71} Even then, scholars, librarians and linguists \textit{etc.} have also developed various romanisation systems within each method according to their specific needs.

According to Okell, nearly all potential users can be categorized into “literary”, “linguists” and “casual”.\textsuperscript{72} He recommends three main systems: the standard transliteration system, i.e. augmented version of Duroiselle’s system, for “literary” work; the phonetic transcription – emphasizing the sounds of the language – for “linguistic” work; and the conventional transcription for “casual” work, which is widely used by anthropologists, political scientists, journalists and economists \textit{etc.}\textsuperscript{73} Okell classifies scholars of Buddhism under the literary group, with an assumption that the study of Buddhism predominantly takes a textual approach. However, this thesis takes an interdisciplinary approach. In particular, I draw upon both textual and socio-anthropological approaches to explore the roles of \textit{Paṭṭhāna} in contemporary Burmese Buddhism. Therefore, my thesis includes both ‘literary work’ and ‘casual work’.

Another aspect to consider in the process of romanisation of Burmese is pervasiveness of Pāli loanwords, i.e. Pāli terms used by Burmese in their vernacular writings and conversations, in the Burmese language. These Pāli loanwords are different in writing, pronunciation and meaning from those of standard Pāli words.\textsuperscript{74} For example, Pāli word ‘\textit{paṭṭhāna}’ (ပ႒ာန) is called ‘\textit{pa-htan}’\textsuperscript{″} (ပ႒ာန္) by Burmese Buddhists. It can be seen that the Pāli loanword is different from the standard Pāli word in both Roman and Burmese scripts. In terms of Burmese pronunciation, the final syllable is dropped and the penultimate syllable is pronounced heavily. The

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{itemize}
\item\textsuperscript{71} Minn Latt 1958, 1966; Becker 1965; Beckova 1967, cited in Okell 1971: 11-13.
\item\textsuperscript{72} Okell 1971: 54-56.
\item\textsuperscript{73} See Okell (1971: 65-67) for all three systems in full.
\item\textsuperscript{74} Houtman 1990: 11.
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
meaning of pa-htan” is, in some cases, the same as the standard Pāli meaning of paṭṭhāna. In other cases, pa-htan” may convey a sense of accumulated karma or perfections (pāramīs) (see 2.1.). Even where standard Pāli words are used, Burmese Buddhists are more familiar with the normative form of Pāli words than the stem form. The latter is used in the western scholarship. For example, ‘adhipati-paccayo’, a-di’pa-ti’pyit-sa-yaw” in Burmese, a compound ends with a normative case, is a common usage amongst the Burmese, while ‘adhipati-paccaya’, a-di’pa-ti’pyit-sa-ya in Burmese, is normally used in the western scholarship.\(^75\) I therefore provide a glossary of Pāli-Burmese-English terms, which includes standard Pāli words, Burmese transcription in Roman and Burmese scripts and English translation in Appendix I.

These transformations of Pāli loanwords have several implications for romanisation systems and translation methods to be used. Since I have interviewed both monastic and lay literati, along with ordinary Burmese informants, data gleaned during fieldwork will consist of standard Pāli terms and popular Pāli loanwords. Therefore, for the romanisation of Pāli words, I use the transliteration system of Pāli employed by the Critical Pāli Dictionary to render Pāli words as attributed in the western scholarly tradition (see Appendix A). In terms of the romanisation of Burmese words and Pāli loanwords, I adopt the ‘conventional transcription with raised comma tones’ – i.e. the conventional transcription system with raised commas as tone-markers – which is used by anthropologists and other casual writers.\(^76\) Thus, it satisfies the need to refer simply and unambiguously to people, places, products and conventional concepts. As noted by Houtman,\(^77\) we cannot afford to equate concepts in the Burmese language as equivalent to those in the Pāli tradition when translating vernacular texts and interviews. I, therefore, consider both historical and

\(^{75}\) See Appendix I for further examples.
\(^{77}\) Houtman 1990: 10-11.
contemporary contexts in which Pāli terms and Pāli loanwords are used to gain insights into the conceptions of Paṭṭhāna and Buddhist practices by Burmese Buddhists.

Use of terms

The non-English technical terms given in this thesis for general Buddhist concepts and Abhidhamma concepts are in Pāli, unless explicitly indicated otherwise. On occasion I use untranslated Pāli terms, e.g. Sāsana, dhammas, cittas, cetasikas, rūpas and kamma etc., while in some places I use the English translations of these words for the purpose of clarity. Where the translations are used, I include the Pāli terms in parentheses in order to avoid ambiguity. This implies that Pāli terms and their translations are used interchangeably as dictated by specific context. I also use the ‘Buddhist hybrid English’ neologism kammic and abhidhammadic in some places. In terms of Burmese words, I indicate clearly where they are used. English translations of Pāli or Burmese words and Pāli or Burmese titles of books are given in single inverted commas.

The Burmese word kyan” is translated here as ‘text’. As Peter Nyunt points out in his translation of the Pi-ta-kat-taw Tha-maing, the ‘Catalogue of the Piṭaka and Other Texts’, “several canonical texts are considered to be one text in several volumes in Roman script”.78 For example, while the Paṭṭhāna text is regarded as one text in five volumes (according to the 6th council edition in the Burmese Pāli canon) in western scholarship, the Burmese often refer to the Paṭṭhāna as consisting of twenty-four texts, kyan” in Burmese, because major sections of the Paṭṭhāna are regarded as

78 Nyunt 2012: 46.
separate kyan” (see 1.3.3). This means the term kyan” is sometimes translated as ‘text’ and sometimes as ‘section’.

In order to distinguish the Abhidhamma tradition in Theravāda Buddhism from the ultra-realist Abhidharma school of the Sarvāstivāda branch of Buddhism, the Pāli spelling ‘Abhidhamma’ is used in the thesis when speaking of Abhidhamma in the Theravāda context. The Sanskrit spelling ‘Abhidharma’ is used when discussing the Sarvāstivāda understandings of reality. I also use the term ‘Abhidhamma’ generically and to refer to the whole corpus of the Abhidhamma literature. In specific contexts, I use the term ‘Paṭṭhāna’ to draw attention to the Paṭṭhāna generically and to refer to the Paṭṭhāna as a text. The words ‘abhidhamma’ and ‘paṭṭhāna’ with lower case are used to refer to them as concepts, and in generic terms. For example, I sometime use the phrases ‘abhidhamma texts’ or ‘paṭṭhāna texts’ referring to abhidhamma and paṭṭhāna texts generically. In the Paṭṭhāna, there are many sections and subsections to the extent that it is impossible to differentiate them by using English terms such as ‘chapter’, ‘division’, ‘section’, and ‘part’. Names of sections in the Paṭṭhāna are therefore mainly referred to by their Pāli titles, such as the Pañhāvāra, the Saṅkhya-vāra etc. In the first occurrence and in some subsequent places, I also give English translations of these sections for the purpose of clarity.

All translations of Pāli texts and Burmese texts are mine, unless explicitly indicated otherwise. References to the Paṭṭhāna and other Pāli texts are based on the Chaṭṭha Saṅgāyana CD published by the Vipassana Research Institute. Since the complete text of the Pāli canon has been printed in Burmese script, references in the footnote on the Paṭṭhāna and other Pāli texts refer to the Chaṭṭha Saṅgāyana edition in Burmese script. Therefore, references such as ‘Paṭṭh. 1.7’ and ‘SN. 1.228-229’ refer to

79 See 1.3.2. on detailed analysis of differences between Abhidhamma in the Theravāda tradition and Abhidharma in the Sarvāstivāda tradition.
Volume 1, page 7 of the Chaṭṭha Saṅgāyana edition of the *Paṭṭhāna* and Volume 1, pages 228–229 of the Chaṭṭha Saṅgāyana edition of the *Saṃyutta Nikāya* in Burmese script respectively. For the *Visuddhimagga* and the *Abhidhammatthasaṅgha*, references are to translations by Bhikkhu Ñāṇamoḷi and Bhikkhu Bodhi respectively. So, reference in the footnote on the *Visuddhimagga*, for example, ‘Vism. XVII, 7, Ñāṇamoḷi 1991: 526’ refers to Chapter 17, paragraph 7 in Ñāṇamoḷi’s translation of the *Visuddhimagga* on page 526 in 1991 reprint.

As still widespread, I use the former name ‘Union of Burma’, ‘Burma’ in short, which has been officially renamed the ‘Republic of the Union of Myanmar’. As Burma has an ethically and religiously diverse population, it might seem incongruous to speak about Buddhists, and the Buddhist practices and cultures in Burma using broad terms such as these: ‘Burmese’ and ‘Burmese Buddhism’. To account for religious diversity within Burma is difficult. In the context of the thesis, which focuses on Buddhist cultures and practices in Burma, I nonetheless do use the term ‘Burmese’ to refer to Buddhists who hold nationality of ‘Union of Burma’, and/or regard themselves as nationals of Burma. This means that the term ‘Burmese’ here does not exclusively refer to Burman ethnic group. I fully acknowledge that such general usage of the broad term ‘Burmese’ is far from being satisfactory to account for ethnic and religious diversity in Burma. On occasion I use the phrase ‘Shan Buddhism’, and make references to scholarly studies undertaken by Western scholars. This is to distinguish the Buddhism of the Shan ethnic group in eastern, highland Burma from the Buddhism of what might be called lowland Burma.

In Burmese Buddhism, the word ‘Hsayadaw’, more popularly written as ‘Sayadaw’ when romanised, literally means ‘royal teacher.’ Historically it was used to refer to senior monks who were teachers of Burmese kings, honouring their Dhamma knowledge. Now, it is used to refer to a senior monk or an abbot of a monastery or a
meditation centre. The word Hsayadaw is used with honorific titles, names of monastery/meditation centre, or names of (birth) places of the monk. In the case of Mo”hynin” Hsayadaw, for example, the word ‘Mo”hynin”’ refers to the Mo”hynin” Forest Monastery where Ven. U Sumana lived, composed Buddhist commentarial texts and practised meditation. Therefore, he is known as the Mo”hynin” Hsayadaw. As for Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw Ven. U Nārada, the phrase ‘Mula’ Pa-htan”’, literally means ‘original/root Paṭṭhāna’, is used to indicate his originality of the paṭṭhāna pedagogy that uses tables (see Chapter 4 and 5). Thus, the phrase differentiates him from other paṭṭhāna monastic teachers. In this thesis, I use a combination of Pāli ordination names with or without the English ‘Ven.’ and the honorific names, e.g. Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw Ven. U Nārada, on the first occurrence. Subsequently I use the honorific name, e.g. Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw, in the main text. References to their works in footnotes are to ordination names in order to make them consistent with bibliography. It should also be noted that the words ‘U’ or ‘Ashin’ are prefixes used before ordination names, which are similar to the English ‘Mr’. When two monks have the same ordination names, I differentiate them by using honorific name. For example, there I refer to two monks who have the ordination name ‘Dhammasāmi’ – one is the Mingala Taik-thik Hsayadaw Ven. Dhammasāmi, and another is Ven. Dr. Khammai Dhammasāmi. Both have written scholarly texts, and their works are included in bibliography. In this case, I put both ordination name and the honorific name ‘Mingala Taik-thit Hsayadaw’ in parentheses when referencing his work in footnote and in bibliography. I use ordination name without ‘Ven.’ when referring to Ven. Dr. Khammai Dhammasāmi. I use the term ‘nun’ when speaking of thilashin, which literally means ‘precept-keeper’, who do not have the full bhikkhunī ordination. The religious authorities in Burma remain opposed to full bhikkhunī ordination. There is thus no fully ordained bhikkhunī in modern day Burma. Unrecognised as monastics
by the Burmese state, *thilashin* are referred to as *tha-tha-na-hnwe-win* in Burmese, ‘associates of Buddhism’, rather than as *tha-tha-na-win*, ‘insiders of Buddhism’, the phrase used for monks on their religious identification/ID card. In this thesis I nonetheless use the word ‘monastics’ to refer to both monks and nuns, unless I specifically draw distinctions between them. In terms of lay people, I use the full name such as Than Tun, Shwe Zan Aung, Daw Khin Myint and Daw Khin Hla Tin etc. in the main text and in bibliography because Burmese people do not normally have a surname.

---

CHAPTER 1

THERAVĀDA UNDERSTANDING OF CAUSALITY

This chapter explores the place and role of the *Paṭṭhāna* in the wider context of the theory of Buddhist causality from the Theravāda perspective. In particular, I shall demonstrate that the theory of Buddhist causality consists of three main ‘laws’, namely, (i) the law of *kamma* (*karma* in Sanskrit), (ii) the law of dependent origination (*paticcasamuppāda*) and (iii) the law of conditional relations (*paṭṭhāna*).\(^{81}\) I shall also suggest that considering these three laws together in the wider context not only gives a holistic view of Buddhist causality, but also highlights the complexity of the interrelationships between *dhammas*, i.e. ultimate components of the reality, (see 1.3.2.). Before turning to these three ‘laws of causality’ and the dynamic interconnectivity between them in detail (see below), I would like to point out here another way of understanding causality that developed in the Pāli commentarial period, namely the five *niyāma/niyama*. The five *niyāma* or ‘constraints’ do not alter the laws of causality examined here, but explain both how causality is not random and how certain types of causality unfold in a predictable manner (see below).\(^{82}\) The five *niyāma* are ‘action’ (*kamma*), ‘consciousness’ (*citta*), ‘season/nature’ (*utu*), ‘seed’ (*bīja*), ‘dhamma/truth’ (*dhamma*). The causality in relation to these five constraints unfolds in predictable ways that are specific to them. That is, *kamma* unfolds in the manner explained under the law of *kamma* and *paṭṭhāna* explained below; *citta* unfolds in accordance with the way consciousness is explained in dependent origination and *paṭṭhāna*; weather and plants follow patterns set by *utu*; certain types of plants grow

\(^{81}\) I thank Ven. Dr. K. Dhammasāmi for pointing this out. (Personal communication on 25/10/2010).

\(^{82}\) Crosby 2008: 59. Ledi Hsayadaw gives a detailed discussion of the five *niyāma* in his *Niyāma Dipani*. See Nyana (2000: 177–248) for the translation of Ledi’s Niyāma Dipani from Burmese into English, where the five categories are translated as follows: *utu* ‘caloric’, *bīja* ‘germinal’, *kamma* ‘moral’, *citta* ‘psychical’ and *dhamma* ‘natural phenomenal sequence’.
from their specific seeds, bija; the whole of causality as well as the extraordinary
events pertaining to the Buddha unfold in line with the Buddha’s teaching (including
all three laws given below) and his nature, which causes what otherwise might seem
to be extraordinary happenings. Thus while each of the laws below outlines the
causality that pertains to *kamma*, *citta*, and cross-life experience, any given event,
experience, phenomenon or development can be looked at holistically through the
five *niyama*, which explains the non-random, to some extent predictable,
manifestation of causality in the world. As we shall see below, this non-random and
somewhat predictable manifestation of causality can be embraced under the concept
of ‘specific conditionality’, which maps specific conditional relations between
multiple phenomena and events (see 1.2. and 1.3.4.). Although the perspective of
*niyama* developed in the commentarial period, it is not a particularly common way of
explaining causality either there or in the modern period.

Related to these three laws of causality are three types of interconnectivity
that they highlight. The first is the moral responsibility individuals or beings have for
themselves and others expressed through the primacy of intention (*cetanā*) in the law
of *kamma* – action and its subsequent repercussions. Secondly, the causes of ethically
qualified *kammas*, i.e. skilful (*kusala*), unskilful (*akusala*) or indeterminate (*abyākata*),
are highlighted in the law of dependent origination. We shall see below that the
interactions between ignorance (*avijjā*) and *kamma* produce the twelve links of

---

83 The Pāli word *abyākata*, or *avyākata*, is derived from the Pāli word byākata, which literally means
‘explained’, ‘declared’ or ‘decided’, with a negative or reversative prefix a. Therefore, *abyākata* literally
means ‘unexplained’, ‘undeclared’ or ‘undecided’ (Rhys Davids and Stede 1997: 653). In Abhidhamma, the
term *abyākata* is used to refer to *dharmas* which cannot be explained in terms of the dichotomy of
skilful and unskilful *dhammas*. This definition is given in the commentary to the Dhammsahāngani as *na
byākatātī abyākata*, *kusālakusalabhāvena akathitī atho* (As. 81): ‘The term ‘indeterminates’ is to be
understood as ‘not explained’. The meaning is that they cannot be defined in terms of being either
skilful or non-skillful’. There are four types of *abyākata-dhamma*, namely resultant consciousness (*vipāka
citta*), functional consciousness (*kiriya citta*), matter (*rūpa*) and Nibbāna. Following Karunadasa’s and
Bodhi’s translations, I shall refer to *abyākata* as ‘indeterminate’ in this thesis. When discussing the law
of *kamma*, the term *abyākata* is used to refer to *kamma* which cannot be determined in terms of the
dichotomy of skilful and unskilful actions. It refers to a *kammically* neutral action.
dependent origination. Thirdly, the ways in which dhammas are related to each other through various combinations of conditions are explained in the paṭṭhāna. Therefore, the paṭṭhāna gives a comprehensive view of causality by relating both the things themselves and the ways in which they are related (see 1.3. and Chapter 5). Thus, the paṭṭhāna describes various points not made explicit in but nonetheless underlying the laws of kamma and dependent origination as we shall see below. When discussing the law of kamma and the law of dependent origination, I shall draw upon the Paṭṭhāna to illustrate the interrelated nature of these three laws of causality.

The reason I provide this information in this chapter is because in later chapters I shall discuss various aspects of Buddhist causality in detail from the perspective of the Paṭṭhāna. The discussion of these laws of causality and the relationship between them from a theoretical perspective is therefore important for further discussions.

1.1. The law of kamma

According to the law of kamma, an action or intention will produce its karmic result (vipāka) depending on the ethical quality of the action. In the Samuddaka-sutta, the law of kamma is expressed as:

Like the seed that is sown, so is the fruit that is harvested.
The doer of good (plants and reaps) good, the doer of bad, bad.
When the seed is sown and planted, you shall experience the (appropriate) fruit.85

Along with this verse, a well-known verse in the Dhammapada illustrates the individualistic view of the law of kamma as follows.

Oneself truly is the protector of oneself;

84 SN. 1.228-229.
who else could the protector be?
With oneself fully controlled,
one gains a mastery that is hard to gain.\textsuperscript{86}

(translation Acharya Buddharakkhita 1985: 47)

One of the most frequent issues discussed or asked in relation to the law of \textit{kamma} is the link between an action and its result, given the doctrine of “not-self”, \textit{anattavāda}. The \textit{anattavāda} is the Buddhist teaching claiming that “all things (both phenomena and objects of thought) are not-self”.\textsuperscript{88} The continuity between an agent of an action and an individual who reaps the fruit of the action has attracted attention in both ancient and contemporary times. In the \textit{Milinda\apīha},\textsuperscript{89} King Milinda poses questions about dilemmas raised by Buddhist philosophy to a monk named Nāgasena. Milinda asks, “who is reborn?” Nāgasena replies, “one does a good or evil deed with (one) name-and-form, because of this deed another name-and-form is reborn”.\textsuperscript{91} Nāgasena argues that phenomena in sequence are connected, the latter being ‘produced from’ the former. For instance, “a man who has stolen some mangoes claims himself to be innocent of theft, on the grounds that the mangoes he stole were different from the mangoes the owner had planted”.\textsuperscript{92} This does not mean that moral responsibility is abrogated because the stolen fruit exists ‘in (causal) dependence’ on the seeds planted by the owner.\textsuperscript{93} The issues of continuity through \textit{kamma} and \textit{kammic} responsibility are highlighted by contemporary scholars, for example, Richard Gombrich\textsuperscript{94} and Steven

\textsuperscript{86} “\textit{Attā hi attano nātho, ko hi nātho paro siyā?, attanā va sudantena, nātham labhati dullabhama}”. Dhammapada verse 160; \textit{Dhp.} 37.
\textsuperscript{87} Collins 1982: 96.
\textsuperscript{88} In Pāli, “\textit{sa\textsuperscript{b}be dhamm\textsuperscript{m} anatt\textsuperscript{a}”}.
\textsuperscript{89} It is a Buddhist text, which purports to record a dialogue in which the Indo-Greek king Menander I (Milinda in Pāli) of Bactria poses questions on Buddhism to the monk Nāgasena. The oldest part might have been composed between 100 BCE and 200 CE (von Hinüber 1996: 85).
\textsuperscript{90} In Pāli, ‘\textit{ko patisandahati?’} literally means ‘Who reconnects?’ \textit{Mil.} 45., cited in Collins 1982: 185 and 293, endnote 1.
\textsuperscript{91} \textit{Mil.} 45, cited in Collins 1982: 185.
\textsuperscript{92} Collins 1982: 185.
\textsuperscript{93} Collins 1982: 187.
Collins. Gombrich summarises the law of *kamma* in terms of individualistic *kamma* as “everyone is ultimately responsible for themselves”, and thus “Buddhism is religious individualism”.

I shall refer to the view of the law of *kamma* in terms of individualistic *kamma* – i.e. an individual action, Ac, leading to an individual experienced result, Ae – as the theory of individualistic *kamma*. I shall also propose that the theory of individualistic *kamma* is incomplete from the perspective of the Buddhist laws of causality as a whole. This is because the individual action, Ac, can lead to multiple *kammic* results not only for the agent of the action in a direct relationship, but also for other people who are affected by the action in an indirect way. The implication is that the *kamma* of an individual can have a wider impact for oneself and others, and there are ‘spillovers’ from an individual action. Thus, *kammic* responsibility, i.e. responsibility for one’s *kamma*, extends beyond oneself such that a *kamma* of an individual can affect others and one can be affected by the *kamma* of others.

A number of relatively recent textual and anthropological studies by scholars, for example, Jonathan Walters, Kate Crosby, and Jeffery Samuels look at how Pali Buddhism and Theravāda Buddhists understand the wider effects of *kammic* actions upon society. I shall refer to these arguments collectively as the theory of socio-*kamma*. Walter convincingly argues that an understanding of socio-*kamma*, i.e. one’s action affecting others across time and space, vice versa, is present in Buddhist texts, drawing on canonical sources. Crosby, drawing upon both textual and anthropological evidence, analyses a range of local interpretations of *kammic* theory in relation to the Tsunami disaster in Sri Lanka in 2004. Crosby notes that local Sri Lankan see such

---

96 Gombrich 2009: 16.
97 Gombrich 2006: 73.
99 Crosby 2008: 53-76.
100 Samuels 2008: 123-147.
disaster as a product of collective kamma. Samuels’ paper also brings out such nuances in local understandings of giving (dāna), one of the ten skilful actions (dasakusalakamma), by Sri Lankan villagers in relation to the theory of merit-making.

We have, so far, seen that in contemporary scholarship, scholars have written on the law of kamma from the perspectives of individualistic kamma and socio-kamma. Drawing upon the theory of socio-kamma, I shall discuss the law of kamma from the perspective of Abhidhamma in order to illustrate the dynamic relationships between individual, specific actions. On the basis of Samuels’ work on contemporary understandings of giving (dāna) and making merit, I shall also discuss both cognitive and affective qualities of volition (cetanā), a synonym of kamma, from the perspective of Abhidhamma.

Kamma, in terms of Buddhist psychology, i.e. the analysis of the mind and mental process, is referred to as volition or intention (cetanā). The term ‘cetanā’, ‘volition’, appears in the Sutta Piṭaka. According to the Nibbhedhika-sutta, the Buddha said the following.

\[
\text{Cetanāhaṁ bhikkhave kammaṁ vadāmi, cetayitvā kammaṁ karoti kāyena vācāya manasā.}
\]

Volition, O monks, I call kamma. With volition, one does kamma by way of body, speech, and mind.\(^{102}\)

From the perspective of Abhidhamma, volition (cetanā) is an important aspect when generating kamma because it is the volition which determines the ethical quality of the action – whether that action is physical, verbal or mental.\(^{103}\) Volition is a mental factor (cetasika) that co-arises with each consciousness (citta).\(^{104}\) As a cetasika, volition organises its other associated mental factors and consciousness, and directs the

---

\(^{101}\) Crosby 2008: 61–62.

\(^{102}\) AN. 2.363.

\(^{103}\) Bodhi 2010: 80.

\(^{104}\) Volition (cetanā), along with contact (phassa), feeling (vedanā), perception (saññā), one-pointedness (ekaggatā), mental life-faculty (jīvītindriya) and attention (manasikāra), are called 7 universal cetasikas (sabbacittasādhāraṇa). See Appendix E for the list of cetasikas.
associated mental states to accomplish their functions. For example, the *Paṭṭhāna* discusses the *kamma* condition (*kamma-paccaya*), which is one of the 24 conditions (*paccayas*) (see 4.3.1. and Table 4.5.), in terms of volition. It indicates that volition can be a conditioning state for the simultaneous arising of its associated states, namely the associated consciousness and mental factors, matter which arises due to the mind (*cittajarūpa*), and matter that arises due to *kamma* (*kammajarūpa*). Therefore, it is stated in Pāli as follows:

\[\text{Cetanā sampayuttakānaṃ dhammānaṃ taṃsamatthānānānca rūpānāṃ kammapaccayena paccayo.}\]  

Volition is a condition, by means of being a *kamma*-type condition, for both the *dhammas* connected with it and the matter that arises from them.

“The implication is that the mental states and the material *dhammas* [i.e. matter originated in mind, and matter originated in *kamma*] in question are determined, fashioned and impelled by the force of volition (*cetanā*)”.\(^{106}\) The example, therefore, illustrates that there are multiple mental and material results for oneself due to one’s own volition. It also shows the cognitive quality of *cetanā* in that it impels a person to do bodily or verbal or mental actions.

In addition to such direct effects of one’s own *kamma*, his/her volition can be the main cause of a wider impact on others, as mentioned above. For example, a person may have the volition (*cetanā*) to do giving (*dāna*) for monks and lay people in his/her community.\(^{107}\) Such volition prompts him/her to undertake the organisation and coordination necessary for the event. In this case, the associated states of his/her volition (*cetanā*) will be skilful consciousnesses (*kusala-cittas*) and their associated mental factors (*cetasikas*), and matter that originates from these mental states (*cittajarūpa*), including the physical action of giving. As for the recipients, both monks

\(^{105}\) *Paṭṭh. 1.7.*

\(^{106}\) Karunadasa 2010: 272.

\(^{107}\) I select *dāna* as an example because of its centrality to Buddhist notions of virtuous conduct.
and lay people, such an act of generosity will also generate happiness and smiles (see below). In turn, the donor is also happy as he/she is pleased with the whole giving event. In terms of Abhidhamma, happiness is a skilful mental state and gives rise to a positive physical gesture such as a smile. Smiles are the manifestation of matters (rūpa) that originate in these uplifting mental states which arise from the generosity of another person. This abhidhammic analysis of volition in relation to dāna aligns with Samuels’ observation regarding volition having an affective quality. As Samuels suggests, the interrelatedness between the donor and the recipients makes the ways in which intention or cetanā has been understood more complex. Therefore, an action, such as the volition to do dāna, can generate both a direct and an indirect impact on both oneself and on others. Thus, the law of kamma viewed from the perspective of Abhidhamma highlights nuances of dynamic relationships between one’s own action and one’s kammic responsibility for oneself and others.

Another issue discussed in Samuels’ paper, which is also relevant here, concerns how one’s volition can change over time. As one of his Sri Lankan informants points out, the three types of volition in this context – volition preceding a donative act, accompanying a donative act, and following a donative act – may affect the amount of merit being accrued. By drawing upon the teachings in the Paṭṭhāna, we can relate how one’s intention may change over time – i.e. prior, during and post-merit making periods. For instance, the Paṭṭhāna explains how a skilful mind or good heart can change into an unskilful state, and vice versa. One of the 24 conditions of

---

108 See f.n. 6 for the reason for the use of ‘matter’ in the plural.
109 On the basis of the Abhidhammatthasangaha, a ‘smile’ is a form of bodily intimation (kāya-viññatti). Intimation (viññatti) is that by means of which one communicates one’s ideas, feelings, and attitudes to another. There are two means of intimation or self expression - i.e. bodily intimation (kāya-viññatti) and vocal intimation (vacī-viññatti). The bodily intimation is a special modification in the consciousness-originated air element, i.e. air element that is originated from consciousness, which causes the body to move in ways that reveal one’s intentions. For detailed discussions of the two means of intimation, see Bodhi (2010: 241), Karunadasa (2010: 189-198) and Janakābhivaṃsa (1995: 475-478).
110 Samuels 2008: 130.
the Paṭṭhāna (see Table 4.5.) is the ‘decisive-support condition’ (upanissaya-paccaya).

For example, a skilful state of mind such as non-greed (alobha) arises prior to merit-making, which prompts giving (dāna) – such as building a dhamma hall in a monastery. However, after the dāna, for example, an unskilful state of mind such as obsessive delight (rāga) might arise, which is the opposite of alobha. Having done the dāna, the sponsor might now cling onto the title of being the donor of the dhamma hall and/or the building as one’s own. Here, alobha – the initial volition – assists rāga to arise by being a strong inducement. Once the building is done, it also becomes a desirable and important object for the mind of the donor, and thus he/she develops clinging to it. In this particular case, the positive conditioning state, alobha, and the negative conditioned state, rāga, is related through the decisive-support condition (upanissaya-paccaya). The relationship between them is stated in the Paṭṭhāna as follows.

\[
\text{Kusalo dhammo akusalassa dhammassa upanissayapaccayena paccayo.} \ldots \\
\text{dānam datvā sīlaṃ samādiyitvā uposathakammam katvā taṃ gaurum katvā assādeti abhinandati, taṃ gaurum katvā rāgo uppajjati, diṭṭhi uppajjati.}^{112}
\]

A skilful state is a condition for an unskilful state by means of being a decisive-support condition. . . . Having made a gift, having undertaken the precepts, having observed the uposatha, having credited that with exceptional importance, one enjoys and rejoices. As a result of crediting that with importance, obsessive delight arises, wrong-view arises.

Thus, the Paṭṭhāna explains that skilful actions can lead to the arising of unskilful actions through the decisive-support condition. In this example, the initial skilful volition changes into unskilful mental states following the donative act.

In sum, we have encountered the law of kamma from the perspectives of individualistic kamma, socio-kamma and Abhidhamma. The theory of socio-kamma and abhidhammic analysis of the law of kamma offer interesting perspectives as they explicate an interconnected network of causes and effects. Moreover, we can say that consideration of the teachings in the Paṭṭhāna not only illustrates various points not

---

112 Paṭṭh. 1.146.
made explicit in but nonetheless underlying the law of kamma, but also provides a better understanding of the complexity of the Buddhist causality.

1.2. The law of dependent origination (*paṭiccasamuppāda*)

The law of dependent origination is regarded as the most fundamental teaching of the Buddha and it is often seen as the main teaching on Buddhist causality. In the *Samyutta Nikāya*, the ‘Connected Discourses of the Buddha’, there is a section on causation, the *Nidāna-samyutta*, discussing the law of dependent origination. According to the *Paccaya-sutta*, within the *Nidāna-samyutta*, the law of causality naturally exist in the world, regardless of whether the Buddha arises or not, as shown below.

This conditionality [i.e. birth as a condition, ageing and death comes to be] remains [as] the natural condition, the real nature of Dhamma [and] the natural constraint by Dhamma, whether Tathāgatas are present or absent [in the world].

A general expression used in the discourses when discussing the causal relationship, such as in the *Assutavā-sutta*,\(^{114}\) is:

> When there is this, that comes to be; with the arising of this, that arises.  
> When this is absent, that does not come to be; with the cessation of this, that ceases.

(translation Bodhi 1995: 2)

In other words, when there is ignorance (*avijjā*) – the first of twelve factors of the dependent origination (see below) – volitional formation (*sāṅkhāra*) comes to be; with the arising of ignorance, volitional formation arises. When ignorance is absent, volitional formation does not come to be; with the cessation of ignorance, volitional formation ceases.

\(^{113}\) SN. 1.264-265.  
\(^{114}\) SN. 1.319-320.
The dependent origination in the *Paṭiccasamuppāda-sutta*\(^{15}\) is explained by the Buddha as follows:

And, what is the dependent origination, bhikkhus? With ignorance as condition there are volitional formations; with formation as condition, consciousness; with consciousness as condition, mentality-materiality; with mentality-materiality as condition, the sixfold base; with the sixfold base as condition, craving; with craving as condition, clinging; with clinging as condition, becoming; with becoming as condition, birth; with birth as condition there is ageing-and-death, and sorrow, lamentation, pain, grief, and despair; thus there is the arising of this whole mass of suffering. This is called the dependent origination, bhikkhus.

(translation ṇānamoḷi 1991:525)

Each of the twelve factors – beginning with ignorance through to ageing-and-death – is a condition for the arising of the subsequent factor. For example, with ignorance as condition, volitional formation comes to be. Therefore, volitional formation arises only when there is ignorance; it does not arise when there are other conditions.

Such dependent arising of factors is called ‘specific conditionality’ (idappaccayatā: idam+paccayatā = this+condition), not just any random conditionality.\(^{16}\)

‘Specific conditionality’ is a relationship of indispensability and dependency: the indispensability of the condition (e.g. birth) to the arisen state (e.g. ageing and death), and the dependency of the arisen state upon its condition. Thus ageing and death cannot come about without birth preceding them. The condition ‘birth’ cannot be substituted by an alternative condition. It is indispensable for ageing and death, and ageing and death are dependent on it. Gombrich also refers to the ‘non-random’ nature of causality when discussing the theory of *kamma*. He explains that experience consists of processes, and those processes are neither random nor strictly determined.\(^{17}\) By determinism, Gombrich is referring to the notion that outcomes are pre-ordained. Such non-randomness and non-strict determinism would then be in line with the specific conditionality. The specific conditionality avoids both extremes

\(^{15}\) SN. 1.243-244.


\(^{17}\) Gombrich 2009: 129.
of random causation and strict determinism because it ensures that the conditioning thing is indispensable for the conditioned thing, and that the latter is dependent on the former. Therefore, explicit causal relationships can be identified. It does not however mean that one cannot influence or change the outcome of the causal relationships, i.e. the outcome is not strictly determined. Strict determinism, i.e. a world view that one cannot influence the outcome in the future, is inconsistent with the law of *kamma*, and it might also imply that there would be no escape from the circle of existence (*saṃsāra*), unless such escape was predetermined. Specific conditionality, which is a middle approach between randomness and strict determinism, ensures that an individual can break free from the circle of existence as a result of their own endeavour, as we shall see below. The above example of specific conditionality with reference to dependent origination shows the conditional relationships between one cause and one effect. We shall see below in more detail that there are conditional relationships involving multiple causes and effects. These conditional relations are also in line with the principle of specific conditionality, namely the indispensability of causes to their effects and the dependency of effects on their causes. I shall, therefore, suggest that specific conditionality can be understood as conditional relationships of indispensability and dependency involving a multiplicity of causes and effects. Thus, in the broader context of Buddhist causality, specific conditionality highlights and maps specific conditional relationships and links between different, multiple things.

According to Bhikkhu Bodhi, the linear sequential formula of dependent origination, as found in the *Sutta Pițaka*, should not be taken to imply that they fit together in a temporally progressive chain of causes and effects.\(^{118}\) Although dependent origination deals only with twelve factors, it considers the most

---

\(^{118}\) Bodhi 1995: 10.
fundamental experiences of existence, such as birth, ageing and death. As noted by Bodhi, the configuration of twelve links is made for the purpose of instruction. David Kalupahana, like Bodhi, observes that the attention of the Buddhists during the period of the Nikāyas was mainly directed to the immediate need of putting an end to suffering.\textsuperscript{119} Such a practical purpose of the law of dependent origination is reflected in its linear configuration. Kalupahana writes,

> As the practical way of solving the problem of pain (dukkha) the Buddhists made an attempt to show the most important factors in the life-flux with a view to enable one to get rid of these and thus put an end to pain.\textsuperscript{120}

While we find such a linear configuration of dependent origination in suttas such as the Paṭiccasamuppāda-vibhaṅga-sutta and the Kaccāyanagotta-sutta in the Samyutta Nikāya, a more complex configuration of the interrelationships between factors across time (and/or existences) can be found in the Paṭisambhidāmagga, and throughout the post-canonical commentarial period, from 5 th-century commentarial texts such as Buddhaghosa’s manual, the Visuddhimagga, the ‘path of purification’, to the teachings of the modern period such as those of the Mogok Hsayadaw Ven. U Vimala (1899-1962), the founder of the Mogok insight (vipassanā) meditation tradition in Burma. Drawing upon the Visuddhimagga and Mogok Hsayadaw’s teachings, I shall explain various aspects of the more complex configuration of the law of dependent origination and discuss how it has been used to explain/explore meditative experiences in the Burmese meditation traditions.

Based on the Visuddhimagga, Mogok Hsayadaw teaches interdependent relationships between the factors by focusing on eight aspects of the dependent origination. The eight aspects of the dependent origination are: 1) twelve factors, 2) three periods/existences, 3) three circles, 4) four causal relationships, 5) twenty qualities/modes of four causal relationships, 6) two roots, 7) two noble truths, and 8)

\textsuperscript{119} Kalupahana 1961: 188.
\textsuperscript{120} Kalupahana 1961: 188.
three links.\textsuperscript{121} In 1960, Mogok Hsayadaw, on the basis of a diagram of the dependent origination drawn by Maing”hkaing Hsayadaw, developed a visual representation of the eight aspects, and each component in these aspects.\textsuperscript{122} These aspects are shown in Figure 1.1.

\footnotesize
\textsuperscript{121} These eight aspects are found in \textit{Vism.} XVII, 284-314. See Nānamoli 1991: 596-604 for a detailed explanation of these aspects.
\textsuperscript{122} Ghosita 2002: 344-346.
Figure 1.1. The *paṭiccasamuppāda* cycle, known in Burmese as *mogok-pa’tika’tha’makpat-sakwaing*”, developed by the Mogok Hsayadaw in 1960.

Here, the lateral, interdependent relationships between the twelve factors are visually represented in the diagram as the wheel of becoming. The twelve factors work in a cyclical way that traps an individual within the round of rebirth (*saṃsāra*). An ongoing process of the round of rebirth is shown by the four arrows labelled as 1, 2, 3, and 4. If and when the twelve factors are broken, one can then break free from the round of rebirth.

---

123 Figure 1.1. is a translated version of the *paṭiccasamuppāda* cycle, which is officially recognised by the Mogok insight meditation tradition. Retrieved from [http://www.thisismyanmar.com/nibbana/tdaing2.htm](http://www.thisismyanmar.com/nibbana/tdaing2.htm) on 24 Feb 2013.
rebirth, which is shown by the breaks between different sections within the circle labelled as ‘link’. For clarity, I have simplified the information shown in Figure 1.1., and represented it in the table below. On the basis of the table, I shall explain the information presented in the diagram, and discuss the eight aspects such as twelve factors, three periods/existences, and three circles, etc. of the dependent origination.\textsuperscript{124}

\textsuperscript{124} I shall not explain in detail the meaning and interpretation of each of the twelve factors as explicated by Buddhaghosa in the Visuddhimagga in this thesis since this is not my primary focus here. See Vism. XVII, 58-270 in Nānamoli (1991: 539-593) for a detailed explanation of the twelve factors.
Table 1.1. Detailed analysis of the dependent origination on the basis of the Visuddhimagga and the paṭiccasamuppāda cycle drawn by Mogok Hsayadaw

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>12 factors</th>
<th>3 existences</th>
<th>3 circles</th>
<th>4 kinds of causal relationships</th>
<th>20 modes</th>
<th>The 1st and 2nd Noble Truths</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. ignorance (avijjā)</td>
<td>Past Existence</td>
<td>circle of defilement (kilesa-vatṭa)</td>
<td>Past causal continuum</td>
<td>ignorance, volitional formation, craving, clinging and becoming</td>
<td>The truth of origin of suffering (dukkhasamudaya-sacca)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. volitional formations (saṅkhāra)</td>
<td></td>
<td>circle of action (kamma-vatṭa)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. consciousness (viññāṇa)</td>
<td>Present Existence</td>
<td>circle of result (vipāka-vatṭa)</td>
<td>Present resultant continuum</td>
<td>consciousness, name and form, six sense bases, contact and feeling</td>
<td>The truth of suffering (dukkha-sacca)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. name and form (nāmarūpa)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. six sense bases (saḷāyatana)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. contact (phassa)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. sensation (vedanā)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. craving (tanhā)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. clinging (upādāna)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. kammically caused-becoming (kamma-bhava)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. rebirth (jāti)</td>
<td>Future Existence</td>
<td>circle of result (vipāka-vatṭa)</td>
<td>Future resultant continuum</td>
<td>consciousness, name and form, six sense bases, contact and feeling</td>
<td>The truth of suffering (dukkha-sacca)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. ageing and death (jarāmarāṇa)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The twelve factors or links make up the circle of existence connecting, according to the Visuddhimagga, past, present and future existences. The first two links pertain to the past life; the next eight links pertain to the present life, and the last two correspond to the future life or rebirth. In other words, ignorance (avijjā) and volitional formation (sankhāra) of the past life are the conditions leading to the present life, and factors from consciousness (viññana) (which is interpreted as rebirth-linking consciousness in the Visuddhimagga) to becoming (bhava) of the present life are the conditions for the future life. Mogok Hsayadaw elaborates 'becoming' (bhava) as 'karmically caused becoming' (kamma-bhava). Thus, action (kamma) causes rebirth (jāti). In other words, action or volition (see above) can be understood as a cause of suffering in that it causes rebirth to arise, which then leads to the arising of old-age and death (jarāmaraṇa).

In addition to the analysis of the twelve factors over three periods, Buddhaghosa highlights causal relationships between these factors by re-configuring them in terms of three circles (tīvatṭa), four kinds of causal relationships (catubhedasaṅgaha) and twenty modes (vīsatīkārāra) of the ‘wheel of becoming/life’ (bhavacakka). It can be suggested that through such lateral analysis of the twelve factors, Buddhaghosa reconfigures and explains the relationships between the twelve factors in terms of multiple causes and multiple effects, which will be explored below.

The spinning of the wheel of existence can be understood as in terms of the three circles, which are shown in the third column in Table 1.1. The circle of defilement (kilesa-vatṭa) consists of ignorance, craving and clinging, which are unskilful qualities and defile the associated mental states. (The following explanation is based on reading from top to bottom along the third column, and the

126 Mogok Wi’pat-tha-na Pyan’pwa’ylei’a-hpwe’ 1996: 127-159.
corresponding factors are found in the first column.) Due to ignorance, i.e. ignorance of the truth of suffering, we then perform actions (*kamma*). Volitional formation (*saṅkhāra*) conditions things, and thus it is essentially a *kammic* force. Volitional formation therefore is one of the two components of the round of *kamma* (*kamma-vaṭṭa*); the other being kammically caused becoming, i.e. *kamma-bhava*. Due to defilements, i.e. ignorance, one performs *kamma*. *Kamma*, in this case, is volitional formation (*saṅkhāra*). These two factors, namely ignorance and volitional formation, pertain to the past existence. The volitional formation then leads to the arising of results in the present existence, which are consciousness (*viññāṇa*), name and form (*nāmarūpa*), six sense bases (*saḷāyatana*), contact (*phassa*), and feeling (*vedanā*). The group of five is thus called the circle of result (*vipāka-vaṭṭa*). The round of rebirth does not stop there at feeling because it gives rise to craving (*tanḥā*) in the present existence. For example, having eaten a tasty cake with very pleasant texture previously, we might develop craving for such taste and texture. So, we are highly likely to buy it, or make it for ourselves, to satisfy our want. Thus we perform actions that cause a new becoming, i.e. *kamma-bhava*, in the present existence (see the second column in Table 1.1.). Therefore, the circle of result leads to the arising of the circle of defilement, which in turn generate actions, and thus there is the circle of *kamma*. (This is found in Table 1.1. column three reading from top to bottom.) Yet, the wheel of becoming continues to spin as there are *kammic* results of individual actions in the future, namely birth, and ageing and death. Therefore, the circle of defilement, the circle of *kamma* and the circle of result are linked in the causal relationships keeping an individual within the round of rebirth so long as the defilements such as ignorance, craving and clinging are not cut off.\(^{129}\) Of these defilements, according to the *Visuddhimagga*, ignorance and craving should be understood as the main causes, i.e.

\(^{129}\) *Vism*. XVII, 298, ṇānamoli 1991: 599.
the root (mūla) of the circle of existence. \textsuperscript{130} This is because ignorance is the main cause in the past existence, giving rise to the subsequent factors ending in feeling. Craving is then the root cause in the present existence leading to the arising of the subsequent resultant factors in the present and future existences. Therefore, these two factors are shown at the centre of Figure 1.1., and they are highlighted in red in Table 1.1.

In the section called ‘wheel of becoming/life’ (bhavacakka) of the Visuddhimagga, Buddhaghosa reconfigures the twelve factors in the chain of dependent origination in terms of four kinds of causal relationships that span across the past, present and future existences, which are shown in the fourth column in Table 1.1. \textsuperscript{131} In order to understand these four kinds of causal relationships, I shall explain the information listed in the fourth and fifth columns in Table 1.1. in conjunction. This is because these four kinds of causal relationships, which are a reconfiguration of the 12 factors, should be understood with reference to the twenty modes of the wheel of becoming (see column four and five in Table 1.1.). The first causal relation consists of five factors, namely, ignorance, volitional formation, craving, clinging and becoming. This causal relation is termed by Mogok Hsayadaw as a’teik-a’kyaung-a’hkyin-a’ya-nga’pa” in Burmese, the ‘5 past causal continuum’. \textsuperscript{132} Although the first two, i.e. ignorance and volitional formation, are the factors mentioned initially as the past causes, Buddhaghosa here explains that “one who is ignorant hankers, and hankering, clings, and with his clinging as condition there is becoming, therefore craving, clinging and becoming are included [as causes in the past] as well”. \textsuperscript{133} These five past causes then give rise to the resultants in the present existence, i.e. the ‘5 present resultant continuum’, which consists of consciousness,

\textsuperscript{130} Vism. XVII, 284-286, Nāṇamoli 1991: 596.
\textsuperscript{131} Vism. XVII, 290, Nāṇamoli 1991: 597.
\textsuperscript{132} Here, I have kept the English translation, e.g. ‘past causal continuum’, ‘present resultant continuum’, etc., that appears in Figure 1.1.
\textsuperscript{133} Vism. XVII, 292, Nāṇamoli 1991: 597.
name and form, six sense bases, contact and feeling. As mentioned above, craving that follows feeling is the root cause of subsequent factors in the present existence. Therefore, with craving as condition, clinging and becoming arise, and they are the three initial present causes. In addition to these three factors, ignorance is also included as a present causal factor because it is associated with craving and clinging. As we have seen above, ignorance causes an individual to develop craving and perform kamma, which is synonymous with volitional formation (saṅkhāra) (see above). In other words, ignorance and volitional formation are closely associated factors. Thus, they – along with craving, clinging and becoming – are referred to as the ‘5 present causal continuum’, i.e. 5 causal factors in the present existence. These causes in the present life then lead to the arising of consciousness, name and form, six sense bases, contact and feeling in the future existence. It may seem that there is a discrepancy between the configuration of these five factors as resultants in the present life and the configuration of two factors - i.e. rebirth and old-age and death - as resultants in relation to the circle of result (vipāka-vaṭṭa). For Buddhaghosa, the consciousness factor of the dependent origination is understood in terms of rebirth-linking consciousness, namely, (re)birth (jāti). Therefore, consciousness is synonymous with birth. Moreover, the term ‘old-age and death’ refers to the ageing and the death of these five resultant factors, i.e. the death of consciousness, name and form, six sense bases, contact and feeling.134 These five resultant factors are referred to as the ‘5 future resultant continuum’ because they will arise in the future existence as the effects of the five causal factors in the present existence, i.e. craving, clinging, becoming, ignorance and volitional formation (see column five in Table 1.1.).

As we can see from column two, four and five of Table 1.1., more complex processes occur between the 12 factors within and across existences. Therefore, the

---

Visuddhimagga has reinterpreted the law of dependent origination to move it away from seeing it as being about an individual moving from one life to another, to an analysis of processes that work within and across lives. In my MA dissertation, I have shown that the conception of the law of kamma and its effects held by the Burmese span across and within past, present and future lifetimes. This is because the majority of my informants, i.e. over 90%, believe that the effects of present kamma in this life may occur in either the present lifetime or future lifetimes depending on the types of kamma that one has done.\(^{135}\) Therefore, the understanding of the law of kamma by the Burmese aligns with Buddhaghosa’s reinterpretation of the law of kamma in the Visuddhimagga rather than the interpretation of some modern interpreters such as Ven. Buddhadāsa of Thailand. Buddhadāsa—based on the second book of the Abhidhamma Piṭaka, the Vibhaṅga\(^{136}\)—interprets the consciousness factor of the dependent origination as consciousness that arises at each moment in the current life. Buddhadāsa explains that the factors of the dependent origination pertain to past, present and future in this life, rather than across three existences.\(^{137}\)

In addition to the analysis of the dependent origination in terms of causal relationships, Buddhaghosa also identifies the causal links in terms of the first and second noble truths of the Four Noble Truths,\(^{138}\) which is shown in the final column of Table 1.1. The first causal link – i.e. ignorance as condition, volitional formation arises – can be understood in terms of the truth of the origin of suffering (dukkhasamudaya-sacca), which is the second noble truth. The next five causal relationships from consciousness to feeling correspond with the truth of suffering (dukkha-sacca). With ignorance and volitional formation as the origins/causes of suffering, suffering arises in the present existence. As we have seen above, craving, clinging and becoming are

\(^{135}\) See Kyaw 2010: 45-46 and 66-67 on detailed analysis of the results from fieldwork.

\(^{136}\) Vibh. 142; Thīṭṭila 1995: 181.

\(^{137}\) See Jackson (1987) and Kyaw (2011) on Buddhadāsa’s interpretations of dependent origination.

then conditioned by the preceding factors. They condition the arising of the subsequent factors, i.e. birth, and ageing and death, and thus they are referred to as the truth of the origin of suffering giving rise to more suffering. Therefore, the wheel of becoming continues spinning in terms of the origin of suffering, i.e. the second noble truth, which causes more suffering, i.e. the first noble truth.

Turning to the application of the teaching of the dependent origination in meditation practices, as Mogok Hsayadaw teaches, one can break free from the round of rebirth at three links in the cycle. These three links are shown by the dotted lines in Table 1.1. The three links are between volitional formation (saṅkhāra) and consciousness (viññāna), feeling (vedanā) and craving (tanhā), and kammically caused becoming (kamma-bhava) and birth (jāti). Essentially, these escape routes, as it were, from the round of rebirth are the connections between the origin of suffering and suffering itself (see columns one and five in Table 1.1.).

Drawing upon Mogok Hsayadaw’s dhamma talks on vipassanā practice, which are based on the causal chain of the dependent origination and selected discourses (suttas), I shall explain how the chain can be broken at the connection between feeling (vedanā) and craving (tanhā). Mogok Hsayadaw emphasises the importance of intellectual understanding of the Dhamma, particularly that of the law of dependent origination. According to him, one must listen to the dhamma-talks given by meditation teachers, while one is reflecting on one’s own aggregates (khandhā). In terms of practice, it is important to remove the wrong view of eternalism (sassata) and nihilism (uccheda) at the very beginning of one’s vipassanā practice. Mogok Hsayadaw’s approach then focuses on the process of contemplating on mind (cittānupassanā) and feeling (vedanānupassanā) through which one discovers that all

139 Kyaw 2012a: 10.
things are but a process of arising and vanishing.\textsuperscript{141} In his approach, the awareness of breath is regarded as ‘home’, \textit{ein-the} in Burmese, because it is the main mental object of one’s awareness during meditation.\textsuperscript{142} For instance, a meditator begins his/her meditation sitting with the awareness of breath. If sensation - pleasant or unpleasant or neutral - arises, then the sensation is regarded as ‘guest’, \textit{e’the} in Burmese.\textsuperscript{143} The meditator then should be aware of arrival of the guest, i.e. arising of the sensation, and should stay with the sensation as his/her mental object until the sensation disappears. Then, his/her awareness should be directed back to breath because breath is the home of the awareness. Through awareness of arising and vanishing of the sensation, the link between sensation or feeling (\textit{vedanā}) and craving (\textit{tañhā}) is broken.\textsuperscript{144} If, on the other hand, the meditator is not aware of the arising of the sensation, then craving (\textit{tañhā}) arises because, according to the law of dependent origination, craving automatically arises when sensation is present. With awareness of the sensation, the meditator discovers arising and vanishing of the sensation. When the sensation vanishes, craving does not arise. That is, \textit{vedanā-nirodhā}, \textit{tañhā-nirodho}, ‘with the cessation of sensation, craving ceases’.\textsuperscript{145} If one sees sensation – pleasant or unpleasant or neutral – as mere sensation with no personalisation of the sensation, one stops the spinning of the circle of dependent origination and thus breaks free from it. While there are three escape routes, Mogok Hsayadaw teaches that a meditator should aim to break the chain between feeling and craving through cultivation of one’s mind because, out of the 12 factors, feeling is where experiences are most obvious and distinctive.\textsuperscript{146}

\textsuperscript{141} Dhammasāmi 2012: 167.
\textsuperscript{142} Mogok Wi’pat-tha-na Fyan’pwa”yel’a-hpwe’ 1996: \textit{gha’}.
\textsuperscript{143} Ghosita 2002: 271.
\textsuperscript{144} Ghosita 2002: 272.
\textsuperscript{145} Ghosita 2002: 272-273.
\textsuperscript{146} Ghosita 2002: 278-280.
My intention here has not been to explore in detail how the teaching of dependent origination is put into practice in the Mogok meditation tradition in this thesis. Rather, I draw on some aspects of teaching given by Mogok Hsayadaw to illustrate how and why, according to some Burmese meditation traditions including the Mogok tradition, meditators should acquire a theoretical understanding of dependent origination and ultimate realities as described in the Abhidhamma through listening to dhamma talks and reading. Meditators undertake their meditation practices on the basis of such theoretical knowledge (see Introduction). Therefore, in the eyes of Burmese Buddhists, the interdependent relationships between the twelve factors of the dependent origination are the topic of intense study, which in turn serves as a core foundation for meditation practices.\textsuperscript{147}

We have seen above that the twelve factors of the dependent origination are interconnected in a lateral way like a spider-web. Moreover, such interconnectedness and interactions between different factors of the dependent origination attests to the theory of socio-kamma, i.e. one’s actions affecting oneself and others across time and space. For instance, we have seen that the first causal link between ignorance and volitional formation/kamma generates the arising of subsequent causal relationships across different time periods. In addition, action, for example, arises due to and together with ignorance, craving, clinging and becoming, and thus this group of five factors acts as causes for another group of five factors, namely from consciousness to feeling (see Table 1.1.). Therefore, it could be suggested that the law of the dependent origination adds a new, dynamic perspective to the analysis and understanding of the law of kamma by highlighting the multiplicity of causes and effects.

\textsuperscript{147} See Kyaw (2012a) on Burmese meditation traditions which teach the theory-based meditation practice, vis-a-vis, the non-theory-based meditation practice.
1.3. The law of conditional relations (Paṭṭhāna)

1.3.1. Holistic understanding of causality from the Theravāda perspective

Before exploring some basic elements of the Paṭṭhāna and its structure in relation to the Buddhist causality, I shall briefly explore the place of the law of conditional relations, i.e. paṭṭhāna, in the overall Buddhist theory of causality. Drawing upon the paṭṭhāna and Karunadasa’s work on the theory of dhamma, i.e. “the concept that all the phenomena of empirical existence are made up of a number of elementary constituents” (see 1.3.2.), I shall illustrate that the law of conditional relations provides a more complex perspective on the Buddhist causality.

On the basis of our discussion on the law of dependent origination, we have seen that from a plurality of causes a plurality of effects takes place (see above). As Karunadasa suggests, when the concept of multiple causes and effects is applied to the theory of dhamma, it means that a multiplicity of dhammas brings about a multiplicity of other dhammas. According to the commentary to the first text of the Abhidhamma Piṭaka, the Dhammasaṅgaṇī, the ’Buddhist Psychological Ethics’, ‘the arising of a single dhamma is not possible’ (ekassa dhammassa uppatti paṭisedhitā hoti). Karunadasa explains that both mental and material dhammas invariably arise as clusters.

Hence, it is that whenever consciousness (citta) arises, together with it there arise at least seven mental factors (cetasika). . . . These seven are called universal mental factors (sabbacittasadharana) because they are invariably present even in the most minimal unit of consciousness. Thus a psychic instance can never occur with less than eight constituents, i.e. consciousness and its seven invariable factors. Their relation is one of necessary co-nascence (sahajāta).

151 See f.n. 104 for the seven universal cetasikas.
In the law of conditional relations, the condition of co-nascence (sahajāta-paccaya) is one of the 24 conditions. In the above example, citta is a conditioning state, on arising, causes its associated cetasikas, including the universal cetasikas, to arise simultaneously with it.

The law of conditional relations adds a new dimension to Theravāda understanding of causality by not only highlighting the causes and their effects, but also conditioning forces (paccaya-satti) acting on these relationships. Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw explains the difference between the law of the dependent origination and the law of the conditional relations as follows.

In . . . [the law of the] Dependent Origination, only the manifested causes and effects [i.e. phenomena such as ignorance, craving etc.] are considered. But, in Paṭṭhāna, the forces [i.e. the 24 conditions] that bring about the relations between the causes and effects are also taken into account and it is with these forces that this subject [i.e. Paṭṭhāna] is primarily concerned.

Therefore, the paṭṭhāna highlights the ways in which causes and effects are related through specific conditioning forces (see below and Chapter 5 for details). In the Visuddhimagga, Buddhaghosa explicates the causal links between the 12 factors of the dependent origination through the 24 conditions of the paṭṭhāna. For instance, one of the ways that the first causal link of the dependent origination, i.e. ignorance as condition, volitional formation arises, can be related is through the decisive support

---

153 The full list of the 24 conditions is as follows: hetu-paccaya (root condition), ārammaṇa-paccaya (object condition), adhipati-paccaya (predominance condition), anantarā-paccaya (proximity condition) samanantarā-paccaya (contiguity condition), sahajāta-paccaya (co-nascence condition), aḥamaniḥ-paccaya (mutuality condition), nissaya-paccaya (support condition), upānissaya-paccaya (decisive support condition), purejāta-paccaya (pre-nascence condition), pacchājāta-paccaya (post-nascence condition), āsevana-paccaya (repetition condition), kamma-paccaya (kamma condition), vipāka-paccaya (kammic-result condition), āhāra-paccaya (nutriment condition), indriya-paccaya (faculty condition), jhāna-paccaya (jhana condition), magga-paccaya (path condition), sampayutta-paccaya (association condition), vippayutta-paccaya (dissociation condition), atti-paccaya (presence condition), naṭṭhi-paccaya (absence condition), vigata-paccaya (disappearance condition), avigata-paccaya (non-disappearance condition). (See Table 4.5. for an explanation of the 24 condition in detail).


155 For a detailed exposition of how the 12 factors are related by the 24 conditions of the paṭṭhāna, see Vism. XVII, 66-272, Nāṇamoḷi 1991: 542-594.
condition (*upanissaya-paccaya*).¹⁵⁶ By way of example, an individual, who is confused by ignorance, may form the desire to rob someone’s house, and thus commits the act of robbing without considering the moral and social consequences for him/herself and his/her victim. Here, ignorance as a decisive-support condition gives rise to the volition (*cetana*) to rob, and thus he/she commits the act of robbing. Ignorance as decisive-support condition is indispensable to the arising of the mental and physical actions – i.e. the volition to rob and the act of robbing, and the arising of such actions is dependent upon ignorance. Hence, ignorance, and the mental and physical actions of robbing are related through a conditioning force called ‘decisive-support condition’ (*upanissaya-paccaya-satti*). In the *Paṭṭhāna* and in the *Visuddhimagga*, we find explicit examples of the interconnected relationships between causes and effects.

We can therefore see from the discussion above (see 1.1.) that the 24 conditions in the *Paṭṭhāna* are used to explain how the causes and their effects are correlated in a lateral manner. As I have suggested previously, the *Abhidhamma Piṭaka* is the crucial and obvious place to look for a comprehensive and systematic account of Buddhist causality. It is my view that appreciation of the teachings in the *Abhidhamma Piṭaka* in general, and the *Paṭṭhāna* in particular in the mainstream Theravāda studies perhaps will challenge the understanding of the doctrines of Theravāda Buddhism presented in much of the academic scholarship on the subject by offering a far more sophisticated understanding of the dynamics of Buddhist causality.

### 1.3.2. Dual role of *Abhidhamma*: analysis and synthesis

In this section, I shall aim to demonstrate that Theravāda understanding of *dhammas*, non-analysable units of reality (see below), does not correspond to the

---

understanding of dhammas by Sarvāstivadins. That is, unlike Sarvāstivadins, Theravādins do not hold dhammas exist in all three time periods – past, present and future, and thus avoid the view that dhammas are unchanging units with underlying ‘self’ (atta). I shall also highlight the dual role of Abhidhamma, analysis (bheda) and synthesis (saṅgaha), in relation to the dhamma theory – i.e. analysis of all entities of empirical existence into elementary constituents.¹⁵⁷

Abhidhamma breaks up and analyses entities and concepts – such as a person, a woman, a car, a tree, I, you etc. – into constituents or factors of reality of the world or experience called dhammas. Scholars, for example Geiger, M. & Geiger, W.,¹⁵⁸ Warder,¹⁵⁹ Carter,¹⁶⁰ Karunadasa,¹⁶¹ and Gethin,¹⁶² have explored different interpretations of dhamma in the early Buddhist texts and traced the development of the concept of dhamma in these texts. The concept of dhamma has many definitions depending on the contexts. For example, dhamma in moral contexts refers to ‘justice’ or ‘righteous’, as in dhammarāja - i.e. righteous king.¹⁶³ In the context of Abhidhamma, dhamma can be defined as a ‘non-analysable phenomenon’ or a ‘bare phenomenon’. I shall refer to a dhamma as a ‘phenomenon’, a ‘thing’, or a ‘state’ depending on specific issues under discussion.

According to the 11-12th century terse summary of Abhidhamma system, the Abhidhammatthasāṅgha by Anuruddha, there are four kinds of ultimate realities (paramattha-dhamma): consciousness (citta), mental factors (cetasika), matter (rūpa) and nirvana (nibbāna).¹⁶⁴ Although ‘paramattha-dhamma’ is translated as ‘ultimate reality’, it does not mean a ‘reality’ in sense of having some kind of ontological status.

¹⁶³ See Gethin (2004: 516-521) on a range of meanings of dhamma on the basis of the early Buddhist texts.
It should be understood as a part of a process, which reflects the Theravadin’s view of *dhamma* as being of a “less reified, more experiential kind”.\(^{165}\) Moreover, according to Karunadasa, the description of *dhammas* as *paramattha* is understood in terms of their objective existence (*paramatthato-vijjamānatā*).\(^{166}\) This refers to the fact that the mental and material *dhammas* represent the utmost limits to which the analysis of empirical existence can be stretched.

The definition of *dhammas* as ultimate realities has led some people to assume that Theravāda sees *dhammas* as having a ‘own-nature’ (*sabhāva*; Sanskrit: *svabhāva*) as in having a ‘self’ in ontological sense. The Sarvāstivāda school, one of the early schools in the history of Buddhism, asserts that the substances of all *dhammas* persist in all the three divisions of time – past, present and future – while their manifestations as phenomena are impermanent and subject to change. For the Sarvāstivadins (‘adherents of the existence of everything’), a *dhamma* in essence continues to subsist in all the three temporal periods. Thus, it resulted in the transformation of the *dhamma* theory into a *svabhāvavāda*, ‘the doctrine of own-nature’. Therefore, there have been debates around the issue of whether ‘own-nature’ is similar to having ‘*atta*’, ‘self’ in ontological sense. One of the core teachings of Madhyamaka, a Mahāyāna Buddhist school of philosophy founded by Nāgārjuna, responds to this issue in Sarvāstivāda by asserting the doctrine not only of *pudgala-nairatmya* but also *dharma-nairatmya*: ‘no-self of the individual’ and ‘no-self of phenomena’. For Madhyamaka, Sārvāstivāda, in proposing *svabhāva*, was going against the fundamental Buddhist doctrine of *anattā*. To equate Sarvāstivāda’s *dharma* theory with that found in Theravāda *Abhidhamma* is a mistaken view on the part of scholars and incorrectly represents the relationship between the theory of *dharma* in the Madhayamaka school and the Theravadin theory of *dhamma*. Let me dwell on this point because we shall see

\(^{165}\) Cousins 1983-84: 107.

\(^{166}\) Karunadasa 1996: 14.
that the teachings in the Abhidhamma and the Paṭṭhāna explicitly exclude the possibility of dhamma having sabhāva in ontological sense.

Skorupski writing on different categories of emptiness from the perspective of Madhayamaka philosophy states that the Theravāda and the Sarvāstivāda-Vaibhāṣika schools reject the existence of the eternal and immutable ātman, and admit the reality of the dhammas. The assumption therefore is that Theravādins hold dhammas as ultimately real, each with its own self-nature (sabhāva). It seems that some of the commentarial literature of Sri Lanka appear at first sight to confirm such a misconception of Theravādin theory of dhamma. Karunadasa writing on the dhamma theory from a Theravāda Abhidhamma perspective observes that “in the post-canonical exegetical literature of Sri Lanka where, for the first time, the term sabhāva (Skt. svabhava) came to be used as a synonym for dhamma.” For example, the commentary of the Mahāniddesa in the Khuddaka Nikāya gives the definition: “Dhammas are so called because they bear their own nature”. This commentarial definition of dhamma as sabhāva seems to not only follow the same sense as Sarvāstivādin’s usage of the term svabhāva, but also contradict the definition in the canonical literature. For instance, the Paṭisambhidāmagga in the Khuddaka Nikāya specifically states that the five aggregates – i.e. form, sensation, perception, volitional formation and consciousness which constitute beings – are devoid of own-nature (sabhāvena-suñṇam). According to Karunadasa, the Sri Lankan commentators took necessary steps to forestall the conclusion that Theravādin’s definition of dhamma might be quasi-substances with own-nature. The commentators supplemented the former definition, i.e. dhamma as

---

167 Skorupski 2010: 11.
170 Mahānīd-a. 1.14. See Karunadasa (1996: n. 24) for other commentarial texts which state the definition of dhamma as sabhāva.
sabhāva, with another which nullifies the view that the dhammas might be independent existents. The commentary of the Dhammasaṅganī, the Atthasālinī, defines dhamma as below.

_Dhammas_ are that which bear their own nature. And yet, they are borne by their own conditions, or borne according to their own characteristics.

_Attano pana sabhāvam dhārentīti dhammā. Dhāriyanti vā paccayehi, dhāriyanti vā yathāsabhāvatoti dhammā._

As explained above, for a dhamma or consciousness to arise there must be at least eight conditions or components. Thus, a dhamma is said to be borne by its own conditions (paccayehi dhāriyanti ti dhamma). In accordance with this view, one of the definitions of dhamma given in the commentaries is “what is called a dhamma is the mere fact of occurrence due to appropriate conditions”. The fact that an occurrence of a dhamma requires multiple causes or conditions is a radical reconfiguration of the theory of dhamma, reversing the whole process which otherwise might culminate in the conception of dhammas as bearers of their own-nature. Karunadasa therefore concludes that “although the term sabhāva is used as synonym for dhamma [by Sri Lankan commentators], it [i.e. sabhāva] is interpreted in such as way that it means the very absence of sabhāva in any sense that implies a substantial mode of being”.

Another reason for such an erroneous view about Theravāda Abhidhamma is perhaps due to a bias in the treatment of the Abhidhamma texts in an earlier phase of scholarship. Until very recently, relatively little had been published on Abhidhamma in English writings about Theravāda. Even where publications on Theravāda Abhidhamma are made, there has been a tendency to focus on the first part of the Abhidhamma texts in which entities and concepts are analysed into discrete dhammas.

---

172 As. 81.
173 Karunadasa 1996: n. 49.
175 Braun 2008: 82; Crosby 2005b: 47.
Very little attention has been paid to the *Paṭṭhāna* texts which provide a synthesising function by describing interrelationships between the *dhammas*, i.e. the subject addressed in the *Paṭṭhāna*, and this means that insufficient attention is paid to the significant differences between Sarvāstivāda and Theravāda *Abhidhamma*. Crosby in her latest book *Theravāda Buddhism: Continuity, Diversity, and Identity* suggests a number of reasons for limited publications on *Abhidhamma* in English writings.\(^{176}\) I would suggest that the study of *Paṭṭhāna* is even more marginalised in the scholarship on Theravāda Buddhism and literature. This is because its voluminous corpus of the canonical and the commentarial texts in Pāli and in vernacular languages such as Burmese requires “not just linguistic expertise but specialist training achieved through years of consistent dedication.”\(^{177}\)

The dual role of the *Abhidhamma*, namely analysis and synthesis, and the importance of the *Paṭṭhāna* in this has been described by Kalupahana in relation to the broader Indian concepts of self as follows.

The Nīkāyas [i.e. learned in the Nīkāyas] and the Abhidhammikas [i.e. learned in the Abhidhamma] counter-acted the Brahmanical schools by analyzing and systematizing the personality into instances of discrete mental and physical phenomena. The Abhidhammikas avoided falling into the extreme of believing in the existence of a plurality of discrete things by formulating the *Paṭṭhāna*.\(^{178}\)

The extent of synthesis in the *Paṭṭhāna* will become apparent when we look at the structure of the *Paṭṭhāna* below in relation to the *mātikā*, the list of categories of *dhammas* that provide the framework for the *Abhidhamma* as a whole. Here, I would suggest that the functions of the *Abhidhamma* *Piṭaka* as a whole will be missed if we ignore the *Paṭṭhāna*. The *Paṭṭhāna* is the focal teaching that clarifies the nuances of the

\(^{176}\) Crosby 2014: 175-176.

\(^{177}\) Crosby 2014: 176.

Theravāda philosophy, causality, and the ‘doctrine of non-self’ (anattavāda), as I stated in my Introduction.

1.3.3. Structure of the Paṭṭhāna: an overview on the basis of the 6th council edition of the Burmese Pāli canon

This section will give an overview of the structure of the Paṭṭhāna texts based on the 6th council edition of the Burmese Pāli canon. In so doing, I shall aim to demonstrate that the mātikā, which is in the opening section of the first book of the Abhidhamma Piṭaka, the Dhammasaṅgaṇī, provides a blueprinted scheme for the Paṭṭhāna. I shall also point out some features of the canonical Paṭṭhāna, but as we shall see below it is not an exhaustive analysis of the structure of the Paṭṭhāna.

The Paṭṭhāna is the last of seven books of the Abhidhamma Piṭaka, and the titles of the first six books are: Dhammasaṅgaṇī, Vibhaṅga, Dhātukathā, Puggalapaññatti, Kathāvatthu, Yamaka.¹⁷⁹ The first book, the Dhammasaṅgaṇī opens with the mātikā listing 22 triplets (tikadhammas) and 100 duplets (dukadhammas) according to the Abhidhamma method.¹⁸⁰ In addition to Abhidhammic classifications of dhammas into 22 triplets and 100 duplets, the mātikā lists categories of dhammas according to the Suttanta method. This section is called the Suttantikadumātikā and is “concerned with factors related to moral precepts, concentration, and views”.¹⁸¹ The arrangement of the 22 triplets is made by grouping together factors in three mutually exclusive sets according to their quality or nature. For example, the first triplet is called ‘kusala triplet’, ‘skilful triplet’. Here, moral quality has been used as a unifying factor to group the

---

¹⁸⁰ See Buswell and Jaini (2006: 84-89) for a comparison of the mātikā in the Theravādin Abhidhamma and the Sarvāstivādin Abhidharma.
¹⁸¹ Buswell and Jaini 2006: 85.
dhammas into a triplet, namely, skilful dhamma (kusaladhamma), unskilful dhamma (akusaladhamma) and indeterminate dhamma (abyākatadhamma). Similarly, the duplets are dhammas which are grouped into twos, and the first duplet is root dhamma (hetūdhamma) and not-root dhamma (nahetūdhamma). In total, there are 266 (22 × 3 = 66; 100 × 2 = 200, thus 66 + 200 = 266) dhammas listed in Abhidhammad classification of the mātikā. There is a clear, close relationship between the mātikā and the Paṭṭhāna. The Paṭṭhāna texts are about describing innumerable numbers of conditional relations between these 266 dhammas and their combinations through combinations of the 24 conditioning forces (paccaya-sattis) (see 5.3.). We shall see how the 22 triplets and the 100 duplets are related in the Paṭṭhāna by looking at its structure in Figure 1.2.

The Paṭṭhāna in the 6th council edition of the Burmese Pāli canon consists of five volumes in total, while Siamese Tipiṭaka edition comprises six volumes. The translation of the first volume of the Burmese version by the Late Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw Ven. U Nārada was published by the Pāli Text Society (PTS) in 1969 and 1981 in two volumes. The commentaries on the Paṭṭhāna, which take the form of exegesis, include the Pañcappakaraṇa-āṭṭhakathā, the Pañcappakaraṇa-mūlāṭṭikā and the Pañcappakaraṇa-anuṭṭikā. While the Pañcappakaraṇa-āṭṭhakathā has traditionally been attributed to Buddhaghosa, von Hinüber in A Handbook of Pāli Literature reports

---

182 It should be noted that certain dhammas may seem to have recurred in different triplets and duplets. For example, we can find internal dhamma (ajjhattā-dhamma), external dhamma (bahiddhā-dhamma), and internal-external dhamma (ajjhattabahiddhā-dhamma) as a triplet, while internal dhamma (ajjhattikā-dhamma) and external dhamma (bāhirā-dhamma) appears as a duplet. Although this triplet dhamma and this duplet dhamma seem to be duplication of the same kind of dhamma, they are essentially different in nature and reference. The triplet, i.e. ajjhattā-dhamma, bahiddhā-dhamma, and ajjhattabahiddhā-dhamma, is concerned with the dhammas that occur in one’s own body, in other’s body, and in one’s own and other’s bodies. The duplet, i.e. ajjhattikā-dhamma and bāhirā-dhamma, refers to the dhammas that are within one’s own body. In post-canonical abhidhamma texts, the 89 types of citta and the five sense-organs are classified as the aṭṭhikā-dhamma, while the 52 types of cetasika, and the other 23 types of rūpa are categorised as the bāhirā-dhamma. See Varatejo (2011: 57) and Tilokābhivaṃsa (2010: 27 and 47) on the analytical exposition of the triplet and duplet dhammas mentioned here.

184 Nyanatiloka 1983: 114
different views on its authorship.\footnote{von Hinüber 1996: 149-153.} For example, Bapat and Vadekar (1942) argue that “the structure of the Abhidhamma commentary points to an author different from Buddhaghosa”.\footnote{Bapat and Vadekar 1942: XXXIII-XXXIX, cited in von Hinüber 1996: 151.} Moreover, the same result was reached at by Jayawickrama (1979) and also Cousins (1987), while only Norman (1983) supports the traditional view of Buddhaghosa as the author.\footnote{von Hinüber 1996: 151, f.n. 521.} The Pañcappakaraṇa-mūlāṭīkā has been attributed to Ānanda, “who lived in the otherwise unknown Kalasapura”,\footnote{Bollée 1969: 832 note 48, cited in von Hinüber 1996: 166.} and the Pañcappakaraṇa-anuṭīkā to Ānanda’s pupil, Dhammapāla.\footnote{Bodhi 2010: 13; von Hinüber 1996: 166.} Although the structure of the Paṭṭhāna in a written form has been described by Karunaratne in the 1950s when writing on the development of the theory of causality in early Theravāda\footnote{See Karunaratne (1956: 186-226) on the structure, etymology and background theory of the Paṭṭhāna.} and also by Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw in his translation,\footnote{Nārada 1969: xi-cix.} Figure 1.2. is the first to represent the overview of the whole five volumes of the Paṭṭhāna in a diagram in English writings on Theravāda Abhidhamma.\footnote{This diagram of an overview of the structure of the Paṭṭhāna is adapted from U Khin Maung Than’s work on the Pucchāvāra, ‘question section’, of the Paṭṭhāna. U Khin Maung Than was the associate professor at the Department of Physics at University of Mandalay. He was interested in the Paṭṭhāna, especially in the Pucchāvāra. He studied and worked on the Paṭṭhāna for over thirty years, but never published his work. I was able to collect some of his work from one of my informants in Mandalay. The rest of his work, which amount to a cupboard full of papers, is now at the International Institute of Abhidhamma (IIA) in Yangon.}

Figure 1.2. An overview of the structure of the Paṭṭhāna on the basis on the 6th council edition of the Burmese Pāli canon (translation of terms provided within discussion below)
The *Paṭṭhāna* can be divided into three main parts: the first is called the *Paccayuddesa*, the ‘Enumeration of the [24] Conditions’; the second is the *Paccayaniddesa*, the ‘Analytical Exposition of the Conditions’; and the final part is called the *Paṭiniddesa*, literally means ‘coming back to a subject again’.\(^{195}\) The *Paṭiniddesa* makes up the rest of the *Paṭṭhāna* and explains the interrelations between *dhammas* in great detail. As I mentioned in the introduction, the *Paccayuddesa* and *Paccayaniddesa* are ritualistically recited by most Burmese Buddhists, while the *Paṭiniddesa* is the focal of scholastic studies of the *Paṭṭhāna*. In the *Paṭiniddesa* section, there are two main divisions: the first is the *Pucchāvāra*, ‘question division’, and the second is the *Vissajjanavāra*, ‘answer division’.\(^{196}\) The *Pucchāvāra*, in theory, describes every possible question regarding conditional relations between the 266 *dhammas* and their combinations through various single and multiple combinations of the 24 conditions (*paccayas*) (see Chapter 5). Nevertheless, the *Pucchāvāra* in the Burmese edition of the Pāli canon covers just over 8 pages in the whole of five volumes of the *Paṭṭhāna*. Yet, Ven. U Paṇḍita, the current abbot of the Pa-htan”theik-pan Sathintaik in Sagaing, says that if this division alone is written out fully without abbreviation (see below), it will add up to nine carts full of traditional manuscripts.\(^{197}\) On the basis of the *Paṅcappakaranā-āṭṭhakathā*, Burmese scholars have calculated that there are a total of 404,948,533,248 questions (*pucchā*).\(^{198}\) Calculation based on the *Paṅcappakaranā-mulaṭīkā* gives a slightly lower number, i.e. 388,778,713,344.\(^{199}\) The *Vissajjanavāra* then forms the rest of the five volumes, and the answers are in response to the questions raised in the *Pucchāvāra*. It should be noted that not every question raised in the

---

195 Tilokābhivaṃsa, personal communication 18 October 2013.
Pucchavāra has a positive answer. The questions in the Pucchavāra ask whether conditional relations between the dhammas can be related by single and multiple conditions. But, some conditional relations cannot be related. We shall also explore the Pucchavāra in some detail in Chapter 5 in relation to enumeration and the mathematical aspects of the Paṭṭhāna.

Before we explore the structure of the Paṭṭhāna further, it is crucial to look at the four main methods (nayas) in the paṭṭhāna. There are four main methods (nayas) used in the paṭṭhāna, namely (1) positive method (anuloma), (2) negative method (paccanīya), (3) positive-negative method (anulomapaccanīya), and (4) negative-positive method (paccanīyānuloma). These methods are applied to both the dhammas, i.e. the 22 triplets and the 100 duplets, and the 24 conditions (paccayas). By this I mean the dhammas and paccayas are expressed positively (anuloma), negatively (paccanīya), positively-negatively (anulomapaccanīya), and negatively-positively (paccanīyānuloma). For instance, the three dhammas in the skilful triplet, i.e. skilful dhamma (kusala-dhamma), unskilful (akusala-dhamma), and indeterminate dhamma (abyākata-dhamma), can be expressed in terms of the four methods as follows.
Table 1.2. The skilful triplet (kusalatika) expressed in terms of the main four methods of the Paṭṭhāna

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Dhamma</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. positive (anuloma)</td>
<td>skilful (kusala), unskilful (akusala), indeterminate (abyākata)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. negative (paccanīya)</td>
<td>not-skilful (na-kusala), not-unskilful (na-akusala), not-indeterminate (na-abyākata)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. positive-negative (anulomapaccanīya)</td>
<td>skilful—not-skilful (kusala—na-kusala), unskilful—not-unskilful (akusala—na-akusala), indeterminate—not-indeterminate (abyākata—na-abyākata)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. negative-positive (paccanīyānuloma)</td>
<td>not-skilful—skilful (na-kusala—kusala), not-unskilful—unskilful (na-akusala—akusala), not-indeterminate—indeterminate (na-abyākata—abyākata)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As for the 24 conditions (paccayas), they are expressed positively as root condition (hetupaccaya), object condition (ārammaṇapaccaya) etc. In terms of the negative (paccanīya), we find not-root condition (na-hetupaccaya), not-object condition (na-ārammaṇapaccaya) etc. (see below). The main purpose of the four methods is to provide a full, comprehensive coverage of every possible conditional relation between dhammas through various combinations of conditions (paccayas). That is to say, the paṭṭhāna describes and shows interdependence between all dhammas explicitly. Thus, it leaves no stone unturned.

To return to the structure of the Paṭṭhāna, I shall explain various sections and subsections in the Vissajjanavāra below. It should be noted that the Pucchāvāra also has the same kind of sections and subsections, if it is written out fully. The multiple sections and subsections of the Paṭṭhāna, as shown in Figure 1.2., reflect its reputation

---

200 This table has been drawn on the basis of the canonical paṭṭhāna text. For example, the first method positive dhamma, ‘dhammānuloma’ is found in the first four volumes of the Paṭṭhāna. The remaining three methods are dealt in the fifth volume of the Paṭṭhāna. The arrangement of dhammas in Table 1.2. shows only some aspects of how dhammas could be arranged. For detailed analysis of combinations of dhammas, see 5.3.

as the ‘ocean of methods’ (naya-sagāra). Focusing on the Vissajjanavāra (see the last box at the third level in Figure 1.2.), these four methods are applied first to the dhammas, i.e. the 22 triplets and the 100 duplets, making up the four sections: Dhammānuloma, Dhammapaccanīya, Dhammānulomapaccanīya, Dhammapaccanīyānuloma. It should be noted that in the Dhammānuloma section, we find the dhammas are expressed positively, as shown in No. 1 in Table 1.2. Within each of these four sections, there are six ways of finding the relationships between the 22 triplets and the 100 duplets on their own and between combinations of the triplets and the duplets. For instance, the first and second ways, i.e. the Tikapaṭṭhāna and the Dukapaṭṭhāna, deal with the 22 triplets and the 100 duplets on their own without mixing one with another. In the third and fourth, the triplets and duplets are combined, i.e. the Tikadukapaṭṭhāna or the Dukatikapaṭṭhāna. Then, the triplets and duplets are combined with each other in pairs, e.g. a triplet/duplet is coupled with another triplet/duplet, and they are called the Tikatikapaṭṭhāna and the Dukadukapaṭṭhāna. Thus, the whole 22 triplets and 100 duplets are related in many different ways.

As we go to the next level down in Figure 1.2., we find that within each of the six ways, there are seven chapters (vāras): (1) the Paṭiccavāra, ‘dependent chapter’; (2) the Sahajātavāra, ‘co-nascence chapter’; (3) the Paccayavāra, ‘condition chapter’; (4) the Nissayavāra, ‘support chapter’; (5) the Saṃsaṭṭhavāra, ‘conjoined chapter’; the Sampayuttavāra, ‘association chapter’; (7) the Pañhāvāra, ‘investigation chapter’. Within each of these seven chapters, there are four sections: Paccayānuloma, Paccayapaccanīya, Paccayānulomapaccanīya, Paccayapaccanīyānuloma. Essentially, here the 24 conditions (paccayas) are configured using the four main methods that are applied to the dhammas. For example, in the Paccayānuloma, the conditions are taken
positively – i.e. root condition (hetupaccaya), object condition (ārammaṇapaccaya) etc., but in the **Paccayapaccaniya**, the conditions are taken negatively – i.e. not-root condition (na-hetupaccaya), not-object condition (na-ārammaṇapaccaya) etc. (see 4.3.2.).

As for the **Paccayānulomapaccaniya**, if one condition is expressed as positive, then the other remaining 23 conditions are expressed as negative. That is, if root condition is in positive (anuloma), i.e. *hetupaccaya*, then it is combined with the other 23 conditions which are negatively expressed, i.e. *na-ārammaṇapaccaya, na-adhipatipaccaya* etc.

Within each of these sections, there are two sub-sections: the Vibhaṅgavāra, ‘classification section’, and the Saṅkhyaṅvāra, ‘enumeration section’. While the former gives detailed accounts of the conditional relations between the dhammas, the latter enumerates the number of possible conditional relations (see Chapter 5). Within the Enumeration section, there are three parts: the **Suddhasaṅkhya**, ‘single (literally ‘simple’) enumeration’, is when the cause and the effect are related by one condition (ekapaccaya); the **Sabhāgasaṅkhya**, ‘common enumeration’, is when there are two conditions relating the cause and the effect (dukapaccaya); and the **Ghaṭanāsaṅkhya**, ‘multiple enumeration’, deals with the conditional relations involving three or more (i.e. between 3 and 24) conditions. We shall examine the Saṅkhyaṅvāra in detail in Chapter 5.

In theory, **Paṭṭhāna** describes the relationships between all dhammas through every possible combination of conditions. The **Paṭṭhāna** in the Pāli canon, however, does not provide every question or answer in full. As Mula’ Pa-htan’ Hsayadaw observes, what is given in the canonical Paṭṭhāna is sufficient to find out the underlying methods which can be utilised to expand the conditional relations given in

---

203 See Paṭṭh. 1.209 for an example of how the conditions are arranged in the Paccayānulomapaccaniya.

204 Following the convention in the canonical paṭṭhāna text, ‘ghaṭanā’ is spelt with a long ‘a’ at the end.

205 See f.n. 529 in Chapter 5 for a detailed explanation of the reason for translating the Ghaṭanāsaṅkhya as ‘multiple enumeration’.
the Vibhaṅgavāra and those enumerated in the Saṅkhyaśāstra. Moreover, it is apparent that the Paṭṭhāna, as in other Abhidhamma texts, is highly repetitious. The repetitions in the earlier sections of the Paṭṭhāna such as the Paccayaniddesa and the skilful triplet (kusalatika) in the Tikapatṭṭhāna, the first triplet in the Paṭiniddesa, are written out with relatively fewer abbreviations. The later sections of the Paṭṭhāna are highly abbreviated in that repetitions are not written out fully, but certain phrases are used to refer back to the repeated text. For example, in the fourth volume of the Paṭṭhāna, the section describing the possible conditional relations between ‘subject to corruption’ dhammas (saṅkilesika-dhamma) and ‘not subject to corruption’ dhammas (asaṅkilesika-dhamma) consists only of a few lines:

Saṅkilesikadukāṁ – Paṭiccavāro

Saṅkilesikāṁ dhamman paṭicca saṅkilesiko dhamno uppaṭṭha hetupaccayā.

Yathā lokiyadukāṁ, evaṁ ninnānakaraṇaṁ.
Saṅkilesikadukāṁ niṭṭhitam.

‘Subject to corruption’ Duplet – Dependent Chapter

A state subject to corruption arises on the basis of a state subject to corruption by means of the latter being a root condition.

As in the case of the mundane duplet there is no variation in form.
The section on subject to corruption duplet is complete.

Here, the phrase ‘yatthā lokiyadukāṁ, evaṁ ninnānakaraṇaṁ’ is used to indicate that the conditional relations of this duplet are the same as those of the mundane duplet, and thus writing out of the repetition is avoided.

It could be suggested that the Paṭṭhāna might be one of the most abbreviated canonical texts and abbreviations in the Paṭṭhāna occur through several terms. In the Paṭṭhana, as in other canonical texts, the repetitions that contain little or no variation are reduced or replaced by the use of the term peyyāla, translated as ‘formula’.

---

207 Paṭṭh. 4.17.
‘repetition’, itself reduced further to *pe, pa, pe...la*.\(^{208}\) *Peyyāla* is perhaps the most well-known term for condensing the repetitions in the Pāli canonical texts. In addition to *peyvāla*, the *Paṭṭhāna* uses other phrases to condense the repetitions. One of which is shown above. There are also other terms used to reduce the repetitions in written form. For example, ‘*saṃkhitta*’, ‘abbreviated’, or ‘*sadisa*’, ‘same as’, are used in conjunction with a reference to indicate that the text has been abbreviated and can be expanded in the same way as the reference. Drawing upon Gethin’s classification of different types of repetition, the “structural repetition”, namely a repetition that provides “a framework structure which can then be used as the basis for a series of repetitions by substituting different items and/or modifying the frame”,\(^{209}\) is reduced by the use of the term ‘*cakkaṃ bandhitabba/kātabba*’, translated as ‘the cycle should be combined/done [by replacing given items]’. It is however not always clear precisely what is to be repeated and in what order. Therefore, abbreviated repetitions pose major difficulties for someone who attempts to memorise the *Paṭṭhāna* and/or undertake the full analysis of the text.

As von Hinüber observes “the structure of Paṭṭh [i.e. *Paṭṭhāna*] is difficult to follow”.\(^{210}\) What I have attempted to show above is a way of looking at the structure of *Paṭṭhāna* by summarising major sections of the text.

### 1.3.4. The teaching of the doctrine of non-self (*anattavāda*)

This section explores the ways in which *dhammas* are interrelated and correlated through the 24 conditions in the *Paṭṭhāna*. I shall suggest that in the Burmese approach to the study of the *Paṭṭhāna* the conditional relations that are

---

\(^{209}\) Gethin 2007: 366.  
\(^{210}\) von Hinüber 1996: 75.
expressed in terms of the mātikā’s scheme of dhammas have come to be explained and understood in terms of the four kinds of ultimate realities described in the Abhidhammatthasangaha (see 1.3.2.). I also aim to show how the Paṭṭhāna is the teaching of the doctrine of non-self. Before turning to the relationship between the doctrine of non-self and the Paṭṭhāna, we shall first explore basic elements of Paṭṭhāna, and thus see the main principles of the Paṭṭhāna.

In the Paṭṭhāna, according to the Burmese approach to the study of the Paṭṭhāna, the final analysis of any conditional relationships between the conditioning states (paccaya-dhammā) and the conditioned states (paccayupanna-dhammā) resorts to the four kinds of ultimate realities, namely, consciousness, mental factors, matter and nibbāna. Nibbāna is an ‘unconditioned element’ (asaṅkhata-dhātu) – i.e. that which is not produced by any cause or condition.211 By definition, it cannot be a conditioned state. The other three ultimate realities – consciousness, mental factors and matter – can be both conditioning states and conditioned states. The Paṭṭhāna explains specific relations and correlations between the four ultimate realities by highlighting the conditioning forces involved in and acting on these relations.

When discussing the conditional relations in the Paṭṭhāna, I shall use the translation of dhamma as ‘state’. Gethin suggests that dhammas are “the basic mental and physical ‘state’”,212 and that they are “qualities that constitute experience or reality is to be related to the usage of dhamma at the end of a possessive, bahubhihi (Sanskrit: bahuvrihi) compound in the sense of a particular nature or quality possessed by something.”213 In this context, where dhamma is used at the end of a bahubhihi compound, it is more appropriate to translate it as ‘state’. ‘Paccaya-dhamma’ is thus

212 Gethin 2004: 516.
understood as ‘conditioning state’, highlighting a ‘quality’ or ‘function’ possessed by the ultimate realities or dhammas.

We now examine basic elements of the paṭṭhāna on the basis of the Burmese pedagogical approach to the study of the Paṭṭhāna. The table below gives a simplified description of the basic elements of Paṭṭhāna.

Table 1.3. The three basic components of the paṭṭhāna.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Conditioning states (paccaya-dhammā)</th>
<th>Conditioned states (paccayuppanna-dhammā)</th>
<th>Conditioning forces (paccaya-satti)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Z</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- X refers to conditioning states, where X can be any of the four ultimate realities. A ‘conditioning state’ is a cause on which its effect is dependent.
- Y refers to conditioned states, where Y can be any of the three ultimate realities, except nibbāna. A ‘conditioned state’ is the effect that results from a cause.
- Z represents conditioning forces, where Z is any of the 24 conditions in the Paṭṭhāna. A ‘conditioning force’ is something that has the power (Pāli: satti, Burmese: that-ti’) to bring about or accomplish or cause the effect to arise. The distinct feature of the method of Paṭṭhāna is the 24 conditioning forces, i.e. the functions of the 24 conditions. Through these 24 conditioning forces the conditioning states give rise to the conditioned states. When explaining the concept of Paṭṭhāna, I think, it is necessary to use the term ‘conditioning force’ (paccayasatti), which highlights the fact that the 24 conditions are forces (satti) that act on the conditioning states in order to cause conditioned states. The word ‘force’ may convey other connotations, for example ‘power’, ‘energy’, ‘pressure’, which might be seen as an independent substance, apart from the conditioning states. In order to avoid confusion, I shall therefore use ‘condition’ when I refer to the 24 conditions, unless I want to refer
specifically to satti. However, the 24 conditioning forces are not separate entities from the conditioning states. “Just as the hotness of chillies is inherent in the chillies and cannot exist without them, so too the conditioning forces are inherent in the conditioning states and cannot exist without them. All conditioning states have their particular force, and this force enables them to cause the arising of the conditioned states”.

So, X and Y are related by Z conditioning forces. For example, considering the first condition of the 24 conditions, the root condition (hetu-paccaya), in the Paccayaniddesa, it is stated as follows.

Hetupaccayo ti – hetū hetusampayuttakānaṃ dhammānaṃ tam samuṭṭhānānañca rūpānaṃ hetupaccayena paccayo.

“Root condition” – Roots are conditions, by means of being a root-type condition, for both the dhammas connected with them and the matter that arises from them.

Here, the ‘roots’, i.e. non-greed (alobha), non-hatred (adosa), non-delusion (amoha), greed (lobha), hatred (dosa), and delusion (moha), are the conditioning states, X. The six roots are mental factors (cetasikas) which arise in immediate conjunction with consciousness and perform more specialised tasks in the act of cognition, making the consciousness ethically skilful or unskilful. Thus, all good and bad actions in thought, speech and deed originate from skilful and unskilful roots. ‘The dhammas connected with them (i.e. roots) and the matter that arises from them’ – namely 71 rooted consciousnesses, 52 mental factors, rooted mind-produced matter and rooted

---

215 Paṭṭh. 1.1.
216 Out of 89 cittas, 71 of them are called rooted cittas because they have skilful, unskilful and indeterminate dhammas, i.e. the 6 roots, as their principle causes, or roots. See Abhidh-s. III, 6-7, Bodhi 2010: 121 on the classification of cittas by way of roots.
217 The origin of the term ‘rooted mind-produced matter’ (sahetuka-citta-rūpa), which refers to matter (rūpa) originated from rooted cittas, can be traced back to an 18th century Burmese analytical work on the Paṭṭhāna called Htan ‘ta-bin pa-htan’ ayakauk (see 2.2). It should be noted that, according to the Dhammasaṅgīti, matter is disconnected with root-condition, i.e. matter is rootless (Rhys Davids 1997: 155 and 262-263). Nevertheless, the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha states that the seventy-five types of
rebirth–kamma–produced matter – are the conditioned states, Y. The conditioning states (X) are conditions for the arising of conditioned states (Y) by means of being a root-type condition, Z. Since these skilful and unskilful dhammas function like the taproot (mūla) of a tree, they are called ‘root’. An analogy – e.g. mūla for the hetupaccaya – is used to illustrate the function of the condition in the exegetical texts, such as the Pañcappakaraṇa-atthakathā. Drawing upon the Pañcappakaraṇa-atthakathā, Mula’ Pahtan” Hsayadaw explains the root condition as follows.

As long as the roots [of trees] are firm and functioning, the trees grow and develop. So, just as the roots are related to the trees as the basis for existence, growth, development and stability, the six roots are related to the states associated with them by bringing them about and keeping them firmly fixed together.²¹⁸

If delusion and the consciousness that arises with it for example are conditioning states, then they give a firm, fixed anchor like a taproot for the arising of the conditioned states, i.e. consciousness rooted in delusion (mohamūlacitta), the mental factors associated with the consciousness rooted in delusion and matters that arise from this consciousness. Here, delusion is both a conditioning state and a conditioning force, for a conditioning force is not a separate entity from the conditioning state, as shown above. It seems that delusion, one of three unskilful roots, gives a firm, fixed foundation for the arising of more consciousness rooted in delusion. The function of delusion is to conceal the real nature of the object,²¹⁹ and thus make one unaware of the real nature of things. Since one is ignorant of the true nature of things, he/she will have more deluded states of mind. Therefore, delusion as a conditioning force with its inherent characteristics of unknowing causes the arising

---

²¹⁹ Bodhi 2010: 83.
of the deluded mental states and the matter that arises from these mental states. As we have seen above, in the common enumeration (sabhāgasāṅkhya) and the combined enumeration (ghaṭānāsāṅkhya) sections, we find that the relationships between X and Y are determined by innumerable combinations of conditioning forces.

It could be suggested then that the Paṭṭhāna teaches both direct and indirect conditional relationships between conditioning states and conditioned states. The above example illustrates a direct conditional relationship in which conditioning states and conditioned states are related by the way of the root condition singly. So, the conditioning and conditioned states are directly connected by means of one condition, i.e. the root condition, and thus I shall refer to such conditional relations involving one condition as a direct conditional relation. The direct conditional relation in Paṭṭhāna is apparent in the etymological analysis of the term 'Paṭṭhāna' given by the Ledi Hsayadaw, which differs from the commentarial explanation. Ledi Hsayadaw analyses it in terms of the word 'ṭhāna', which literally means a station, a thing or an event by which the fruit or effect is established, and the intensive prefix 'pa', which has a sense of predominance or pre-eminence (padhānam). Hence, in the Paṭṭhānuddesa-dīpanī-nissaya, the Pāli-Burmese nissaya on the Paṭṭhāna by Ledi Hsayadaw, the term Paṭṭhāna is interpreted as padhānam ṭhānam, the ‘prominent condition’. We can therefore say that the prominent condition in the above example is delusion, which causes the arising of its associated states by being a root-type condition. There are also indirect conditional relationships described in the Paṭṭhāna because a certain group of conditioned states called ‘Q’, for example, may be

---

220 See Introduction for different explanations of the term paṭṭhāna given in the commentary on the Paṭṭhāna.
221 Ledi Hsayadaw 1915-16: 26. It should be noted that various commentarial texts such as the commentary to the Majjhima Nikāya and the Visuddhimagga explain the word satipaṭṭhāna in terms of ‘foundation’ or ‘cause’, i.e. paṭṭhāna (Anālayo 2008: 29). Therefore, it seems that Ledi Hsayadaw’s interpretation of paṭṭhāna is based upon the explanation of satipaṭṭhāna in such commentaries.
222 Ledi Hsayadaw 2001: 599.
correlated to conditioning-state-A through a condition, while this same group of conditioned states, i.e. ‘Q’, is correlated to conditioning-state-B through other conditions. From the spiritual perspective, Ledi Hsayadaw highlights that all things that happen and produce change are directly or indirectly related through and caused by the workings of these 24 conditions.  

While we have seen that the notion of ‘specific conditionality’ in dependent origination encompasses the conditional relations involving multiple causes and effects, this concept in the *Paṭṭhāna* seems to have broadened to include not only a multiplicity of causes and effects, but also multiple conditions relating the causes and effects. *Paṭṭhāna* encompasses a wider range of conditioning states and conditioned states than those in dependent origination. That is, the four types of ultimate realities (*paramattha-dhammas*) and the sub-categories of *dhammas* in Abhidhamma are potential conditioning states. Moreover, *Paṭṭhāna* is concerned with innumerable types of conditional relation between conditioning and conditioned states, which are linked by means of 24 conditions. Hence, the *Paṭṭhāna* is well-known as ‘ocean of methods’ or ‘all-encompassing infinite methods’ (*ananta-naya-samanta*). Therefore, the specific conditionality in *Paṭṭhāna* is a broader concept encompassing both direct and indirect relationships as well as multiple causes and effects. From textual, spiritual and philosophical stand points, the sphere of *Paṭṭhāna* covers both direct and indirect relations and correlations.

Turning to the relationship between the doctrine of non-self and the *Paṭṭhāna*, Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw suggests that the *Paṭṭhāna* is the teaching of the

---

223 Nyana 2000: 120.
224 ‘The view that the *Paṭṭhāna* is one of infinite methods and enormous numbers of conditional relations is pervasive in Burmese Buddhism. Ironically, such vast complexities and ‘ocean of method’ seem to be a factor which enhances its attraction for the Burmese to study the text, rather than hindering the popularity among the Burmese.
anattavāda.\textsuperscript{225} The \textit{Paṭṭhāna} explicitly rejects the doctrine of ‘self’ (\textit{attavāda}) at two levels. First, it emphasises interrelationships between the conditioning states and the conditioned states through 24 conditions. Thus, the arising of the conditioned states is "not at the will and mercy of any being [i.e. a creator or a ‘self’]."\textsuperscript{226} The fact that there are interdependent, lateral relations where the presence of appropriate conditions will lead to the automatic arising of effects attests to the doctrine of non-self. Second, the interrelatedness and interdependence of these \textit{dhammas} are not explained on the basis of the dichotomy between conditioning states and conditions (i.e. conditioning forces). We have seen that the conditioning forces are not apart from the conditioning states, i.e. \textit{dhammas}, and that the \textit{dhammas} themselves have inherent functions which perform specific tasks causing the associated effects. This non-duality between \textit{dhammas} and conditions accentuates that there is no independent creator or ‘self’ that may influence conditioning states to give rise to conditioned states. Thus, we can say that Theravāda \textit{Abhidhamma} leaves no loophole for the \textit{attavāda} to exist.

1.4. Summary

In this chapter, we have seen the place and importance of the \textit{Paṭṭhāna} in a broader framework of Theravādin understanding of Buddhist causality. In particular, I have demonstrated above that the dynamic relationship between the three laws of Buddhist causality provides insightful nuances regarding key concepts, namely ‘individualistic \textit{kamma}', ‘socio-\textit{kamma}', ‘specific conditionality', and ‘direct and indirect relationship', involved in understanding causality from a Theravāda perspective. With this theoretical framework in mind, I shall now turn to the special

\textsuperscript{225} Nārada 1996: xi-xvi. See Karunadasa 2010: 262-264 for a detailed explanation of principles behind the \textit{Abhidhamma} doctrine of conditionality, i.e. \textit{paṭṭhāna}, and thereby rejecting the view of self-causation (\textit{attavāda}).

\textsuperscript{226} Nārada 1996: xiii.
place of the \textit{Paṭṭhāna} in Burmese cultural and sociopolitical contexts in the next chapter.
CHAPTER 2

THE SPECIAL PLACE OF THE \textit{PA\textscript{\textit{T}}\textscript{\textit{T}}\textscript{\textit{H}}\textscript{\textit{A}}\textit{NA}} AMONGST BURMESE BUDDHISTS

In this chapter, I shall explore the cultural and sociopolitical contexts in which \textit{Abhidhamma} and the study of the \textit{Abhidhamma} texts, including the \textit{Pa\textscript{\textit{T}}\textscript{\textit{T}}\textscript{\textit{H}}\textscript{\textit{A}}\textit{NA}}, have come to be one of the most distinctive features of Burmese Buddhism in the recent history of Burma. Drawing upon recent works by Eric Braun,\textsuperscript{227} Jason Carbine\textsuperscript{228} and Kate Crosby,\textsuperscript{229} I shall examine how the pervasiveness of \textit{Abhidhamma} amongst Burmese Buddhists has increased since the late-19\textsuperscript{th} century when Burma was colonised by Britain following three Anglo-Burmese Wars (1824-1885). I shall suggest that there is an ongoing process of \textit{‘Abhidhamma-ization’} of Burmese Buddhism. In other words, the emphasis in Burma on learning and preserving the \textit{Abhidhamma}, on using \textit{Abhidhammic} terminologies in sermons and instructions for meditation, and on incorporating the \textit{Abhidhamma} – particularly the \textit{Pa\textscript{\textit{T}}\textscript{\textit{T}}\textscript{\textit{H}}\textscript{\textit{A}}\textit{NA}} – in ritualistic and esoteric practice has intensified over the past two centuries.

As we have seen in the introduction to this thesis, the dynamic role of \textit{Abhidhamma} in contemporary Burma is attested by its presence across the spectrum of Buddhist activities from Buddhist scholarship to meditation to apotropaic practice. Moreover, \textit{Abhidhamma} has been applied in (or used in) the study of Pāli language as early as 13\textsuperscript{th}-14\textsuperscript{th} century C.E. Pagan (see 3.1.) as well as in indigenous medical texts. Drawing upon evidence from my fieldwork in Burma between September 2011 and September 2012, and my own interactions with Burmese Buddhists over many years, I shall suggest that the importance of the \textit{Abhidhamma} for Burmese Buddhists also lies in the belief that it is the \textit{Abhidhamma Pi\textscript{\textit{T}}\textscript{\textit{A}}\textit{KA}}, starting with the \textit{Pa\textscript{\textit{T}}\textscript{\textit{T}}\textscript{\textit{H}}\textscript{\textit{A}}\textit{NA}}, that will

\textsuperscript{227} Braun 2008.
\textsuperscript{228} Carbine 2011.
\textsuperscript{229} Crosby 2014: Chapter 7.
disappear when the current religion of Gotama Buddha, i.e. sāsana, reaches its end. Given the significance of Abhidhamma for the Burmese Buddhists, I shall aim to illustrate below that there is a feedback mechanism in the process of intensification of Abhidhamma culture in Burmese Buddhism. This feedback mechanism, as shown in Figure. 2.1. (see below), reinforces the Burmese worldview that the Abhidhamma, specifically the Paṭṭhāna, acts as a “front-line fortress” safeguarding the Buddha’s sāsana.\textsuperscript{230} Along the way, we shall also see that the changes in the sociopolitical situation in Burma in the 19\textsuperscript{th} century have had implications for the nature of learning Buddhist texts (pariyatti) and the approach to Buddhist practice and the understanding of the Buddhist path, including the ritualistic usages of the Paṭṭhāna.

2.1. Understanding the Abhidhamma from the Burmese perspective

This section considers the importance of Abhidhamma in Burmese Buddhism by taking into the account of the worldview held by Burmese Buddhists in relation to the Abhidhamma Piṭaka. I shall illustrate that the significance of Abhidhamma in Burmese Buddhism comes from the understanding of it as the words of the Buddha (buddhavacana) and as the first part of the Buddha’s Dhamma to disappear. On the basis of these two aspects of Abhidhamma, Burmese Buddhists have come to regard the Paṭṭhāna as the embodiment of the Buddha’s perfect wisdom and as the great defence against the decline of the Buddha’s sāsana. Before exploring the conceptions of Abhidhamma from the perspective of the Buddhist tradition, I shall briefly highlight specific points regarding scholarly analysis of the development of the Abhidhamma Piṭaka in English writings on Abhidhamma.

\textsuperscript{230} Carbine 2011: 148.
As mentioned in the introduction, scholars – for example, David Kalupahana,\textsuperscript{231} Robert Buswell and Padmanabh S. Jaini,\textsuperscript{232} Lance Cousins,\textsuperscript{233} and Rupert Gethin\textsuperscript{234} – have traced the development of *abhidhamma* thought and the *Abhidhamma Piṭaka* from the perspective of textual history. Buswell and Jaini’s article on the development of *Abhidhamma* philosophy gives a very detailed and useful account of evolution of ideas and texts that came to be regarded as *Abhidhamma* in different Buddhist schools. Gethin – writing on canonisation of *Abhidhamma/Abhidharma* of the Theravādins and Sarvāstivādins – suggests that canonical *Abhidhamma* treatises were works composed by multiple authors and evolved over centuries, out of materials and in accordance with certain literary and philosophical tendencies already present in the Vinaya and Sutta portions of the canon.\textsuperscript{235} For example, in the Saṅgītī-sutta of the *Dīgha Nikāya*, when Sāriputta teaches, he organises lists of 230 factors – e.g. aggregates (*khandha*), skilful/unskilful roots (*kusala/akusala-hetu*), faculties (*indriya*) etc. – numerically from ones to tens.\textsuperscript{236} Some of the pairs of factors in the dyad section of the Saṅgītī-sutta appear in the Suttantikadukamātikā, i.e. the mātikā section based on the classification of factors in the *Sutta Piṭaka* (see 1.3.3.).\textsuperscript{237} Another *sutta* that comes very close to the *Abhidhamma*, both in terms of content and methodology, is the *Paṭisambhidāmagga* of the Khuddaka Nikāya in the *Sutta Piṭaka*.\textsuperscript{238}

The Buddhist tradition itself seems to support the scholarly analysis by recognising that some of the canonical *Abhidhamma* texts were the work of the early generations of the Buddha’s disciples. For example, the fifth book of the *Abhidhamma*

\begin{notes}
\item[233] Cousins 1981: 22-46.
\item[235] Gethin 2005b: 10021.
\item[236] Peoples 2009: 4 and 60. See Peoples (2009) for a detailed study of the Saṅgītī-sutta. He looks at the role of the *Saṅgītī-sutta* in the formation of the *Abhidhamma*, as an educational manual as well as a meditation manual.
\item[237] Buswell and Jaini 2006: 85.
\item[238] Karunadasa 2010: 2; Gethin 2005b: 10021.
\end{notes}
Piṭaka, the Kathāvatthu, is explicitly attributed to Mogaliputtatissa at the time of the emperor Asoka in the mid-3rd century B.C.E. According to the Burmese Abhidhamma tradition, a short section in the Saṅkhyaśāra, the ‘enumeration section’, of the Pañhāvāra, the ‘investigation chapter’, called the ‘Paccanīyuddhāra’, translated as ‘synopsis of negative condition’, was added by the elders (theras) at one of the Buddhist councils. Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw says that this section is a summary of methods describing how to expand and understand the enumerations regarding the conditions. (For a detailed explanation of the enumeration section, see Chapter 5.) While Burmese commentators do not indicate the precise council during which this section was supposedly added, it is very likely that they are referring to one of the early Buddhist councils that – according to Theravāda tradition – took place in India. As Gethin observes, the tradition emphasises that the profundity of these texts is proof that they are ultimately the products of the perfect wisdom of a Buddha. As we shall see below, an elaborate account of the origin of the Abhidhamma Piṭaka given in the Pāli commentaries authorises it by claiming that the Buddha reflected on Abhidhamma in the fourth week after his enlightenment and that he taught it to gods at his seventh rains-retreat in Tāvatiṃsa heaven.

According to the commentary on the Dhammasaṅgaṇī, the Atthasālinī, the Buddha taught the Abhidhamma in Tāvatiṃsa heaven for three months, as a mark of gratitude to his mother, who was reborn in Tusita heaven (higher than Tāvatiṃsa in

\footnotesize

240 Paṭṭh 1.216-1.218.
241 The word ‘paccanīyuddhāra’ is a compound of paccanīya and uddhāra. Paccanīya means negative or opposite conditions and uddhāra means synopsis or abstract.
244 Htan”ta-bin Hsayadaw Ven. Nandamedhā writing in the 18th century does not indicate the Buddhist council at which this section was added. He uses the phrase ‘than-ga-ya-na saya’, ‘teachers of saṅgāyana’ (Nandamedhā 2006: 527).
Buddhist cosmology) as a god. Passages in the Atthasālinī and the commentary on the Dhammapada, the Dhammapada-āṭṭhakathā, describe how the teachings in the heavenly realm were brought to the human world by the Buddha himself as he came down for his daily meals and rest, while his replica was still teaching the dhamma in heaven. The Buddha then summarised the teaching to Thera Sāriputta, one of the chief disciples foremost in wisdom, who then taught the teaching to his five hundred pupils. It is believed that these five hundred monks were bats at the time of the previous Kassapa Buddha. Although they could not understand the meaning of the teaching, having heard the sound of the Abhidhamma recited by an elder, the bats then gained faith (saddhā) in the sound of the Dhamma. As a consequence, according to the tradition, they experienced heavenly pleasure as gods during the time interval between Kassapa Buddha and Gotama Buddha. At the time of Gotama Buddha, they became the first to learn the Abhidhamma on earth and thus gained arhantship. This is one of the oft-quoted reasons by the Burmese for reciting the Paṭṭhāna or listening to the recitation of the Paṭṭhāna, even if one does not understand the semantic meaning. In the eyes of the Burmese Buddhists, if small animals like bats, who do not understand that these words are the profound teaching of the Buddha can benefit from just hearing the Paṭṭhāna, people – knowing that it is about Abhidhamma – would gain immensely. For the Burmese, this story then exemplifies not only the direct transmission of the Abhidhamma from the Buddha to his disciples, but also the efficacy of the Abhidhamma and the power of the sound of the Dhamma. The power of

246 While we see many references to her re-birth in Tāvatiṃsa in the western scholarship, the late Tipiṭaka Hsayadaw Ven. U Vicittasāriabhivamsa in his Great Chronicle of the Buddha states that Mahāmāyā was reborn as a god (deva), not as a goddess (devi) in Tusita heaven. He also provides evidence from two sub-commentaries, namely the Jinālankāraṭīkā and the Manidipaṭṭikā (see Vicittasāriabhivamsa 2006: 115-116). The Dhammapada commentary also claims that the gods, including the Buddha’s mother, came down from Tusita to Tāvatimśa to listen to the Buddha’s teaching on the Abhidhamma. See Dhp-a 2.130-2.149 for Pāli, and http://www.tipitaka.net/tipitaka/dhp/verseload.php?verse=181 for an English translation of the story, which is called the Devorohanavatthu in the Buddhavagga of the Dhammapada.

247 As. 13-16 and Dhp-a. 2.130-2.149. See Pe Maung Tin (1999: 19-21) for an English translation of the story in the Atthasālinī.
recitation or sound to evoke saddhā highlighted in this account is consistent with the strong oral tradition observed amongst Burmese Buddhists.

Traditionally, the seven books of the Abhidhamma are believed to be contemplated in sequence by the Buddha in the fourth week after his enlightenment at the north-west of the Bodhi tree, the tree under which the Buddha was enlightened. Only when he reached the Paṭṭhāna his body emitted rays of six colours in all directions because the Buddha took the subtle, and yet profound teaching on the interdependent nature of things that perfectly matches his omniscience as his meditative object. He then contemplated the infinite methods and combinations of relations in the Paṭṭhāna leading to great joy and rapture. As a result, the heart, blood, and other organs became clear and transparent, thus emitting rays from the Buddha’s body. Following the analogy given in the Atthisālinī, the Mahagandayon Hsayadaw Ven. Janakabhivamsa (1900-1977), explains how the great teaching in the Paṭṭhāna befits the Buddha’s omniscient wisdom by comparing it with the imagery of the middle of ocean as a perfect stamping ground for great fish as follows.

Here is a parallel: There are great fish, about 500 yawzanā (yojana) in length, in the ocean. These great fish: when they come near the shore, they do not have enough room to move freely. . . . Only when they are in the middle of the ocean, which is 84,000 yawzanā deep, they can enjoy themselves in oceanic water that deep. They then have an opportunity to

248 As. 12-16. See Pe Maung Tin (1999: 16-19) for the translation of the story of emission of rays from the Buddha’s body that is described in the Atthisālinī.
249 Ven. Janakabhivamsa was an educationalist who revived a famous teaching monastery called Mahagandayon Sathintike in Amarapura, also known as Taung-myo’ – ‘southern city’ as it is located in 11 km (7 miles) southwest of Mandalay (henceforth I shall refer Amarapura as Taung-myo’). He is known by several names. He is known as ‘Mahagandayon Hsayadaw’ because his monastery is called Mahagandayon Sathintike (Mahāgandhārāma Teaching monastery) in Amarapura. Amarapura is also known as Taung-myo’, and thus Janakabhivamsa is known as ‘Taung-myo’ Hsayadaw’ because it’s where he resided. Finally, he is known as ‘Bhāsāṭikā Hsayadaw’ because he composed a series of commentaries in Burmese, and the series is known as ‘Bhāsāṭikā’. The last of the three is used only by the monastics. I shall refer to him as ‘Mahagandayon Hsayadaw’.
250 Yojana in Pāli is a measure of length, a distance of about 7 miles, and is often translated as ‘league’. Carbine notes that the size of one yawjana as understood by Janakabhivamsa remains unclear (Carbine 2011: 150; f.n. 41).
251 It is interesting to note that various sizes of great fish in the ocean is also described in the Pahārāḍā-sutta (AN. 3.38-44) in the Aṅguttara Nikāya. In this sutta, Pahārāḍa, the asura king, while visiting the Buddha, describes that “the mighty ocean is the home of vast beings. . . . There are in the mighty ocean creatures a hundred leagues (long), two hundred, three, four and five hundred leagues long” (Hare 1995: 137).
frolic and enjoy themselves [because] the water is extremely deep and wide. Just in the same way, when the Buddha’s wisdom took the first [six books of the] Abhidhamma as meditative objects and contemplated on it, it [i.e. the first parts of Abhidhamma] does not have enough scope to contemplate freely, as in the shallow water [not allowing the great fish to swim freely]. Then, only when the Buddha arrived at the great Paṭṭhāna, he could apply his wisdom in multiple ways, such that “it is also like this... it is also like this”, contemplating and internalizing [the interdependent relations of things] in a sequential manner. Thus, the Buddha’s great wisdom had found its perfect match with the Paṭṭhāna. In fact, the Buddha’s great wisdom reached an extremely joyful state when it arrived at the Paṭṭhāna.

(translation Carbine 2011: 149-50; adapted and abridged Kyaw)

The commentarial tradition of Sri Lanka and Burma emphasizes the idea that the Buddha’s omniscient wisdom finally had room to fully enjoy the interdependent nature of things and the depths of its comprehension through the innumerable methods and combinations of dhammas and conditions in the Paṭṭhāna. Drawing upon the commentaries, Burmese Buddhists believe that only the Buddha’s omniscient wisdom (sabbaññuta-ṇaṇa) can fully comprehend and understand the profound, interdependent causal relationships described in the Paṭṭhāna. Therefore, the Paṭṭhāna is believed to be the embodiment of the Buddha’s omniscience by Burmese Buddhists. It is important to note that such belief in the authenticity of Abhidhamma is firmly permeated in the Burmese Buddhist society. It is not surprising, then, to witness a very intense reaction from members of the Saṅgha and lay people when the authenticity of Abhidhamma and the credibility of the Sri Lankan commentarial tradition, namely the Mahāvihāra commentarial tradition, are publicly challenged by individuals in Burma. As we shall see in 2.2., such controversial accusations often result in heated scholarly debates and/or formal court cases (since the 1980s reform

---

252 The writing of the commentaries, sub-commentaries and manuals occurred under the auspices of the Mahāvihāra monastery in Anuradhapura in Sri Lanka between the 5th and 12th century C.E. According to the tradition, the famous commentator, Buddhaghosa resided and wrote many commentaries on the canonical Pāli texts at the Mahāvihāra monastery in the 5th century C.E. In the 12th century, King Parakkamabahu I of Sri Lanka forcibly unified the various saṅgha of Sri Lanka under the Mahāvihāra fraternity, emphasising Pāli and Sanskrit learning and correct vinaya conduct. Followling this reformation, a large number of manuals and sub-commentaries were written in Sri Lanka, establishing the Mahāvihāra’s credentials for correct vinaya practice, grammar and textual scholarship, including on the abhidhamma topics (Crosby 2003: 95-96; Crosby 2014: 81).
of Burmese Buddhism under General Ne Win’s government) in a form of Dhamma-vinicchaya.\textsuperscript{253}

The narratives about the decline and disappearance of the Buddha’s sāsana found in the post-canonical literature across the Theravāda world inform the Burmese Buddhist worldview that to safeguard the sāsana is to preserve the Abhidhamma through the study and recitation of it, especially the Paṭṭhāna. Within the Theravāda traditions, there are a large number of narratives that explain when and how the current sāsana will decline and eventually disappear.\textsuperscript{254} These narratives about the decline of the sāsana appear in various commentaries on the canonical texts such as the Manorathapūraṇī, the commentary on Aṅguttaranikāya attributed to Buddhaghosa, and in the later Southeast Asian Buddhist literature, for example the commentary on the Anāgatavamsa, ‘the chronicle of the future’, a text that circulated widely throughout the Theravāda world in Pāli and vernacular recensions.\textsuperscript{255} Although there are several versions of the stories of the disappearance of the sāsana found in commentaries, the narratives generally focus on five disappearances of things related to the sāsana. These five disappearances are: the disappearance of (1) certain attainments associated with the path to arahantship, (2) the learning aspects of the sāsana (paṭipatti-sāsana), (3) the practice aspects of the sāsana (pariyatti-sāsana), (4) the signs or marks of monasticism such as robes, and (5) the Buddha’s relics themselves.\textsuperscript{256}

\textsuperscript{253} In 1979, the then President of Burma, General Ne Win, brought together various sects of the saṅgha, excluding sects which developed after Mindon’s reign and those only found among minority groups, in the name of the purification, perpetuation and propagation of Buddha’s sāsana. Throughout the 1980s, his government introduced various reform measures regarding the Burmese saṅgha administrative system, including the establishment of centralised saṅgha bodies at the national level. These saṅgha bodies are called the State Saṅgha Mahānāyaka Committee (equivalent to the Supreme Saṅgha Council in Thailand), the Central Saṅgha Assembly and the Saṅgha Representatives Assembly, which runs religious affairs of Buddhists concerning doctrine, Buddhist education, administration and judicial matter. The current saṅgha administrative system has brought the saṅgha from various fraternities together to take action against individuals or groups that may seem to be threats to the Buddha’s sāsana and the Buddhist nation.

\textsuperscript{254} Nattier 1991: 56-8. For the study of different narratives about the decline of the sāsana in eastern Buddhism – especially in Chinese Buddhist texts, see Nattier 1991.


\textsuperscript{256} Carbine 2011: 153.
In the Sammohavinodani, the commentary of the Vibhaṅga, as in many of these narratives, the decline of the paṭipatti-sāsana begins with the loss of the Abhidhamma Piṭaka and the decline of the Abhidhamma begins with the loss of the Paṭṭhāna.\\(^{257}\) Therefore, the Paṭṭhāna acts as a fortified defence, khantat in Burmese, for the preservation and perpetuation of Buddhism in the eyes of Burmese Buddhists. This culturally inherited perception encourages Burmese monastics and lay to recite and study the Paṭṭhāna individually and communally. Moreover, the concept of the Paṭṭhāna as ‘the great fort’, maha-khantat in Burmese, is artistically portrayed by San in a published work of colourful illustrations of the 24 conditions.\\(^{258}\) These murals of 24 conditions are also displayed in a dhamma hall of the Shwedagon Pagoda, Yangon.\\(^{259}\) Almost all Abhidhamma monk- and lay-teachers emphasise the responsibility as a Buddhist to perpetuate Buddhism by reciting and studying the Paṭṭhāna. For example, Ven. Paññāsāmi (pen name Māgadhī) concludes his book about the non-stop chanting ceremony of the Paṭṭhāna (see below) by encouraging the reader to prevent the decline of what he calls the “pa-htan" tha-tha-na”, literally ‘paṭṭhāna-sāsana’ or ‘paṭṭhāna religion’.\\(^{260}\) The active and self-conscious attempt to perpetuate Buddhism by the Burmese Buddhists perhaps challenges the prophecy of the decline of the sāsana proposed by Buddhaghosa, the great commentator of the 5\(^{th}\) century.

In addition to the interpretation of Paṭṭhāna as the great defence of the Buddha’s sāsana, it is understood as explaining karmic relations between individuals by the Burmese. For instance, an individual may explain one’s relationship with other people in family or organizational or social contexts by using the Burmese term pa-
htan’set, which can be translated as ‘connected by Paṭṭhāna’. For Burmese people, pa-htan’set describes links of interdependence amongst individuals which may have existed across previous lives. Rozenberg writing on alchemy traditions in Burma also observes the usage of pa-htan’set by Burmese people. In the context of Burmese alchemy and/or wizard, weikza in Burmese, the word pa-htan’set is often understood as one’s accumulated perfections (parāmīs). The ability to become a successful alchemist, or to walk the ‘path of occult knowledge’, weikza-lam’ in Burmese, or to undertake either concentration (samatha) or insight (vipassanā) meditation practice depends on one’s accumulated perfections – i.e. pa-htan’set. Therefore, a variety of the interpretations of the concept of Paṭṭhāna by Burmese Buddhists span across the spectrum of Buddhist practices.

In sum, while the historicity and authenticity of the Abhidhamma works have been questioned by the scholars and by certain Buddhists (see below), the tradition on the whole holds a different view on the origin and development of the Abhidhamma. For Theravādins, the historicity of the Abhidhamma is inseparable from the life of the Buddha and the knowledge that the Buddha attained. Given such tensions, for the purpose of writing this thesis, I shall consider the development of the Abhidhamma from a traditional standpoint in order to see and thus understand practitioners’ perspectives. Nevertheless, historical development of the Abhidhamma is not discarded in this consideration. In fact, the inclusion of both perspectives, namely – historical analysis of Abhidhamma and practitioners’ perspectives – may shed light upon the dynamics involved in the process of intensification of Abhidhamma culture in Burmese Buddhism.

261 Rozenberg 2010: 214.
2.2. The Burmese sociopolitical context and the popularity of the Abhidhamma

We have seen religious reasons for the importance of Abhidhamma in Burma from the Burmese perspective above. This section will then investigate the Burmese sociopolitical climate that has fostered the popularity and omnipresence of Abhidhamma amongst the Burmese to the present day. In particular, I shall demonstrate how a combination of the beliefs mentioned above – i.e. Abhidhamma as the embodiment of the Buddha’s omniscience and the great defense of his sāsana – and the socio-political and cultural factors have led to the ongoing commitment in Burma to the training required to master the complexity of Abhidhamma amongst monastics. These religious, socio-political and cultural factors have also led to an expansion of the Abhidhamma culture to reach out to the mass population, as shown in Figure 2.1.
Figure 2.1. An ongoing process of intensification of Abhidhamma culture in Burmese Buddhism

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Buddhist Beliefs</th>
<th>Socio-political factors</th>
<th>Outcomes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Abhidhamma as the embodiment of the Buddha’s perfect wisdom (sabbaññuta-ñāṇā) and the great defence of the Buddha’s sāsana | Strong literary traditions of Buddhist studies in Burmese history - e.g.:  
- The studies of Pāli language and the Pāli canon in Pagan period or earlier  
- The increased studies of Abhidhamma at least from the 16th/17th century Burma | Omnipresent Abhidhamma:  
- Mass Abhidhamma studies  
- Transformation of studies on Buddhist texts  
- Abhidhamma meditation  
- Abhidhamma medicine  
- Abhidhamma based apotropaic practice  
- Daily objects – e.g. the 24 conditions as logo on fans, banners etc. |

Threats – real or imagined:  
- External threats – e.g. the British in the early 19th century  
- Internal threats – e.g. controversial Buddhist teachings by various groups  
- Natural threats – e.g. cyclones  
- Supernatural threats – e.g. angry spirits or dark magic

Nationalism:  
- Differentiating Burmese Theravāda Buddhism  
- Establishing Burmese Buddhist identity

Reinforcing forces: sermons and dhamma talks given by monks and lay literati + memorisation and recitation of Abhidhamma + beliefs in gods (devas) being helpful
A long history of the study and composition of *abhidhamma* texts in Burma seems to be one of the factors contributing to the ongoing commitment to the *Abhidhamma* studies. In particular, in the 17th century Burma, well-known scholar-monks such as the Taungbila Hsayadaw Ven. Munindaghosa (1578-1651), the Nankyaung Hsayadaw Ven. Aggadhamma and the Taunbi “lu” Hsayadaw Ven. Anantadhaja started composing analytical works called *ayakauk* on mainly on the canonical *abhidhamma* texts (see Chapter 3 and Chapter 4.). *Ayakauk* is a form of *nissaya* and translate the Pāli *abhidhamma* texts into Burmese language with reference to the four categories of ultimate realities, namely consciousness, mental factors, matter and *nibbāna*. These *ayakauk* texts explain how we might interpret and understand the canonical *abhidhamma* texts such as the *Paṭṭhāna*. On the basis of my survey of the *Paṭṭhāna* texts, a complete set of *ayakauk* texts for the whole five volumes of the *Paṭṭhāna* were written by various scholars in the 17th and 18th century. One of such texts which is on the monastic examination syllabus and still used by the students of *Paṭṭhāna* to this day is the text known as the *Htan*”ta-bin pa-htan’ *ayakauk* (henceforth HPA) written by the Htan*’ta-bin* Hsayadaw in the 18th century. In the modern pedagogies of the study of *Paṭṭhāna*, most students may not read the *Htan*”ta-bin pa-htan” *ayakauk* directly. This is because, as we shall see in later chapters, *Paṭṭhāna* teachers in Burma have developed their own textbooks and ways of presenting the conditional relations in tables and charts for their students on the basis of the HPA.

In addition to the use of *ayakauk* in *Abhidhamma* studies in Burma, the Burmese approach to *Abhidhamma* relies predominately on a detailed study of the terse compendium of *Abhidhamma*, the *Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha*. The text itself is written tersely in Pāli verses making the memorization of the contents easier (see 4.1.). This is

---

263 Māgadhī reports that Htan*’ta-bin* Hsayadaw completed the first part of the *paṭṭhāna* *ayakauk* in 1759 during the reign of Alaunghpaya, and the second part in 1777 during the reign of Singu Min (Māgadhī 1996: 176).
a huge help for monastics who are expected to memorize the whole text for their monastic examinations. In order to explain the meaning of the contents, Burmese scholars have written expositions, commentaries and textbooks on this text. Such commentaries and textbooks explain the meaning in detail and thus make abhidhamma slightly easier to understand. As in the Patṭhāna textbooks, the list and classifications of dhammas are presented in tables and charts in modern textbooks on the Abhidhammatthasāṅgaha and it is thus perhaps more interesting for the students. Therefore, such abhidhamma texts written in Burmese language play a very important role in sustaining and promoting the living tradition of Abhidhamma studies amongst monastics and lay students in Burma.

Apart from the strong development of abhidhamma literature in the history of Burmese Buddhism, several other key factors have contributed to the popularity of Abhidhamma amongst the Burmese (see Figure 2.1.). These factors include real or imagined threats to Burma and her religion, i.e. the Buddha’s sāsana, whether from external or internal groups, as well as the essentialisation of Burmese national identity as Theravāda Buddhist in recent history. In order to understand the sociopolitical situation in which the Buddha’s sāsana, in particular the pariyatti-sāsana with reference to Abhidhamma, came to be perceived as the most important/distinguished aspect of Burmese Buddhism by the Burmese, we shall look briefly at some key events relating to monastic education that occurred in the 19th and 20th centuries when British colonialism was the main threat to the Burmese.

The Anglo-Burmese wars and British colonialism in the 19th and early 20th century posed a real threat to the existence of the Buddhist kingdom of the Burmese. This threat to the Burmese kingship came to be perceived as or equated with a threat to Buddhism itself and the Burmese Buddhist culture. Burmese kings had been successful at portraying themselves as guardians of Buddhism and were major
sponsors of Buddhist activities. In response to such threats from the British, the Burmese, including the Saṅgha, became nationalistic after the end of the second Anglo-Burmese war (1852-1854) in which Burma lost the whole of Lower Burma to the British. In spite of the difficult political situation King Mindon (r. 1853-1878) faced, he devoted an enormous effort into demonstrating his intention to safeguard the Buddhist scriptures, and by extension Buddhism itself. He did so through sponsoring of the copying of the Tipiṭaka on palm leaves and the inscribing of the texts on 729 marble slabs in 1860-1868. Prior to the copying Mindon had the texts examined closely for any errors by many monk and lay literati so as to insure purity. In 1871, after all the work to purify the texts and to record them on both palm leaves and stone, Mindon convened the Fifth Council, in which twenty-four hundred monks gathered to chant the entire Tipiṭaka.

In addition Mindon, following the example of his predecessors such as Thalun (r. 1629-1648) and Bodawhpaya (r. 1782-1819), promoted monastic education by transforming the curricula and format of the Pahtamapyan and the Vinaya examinations and introducing Abhidhamma examinations. While Burmese chroniclers and historians credited King Thalun for establishing the Pahtamapyan examinations, Khammai Dhammasāmi demonstrates in his comparative study of the 19th century monastic education systems in Burma and Thailand that the establishment of such formal examinations was politically motivated. Dhammasāmi also suggests that formal examinations restrict the autonomy of the Saṅgha in the management of its education. Under a more autonomous system of monastic education, both the teacher and the student had freedom to choose subjects,

---

265 Braun 2008: 59.  
266 Dhammasāmi 2004: 126-133. The Pahtamapyan and the Vinaya examinations were initiated by King Thalun and Bodawhpaya respectively. On a brief history of the Pahtamapyan and the Vinaya examinations under Thalun and Bodawhpaya, see Dhammasāmi 2004: 63-98.
including secular subjects such as astrology, medicine, mathematics, magic, law and Sanskrit literature, and decide forms of assessments according to their own scholarly interest.\textsuperscript{267} Therefore, prior to Mindon’s reign, the Saṅgha resisted the change from a more autonomous system of monastic education to the formal examinations. Nevertheless, Mindon won the support of the Saṅgha on the issue of the formal examinations through his tactful approach in using the emerging nationalist sentiment amongst the Saṅgha and the idea of specialization-orientated examinations. Mindon promoted the Vinaya and the Abhidhamma examinations as a specialist pursuit by including all canonical vinaya texts and abhidhamma texts in the Burmese edition of the Pāli canon – namely five volumes of the Vinaya and seven volumes of the Abhidhamma respectively – in these examination syllabuses. In terms of the modification of the Pahtamapyan examinations under Mindon, there were some minor changes to the curricula.\textsuperscript{268} On the whole, Mindon’s reformation of the Pahtamapyan syllabuses kept the same texts from the old syllabuses under Bodawhpaya. For instance, the abhidhamma texts, i.e. the Mātikā, the Dhātukathā, the Yamaka and the Paṭṭhāna, which were on the Pahtamapyan syllabus since Bodawhpaya’s reign, were kept in the new syllabuses under Mindon.\textsuperscript{269} Since then, the whole skilful triplet (kusala-tika) of the Paṭṭhāna has been on the syllabus of the advanced level (pahtamakyi). In these examinations held during Mindon’s reign, the candidates recited the texts from memory. The ability to commit the texts to memory and subsequently recall them was, and still is, seen as the mastery of Vinaya and Abhidhamma on the part of successful candidates. Thus, Mindon tapped into the Saṅgha’s psyche, which perceives the mastery of these texts as not only fulfilling their

\textsuperscript{267} Dhammasāmi 2004: 40 and 46–47.
\textsuperscript{268} Dhammasāmi 2004: 129.
\textsuperscript{269} Dhammasāmi 2004: 132–133. See Dhammasāmi (2004: Appendix A) for the syllabuses of the Pahtamapyan examinations under Bodawhpaya.
duties to preserve the golden words of the Buddha, but also satisfying their scholarly pride.

In addition to these examinations, in 1870, Mindon sponsored a three-months-long discussion of the *paṭṭhāna* texts led by the *Thudhamma* (*Sudhamma* in Pāli) Hsayadaws\(^{270}\) at a specially built hall called the *Pa-htan*” Hall.\(^{271}\) Such emphasis on the *Paṭṭhāna* might have reflected the tradition that the study of *Abhidhamma* is so vital to the perpetuation of the Buddha’s *Sāsana* and that the first sign of the decline of Buddhism is thought to be signaled by the disappearance of the *Paṭṭhāna*. At the time when Burma was facing the threat of the British under Mindon, the *Paṭṭhāna* was perhaps seen by Burmese people as a shield guarding Burmese Theravāda Buddhism and the Burmese Buddhist kingdom. Through memorisation and recitation of the canonical Pāli texts, the Sudhamma monks had successfully convinced the royal court of their authoritative textualism.\(^{272}\) In particular, the Sudhamma monks portrayed a tradition of committing the Pāli texts to memory to be as proper monastic training.\(^{273}\) As we shall see in Chapter 4, the oral tradition of monastic learning has survived to the present in Burma.

It could be suggested then that Mindon, in response to the threats from the British, undertook reform based on the promotion of the in-depth study of the canonical and post-canonical texts. Through such active promotion of the *Abhidhamma* and the *Vinaya*, the study of secular subjects became marginalized, and they later disappeared from the mainstream or formal Burmese monastic education system.

---

\(^{270}\) The term ‘*Sudhamma Hsayadaws*’, in this context, refers to the monks who were in the Sudhamma sect (*nikāya*). On detailed analysis of the rise of the *Sudhamma* sect and the reformation led by the *Suddhamma* monks, see Charney (2005: 18-49; 89-107).

\(^{271}\) Than Tun 1989: 729-730.

\(^{272}\) Charney 2005: 44.

\(^{273}\) Charney 2005: 43.
After the British colonization of the whole of Burma in 1885, the British initially adopted a policy of so-called neutrality towards religion, and thus suspended the Pahtamapyan and other monastic examinations, and ended all support for the Saṅgha. This then heightened the fear that under British rule the end of Buddhism was now a real possibility. The anxiety to safeguard the Buddha’s sāsana, in particular the pariyatti-sāsana, spread to the lay people. Therefore, leading monks and prominent community leaders, including influential businessmen, came together to establish the Cetiyaṅgaṇa Pariyatti Dhammānuggaha Association (The Association of (Shwedagon) Pagoda for the Promotion of Buddhist Teachings) in Yangon and the Sāsanahita, known as That-kyá-thi-ha in Burmese (sakyāśiha), in Mandalay in the 1890s, which are still actively involved in holding non-governmental monastic examinations in Burma.274 The main aim of these associations was, and still is, to propagate the sāsana through the promotion of the Buddhist teachings by holding monastic examinations. The examinations of the two associations became known as a-nyo-tha-sa-mei-pwe, national examinations. These monastic examinations are also known as ‘abhivaṃsa’, i.e. ‘higher’, examinations because the candidates are required to undertake detailed and comprehensive study not just of the Pāli canon, including the Abhidhamma Piṭaka, but the commentaries and handbooks such as the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha and the commentaries on it as well. Instead of a secularised monastic education system, leading members of the Saṅgha in Burma have been opposed to secularisation of the monastic education to the present day.275 This then in turn has reinforced the in-depth study of Abhidhamma and other Buddhist texts within the formal monastic education system. Therefore, it could be suggested that the text-based reforms

274 On different types of monastic examinations in Burma, see Kyaw (2012b).
275 Schober explores how the resistance to secularisation of monastic education by the Saṅgha coincided with a rapid increase in demand for secular education provided by the British amongst the lay people with English as the medium of instruction, and thus polarised the monastic and lay education. See Schober (2007: 52-70) for the detailed study of the impact of colonial knowledge on monastic education.
initiated by the final kings of Burma have created legacies in Burmese Buddhism: the retention of more complex systems of Buddhist doctrine based on *Abhidhamma* and the Mahāvihāra commentarial tradition, and the involvement of lay people in monastic education through the growing number of lay associations.

In Burma, it is not surprising then to find that criticisms of the narratives such as the origin of the *Abhidhamma* and/or specific presentations and interpretations of the *Dhamma* in the canonical and post-canonical texts can result in a public outcry from both the *Saṅgha* and lay people. The following cases demonstrate different reasons for such public reaction if and when the credibility and authenticity of *Abhidhamma* in relation to (Mahāvihāra and Burmese) commentarial literature is criticized.

The first case concerns the criticism by Ledi Hsayadaw in the early 20\textsuperscript{th} century of the Sri Lankan commentaries of the *Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha*. The publication of his resulting *Paramatthadīpānī* led to a series of debates between the supporters and the critics of the *Paramatthadīpānī*. In the *Paramatthadīpānī*, Ledi Hsayadaw critiques and corrects specific interpretations made in the commentaries on the *Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha*, namely the *Porāṇāṭikā*, the *Abhidhammatthavibhāvanīṭikā*, known in Burmese as *Tika-kyaw*, and the *Sankhepavāṇṇanā*.\footnote{Braun 2008: 110.} In particular, “Ledi [Hsayadaw] corrects the Tikajaw far more than any other commentary.”\footnote{Braun 2008: 110.} Braun – on the basis of a detailed study of the nature of responses to the *Paramatthadīpānī* –

---

\footnote{On the involvement of lay people in the study of abhidhamma texts through Ledi Hsayadaw’s influence, see Braun (2008: Chapter 4). In terms of the involvement of lay people in insight meditation practice and tradition in the 20\textsuperscript{th} century, see Houtman (1991: 124-158) and Jordt (2001).}

\footnote{The *Porāṇāṭikā* is attributed to a Sri Lankan elder named Navavimalabuddhi in the 12\textsuperscript{th} century. The *Abhidhammatthavibhāvinī* is known to have been written by Sumangalasāmi in the 12\textsuperscript{th} century Sri Lanka. The third one, the *Sankhepavāṇṇanā*, is attributed to a Burmese monk named Saddhamma Jotipāla, also known as Chapada Mahāthera in the 16\textsuperscript{th} century (Bodhi 2010: 17).}
argues that Ledi Hsayadaw’s criticisms were not regarded as doctrinally threatening. Braun reasons as follows:

. . . if Ledi’s corrections were considered doctrinally dangerous, the response āṭīkās [i.e. commentaries] would focus on them directly and vigorously. But none respond in a way that indicates that they considered any particular argument or handful of arguments by Ledi more important than the others.

Despite the harmless nature of Ledi Hsayadaw’s critique, the debates between the supporters and critics of the Paramatthadīpanī stretched over thirty-five years resulting in the publication of over forty books, described by Hla Pain (the biographer of Ledi Hsayadaw) as the “big war of the commentaries”. Since the study of the Abhidhammatthavibhāvanīṭīkā was, and still is, embedded in the scholastic structure of Abhidhamma education in Burma, any criticism of the understanding of particular points in the Abhidhamma can be seen as the criticism of the understanding of the monks who depend upon its interpretations. Thus, it might have provoked the sense of the undermining of the authority of the monks in question, which – in the Burmese monastic context – depends predominately on the display of textual learning.

The second case is a newspaper article criticizing Buddhaghosa’s commentaries in relation to the story of the Buddha’s visit to Tusita heaven. A Burmese-English newspaper called New Times of Burma published an article by a novice called Koyin Cakkinda on 20 October 1951, challenging the orthodox view that the Buddha taught the Abhidhamma in Tusita heaven. In the article ‘Abhidhamma Day’, Cakkinda argues that the story about the Buddha’s visit to Tusita heaven was invented

279 Braun 2008: 126. For a detailed analysis of the nature of the Paramatthadīpanī and the responses, see Braun 2008: Chapter 3.
280 Braun 2008: 126.
282 For instance, the Abhidhammatthavibhāvanīṭīkā is included in the syllabus of the national Abhidhamma Examination held by the Ministry of Religious Affairs (see 4.1.). For the place of Abhidhamma texts – both canonical and post-canonical – in Burmese monastic examinations, see Kyaw (2012b).
283 Braun 2008: 111.
284 The term ‘Koyin’ is a prefix in Burmese used to address a Buddhist novice.
by Buddhaghosa in an attempt to outcompete the rival Abhayagiri monastery of Sri Lanka in the 5th century B.C.E. He concludes, “if the story is accepted as an idiomatic expression to indicate any great transition in thought, it is natural. But to accept the story literally demands an effort in credulity on the part of believers even.”\textsuperscript{285} In response to Cakkinda’s article, lay Abhidhamma teachers and students from the Abhidhamma Propagation Association (APA) of Sule Pagoda requested prominent scholar-monks and lay scholars to assess claims made in the article. The members of the APA also sent letters to the Ministry of Religious Affairs to take action on this issue. The monks and laity considered that accusations made by Cakkinda were “extremely serious for the existence of the Abhidhamma-sāsana”.\textsuperscript{286} Therefore, eight leading scholar-monks, including the Pahkokku Hsayadaw Ven. U Nandavaṃsa, the Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw Ven. U Nārada, and a lay scholar Saya Lin wrote their assessment on the case. These responses were published by the Ministry of Religious Affairs in a book called A-bhi’dama-nei’ A-yei”taw-pon (Abhidhamma Day Rebellion) at a later date.\textsuperscript{287} The responses given by monastic and lay literati draw on both canonical and post-canonical literature across the Vinaya, Sutta and Abhidhamma collections. Moreover, six out of nine respondents single out particular arguments made by Cakkinda and refute them vigorously with long discussions supported by evidence from the Pāli canon and the commentaries. For example, Pahkokku Hsayadaw identifies seven points made by Cakkinda and refutes each of them with evidence drawn from the canonical and post-canonical literature.\textsuperscript{288} Drawing upon the complexity of the conditional relations in the Paṭṭhāna, Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw argues that the Abhidhamma Piṭaka, from the Dhammasaṅgaṇī to the Paṭṭhāna, cannot

\textsuperscript{286}Tha-tha-na-yei”wun-kyi”hta-na 1981: 1.
\textsuperscript{287}I have managed to tracked down the book published in 1981 by the Ministry of Religious Affairs. However, I cannot verify whether it was the first print, as the book does not indicate which print or edition it is.
\textsuperscript{288}Tha-tha-na-yei”wun-kyi”hta-na 1981: 7-27.
be the realm of the disciples’ wisdom (sāvaka-visaya), and it can only be the realm (visaya) and fitting place (gocara) of the Buddha’s wisdom.\(^{289}\) He, therefore, concludes that the Abhidhamma is spoken by the Buddha, i.e. buddhabhāsita.

A similar controversial case – in which a group called luthe-luhpyit, literally translated as ‘Die as Human, Born as Human’, rejected the authenticity of almost all of the Pāli canon, including the Abhidhamma, and the existence of all realms but human – occurred in the 1950s and 1960s.\(^{290}\) Retrospectively in the early 1980s, under the reform and scrutiny of the Saṅgha introduced by General Ne Win through the Saṅgha Purification and Unification Act, this luthe-luhpyit group was put on trial at the highest Saṅgha court for teaching and spreading the Dhamma that is not in accordance with the Buddha’s true teaching, and the group was subsequently banned.\(^{291}\)

These cases above attest to not only the relevance and importance of Abhidhamma in the daily life of Burmese Buddhists, but also to how passionately the parties concerned defend any challenge to its authority and sanctity with reference to the Saṅgha’s in-depth knowledge of Buddhist doctrine. While Ledi Hsayadaw’s case might not have been regarded as doctrinally threatening, the other two cases were, and still are, seen as internal threats to the sāsana as they challenged the belief in the authenticity and purity of the Tipiṭaka held by a majority of the Burmese. An ongoing anxiety to preserve the sāsana amongst the Burmese might have been heightened when facing external and internal threats – real or imagined. This then seems to have contributed to the increased popularity of Abhidhamma amongst the Burmese. Turning to popular culture of Abhidhamma, we shall now explore how Paṭṭhāna is used as a basis to safeguard oneself and others from natural and supernatural threats in relation to ritual and protective practices.

\(^{289}\) Tha-tha-na-yei”wun-kyi”hta-na 1981: 109 and 111.
\(^{290}\) Tha-tha-na-yei”wun-kyi”hta-na 2005: 24-35.
\(^{291}\) Dhammasāmi 2012: 162-163.
2.3. *Paṭṭhāna* in ritual and protective practices: the most powerful *abhidhamma* text safeguarding from natural and supernatural threats

As we have seen in the introduction, in Burma, the *Paṭṭhāna* is the most popular protective text out of all *abhidhamma* texts. The *Paṭṭhāna* is regarded by the Burmese as the most sacred and powerful text, which can be used not just to safeguard oneself and others – family, community, or nation – from threats caused by nature such as cyclones, fire etc., and supernatural threats such as angry spirits, dark magic etc., but also to bring good luck and positive outcomes to oneself and others, as shown in Figure 2.1. This section will explore some aspects of a non-stop chanting ceremony of the *Paṭṭhāna*, and the ways in which the efficacy of *Paṭṭhāna* has been explained by the Burmese. In so doing, I shall also assess the understanding of Pāli language and the power of Pāli sound/word (*sadda*) from Theravāda perspective.

2.3.1. The non-stop chanting ceremony of the *Paṭṭhāna*

We have seen that King Mindon sponsored the discussion, and possibly the recitation, of the *Paṭṭhāna* by the Suddhamma Hsayadaws for three months (see above). However, we do not know when and how the current form of the non-stop *paṭṭhāna* chanting ceremony, *a-than-ma-se"pa-htan"pwae*, came about in modern period (see below). Ven. Dr. Nandamālābhivaṃsa (1940- ), the Rector Hsayadaw of the International Theravāda Buddhist Missionary University (ITBMU) (henceforth Nandamālābhivaṃsa), recalls that on his first visit to Yangon in 1952, he noticed the
24-hour non-stop chanting ceremony of the Paṭṭhāna at Shwedagon Pagoda. It was the first time that he had seen the non-stop paṭṭhāna chanting ceremony. It seems to me that the popularity of the non-stop paṭṭhāna chanting has increased rapidly and spread to various parts of the country over the past thirty years or so. For instance, in 1983, Ven. U Paññāsāmi (pen name Māgadhī) wrote a how-to manual for sponsoring and organizing the non-stop paṭṭhāna chanting ceremony. The non-stop paṭṭhāna chanting ceremony is now omnipresent amongst the Burmese Buddhists as the annual non-stop chanting ceremony of the Paṭṭhāna is held not just in many towns and villages throughout Burma, but also amongst the Burmese diaspora in the UK and the USA. For instance, several precept-nuns from Sagaing informed me that they travel up to the nunnery of their friends in Myitkyina in Kachin State in the north of Burma every year to help organize the chanting ceremony and to participate in the chanting. As for the chanting ceremony of the Paṭṭhāna amongst the Burmese diaspora in the UK, Tisarana Vihāra in Twickenham, London, for example, holds a 3-day non-stop chanting ceremony of the Paṭṭhāna every April as a celebration of the Burmese New Year.

While the paṭṭhāna chanting in Burma is similar to the formal paritta chanting ceremony in Sri Lanka in many aspects, it is not performed in a temporary enclosure. On the contrary, the chanting of Paṭṭhāna is usually performed in front of the main shrine room of the monastery or the nunnery, where a desk with a pile of paṭṭhāna books and a lamp will be laid out. Items to be empowered through the sound of Paṭṭhāna are placed close to the desk. For instance, twenty-four pots or bottles of

---

292 Interview with Ven. Dr. Nandamāḷābhivamṣa on 23 January 2012.
293 I visited the annual non-stop paṭṭhāna chanting ceremony at Tisarana Vihāra in April 2011 as part of my fieldwork.
294 In Burmese Buddhism, there are eleven discourses (suttas) which are considered as the main protective chants and known as 'pa-yelkkyi hsathathok', the great eleven discourses. Many people would have committed at least one or two suttas in their memories, and others would know the whole set of eleven suttas by heart.

126
water, each labelled with a condition, e.g. *hetu-paccaya*, *ārammaṇa-paccaya* etc., represent the twenty-four conditions and are essential items to be blessed, and later distributed.

A non-stop chanting ceremony of the *Paṭṭāna* can last from 24 hours to seven days and nights.\(^{296}\) It is usually undertaken by monks and precept-nuns at monasteries, nunnuries and/or communal spaces such as a pagoda compound. In Yangon, non-stop *paṭṭāna* chanting seems to be performed increasingly by lay people (see Introduction). Since the chanting is non-stop for a certain length of time, i.e. one to seven days, the participants take turns in the chanting. For example, a monk may chant for a hour and then another monk takes over the chanting, continuing with the text.\(^{297}\) Loudspeaker systems are usually set up so even those unable to attend the ceremony may benefit from the sound broadcast around the neighbourhood throughout day and night.\(^{298}\) The monks and nuns are provided with the breakfast and lunch, and are kept refreshed with sweets, drinks and other nourishments regarded as ‘medicine’ (according to the monastic discipline) in the afternoon and throughout the night. People in the neighbourhood may volunteer to help with cooking and providing food for the participants. Some may donate money contributing towards breakfast and lunch offering for the monks and nuns. People may come and go during the chanting ceremony. Some may stay longer listening to the chanting and/or helping with cooking or other chores. Therefore, the non-stop *paṭṭāna* chanting ceremony is a communal event in which people in the neighbourhood, and monks and nuns from other monasteries and nunneries come together to perform

---

\(^{296}\) During my fieldwork in Burma, I observed non-stop *paṭṭāna* chanting ceremonies in Yangon, Pyay, Sagaing and Monywa. In particular, while I was ordained as a precept-nun, I participated in the chanting of the *Paṭṭāna* at a 5-day non-stop chanting ceremony at Myintzujaka nunnery in Monywa. Moreover, I participated in the chanting of the *Paṭṭāna* at APA in Yangon.

\(^{297}\) In non-stop *paṭṭāna* chanting undertaken by precept-nuns, they rotate every half hour. As for lay people, they rotate every fifteen minutes, presumably because it is more difficult for lay people to chant for a longer time with no break.

\(^{298}\) It is interesting to observe different views that people have regarding whether such broadcasting is a disturbance for people in the neighbourhood.
meritorious acts such as chanting and listening to the *Dhamma*, as well as doing donations (dāna).

The non-stop chanting of *paṭṭhāna* is normally performed in a more formal setting with ceremonial opening and closing. During the opening ceremony specially chosen monks or nuns read out various praises of the Buddha’s omniscient wisdom in relation to the *Paṭṭhāna* written by Burmese scholars. If the non-stop chanting ceremony is exclusively organised and chanted by lay people, then the praises are read out by specifically chosen lay people. These praises are meant to be read out poetically because they are written in meter. I observed that the opening praises read by nuns and lay people are more melodious than that by monks. After the opening praises, a special Pāli verse and the Pāli-Burmese *nissaya*\(^{299}\) of the verse are read out inviting gods from infinite universes, including brahmās, to attentively listen to the chanting of *Paṭṭhāna*. Then, the *paṭṭhāna* chanting begins with the whole audience chanting the *Paccayuddesa* and the *Paccayaniddesa* sections together. During the closing ceremony, two people may retell the story of the origin of *Abhidhamma*, according to the tradition, in question and answer format. The sharing of merits with the whole audience – seen or unseen – plays a crucial part in the closing ceremony. Only then, the invited gods are sent away by reading a sending-away verse in Pāli and Pāli-Burmese *nissaya*. It therefore seems that the non-stop *paṭṭhāna* chanting is to benefit people as much as gods and other beings, to which we shall now turn.

2.3.2. The *Paṭṭhāna* recitation for oneself and others

---

\(^{299}\) The Pāli-Burmese *nissaya* of such verses are much more interpretive and elaborate than direct translations. On a brief explanation of different types of Pāli-Burmese *nissaya*, see 3.1.
Drawing upon Nicola Tannenbaum’s work on power relationships between various beings in the context of Shan Buddhism,\(^{300}\) this section explores the protective role of the *Paṭṭhāna*. In particular, this section seeks to illustrate the role of the *Paṭṭhāna* in the “power-protection/acquisition”\(^{301}\) relationships between various beings – seen or unseen. I shall first explain the concept of ‘power’, *tan-hko*” in Burmese, in relation to various beings in the Buddhist cosmology. I shall then discuss the Burmese conception of the *Paṭṭhāna* as the most powerful ritual text and of how the power endowed in the *Paṭṭhāna* is transferable for the benefit of oneself and others.

As Tannenbaum writes, power is a basic, unquestioned part of the universe. It is not equally distributed throughout the universe; some beings have great power, others have little.\(^{302}\) In the context of Burmese Buddhism – as in Shan Buddhism – the Buddhas, i.e. previous Buddhas, Gautama Buddha of this world, and the next Buddha, have the greatest power. Beings in the lowest hells have the least power. Gods (*devās*), humans, and spirits (see below) generally rank somewhere in the middle, and they are essentially the same in terms of their experiences as they all can feel pain and pleasure, and are subject to death. These beings, namely gods, humans and spirits, are ranked in terms of relative power: gods are regarded as more powerful than humans; humans are seen as more powerful than spirits. Gods or deities reside in heavens, and they are mainly helpful towards humans. In contrast, the term ‘spirits’ is used here to refer to local guardian spirits, *nats* in Burmese, and beings in unfortunate realms such as the realm of hungry ghosts (*peta-loka*) and the realm of antigods/titans (*asura-loka*). Some of these spirits have less power than human. As Tannenbaum notes, power also

\(^{300}\) Tannenbaum 2001: 79-99.
\(^{301}\) Kyaw 2010: 37.
\(^{302}\) Tannenbaum 2001: 79.
implies protection.\textsuperscript{303} If one has access to power, one is protected. Moreover, power has an acquisitive aspect in that power causes good things to happen to one who has access to it.\textsuperscript{304} Another aspect of power is that power can be gained or lost.\textsuperscript{305} Once achieved, power can be shared and bestowed on one’s followers. The implication is that if one has access to power as a result of invoking powerful beings or using powerful objects or reciting powerful chants, then the resulting power can be shared with others. The above analysis is important for the following paragraphs as it provides background for the Burmese conception of the power endowed in the \textit{Paṭṭhāna} and how such power is perceived to have functioned for oneself and others.

In the context of Burmese Buddhism, the chanting of the \textit{Paṭṭhāna}, as with the chanting of the \textit{paritta}, is believed to be endowed with protective and acquisitive power.\textsuperscript{306} In my survey questions, I asked the informants regarding their views on benefits accrued from the chanting of the \textit{Paṭṭhāna}. Out of 53 informants, who completed the survey questions, 22 informants explicitly state that the chanting of the \textit{Paṭṭhāna} prevents bad things or dangers such as accidents or serious illnesses from happening to them.\textsuperscript{307} One of the informants, informant M4, explains his experience regarding the use of the 24 conditions as a protective chant to stop the evil spirits from tormenting him as follows.

At that time, I was living at a monastery in Myitkyina [in Kachin state]. . . . There, I had nightmares about ghosts and evil spirits, and could not sleep. It went on for about two weeks. I then remembered to use the 24 conditions as a fence [\textit{si"ta}” in Burmese] around my bed [by chanting the conditions]. Since that night, they [i.e. evil spirits] did not disturb me and I had good sleep. So, I carried on with the practice up to now.

During my fieldwork in Burma in 2010, and 2011-2012, I have encountered people saying that evil spirits do not like the chanting of the \textit{Paṭṭhāna}, or indeed any kind of

\textsuperscript{303} Tannenbaum 2001: 80.
\textsuperscript{304} Kyaw 2010: 38.
\textsuperscript{305} Tannenbaum 2001: 80.
\textsuperscript{306} Kyaw 2010: 37-40.
\textsuperscript{307} 3 informants answered ‘yes’, and they did not give further explanations. 2 informants did not answer the question.
protective Buddhist chant, and that these spirits cannot stand it. The Burmese use the Burmese word ‘pu-laung’, literally ‘hot’ or ‘scorching’, to imply that the chanting or the sound of the Paṭṭhāna burns the evil spirits. This is based on the perception that the Paṭṭhāna, as the most virtuous and powerful force, is very unpleasant for evil spirits. Therefore, in the eyes of the Burmese, if one chants the Paṭṭhāna evil spirits cannot stay within one’s compound.

On the basis of such belief, some people whom I met during my fieldwork in Burma also say that one should not recite the Paṭṭhāna at home because it makes the evil spirits angry and that these evil spirits may cause harm. Although their conception of the power of the Paṭṭhāna may seem contradictory to the protective power of the Paṭṭhāna as explained by informant M4 and other informants, the two attitudes are consistent when we take the Burmese conception of kamma, kan in Burmese, into account. During my fieldwork in 2010, and 2011-2012 in Burma, I encountered cases where my informants talk about two kinds of kammic effects, namely positive kammic effects and negative kammic effects, from their previous actions done in the previous lives or the present life.308 In Burmese, these two kammic effects are referred to as kan-myni’, literally means ‘high kamma’, and kan-nein’, ‘low kamma’. The Burmese believe that there are times when the kammic retribution is at its height, i.e. the good kamma (kusalakamma) from the past yields positive effects. At other times, the kammic retribution may be at the low, i.e. the negative effects arise from bad kamma done in the past. In other words, these times are what we might call high and low points in one’s life, but for the Burmese, they explicitly express them in terms of kamma and kammic retributions. According to one of my informants, informant LW1, with whom I interviewed in 2010 on the issue of Buddhist rituals in relation to Buddhist business practices, when a person is at a low point, i.e. kan-nain’,

308 See 1.2. on the Burmese conception of kamma within and across lifetimes.
then evil spirits or local guardian spirits (nats) can cause harm if they want to. In terms of the power-protection paradigm mentioned above, at such a low point, the person’s power is lost and thus his/her protection against harmful dangers and evil beings is lost too. At a such time, evil spirits or nats can cause harm. My informant adds,

We are ordinary beings [i.e. puthujjana-puggala] and do unskilful actions [i.e. akusalakamma]. We also forget to do skilful actions [i.e. kusalakamma] sometimes. At such a low point [i.e. kan-näint], we are likely to do more unskilful actions. This makes it easier for the evil spirits and nats to harm us. So, it is better to avoid any kind of behaviour that might make them [i.e. spirits and nats] angry or upset in the first place.309

As mentioned above, there is a perception amongst the Burmese that the chanting of the Paṭṭhāna ‘burns’, pu-laung in Burmese, the evil spirits, and thus makes them angry. It is in this context that some people claim that one should not chant the Paṭṭhāna at home. In response to such view, which is pervasive amongst the Burmese, Shwe-sin Tipiṭaka Hsayadaw Ven. Dr. Gandhamālālaṅkāra (1968- ), who is the ninth monk to pass the Tipiṭakadhāra Examinations in the whole of Burma,310 says,

To hold such view is extremely wrong because in the Paṭṭhāna the Buddha taught how ultimate realities are related using numerous methods. The Paṭṭhāna is not a mantra to cause harm to evil spirits. In fact, the Paṭṭhāna is very powerful and is highly venerated by many gods and brahmas. Having heard the Buddha’s preaching on the Abhidhamma in Tāvatimsa heaven, innumerable numbers of gods and brahmas became noble beings [i.e. ariya-puggala]. These gods and brahmas are very pleased with the people who recite, study and contemplate on the Paṭṭhāna. And, they [i.e. gods and brahmas] protect them from various dangers and bring good luck to them. Through the veneration of the Paṭṭhāna, one will gain enormous amount of merit and will be protected by the gods and brahmas. It can also help one to reach nibbāna. In the light of all [these] benefits, it is senseless not to recite [the Paṭṭhāna] just because of the minority of evil spirits [do not like it].311

309 Informant LW1, interviewed on 20 July 2010.
310 The Tipiṭakadhāra Selection Examinations (TSE) began in 1949 under U Nu’s government. It consists of two components: oral and written. The oral examinations cover the Vinaya Piṭaka (all five volumes comprising 2260 pages), the Dīghā Nikāya of the Sutta Piṭaka (2 books comprising 782 pages) and the Abhidhamma Piṭaka (13 books comprising 4,987 pages), a total of 20 books with 8027 pages. In addition, the written component extends to include the exegeses on these canonical texts. See Dhammasāmi and Kyaw (2012) on a brief history of the TSE.
311 Shew-sin Tipiṭaka Hsayadaw, interviewed on 19 December 2011.
Shwe-sin Tipiṭaka Hsayadaw’s perspective on the benefits of the Paṭṭhāna chanting not only reflects the pervasive belief held by the Burmese about both the protective and the acquisitive power of the Paṭṭhāna, but also explains that benefits outweigh any drawback associated with the chanting of the Paṭṭhāna. In this light, some people say that in order to reduce any adverse effect of the Paṭṭhāna chanting on evil beings, the Karanīyametta-sutta, ‘discourse on loving-kindness’, should be recited before the chanting of the Paṭṭhāna. For the Burmese, the Karanīyametta-sutta is believed to have ‘cooling’ effect on all beings, which reflects the canonical view of benefits accrued from the Karanīyametta-sutta. Thus, the chanting of both the Karanīyametta-sutta and the Paṭṭhāna together creates balanced power-protection/acquisition relationships between various beings in the eyes of the Burmese.

Another dynamic aspect regarding the Burmese conception of the power of the Paṭṭhāna is related to the concept of merit accrued from the chanting of the Paṭṭhāna and the sharing of the merit with others. All of my informants believe that the chanting and study of the Paṭṭhāna generates enormous amount of merit regardless of whether one knows the semantic meaning or not (see below). Informant M11 says, “Once one has chanted the Paṭṭhāna, one can share the merit accrued from the chanting with others. Thus, the ‘patti-dāna’, [i.e. ‘giving of acquired merit’] is achieved”. According to Bamaw Hsayadaw, both gods (devas) and some woeful beings such as hungry ghosts (petas) like to listen to the chanting of the Paṭṭhāna, along with other protective chants (parittas). He explains that the merit gained by listening to the Buddha’s Dhamma and rejoicing in hearing the teachings may convert beings in woeful states into more favourable states, as in the story in which the 500 bats were reborn in heaven upon hearing the sound of the Abhidhamma (see 2.1.).

---

312 People use the term ‘ei”mya thi’ or ‘ei”hkyan thi’, literally ‘cool’ or ‘calm’ respectively, to reflect the effect of the Karanīyametta-sutta.
313 Informant LW8, interviewed on 18 December 2011.
314 Informant M 11, questionnaire.
We have, so far, seen a complex picture of the Burmese conception of the power endowed in the Paṭṭhāna. All of my informants agree that by chanting the Paṭṭhāna, one not just protects oneself from harmful things such as escaping from accidents and natural disasters, but also brings positive outcomes, e.g. having good fortune in business or at a job and good health, to oneself.\textsuperscript{315} In addition to worldly benefits, the majority of my informants are very keen to point out that through the recitation as well as the study of the Paṭṭhāna, one will be able to attain enlightenment (nibbāna) eventually.\textsuperscript{316} They also agree that the chanting of the Paṭṭhāna is a meritorious act, and the merit accrued from such an act can be shared with others, which in turn multiplies the merit.\textsuperscript{317} Moreover, my informants note that the Paṭṭhāna is highly respected by gods. They believe that gods and brahmas very much like to hear the chanting of the Paṭṭhāna. In the eyes of the Burmese, pleasing the gods through the recitation of the Paṭṭhāna, whether individually or communally, they protect and bring good fortune for the reciter, and this makes the Paṭṭhāna efficacious. However, it is not very clear to me at the moment as to their perception about the power of the Paṭṭhāna in relation to spirits and woeful beings. On the one hand, some people believe that the Paṭṭhāna can have a ‘burning’ effect on evil spirits, and thus evil spirits do not like to hear the chanting of the Paṭṭhāna. They thus claim that the Paṭṭhāna should not be recited at home, or it should be chanted in conjunction with the Karanīyaṃetta-sutta. On the other hand, some people, including Bamaw Hsayadaw, explain that the power endowed in the Paṭṭhāna and the merit accrued from the chanting and listening of the Paṭṭhāna can turn woeful beings in unfortunate states into more favourable states. Therefore, evidence from my fieldwork suggests that the

\textsuperscript{315} Māgadhī 1996: 168.

\textsuperscript{316} Informants M3, M5, M9, M11, M14, M15, M16, LM4, LM6, LM8, LM10, LW2, LW3, LW4, LW5, LW7, LW11, LW15, LW17, LW23, and LW27. In their answers to the questionnaire, they have indicated meditative benefits accrued from the chanting and the study of the Paṭṭhāna.

\textsuperscript{317} Several informants, e.g. M11, N3, LM4, LW8, and LW9, explicitly used the term ‘ku-tho-pwa’, literally ‘multiplying the merit’, when they are talking about the chanting and study of the Paṭṭhāna.
Burmese understanding of the inherent power of the *Paṭṭhāna* and the ways in which such power can affect various beings is dynamic. This is because my informants draw upon various concepts – such as the law of *kamma*, merit, and power relationships between various beings – and their own understanding of these concepts in order to discuss the protective and acquisitive power of the *Paṭṭhāna*.

Having discussed the power of the *Paṭṭhāna* in relation to various beings, the rest of the section will explore specific ways through which the efficacy of the *Paṭṭhāna* is understood to have worked by my informants. We have already seen that the efficacy of the *Paṭṭhāna* is realised by pleasing the gods through recitation and study of the *Paṭṭhāna*. U Htay Hlaing reports that in the 17th century the Taungbila Hsayadaw, the author of the first *Paṭṭhāna* *ayakauk* (see 3.1. and Appendix G), asked a (stream-enterer) god who came to listen his recitation of the *Paṭṭhāna* whether the *Paṭṭhāna* being recited was the same as the words spoken by the Buddha. The god then answered in the affirmative.318 According to Shwe-sin Tipitaka Hsayadaw, powerful gods, having heard the words of the Buddha in his lifetime, now have a chance to listen to these words again.319 Informant M12 explains, “By providing the chance to listen the teaching again, powerful gods will in turn help and protect the reciter. This is why the *Paṭṭhāna* is regarded as a very powerful text.”

In order to make the *Paṭṭhāna* recitation more efficacious, Bamaw Hsayadaw suggests five things that should be undertaken by the reciter.

1) The reciter must wear clean clothes and recite in a clean environment.

2) The recitation must be done at a set time regularly - i.e. if one recites at 7:00 am, one must stick to it.

3) The regular recitation must be at a set place - i.e. one must recite in the same place.

4) Loud and clear textual enunciation is essential.

318 See Hlaing (Undated): 76-77.
319 Shwe-sin Tipitaka Hsayadaw, interviewed on 05 Dec 2010.
5) One must share the merit of the recitation of the *Paṭṭhāna*.\textsuperscript{320} Bamaw Hsayadaw advocates that these five things enhance the efficacy of the *Paṭṭhāna*. Having a clean environment creates a pleasant atmosphere for the gods, while reciting at same time and same place fulfils the expectations of the gods who would come regularly. Moreover, loud and clear textual enunciation evokes the power of the *Paṭṭhāna* in full strength.

Another explanation for the efficacy of the recitation of the *Paṭṭhāna* is based on the Theravāda Buddhist conception of the Pāli language as the language spoken by the Buddha.\textsuperscript{321} For example, when I asked the Shwe-sin Tipiṭaka Hsayadaw whether it would still be efficacious if the *Paṭṭhāna* is recited in other languages, he replied that it would still be efficacious because the *paṭṭhāna* texts are statements of truth uttered by the Buddha. He then added that it is more appropriate to recite it in the Pāli language because by reciting the texts in Pāli clearly and precisely one’s recitation of the *Paṭṭhāna* reconnects with the words, or the sounds, of the Buddha which are still present in the infinite universes in the Buddhist cosmology.\textsuperscript{322} He, thus, reasoned that the recitation of the *Paṭṭhāna* in Pāli not only invokes the power of the Buddha, who has the greatest power (see above), but is a form of paying respect to the Buddha and his perfect wisdom as well.\textsuperscript{323}

From *abhidhamma* perspective, language is regarded as a concept (*paññatti*).\textsuperscript{324} Nevertheless, for Burmese Buddhists, the language and the way in which *paṭṭhāna* or *paritta* is recited seems to have an impact on the efficacy of these texts. An implication

\textsuperscript{320} Kumārābhivamsa 06 June 2009.
\textsuperscript{321} Crosby 2014: 90. On the transition from using the term ‘pāli’ as ‘text’ to using it as a language name, and how Pāli came to be seen as a *lingua franca* of Theravāda Buddhism, see Crosby 2014: 89–91.
\textsuperscript{322} I have not come across the understanding that the word/sound of the Buddha is present throughout the Buddhist cosmos to this day in canonical and post-canonical literature. Yet, the belief that the rays emitted by the Buddha while he was contemplating the *Paṭṭhāna* are still present across the Buddhist cosmos is common amongst the Burmese. The praises recited at the opening ceremony of the non-stop *paṭṭhāna* chanting attests to such a pervasive belief among the Burmese.
\textsuperscript{323} Shew-sin Tipiṭaka Hsayadaw, interviewed on 05 Dec 2010.
\textsuperscript{324} Bodhi 2010: 325-328; Karunadasa 2010: 10 and 47-58.
of evoking the power through the recitation of the *patṭhāna* texts in Pāli is that the Pāli language is regarded as a sacred language by the Burmese Buddhists, which is similar to the brahmanical attitude to Sanskrit. The power of *patṭhāna* and *paritta* is believed to derive in part from the intrinsic power of the Pāli language. Asanga Tilakaratne, exploring the idea of Pāli as a sacred language in later Buddhist traditions, points out that later development of this idea took place under the influence of Hinduism.\textsuperscript{325} Tilakaratne writes that in early Buddhism language has been considered as a natural phenomenon, and thus it is subject to the three signs common to any other things, i.e. impermanence, suffering and not-self.\textsuperscript{326} He also reports that in the canonical pāli texts, the power of *paritta* is believed to derive from their source and content, i.e. the truthfulness of the words in the *paritta* spoken by the Buddha.\textsuperscript{327}

Turning to post-canonical Pāli texts, he traces the development of the view of a sacred language in Theravāda Buddhism with specific reference to Buddhaghosa’s commentaries. For instance, in the *Sammohavinodanī*, Buddhaghosa claims that Pāli is spoken everywhere in hell, the animal realm, the human realm and heaven, and that it will never change.\textsuperscript{328} Moreover, in the commentary to the ordination and higher ordination (*pabbajjā-upasampadā*), Buddhaghosa stresses that unless the formula of going refuge to the Triple Gems is recited exactly without adding or omitting even one single syllable, the purpose of ordination is not achieved.\textsuperscript{329} As Crosby observes, Theravāda Buddhists, at least by the time of Buddhaghosa, came to regard Pāli as a sacred language with special qualities such as these: Pāli is pure and a *lingua franca* across worlds understood by gods, hell-beings and animals.\textsuperscript{330} In this sense, the words of the Pāli language contain extraordinary mystical powers capable of converting an

\textsuperscript{325} Tilakaratne 1993: 117-121.
\textsuperscript{326} Tilakaratne 1993: 117.
\textsuperscript{327} Tilakaratne 1993: 118-119.
\textsuperscript{328} Tilakaratne 1993: 120.
\textsuperscript{329} Crosby 2014: 90.
\textsuperscript{330} Crosby 2014: 90.
ordinary person into an ordained monk, or removing any danger and bringing good fortune to the reciter. The degree to which the perception of Pâli as a sacred language is common amongst the Burmese is yet to be ascertained. Nevertheless, the evidence from my fieldwork suggests that such a conception of Pâli, i.e. Pâli as a sacred language, is implicit in the Burmese interpretation of how the efficacy of the Paṭṭhāna works.

In sum, the understanding of the protective and acquisitive power of the Paṭṭhāna by the Burmese depends upon numerous factors. For the Burmese, the efficacy of the Paṭṭhāna is believed to derive from the truthfulness of the content, the power of the Buddha, the precise pronunciation of the paṭṭhāna texts in Pâli, and the helpful gods who are pleased with the recitation of the Paṭṭhāna.

The omnipresent recitation of paṭṭhāna and paritta in Burma raises an interesting question. To what extent do Burmese Buddhists know the meaning of the Pâli (which is now a dead language) texts being chanted? The early ethnographic accounts of Theravādin paritta, Stanley J. Tambiah,331 Lily de Silva332 and Melford Spiro333 for example, suggest that the meanings remain inscrutable to laypeople. They also argue that the paritta tradition arose as a “response to an irrepressible psychological need’, through which the pursuit of ‘non-soteriological goals’ came to be seen as a legitimate part of Buddhist practice”.334 According to these early accounts, the paritta tradition is to accommodate the psychological needs of the laypeople, who see it as “a form of white magic”.335 Anne Blackburn overturned this view of ‘accommodating rituals’ by demonstrating that the monastics in thirteenth and eighteenth century Sri Lanka self-consciously attempted to create connections

---

331 Tambiah 1968.
332 deSilva 1981.
333 Spiro 1982.
between *paritta* and forest-dwelling ascetic practices. Moreover, Paul Greene analysing the practice of Burmese *paritta* chants from ethno-musicological perspectives explains that not only meanings of texts but also sounds are important to understand the functions and place of the *paritta* in Theravāda world. By using a model of ‘the sonic praxis of the *dhamma*’, i.e. ‘*dhamma* as patterned sound’ to analyse the *paritta* chants, he concludes that although ordinary laypeople typically cannot grasp the meaning of the texts at first, melodic, rhythmic, and timbral features of the *paritta* recitations inspire interest in and mindfulness of the texts and eventually facilitate their memorisation. Based on the evidence of audio recordings of the *Paṭṭhāna* recitation by Burmese monks, such musicological aspects are also present in the *Paṭṭhāna* recitations to some extent. For example, the recitation of the *Paṭṭhāna* by Bamaw Hsayadaw is aesthetically powerful and highly pleasing. In terms of the recitation of the *Paṭṭhāna* by a group of monks or a group of nuns, the recitation of the *Paṭṭhāna* by nuns is more harmonious and perhaps more musicological than the recitation by monks. I thus find the recitation of the *Paṭṭhāna* by nuns aesthetically very pleasing.

These musical features perhaps act as learning tools in the memorisation process of the long *Paṭṭhāna* text. In addition to this passive learning of the *Paṭṭhāna* through melodic recitations, a conscious process of learning the *Paṭṭhāna*

---

336 Blackburn 1999: 355-356; 365-372. My survey of the *paritta* literature in Burmese also shows that learned monks have appropriated the *paritta* for their literary study and monastic practices. For example, the Tha-pyay-kan Hsayadaw, Ven. Vāseṭṭhābhivamśa, wrote a scholarly *nissaya* of the *paritta* suttas.

337 Greene 2004. See Greene (2004: 47-48) for his informants’ accounts of how the melodic and rhythmic features of *dhamma* incantation, like the elements of poetic style, help greatly in the memorizations of the lengthy texts. His paper also compares differences in the melodic and rhythmic features between the Burmese, Sinhala and Thai *paritta* chant performances.

338 It would be more accurate to say that the chanting style in Shan (forest) tradition is far more musical than that of Burmese or Thai. This perhaps is due to institutional freedom that forest wandering monks have, as oppose to village dwelling monks who are under the influence of centralization processes which have occurred in Burma and Thailand since 19th century.

339 I have observed and participated in several of non-stop chanting ceremonies of the *Paṭṭhāna* held at teaching nunneries and at APA during my fieldwork. I find that the chanting of the *Paṭṭhāna* by informants N1, N2 and LW2 is highly pleasing because they enunciate the words clearly, and break up the text appropriately. The pace of their recitations is also well balanced. I also received a few lessons from LW2 on how to recite the *Paṭṭhāna* with timbral features.
is undertaken by the Burmese by attending *abhidhamma* classes taught by the *Saṅgha* and the lay *abhidhamma* teachers (see Chapter 4).

In sum, the section has examined the protective and acquisitive power of the *Paṭṭhāna* by drawing on my fieldwork in Burma over several years. We have seen that the non-stop chanting ceremony of the *Paṭṭhāna* has become a popular Buddhist ritual in Burma since perhaps the 1980s. In terms of the efficacy of the *paṭṭhāna* chanting in relation to various beings in Buddhist cosmology, the Burmese draw on various Buddhist doctrines and concepts – such as law of *kamma*, merit, and Pāli as the language spoken by the Buddha – in order to make sense of their Buddhist practices. They, thus, present a dynamic and nuanced interpretation of the power of the *Paṭṭhāna* and the way in which such power can affect various beings in relation to power relationships.

### 2.4. Summary

In this chapter, we have seen that the understanding and the usage of *Paṭṭhāna* encompass varieties of religious, cultural and social aspects of Burmese Buddhism. From a traditional perspective, the *Abhidhamma* is not only a subject of the textual learning, but also a very sacred text endowed with the Buddha’s omniscience. In particular, the *Paṭṭhāna* from the perspective of Theravāda Buddhists carries the responsibility for the preservation of Buddhism. These religious values are reinforced by the sociopolitical situation of Burma since the early 19th century. The reforms introduced by various governments – either royal or state – also attempt to harness such religious values in national rhetoric as a response to the various threats from external and internal groups.
We have also examined an important role of Abhidhamma in ritual and protective/acquisitive practices. In particular, our exploration of the Burmese understanding and conception of the efficacy of paṭṭhāna and the recitation of it has demonstrated a crucial, dynamic role of the Paṭṭhāna in the Burmese Buddhist society. The communal aspects of the Abhidhamma tradition, such as the non-stop chanting of abhidhamma texts and the abhidhamma classes amongst Burmese communities in Burma and beyond, also contributes evidence in support of my argument that there is an ongoing process of intensification of Abhidhamma culture in Burmese Buddhism. In order to have a more in-depth understanding of the living tradition of Abhidhamma in Burma, we shall explore the development of the Abhidhamma literature in recent history, with a focus on the literary history of the Paṭṭhāna, in the next chapter.
CHAPTER 3
AN OVERVIEW OF THE LITERARY HISTORY OF PAṬṬHĀNA IN BURMA

In the previous chapter, we have touched on the importance of the long literary history of Abhidhamma literature in the ongoing process of strengthening Abhidhamma culture in Burmese Buddhism. In this chapter, I shall provide an overview of the literary history of Abhidhamma with a focus on the roles of various teachers of the Abhidhamma in the development of Abhidhamma studies in Burma. I shall also explore and assess the importance of their works in the history of Abhidhamma studies to the present day. This chapter aims to demonstrate that the history of the production of the abhidhamma texts, especially the paṭṭhāna texts such as textbooks and popular books, reflects a shift from an informal educational paradigm towards a formal examination-orientated paradigm within monastic education. I shall also suggest that in the process of moving from informal to formal education, certain forms of pedagogical approaches have become marginalised, while others have developed. Before turning specifically to the Paṭṭhāna literature, I shall briefly survey the Abhidhamma literature produced in Burma in its long history of Abhidhamma studies with an aim to highlight the extent and depth of Burma’s expertise in the subject.

3.1. An overview of Abhidhamma literature in Burma

This section explores Abhidhamma literature in Burma from the Pyu period (c. 100 B.C.E.–840 C.E.) to the contemporary period with a focus on individuals who are learned in Abhidhamma (Pāli: ābhidhammikas) and their works. I shall thus provide examples of literary trends in the composition of abhidhamma texts in the time period.
In so doing, I aim to show certain turning points in Burma’s long history of Abhidhamma literature since the 17th century, which have shaped the Abhidhamma tradition in present day Burma. In particular, the composition of abhidhamma ayakauk in the 17th–18th century, the publication of Ledi Hsayadaw’s Pa-ra-ma-tha-than-hkeik in 1904 and the innovation of Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw by presenting the abhidhamma teaching in tables since 1940s are examples of key events, which have changed the landscape of Abhidhamma studies in contemporary Burma.

According to Burmese scholar-monks such as the late Pa-htan” Hsayadaw Ven. Ashin Visuddhābhivaṃsa340 and Nandamālābhivaṃsa341 writing on the history of Abhidhamma studies in Burma, Abhidhamma study started to become popular during the Pagan period (1044-1279). Along with these two sources, Bode in The Pāli literature of Burma, which draws chiefly on the Sāsanavaṃṣadīpa, the ‘History of the religion’, ascribed to Ven. Paññasāmi of Mandalay in 1861,342 suggests that Abhidhamma works by Burmese monks began to appear at the time of King Narapatisithu (r. 1167-1202).343 Two works, namely the Saṅkhepaṇṇanā, a sub-commentary of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha, and the Nāmacāradīpaka, a Paṭṭhāna text, have been ascribed to a Burmese monk called Chapata,344 who went to Sri Lanka as a novice (sāmaṇera) with Uttarajīva Thera, and later returned to Pagan after higher ordination and long-term study at the Mahāvihāra, by Bode, Visuddhābhivaṃsa et al., and Nandamālābhivaṃsa. The Nāmacāradīpaka, according to Visuddhābhivaṃsa et al., is a brief explanation of the 24 conditions of the Paṭṭhāna with reference to consciousness, citta, mental factors, cetasika, and matter, rūpa, in order to understand the nature of

342 Lieberman shows that the Sāsanavaṃṣadīpa is a heavily edited translation into Pali of a Burmese-language composition entitled Tha-tha-na-wun-tha”sa-dan”tha-tha-na-lin-ga-yā kyan”, the ‘History of the religion which is an adornment of the religion’. He also notes inaccuracies in the Sāsanavaṃṣadīpa (Lieberman 1976: 137-149).
344 We find various transliterations of the name ‘Chapata’ in the modern literature such as ‘Chapada’, ‘Chappada’ and ‘Chapaṭa’.
conditional relations.\textsuperscript{345} Bode—based on the \textit{Gandhavaṃsa}\textsuperscript{346}—also ascribes the \textit{Mātikatthadīpanī} and the \textit{Paṭṭhānaṇaṇānaya}, presumably texts on the \textit{Mātikā} and the \textit{Paṭṭhāna} respectively, to Chapata.\textsuperscript{347} Although Bode mentions these \textit{abhidhamma} texts, they are not mentioned in the \textit{Piṭa-kat-taw-tha-maing"}, the ‘History of the \textit{Piṭaka}'.\textsuperscript{348} Therefore, for these writers, these \textit{abhidhamma} works represent the beginnings of \textit{Abhidhamma} composition in Burma.

Later scholarship which explores the relations between Burma and Sri Lanka between the 12\textsuperscript{th} and 15\textsuperscript{th} century, however, suggests that Chapata of the 12\textsuperscript{th} century was not the author of the above mentioned \textit{abhidhamma} texts. C. E. Godakumbura—writing in the 1960s—examines the identity of the scholarly monks who were known by the name of Chapata in his article ‘Chapada and Chapada Saddhammajotipāla’ published in 1969. Godakumbura – based upon Kalyāṇī Inscriptions and in the Glass Palace Chronicle – shows that no literary works are ascribed to Chapata of the 12\textsuperscript{th} century, the companion of Uttarajīva Thera to Sri Lanka.\textsuperscript{349} According to Godakumbura, Chapata of the 15\textsuperscript{th} century, whose ordained name was Saddhammajotipāla, is the author of the various texts listed in the \textit{Sāsanavaṃsadīpa} and the \textit{Gandhavaṃsa}, including the \textit{Saṅkhepavaṇṇanā}.\textsuperscript{350} Literary evidence provided by Godakumbura thus suggests a later date, i.e. the 15\textsuperscript{th} century, for traceable \textit{Abhidhamma} compositions in Burma. In other words, the attribution of works by Chapata to the 12\textsuperscript{th} century and thus the histories that place this in the Pagan period are not reliable. As Godakumbura shows, such attribution appears to be based on a

\textsuperscript{345} Visuddhābhivāṃsa et al. 1987: ngu". Forchammer, however, thinks that the \textit{Naṃacāradīpanī} was a book on ethics, and not on \textit{Abhidhamma}. Forchammer 1885: 34-35, cited in Ray 2002: 127.
\textsuperscript{346} It is a Pāli chronicle written in Burma possibly in the 17\textsuperscript{th} century. It gives brief accounts of post-canonical Burmese and Sri Lankan Pāli texts.
\textsuperscript{347} Bode 1966: 19.
\textsuperscript{348} The \textit{Piṭakat-taw-tha-maing}, the ‘History of the \textit{Piṭaka}', is a rather comprehensive catalogue of the canonical and post-canonical literature known to the Burmese and was composed by Min"kyi" Mahāsiriijeya-sū in the late Konbaung period.
\textsuperscript{349} Godakumbura 1969: 2; von Hinüber 1996: 164, n. 569.
\textsuperscript{350} Godakumbura 1969: 5.
misreading of the colophons and – perhaps – on a misreading of the Sāsanavamsadīpa. The confusion arises because the later Chapata, like the earlier one, also had an association with Sri Lanka and a king Parakkamabāhu. On seeing the mention of a Chapata’s visit to Sri Lanka, of a Chapata in connection with a Burmese king Narapatisithu in the Sāsanavamsadīpa and of a Sinhalese king Parakkamabāhu in relation to a purification of the Sāsana in the colophons of the texts, i.e. the Kaccāyanasuttaniddesa, the Saṅkhepavāṇṇanā, and the Sīmālāṅkāra-ṭīkā, people have naturally assumed that this is the 12th century Chapata, the first Narapatisithu and the first Parakkamabāhu (r. 1153-1186) of the same century. As Godakumabura points out, in dealing with the dating of Burmese kings Polwatte Buddhadatta Mahāthera, a Sri Lankan scholar-monk, has confused Narapatisithu of Pagan of the 12th century with Narapati of Ava of the 15th century (see below for some literary works produced in the Ava period).\(^{351}\) Moreover, a closer reading of the colophons indicates that this is the Parakkamabāhu (r. 1412-1467) of Jayavaddhanapura in the 15th century, i.e. Parakkramabāhu VI, who also conducted a purification of the Sāsana and established a sīmā in Jayavaddhanapura. Thus, Godakumbura concludes that the confusion regarding the date and identity of the two Chapatas has been due to the similarity in the names of both Burmese and Sinhalese kings under whom both scholars flourished.\(^{352}\) Therefore, the importance of Abhidhamma in the Pagan period can only be inferred from less clearcut evidence – an incidental reference to Paṭṭhāna chanting and the use of Abhidhamma in ‘grammatical works’ of the subsequent centuries (see below).

Bode, Visuddhābhivaṃsa et al. and Nanadamālābhivaṃsa, based on the Sāsanavamsadīpa, mention a story of how busy mothers of families took time to learn the whole section of the skillful triplet (kusala-tīka) of the Paṭṭhāna and the Pāli

\(^{351}\) Godakumbura 1969: 1.
\(^{352}\) Godakumbura 1969: 5.
grammar by-heart.\textsuperscript{353} Even if we question the validity of the claim by Paññasāmi, a Sudhamma monk, that busy mothers took time to learn the Paṭṭhāna by-heart, the presence of such accounts in the chronicle reflects the emphasis on memorisation and recitation of the Pāli texts by the Sudhamma monks (see 2.2.).\textsuperscript{354}

Aleix Ruiz-Falques, working on the Pāli grammatical tradition in Burma from the 12\textsuperscript{th} to 15\textsuperscript{th} century C.E., shows that the scholar-monks of Pagan composed texts about the Pāli language in relation to the Abhidhamma understanding of sound/word (sadda).\textsuperscript{355} In particular, he focuses on a text entitled the Saddatthabhedacintā composed by Saddhammasiri, which Bode had identified as a grammatical text.\textsuperscript{356} Based on his reading of the commentaries of this text written by two other scholar-monks of Pagan, Ruiz-Falques argues that in the Saddatthabhedacintā, grammar and philosophy are mixed together in a metaphysical discourse, which he refers to as “grammatical philosophy”.\textsuperscript{357} These texts indicate that in the Pagan period, in-depth study of canonical and post-canonical abhidhamma texts was supported and pursued by the monastic literati. In addition, Abhidhamma was not studied in isolation but as part of a philosophical framework such that the analytical study of grammar and the Abhidhamma understanding of language and sound were integral aspects of the same literary endeavour. Therefore, while Burmese chronicles and the majority of modern Burmese scholars claim that Theravāda Burmese Buddhism was established by the Burmese King Anawrahta (r. 1044-1077),\textsuperscript{358} i.e. they ascribe the beginnings of Burmese Abhidhamma studies to the Pagan period, further evidence is needed to confirm this

\textsuperscript{353} Bode 1966: 25, f.n. 3; Visuddhābhivamsa et al. 1987: sa.
\textsuperscript{354} See Charney (2005: 42-44) on the use of memorisation and recitation of the Pāli texts as a way to demonstrate textual expertise by the Sudhamma monks.
\textsuperscript{355} Ruiz-Falques 2012: 3-11. I thank Aleix Ruiz-Falques for allowing me to use a draft version of his paper, which he presented at Burma Studies conference 2012 in North Illinois University.
\textsuperscript{356} Bode 1966: 20.
\textsuperscript{357} Ruiz-Falques 2012: 5.
\textsuperscript{358} The name has been variously transliterated as Anoratha, Aniruddha, Anuruddha, Anawrahta. I am following Paul Strachan’s (and D. Swearer’s) transliterations. Plus, ‘Anawrahta’ follows the closest transliteration in the Burmese vernacular language.
position. Nonetheless, in associating the beginnings of Abhidhamma studies with the Pagan period, the chronicles and scholars overlook the presence of Pāli studies and Abhidhamma studies before the Pagan period, namely in the Pyu period, and the findings for the Pyu period are easier to date accurately.

A serious consequence of asserting the Pagan period as the origin of Theravāda Burmese Buddhism is that the archaeological findings discovered between 1897 and 1929 at Prome (now Pyay), the old Śrī Kṣetra, are not part of the history of Buddhism in Burma in the eyes of Burmese Buddhists. The archaeological findings unearthed at Prome include two perfectly preserved gold-plates, which were found at Maunggan, a small village 11 km (7 miles) south of the walled site at Śrī Kṣetra. Each of the two plates, dated to the 6th century C.E., contains three lines of Pāli. The Pāli text inscribed on them was identified by Finot as the famous and ubiquitous verse on causality and impermanence spoken by Assaji to Sāriputta, i.e. ye dhammā hetuppabhava, ‘those phenomena which proceed from a cause’, and other verses which may be excerpts of some of the contents of the Vibhaṅga and the Sutta Piṭaka.\(^{359}\) At the Khin Ba Gon, just east of the walls of Śrī Kṣetra, a book with twenty gold-leaf Pāli manuscripts was discovered. It contains texts such as the paṭiccasamuppāda, ‘dependent origination’, the vipassanā-ñāṇas, ‘stages of insight knowledge’, and various other excerpts from the Abhidhamma Piṭaka.\(^{360}\) Duroiselle reports the discovery of some terracotta tablets from a mound at Pyogingyi-Kon. One of the tablets contains a short inscription from the Abhidhamma: (adhi) paripaccaya anantara paccayo.\(^{361}\) Ray suggests that the extract is probably from the Paṭṭhāna.\(^{362}\) These archaeological findings are, therefore, significant

\(^{359}\) Ray 2002: 33-35.
\(^{360}\) Ray 2002: 37-41.
\(^{362}\) Ray 2002: 43, n. 78.
in establishing “how highly developed scholarship of the Pali Buddhist texts must
have been in Lower Myanmar even in these early days”.

Only a handful of Burmese scholars, such as Lwin, Esika and Dhammasāmi, have documented such findings in their work. An award winning book the *Htay-ra-wada Budabatha*, the ‘Theravāda Buddhism’, by Ven. Ashin Esika – written in the Burmese language – includes a section on ‘Śrī Kṣetra Theravāda’. In this section, he concludes, on the basis of the archaeological findings, that Pyu culture is that of the Theravāda Buddhist culture. Moreover, Lwin writing on the Pāli-Burmese *nissaya* in the 1960s looked at the Pyu *nissaya* and noted, “the Pyu people were very keen on *Abhidhamma* studies”. Such archaeological findings have not only re-written the early history of Burmese Buddhism, but also shown that “learning [by the Pyu] had gone well beyond the basics into the world of *Abhidhamma* studies”. In sum, while we cannot document the continuity between the Pyu and Pagan period interest in *Abhidhamma*, we can be certain of the importance of *Abhidhamma* in Burma as early as the Pyu period, namely in the 5–7th century. Moreover, it is reasonable to expect that this picture will be enhanced by the ongoing discovery of stone inscriptions and other materials from Pyay and other sites such as Dawei.

Turning to later periods, the Ava period (1364-1555 and 1606-1752) is well known for its contribution to *Abhidhamma* studies. For instance, Ariyavamsa, a

---

366 Tin Lwin also identifies other synonyms of *nissaya*: ‘nik-tha-ye” (supporter), ’a-hmi’ (aid), ’a-nak’ (meaning), ’akauk’ or ’ayakauk’ (abstract) in Burmese (Tin Lwin 1961:5).
368 Dhammasāmi 2004: 27.
370 U Tun Nyein (1898), Finot (1912, 1913) and Stargardt (1995: 201) cited in Moore 2007: 179 date the gold plate manuscripts found in the region of Śrī Kṣetra to the 5–7th century.
372 Here, I have used the term ‘Ava period’ in a broader sense to refer to an ancient imperial capital, Ava (also spelt as Inwa), located in the south-west of Mandalay, which was used as a political base of successive Burmese kingdoms from the 14th to 19th centuries. In terms of political eras, historians divide the whole period in terms of the Ava Kingdom (1364-1555), the First Taungoo Kingdom (c. 1486-1599),
prominent scholar-monk and royal tutor of King Narapati (r. 1442-68), composed texts on the Abhidhamma, the Jātaka, and the Pāli grammar. He wrote the Maṇidīpaṭikā and the Manisāramaṇjusāṭikā, sub-commentaries on the Āṭṭhasālinī and the Abhidhammatthavibhāvanī respectively, in the Pāli language. In addition, the Piṭa-kat-taw-tha-maing records that during the reign of King Mahāsihasūra of Ava (r. 1468-1480) he composed a Burmese-Pāli nissaya on the anuṭikā on the Abhidhamma in five volumes.374 Moreover, in lower Burma in the 16th century, then known as Hanthawati (now Pegu), the Mon capital until 1539, some commentarial work on the Abhidhamma was composed by monks such as Saddhāmaḷaṃkāra, Ānanda, and Mahāsuvaṇṇadīpa. For instance, the Piṭa-kat-taw-tha-maing ascribes the Madhusāratthadīpanī, a commentary on the Mūlaṭikā, which presumably is the work of Ānanda of the unknown Kalasapura (see 1.3.3.),375 to (another) Ānanda. As Ven. Aggamahāpaṇḍita376 Paṇḍitābhivamsa, the former rector of the State Pariyatti Sāsana University of Yangon, explains, the Pāli term ‘madhu’, translated as ‘sweet’, has been used by the Mon monks in the title of their works.377 We have, then, from the 14th century to the mid-15th century of the Ava period, strong evidence for the composition of commentarial works on the canonical and post-canonical abhidhamma texts in Pali.

From the second half of the Ava period, there is evidence for the production of abhidhamma texts in both Pāli and Burmese, which may reflect a shift towards vernacular writing at this time. Moreover, it is in this period that we can first see the

and the Restored Taungoo Kingdom (1597-1752). On history of political establishments in Burma from the mid-14th century to the 19th centuries, see Harvey (1925).
374 Min”k’yi” Mahāsiirijeyasū 1989: 207. Presumably it is the anuṭikā that is ascribed to Dhammapāla of Sri Lanka.
375 von Hinüber 1996: 166.
376 The term ‘Aggamahāpaṇḍita’, literally the ‘highest great scholar’, is used as a title, which is given to learned monks by the state.
appearance of *abhidhamma ayakauck* texts which are very significant for the Burmese approach to the learning of *Abhidhamma* to the present day. I shall therefore discuss below various aspects of the *Abhidhamma* literature in the late Ava and the Konbaung periods in detail. In particular, I shall highlight that the development of the composition of *ayakauck* texts on the four canonical *abhidhamma* texts, namely the *Mātikā*, the *Dhātukathā*, the *Yamaka* and the *Paṭṭhāna*, by various scholar-monks of the 17th and 18th century is closely related to – and therefore seems to have contributed to – the development of a unique pedagogical approach used in the study of *Abhidhamma* in Burma, which is known as the *Abhidhamma nya‘wa* tradition (see below).

Following the earlier trend of producing commentaries on various canonical and post-canonical texts in the Pāli language, during the reign of Anaukhpeklun (r. 1608-1628), Ven. Tilokaguru of Sagaing composed sub-commentaries on the *Dhātukathā*, the *Yamaka* and the *Paṭṭhāna* in Pāli.\(^{378}\) In the 17th century, well-known scholar-monks such as Taungbila Hsayadaw, Nankyaung Hsayadaw and Taungbi”lu” Hsayadaw composed ‘*nissaya*’ texts on the *Abhidhamma*, along with other literary work on various topics (see 2.2.). For instance, Taungbila Hsayadaw, also known as ‘*Pyay-pazin-kyaw*’, ‘prominent monk of Pyay (Prome)’\(^ {379}\) and by his title, Tipiṭakālaṅkāra,\(^ {380}\) composed not only *nissayas* of the Mātikā, the Dhātukathā, the Yamaka and the Paṭṭhāna, but other commentaries such as the commentary on the *Vessantara-jātaka* in Burmese verse (*pyo*) as well.\(^ {381}\) Like Taungbila Hsayadaw, Nankyaung Hsayadaw also composed *nissayas* on the Mātikā, the Dhātukathā, the Yamaka and the Paṭṭhāna, along with *nissayas* of the *Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha* and the *Kaccāyanavyākarana*, a Pāli grammatical text. Nankyaung Hsayadaw was the son of the

\(^{378}\) Visuddhābhivāṃsa et al. 1987: 51‘.

\(^{379}\) Tin Lwin 1973: 287.


\(^{381}\) Visuddhābhivāṃsa et al. 1987: 51‘; Dhammasāmi 2004: 44; Nyunt 2012: 64, f.n. 61. Taungbila Hsayadaw was also a talented poet, and his other poetry compositions include *linkas* (metaphysical and religious poems) and other genres of poetry of that period.
chief minister during the reign of King Pintale (r. 1648-1661), and presumably composed these texts during this period. A decade after the composition of such nissayas, Taungbi’lu’ Hsayadaw – following in his predecessors’ footsteps – composed a new set of nissayas on the canonical abhidhamma texts mentioned above and on the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha during the reign of King Narāvara (r. 1672-1673). Under the reign of King Minyekyawhtin (r. 1673-1698), a step-brother of King Narāvara, a monk called Devacakkobhāsa was well known for his proficiency in the Paṭṭhāna. Ray reports that his system of teaching the Paṭṭhāna was much admired by the king to the extent that the Paṭṭhāna became a compulsory text to be studied at all monasteries. Therefore, these learned monks of the 17th century mentioned above developed pedagogical approaches to the study of the Abhidhamma and composed texts on the Abhidhamma in same genre by writing Pāli-Burmese nissayas on the Mātikā, the Dhātukathā, the Yamaka, the Paṭṭhāna and the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha. It should also be noted that from the 17th century the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha is probably the most translated and paraphrased Pāli work of abhidhamma manuals/texts. According to Visuddhābhivamsa et al., there are over thirty different Pāli-Burmese nissayas of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha. The numerous nissayas of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha reflects its importance in the Burmese approach to the study of not only abhidhamma texts but also other Buddhist texts, as we shall see in chapter 4.

In the first half of the 18th century, nissayas and commentaries on various abhidhamma texts and manuals such as the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha, were composed by learned monks such as the Neiyin” Hsayadaw Ven. Ariyālāmkkāra, the Pok-ba-yon Hsayadaw Ven. Saradassi and Pa’hta’ma’kyaw-aung-san-hta Hsayadaw Ven.

---

382 Nyunt 2012: 94.
384 On the list of literary texts on the Abhidhamma produced by other scholar-monks of the late Ava period, see Visuddhābhivamsa et al. 1987: si.
ñāṇavara. Turning to the second half of the 18th century, we can also find a scholar-monk, the Htan”ta-bin Hsayadaw Ven. Nandamedhā, who wrote nissayas on the Mātikā, the Dhātukathā, the Yamaka, and the Paṭṭhāna, along with nissayas on the vinaya topic and the Kaccāyanayvakaṇṇa. His Paṭṭhāna nissaya has come down to us to the present day and is widely used in the study of Paṭṭhāna in Burma. In this sense, he followed in his predecessors’ footsteps, namely Taungbila Hsayadaw, Nankyaung Hsayadaw and Taungbi”lu” Hsayadaw, and composed the same kind of nissaya texts a century later.

The composition of such nissayas may appear as a simple addition to Abhidhamma literature in Burma by translating the abhidhamma texts into Burmese, if we do not take into account the different forms of Pāli-Burmese nissaya available in the vernacular literature on Buddhism (see 3.3) and the living tradition of Abhidhamma nya’wa in Burma. Tin Lwin – writing on the history of Pāli-Burmese nissaya texts – explains that there are three types of nissaya, or techniques of writing nissaya. They are called ‘nan-kyae’, ‘nan-kyin’, and ‘nan-pyout’ in Burmese. The word ‘nan’ is abridged form of the word ‘a-nek’, ‘semantic meaning’. The first type of nissaya, ‘nan-kyae’, ‘broad meaning’, refers to the case in which word-to-word translation from Pāli into Burmese is done. In the ‘nan-kyin’, ‘narrow meaning’, key or difficult Pāli words are translated, while other words may be expressed through peyyala. The final type, ‘nan-pyout’, ‘lost meaning’, emphasizes the Abhidhamma and translates the text in terms of Abhidhammic categories. Thus, it does not take the semantic meaning or

386 I very much appreciate Saya U Nyunt Maung, a retired librarian from University of Yangon, for discussing on the issue of different types of nissaya texts written in Pāli-Burmese, and pointing out Burmese sources to take the research further.
388 Tin Lwin classifies the first type of nissaya, nan-kyae, into four categories according to their style. They are: (1) verbatim translation, (2) free translation, (3) ornate translation, and (4) translation with short notes. See Tin Lwin (1961: 5-11) on detailed explanation and examples of these four categories of the nan-kyae type of nissaya.
the grammatical structure of the sentence into account. Tin Lwin refers to nan-pyout method of nissaya writing as ayakauk.389

In these abhidhamma nissayas, Taungbila Hsayadaw and others were not doing a simple word-to-word translation from Pāli into Burmese. In fact, they were composing abhidhamma ayakauk texts. These ayakauk texts give an extended explanation and analysis of the root text by using both the simple nissaya translation and nan-pyout method of nissaya writing. Thus, in the Pi’ta-kat-taw-tha-maing, we find the term nissaya is used to refer to abhidhamma ayakauk texts.390 For instance, Taungbila Hsayadaw’s work on the Dhātukathā, the Da-tu’ka-hta-pali’taw-ni’tha’ya, Dhātukathā Pāli Nissaya, is also known as the Dhātukathā ayakauk.391 In particular, the term ayakauk is used in relation to the Mātikā, the Dhātukathā, the Yamaka and the Paṭṭhāna. Hence, we find the ma-ti’ka-ayakauk (Mātikā-ayakauk), the da-tu’ka-hta-ayakauk (Dhātukathā-ayakauk), the ya-mike-ayakauk (Yamaka-ayakauk) and the pa-htan"ayakauk (Paṭṭhāna-ayakauk) in the list of abhidhamma texts given by Visuddhābhivamsa et al.392 We can suggest that the term ayakauk has become a specialist term used to refer to the nissaya texts on Abhidhamma within the literary circle of contemporary Abhidhamma studies.

According to the ayakauk method, a text is translated with reference to abhidhammic terms, namely consciousness, mental factors, matter and nibbāna, thereby concealing the syntactical meaning of the text.393 For example, a simple translation and an ayakauk, or nan-pyout, translation of the following paṭṭhāna text by Htan”ta-bin Hsayadaw are given below.

Kusalo dhammo kusalassa dhammassa hetupaccayena paccayo.394

393 Tin Lwin 1973: 298.
394 Paṭṭh 1.153.
Simple translation: A skilful state is a condition for a skilful state by means of being a root condition.

Ayakauk: 'Kusalo dhamma’ refers to a skilful citta (out of 21 skilful cittas) and its 38 associated cetasikas. At each moment of this skilful citta and its cetasikas, if the arisen skilful citta has two roots (dvihetuka) or three roots (tihetuka), [the pair of roots] ‘alobha and adosa’ or [the triplet of roots] ‘alobha, adosa and amoha’ are conditioning states (paccaya-dhammas) respectively, by means of being a root-condition. 'Kusalassa dhammassa’ refers to any of 21 skilful cittas and the associated 38 cetasikas, and the matter that arises from them, which are conditioned states (paccayuppana-dhammas). ‘Hetupaccayena paccayo’ refers to skilful roots, namely alobha, adosa, and amoha, giving rise to the conditioned states, by means of being a root condition.395

The ayakauk method not only breaks up the sentence into different sections, namely conditioning states, conditioned states and the condition, but also analyses each of these components in terms of consciousness, mental factors and matter. Thus, the ayakauk method refers to an analytical approach in which canonical abhidhamma texts are expressed in terms of a more refined presentation of the ultimate nature of things (see Chapter 4). The syntactical meaning may be lost in this type of nissaya translation because grammatical rules and syntax are not being strictly followed. Yet, the detailed analysis of the text in relation to abhidhammic categories gives a clearer explanation of the semantic meaning of the text than perhaps the simple translation. Thus, we may deduce that this nan-pyout technique of nissaya writing is used when translating the abhidhamma texts to explicate difficult teaching in the Abhidhamma Piṭaka.396

Moreover, Visuddhābhivāṃsa et al. explain the role of ayakauk texts in Abhidhamma studies in Burma as follows.

At night, using ayakauk texts as a basis, the teacher explains a topic by using the ayakauk method until the student has understood it. Both the teacher and the student - without looking at books or manuscripts - discuss the ultimate nature (ayakauk) of the topic [through catechism]. This is called ‘nya’wa’ (night-lesson).397

396 Tin Lwin 1973: 300.
397 Visuddhābhivāṃsa et al.1987: si.
In summary, the term ayakauk is used not only to refer to the type of exegetical text, but also as a name for a specific pedagogical method that uses this form of exegesis. We shall explore the ayakauk pedagogical method further in the next chapter.

Before turning to the Abhidhamma literature produced in the late Konbaung period, it is interesting to note that the increased production of these ayakauk texts on the Mātikā, the Dhātukathā, the Yamaka and the Paṭṭhāna over the 18th century coincided with the promotion of the Pahtamapyan examination by Bodawhpaya. As mentioned in 2.2., these abhidhamma texts were already in the syllabus of Pahtamapyan examination in the reign of Bodawhpaya. Since then, they have been incorporated into the syllabuses of national examinations held by the Cetiyaṅgaṇa and the Sakyasīha associations (see 2.2.). By the 20th century, these four abhidhamma texts came to be known as nya’wa subjects amongst the monastics. Dhammasāmi observes that the inclusion of these abhidhamma texts in the monastic examination syllabuses in Burma since the 18th century has ensured the study of the abhidhamma texts amongst monks and nuns, which may be a factor contributing to the popularity of Abhidhamma studies in Burma.398

The continuous contributions of monastic and lay literati towards the Abhidhamma literature of Burma since the 19th century not only reinforce the transmission of the Burmese approach to the study of Abhidhamma to the present day, but popularise the study of Abhidhamma amongst a wider audience of lay people as well. In addition to the Paramatthadīpanī, Ledi Hsayadaw composed a number of abhidhamma texts, including two composite paṭṭhāna texts entitled the Paṭṭhānuddesadīpanī in Pāḷi and its Pāḷi-Burmese nissaya, and the Pa-ra-ma-hṭa’than-hkeik (Paramatthasaṅkhēpa), and its auto-commentary. The Pa-ra-ma-hṭa’than-hkeik is a Burmese-language poem on the Abhidhammatthaṅgaha. As Braun demonstrates the

398 Dhammasīmi, personal communication on 25 October 2010.
"Pa-ra-ma-hta’than-kheik “pushed the Abhidhamma tradition of Burma in a new direction by popularising the study of Abhidhamma learning beyond the male monastic elite.” Ledi Hsayadaw composed this work in metrical verses using both simple Burmese and Pāli abbreviation for “an audience which typically did not study the Abhidhamma”. Its poetical structure and its use of simple Burmese and Pāli abbreviation as a mnemonic list, or gist, of the ultimate things about reality should help in memorising the text, and thus provides a shortcut to the study of key concepts of the \textit{Abhidhamma}. Ledi’s auto-commentary is in prose explaining the verses, and thus aids the study of the text. Ledi Hsayadaw also established an educational framework by creating ‘\textit{Pa-ra-ma-hta’than-hkeik}’ lay groups to study the text. These lay groups seem to have been popular in the early 1900s. The \textit{Pa-ra-ma-hta’than-hkeik} group in Monywa has continued and holds examinations on the text, and in October 2011, the group held its thirtieth examinations. As mentioned in the introduction, for Ledi Hsayadaw the study of the \textit{Abhidhamma} provides a tool for the laity’s progress in spiritual development, and thus it becomes a vital foundation for meditation practice.

\textbf{Hsaya-gyi}” U Ohn (1846-1925), contemporary with Ledi Hsayadaw, was well known as a teacher of \textit{Abhidhamma}. He, as a monk, studied and taught \textit{abhidhamma nya’wa} in Mandalay during the reign of Mindon and Thibaw (r. 1878-1885). In 1886, one year after the fall of the whole of Burma to the British – a period of instability that saw many leave the \textit{Saṅgha} – U Ohn disrobed and lived in Taungoo until 1903. He then moved to Taung-myo’ (Amarapura), which was one of the well-known centres

\footnotesize
399 Braun 2008: 240.
400 Braun 2008: 293.
401 On detailed analysis of the nature and style of this text, see Braun 2008: Chapter 5.
403 During my fieldwork, I visited the Ledi monastery in Monywa and obtained information regarding the examinations on the \textit{Pa-ra-ma-hta’than-hkeik} and its auto-commentary. This group also holds an examination of a work of Ledi’s on meditation, the \textit{Ledi Ka-ma-htan}” (\textit{Ledi’s Kammatṭhāna}).
404 Dhammasāmi (Mingala Taik-thit Hsayadaw) 1936: 360.
of textual studies. In particular, it was a famous centre of the *abhidhamma nya’wa* study from the 19th century (see 3.3.). As the news about his residence in Taung-myo’ spread, some student-monks came to study *Abhidhamma* at his house. In 1905, he started teaching *abhidhamma nya’wa* to ten student-monks at a teaching monastery, the Mingala Taik (Maṅgalā Monastery), in Taung-myo’.405 Thus, U Ohn moved back into a teaching career as a layman, attracting many students – monks, nuns and laymen – from different parts of the country. Ghosita reports that at one point in his teaching career, his classes on *Abhidhamma* might have attracted about 275 students, and at least 25 of them were laymen. These laymen established an *Abhidhamma* association called ‘Association of *Abhidhamma Bhāṇaka*.’ Ghosita adds, “since these laymen recited the *abhidhamma* texts along with the monks and nuns, they came to be known as ‘*Abhidhamma bhāṇaka*’ [‘reciter of *Abhidhamma*’].” 406 We, then, have evidence for a parallel development in lay engagement, like Ledi’s lay groups, in *Abhidhamma* studies in and around Taung-myo’. U Ohn also composed an *abhidhamma* text entitled the *A-bi’da-ma Tan’hkon hnin’ Ya-ma-ka Wi-hti’man-za-ri*, the ‘Banner of *Abhidhamma* and garland of mental process in Yamaka’, a commentary on the *Mātikā*, the *Dhātukathā*, the *Yamaka* and the *Paṭṭhāna*.

In 1930s, Mahagandayon Hsayadaw composed commentaries on all seven canonical *abhidhamma* texts, and sub-commentaries on post-canonical *abhidhamma* texts, along with many other works on *vinaya* topics, on the *Dīgha Nikāya* and about educational reforms for various monastic examination boards. His commentaries on *abhidhamma* and *vinaya* texts are entitled with a suffix ‘*bhasāṭikā*’, literally translated as ‘language commentary’. For instance, his sub-commentary on the *Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha* is entitled the ‘*Thin-gyo Ba-tha-ti-ka*’. Since he, like Ledi

405 Ghosita 2002: 60.
406 Ghosita 2002: 64.
Hsayadaw, composed his works in Burmese, the bhāsā in the title indicates the Burmese language. Thus, his works can be referred to as 'Burmese commentaries'. This does not mean that his works do not feature Pāli words. In fact, as in Ledi’s works, a mixture of Burmese and Pāli is used. In 1932, his work on the application of Abhidhamma to daily life experiences entitled the Ko-kyin’ A-bi’da-ma, the ‘Ethical behaviour from Abhidhamma perspective’, was published. He wrote this work for lay people so that they can understand their daily experiences in terms of Abhidhamma and thus put the abhidhamma teaching into their daily life.407 In this work, he explains a range of issues such as different types of personality, different types of kamma and skilful actions from the perspective of Abhidhamma in relation to daily life examples. In 1972, he also gave dhamma talks on the Paṭṭhāna at the request of his devotees. In 1979, the first print of these dhamma talks was published entitled the ‘A-hkye-pyu Paḥtan’, the ‘Basic Paṭṭhāna’.

Another ābhidhammika who composed numerous numbers of abhidhamma texts and promoted Abhidhamma studies amongst lay people from 1930s afterwards was the Mula’ Pa-ḥtaṇ” Hsayadaw Ven. Nārada (1898-1983). Prior to the World War II, he worked on the Abhidhamma while he was staying at a forest monastery called ‘Hkin-oo Shwe-bei”kin” Taw-ya’ near Hkin-oo town, 24 km northwest of Shwebo.408 In particular, during that period, he worked on the whole of the Paṭṭhāna – namely the 22 triplets and 100 duplets. He developed a new approach to the study of Paṭṭhāna by presenting the materials in the paṭṭhāna ayakauk in tables (see Chapter 4). His innovative presentation of the conditioning states, the conditioned states and the condition in tables means that long prose of the paṭṭhāna ayakauk is now being condensed, and only key points are being represented in the tables. Taking the above mentioned

ayakauk translation of the paṭṭhāna text as an example (see above), it can be presented in a table as follows.

Table 3.1. The ayakauk of the conditional relations related by the root condition

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Conditioning states</th>
<th>Conditioned states</th>
<th>Condition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• 2 or 3 skilful roots (alobha + adosa or alobha + adosa + amoha)</td>
<td>• any of 21 skilful cittas</td>
<td>• 3 skilful roots</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• their associated skilful citta and cetasikas</td>
<td>• the associated 38 cetasikas</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• the matter that arises from them</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Presenting the ayakauk of the conditional relations, i.e. a more refined analysis of the nature of the conditional relations, in a table makes it easier for the students to understand the complex conditional relationships. This is because condensed lists of the dhammas involved can be seen clearly in the table. Such presentation can also help with memorisation and recall of the text.

From 1946, Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw taught Abhidhamma for thirty years to monastics and lay people in Yangon using abhidhamma tables he designed. Since he became an advisor (ovādācariya) of the Abhidhamma Propagation Association (APA) in 1946, he taught all seven abhidhamma texts to lay people, both men and women. His lectures and published works aimed at the lay people, who may not have studied Pāli grammar in detail. He also published works on canonical and post-canonical abhidhamma texts, including the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha, in which he used abhidhamma tables to represent main points in a mixture of Pāli and Burmese. For example, in 1951, he published the Pa-htan” pa-ra-gu, the ‘Expert in Paṭṭhāna’, which summarises the paṭṭhāna ayakauk in tables and explains it in simple Burmese, at the request of his lay devotees (dāyakas). These lay devotees claimed, “they will definitely pass the Pahtamapyan examinations with the paṭṭhāna tables [in the Pa-htan”
Succeeding in these examinations is awarded through position and prestige, as I stated in the introduction. Following in the footsteps of his predecessors, he promoted study of the *Abhidhamma* amongst the lay people mainly through the APA. Many of his lay students went on to become teachers of *Abhidhamma*, including his niece, Daw Hkin Myint. She was also known as Pa-htan” Daw Hkin Myint because she became a famous teacher of the *Paṭṭhāna* in her own right. She also co-authored a handbook on the *Abhidhammadhatthasaṅgaha* with Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw in which detailed analysis and commentary on the fourfold categories of *dhammas* are explicated using tables and notes. Through the publications of the *Pa-htan” pa-ra-gu* and the *Ya-mike pa-ra-gu*, and weekly lectures at the APA, Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw’s pedagogical approach to the *abhidhamma nya’wa* subjects, as we shall see in the next chapter, are now widely used by both the monastics and lay people.

This above section has given a very brief overview of the *Abhidhamma* literature of Burma from the Pyu period to the present time. However, this is not an exhaustive list of *Abhidhamma* works produced in Burma. I have shown significant contributions made by specific authors towards the *Abhidhamma* literature at various points in Burma’s long history of *Abhidhamma* studies. While there were, and still are, many authors writing on *Abhidhamma* in Burma, the individuals mentioned above are examples of the trends in the production of *Abhidhamma* literature in their time. We shall see other *abhidhamma* works composed by the Burmese as we explore *Paṭṭhāna* literature in Burma and the lineage of *abhidhamma* teachers from Taung-myō’ in 3.2. and 3.3.

From the above evidence it would seem that almost all the authors up to the 19th century were monks, particularly those who had honorary titles given by royalty. However, in the 19th and the 20th century, we have for lay engagement in the study

---

409 Nārada 1951: iii.
and compositions of Abhidhamma works not only in lowland Burma, but also in highland Burma such as Shan areas. For example, in the 19th-20th century, Shan zare, ‘poet or poet reader’,\(^\text{410}\) such as Zao Kang Suea and his daughter Nang Kham Ku, regarded by many as gifted composers of Shan poetic literature, composed works on a variety of subjects, including Abhidhamma.\(^\text{411}\) The father, Zao Kang Suea, followed a habit that we saw with U Ohn (see above), where someone develops their expertise as a monk but continues in the field after disrobing. His daughter, Nang Kham Ku, as we saw also with Pa-htan” Daw Khin Hla Tin (see above), became a recognised composer in her own right, composing works on the Abhidhamma, as well as other subjects. It is almost impossible to explore if and how Abhidhamma were studied amongst the masses prior to the 19th century in Burma, given the lack of pertinent records prior to the 19th century.

3.2. Paṭṭhāna literature in Burma

As mentioned above, Paṭṭhāna is one of the abhidhamma nya’wa subjects. And, we have evidence that it has been widely studied by monks, nuns and lay people since the early 20th century. It is not surprising then to find numerous numbers of paṭṭhāna handbooks, or textbooks, composed by the Burmese. It seems that the earliest paṭṭhāna pedagogical handbook was composed at some point between 1762 and 1838 by the The”in” Tha-tha-na-paing Hsayadaw Ven. Sūriya (henceforth The”in” Hsayadaw) entitled the Pa-htan” Nya’wa Thon-saung-twe (henceforth PNT), the ‘Three volumes of Paṭṭhāna night-lesson’. This text is slightly different from the Htan”ta-bin

\(^{410}\) The term zare in the Shan language refers to the scholars who recite, copy, and, in many cases compose Theravāda literature on a range of topics from meditation to abhidhamma to merit making.

\(^{411}\) Crosby and Khur-Yearn 2010: 6-8; Crosby 2014: 240. On the composition of Shan poetic works on Abhidhamma by lay zare, which might have been under the influence of Burmese Abhidhamma tradition in the 19th-20th century, see Jotika Khur-Yearn 2012: 93, n. 170.
Hsayadaw’s *paṭṭhāna ayakauk* (HPA) in that it focuses on the *Paccayuddesa*, the first section of the *paṭṭhāna* text listing 24 conditions, and gives detailed analysis of the 24 conditions through *ayakauk* method. And, the PNT is shorter than the HPA as the latter covers the whole of the skilful triplet. The PNT is divided into three sections. The first section, the *pa-htan*"thon-hkyat-su, ‘three items of Paṭṭhāna’, describes three main items, or aspects, of the 24 conditions, namely the conditioning states (*paccaya-dhammas*), the conditioned states (*paccayuppanna-dhammas*) and the not-conditioned states (*paccaniya-dhammas*) of root condition, object condition etc. The second section, the *pa-htan*"pyit-se"pyaing, ‘finding common conditions’, describes combinations of different conditions that can influence a specific conditional relation (see Chapter 5). The final section, the *pa-htan*" ra-thi-su (Paṭṭhāna-rāsi), ‘categories of conditional relations’, describes how a condition (*paccaya*) may influence mental processes (*cittavīthi*) of different categories of beings across different realms in Buddhist cosmos. The final section is the longest, and explains mental processes in great detail. According to Bamaw Hsayadaw, one had to memorise such a text, including the detailed mental processes, in the old method of *Paṭṭhāna* study (see 3.3. and Chapter 4).

A century later, in 1938, Mahagandayon Hsayadaw published the *Wi-hti* ′hnit Thon-hkyat-su, the ‘Mental process and three items’, which seems to have been based on the first section of the PNT. In this text, Mahagandayon Hsayadaw not only describes three main aspects of the 24 conditions as in the PNT, but also gives a detailed commentary on these three aspects of each condition in relation to the mental processes (*vīthi*). It is this text that Friedgard Lottermoser, also known as Daw Ohnma, studied while she was staying at the Mahagandayon monastery in 1960s. She then wrote a MA dissertation on it in English, and submitted to the Pāli Department at the University of Mandalay in 1970.
Another type of handbook for the students of Paṭṭhāna found in Burma is called the Pa-htan" ganṭhi, the ‘Knots of Paṭṭhāna’. Although it is called ‘knots of Paṭṭhāna’, these texts are untying the ‘knots’ by explaining specific difficult points and/or words. In 1937, a layman, U Kyi” Hpei, published the Pa-htan" anuganṭhi, the ‘Subtile knots of Paṭṭhāna’, which may give a more nuanced explanation of the ‘knots’ as the title contains ‘anu’.

Since the 1950s, we can see an increased production of this kind of handbook, or textbook. For example, the Masoyein Hsayadaw Ven. Sūriya, published a series of paṭṭhāna books, namely the Pahtan" thin-ne"akyin"hkyok, the ‘Essence of teaching methods of Paṭṭhāna’, the Pa-htana tha-ru-pa’na-yu-pa’dē-tha, the ‘Exposition on the essential nature and methods of the Paṭṭhāna’, and the Pa-htan"ayakauk akyin"hkyok, the ‘Concise Paṭṭhāna ayakauk, (see Appendix G). The Masoyein Hsayadaw’s paṭṭhāna ayakauk describes the main points in the Paṭiccavāra and the Paṅhāvāra (see 2.1.) of the Paṭṭhāna and explains conditional relations through the ayakauk method, i.e. explicating a more nuanced nature of conditional relations in terms of the fourfold categories of reality. This work differs from the PNT and Mahagandhayon Hsayadaw’s above-mentioned work in that his approach to the study of Paṭṭhāna focuses on two main aspects of a conditional relation, i.e. the conditioning states and the conditioned states, rather than three aspects. This is one of the pedagogical approaches that we shall assess in detail in Chapter 4.

The paṭṭhāna texts mentioned above are written in prose and in a mixture of Pāli and Burmese. As I have mentioned above, in 1951, Mula’ pa-htan” Hsayadaw published the Pa-htan” pa-ra-gu, which presented the paṭṭhāna ayakauk in tables. As his approach to Paṭṭhāna study spread to different parts of the country, we observe an increase in composition of paṭṭhāna textbooks using tables. For example, the paṭṭhāna textbooks by In"sein Hsayadaw, Ven. Kumāra, Ok-kan Hsayadaw Ven. Nandobhāsa,
Ven. Nandimālaṅkāra and Ven. Kusala uses the pedagogy based on tables, i.e. Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw’s approach (see Appendix G). The contents and interpretations of the text in these textbooks are the same, because in the eyes of the Burmese, it is vital to preserve the texts, including the commentarial texts written by the Burmese monks. This means that the presentation of the paṭṭhāna ayakauk in tables and the order in which different sections of the Paṭṭhāna is arranged may differ from textbook to textbook. Yet, the underlying pedagogical approach and philosophy of these different textbooks are the same. As we shall see below, this approach to Paṭṭhāna study has now become so popular that it has replaced other pedagogical approaches.

Since Paṭṭhāna is also a ritual text chanted widely by the Burmese as a protective chant, there are numerous paṭṭhāna books explaining the definition and efficacy of Paṭṭhāna for the masses. The Paccayuddesa and the Paccayaniddesa, the first two sections of the Paṭṭhāna, are the topics of discussion in a majority of these popular books. In these books, the definition and nature of each condition may be explained using analogies and in simple Burmese. Stories about how a person escapes danger and/or gains a positive outcome by chanting the 24 conditions, or the Paccayaniddesa, are also reported in books and magazines. For example, Ven. U Sīri compiled such stories and published a book entitled the Pa-htan” tan-hko” let-twe’a-kyo”, the ‘Practical benefits of the power of the Paṭṭhāna’. As mentioned in the introduction, various meditation teachers in Burma have also written books on the relationship between Paṭṭhāna and insight meditation (vipassanā). In addition to such printed sources on Paṭṭhāna, there are recordings of sermons, dhamma talks, and lectures given by

---

412 In Burmese Buddhism, the term ‘dhamma talks’, ta-ya-pwe or ta-ya-tha-bin in Burmese, is used to refer to special talks given by monks at a monastery, or a nunnery, or a town hall, or even in streets during winter. Dhamma talks are often held in the evening, and sponsored by an individual person, or, by a group of people from a community or an organization. Drawing upon specific Pāli and vernacular literary works, stories, and personal experiences, the monk gives a talk on a specific issue. A variety of topics – e.g. meditation, abhidhamma, kamma, dependent origination, and other doctrinal topics – are preached at dhamma talks. In contrast, the term ‘sermons’, thi-la-pay ta-ya-haw” in Burmese, is used to
various *paṭṭhāna* teachers - both monastics and lay people - available in CD and video CD, some of which are accessible online. In some cases, these audio recordings have been transcribed and published as books. Bamaw Hsayadaw’s *Pa-htan” Ta-ya”taw*, the ‘*Paṭṭhāna Dhamma*’, is one of such publications.

In summary, *paṭṭhāna* texts have been composed throughout the literary history of *Abhidhamma* in Burma to the present day. Due to its multiple roles in Buddhist practices and its unparalleled popularity amongst the Burmese, I would suggest that the *Paṭṭhāna* in its various forms is the most published *abhidhamma* text in contemporary Burma. The continuous supply of learning resources such as books, sermons, *dhamma* talks and classes/courses on *Paṭṭhāna* not only fulfils the ongoing demand on the part of a willing audience in Burma, but also expands the pool of knowledge on *Paṭṭhāna*. The vast number of *paṭṭhāna* texts available in Burma provides useful information on the doctrinal aspects of *Paṭṭhāna* from a Burmese perspective. I also find these sources can help us to understand how and to what extent *Abhidhamma* studies have permeated the Burmese audience, and the place of *Abhidhamma* studies in the broader context of monastic education in Burma, which we shall explore below.

### 3.3. Taung-myö’: the city of *abhidhamma nya’wa*

In order to understand Burma’s *Abhidhamma* expertise, it is important to understand the transmission of knowledge across different generations of *Abhidhamma* teachers. In particular, the study of Burma’s *Abhidhamma* tradition is not complete unless the *abhidhamma nya’wa* tradition at Taung-myö’ is considered. I shall refer to a preaching given by monks at religious giving (*dāna*) and other religious functions such as *kathina* (robe-giving), and ordination ceremonies. This means sermons are given as a part of religious events. Monks teach about an issue directly related to the occasion. Making this distinction augments the information provided by Deegalle (2006), Tannenbaum (1995: Chapter 5) and Crosby (2013: 91-93) on sermons and preaching in Sri Lanka and northern Thailand.
briefly trace a lineage of *Abhidhamma* teachers at Taung-myo’ from the late 19th century until World War II, before exploring the place of Taung-myo’ as the city of *abhidhamma nya’wa* in relation to other monastic education centres such as Mandalay and Pahkokku. This section, thus, aims to provide a background for our investigation of Burmese pedagogical approaches towards the study of *Paṭṭhāna*, which is the topic of chapter 4.

*Abhidhamma* teachers from Taung-myo’ composed *ayakaṅ* texts on *nya’wa* subjects, i.e. on the *Mātikā*, the *Dhātukathā*, the *Yamaka* and the *Paṭṭhāna*, which may have formed a basis for their *abhidhamma* classes at night. In 1823, the first Dok Hlan” Hsayadaw Ven. Candamālā composed and taught *ayakaṅ* texts on the *Mātikā* and the *Dhātukathā* in Taung-myo’.

His two close disciples, the Myo’pyin-gyi” Hsayadaw Ven. Arindama and the second Dok Hlan” Hsayadaw Ven. Ariyavaṃsa (his younger brother), continued his lineage by teaching the *abhidhamma nya’wa* subjects in Taung-myo’ and in Mandalay respectively. Myo’pyin-gyi” Hsayadaw composed another set of the *ayakaṅ* texts on the *abhidhamma nya’wa* subjects, namely the *Mātikā*, the *Dhātukathā*, the *Yamaka* and the *Paṭṭhāna*, in the second half of the 19th century.

Myo’pyin-gyi Hsayadaw’s disciples, the Wa-so Hsayadaw Ven. Visuddha, the Shwetaung Hsayadaw Ven. Nārada and the Mhawbi Hsayadaw Ven. Teja became to be known as the ‘Nya’wa-kyaw’, ‘famous *nya’wa* teachers’. While the first two monks stayed and taught in Taung-myo’, Mhawbi Hsayadaw moved to the Maṇḍalārāma (Pyay) Taik in Mandalay, which was under the auspices of Mindon. There, he continued to teach the *abhidhamma nya’wa* using the method from Taung-myo’ to students from different parts of the country, including the above mentioned Hsayagyī” U Ohn, who was then a monk under the ordained name Ven. Ādicca.

---

413 Dhammasāmi (Mingala Taik-thik Hsayadaw) 1936: *ka’*.
415 Ghosita 2002: 93.
After U Ohn moved to Taung-myō and taught at the Mingala Taik from 1905, he also had close students, who later became the authors of various *abhidhamma* texts. Mogok Hsayadaw Ven. Vimala, the founder of the Mogok *vipassanā* meditation tradition, and the Mingala Taik-thik Hsayadaw Ven. Dhammasāmi, who later became the abbot of the Mingala Taik-thik (New Maṅgalā Monastery), were trained by U Ohn on the *abhidhamma nya’wa* subjects for six years. U Ohn asked them to repeat the *Paṭṭhāna* course, *pa-htan” sa-wa* in Burmese, until he thought they were ready to teach it to others. By 1923, both of them became teachers of all four *abhidhamma nya’wa* subjects at Mingala Taik. Ghosita, the author of the biography of Mogok Hsayadaw, reports that, in 1927, Mogok Hsayadaw published the *Ya-ma-ka Wi-hti’man-za-ri*, the ‘Garland of mental process in *Yamaka*’, a commentary on the *Yamaka* showing the detailed *ayakauk*. Based on a copy of the fourth reprint of the text, which I was able to obtain from Burma during my fieldwork, this *yamaka* text, along with the *A-bi’da-ma Tan”hkon*, the ‘Banner of Abhidhamma’, is ascribed to U Ohn. In 1936, Mingala Taik-thik Hsayadaw published the *Nya’wa Tan”hkon*, the ‘Banner of Abhidhamma night-class’, *ayakauk* texts on the four *abhidhamma nya’wa* subjects with a specific focus on the *Paṭṭhāna*. We, then, have evidence for the lineage of *abhidhamma nya’wa* teachers that can be traced back to the first Dok-hlan” Hsayadaw in Taung-myō'. In terms of literature, their works, for example U Ohn’s *A-bi’da-ma Tan”hkon* and Mingala Taik-thik Hsayadaw’s *Nya’wa Tan”hkon*, are based on the 18th century *ayakauk* texts. For instance, in U Ohn’s work on the *Paṭṭhāna*, he makes specific references to the Htan”ta-bin *ayakauk*. His work is shorter than that of Htan”ta-bin Hsayadaw because he has developed a new approach to the study of *Paṭṭhāna* (see Chapter 4). As Ghosita notes, U Ohn’s approach reduced the time taken to study the skilful triplet of the *Paṭṭhāna* from one year down to six months.\footnote{Ghosita 2002: 79.} 

\[416\] A *paṭṭhāna* course lasting six months, in
contrast to the later 45-day courses (see Chapter 4), suggests that much emphasis might have been given to mastering of the whole text, including difficult parts such as the enumeration sections of the Patṭhāna (see 1.3.3. and Chapter 5), rather than preparing for a formal examination on it.

Taung-myo’ was the centre for the study of the abhidhamma nya’wa perhaps from the early 19th century until World War II. It became to be known as the ‘city of abhidhamma nya’wa’ because the teaching monasteries at Taung-myo’ gave special attention to teaching the nya’wa subjects. For example, the Mingala Taik and the Tu”maung Taik were top teaching monasteries in Taung-myo’ focusing on the abhidhamma nya’wa study, and thus attracting many students across the country. By the time U Ohn was teaching at the Mingala Taik in the 1910s, there were approximately 200-300 students attending his abhidhamma class at night (see above). As Ghosita reports, Taung-myo’ was over populated with student-monks who came to attend nya’wa and some of them could not find a place in any monastery in the city.

As the pedagogy of nya’wa relies on memorisation of the ayakauk texts, students may recite the texts out loud as a tool for memorisation during the day time (see Chapter 4). In particular, rote-learning of what the Burmese called ayakauk so-yo”, recitation formulae eliciting a more refined nature of things, plays a vital role in the nya’wa tradition. Recitation of the so-yo” permeated the city, so much so that even lay people were familiar with phrases such as ku-tha-la-taik (kusalatika), ve-da-na-taik (vedanatika), and the much recited phrase haw-han-ka”, ‘This is how it is taught [by the Buddha]’. One of the oft-cited stories about its fame as the city of abhidhamma nya’wa is related to how doors at the Mingala Taik and the Tu”maung Taik used to make the

---

417 Based on Mogok Hsayadaw’s biography, on the eve of World War II, students from teaching monasteries in Taung-myo’ and Mandalay began to go back to their villages in order to avoid the effects of the war. By 1942, only a handful of monks were left at each teaching monastery in Taung-myo’ (Ghosita 2002: 127).
418 Yujanañāṇī 2012: 5.
noise *haw-han-ka*” when opening them.\(^{419}\) This is because even inanimate objects such as doors were so used to the recitation formulae of the *ayakauk* texts that these texts became the fabric of the teaching monasteries.

While Taung-myo’ came to be known as the city of *abhidhamma nya’wa*, Mandalay was recognised as the centre of the study of grammatical rules and the hermeneutics of post-canonical Pāli literature. As we have also observed in 2.2., by the end of the 19\(^{\text{th}}\) century, a majority of leading members of the *Saṅgha*, including senior monks from Mandalay, embraced the formal monastic examinations, which has led to the development of a teaching method that came to be known as the *mandalay-ne”*, the Mandalay method.\(^{420}\) The *mandalay-ne”* – based on the syllabuses of formal examinations – lays emphasis on grammatical study and textual analysis of canonical and post-canonical texts. Under this method, which is now widely used amongst monastics in Burma, students are required to study various grammatical rules and commentarial methods of hermeneutics from auxiliary works written by Burmese monks.\(^{421}\) Using such rules and methods, students analyse post-canonical texts such as the *Pārājika*-aṭṭhakathā, also known as the *Samantapāsādikā* – the commentary on the *Pārājika* section of the *Vinaya Piṭaka*, and the *Sīlakkhandha*-vagga-aṭṭhakathā – the commentary on the first division of the Dīgha Nikāya, and the *Aṭṭhasālinī*, which are the prescribed texts for examinations at the *dhammacāriya*, ‘teacher of Dhamma’, level. Therefore, Mandalay was, and still is, regarded as a famous centre for the advanced study of the above mentioned commentaries through numerous grammatical and commentarial methods of hermeneutics.

Another centre of learning that was established in the early 20\(^{\text{th}}\) century is Pahkokku, 171 km (106 miles) southwest of Mandalay. As Dhammasāmi observes, at

---

\(^{419}\) Ghosita 2002: 67.
\(^{420}\) Dhammasāmi 2004: 141.
\(^{421}\) See Dhammasāmi 2004: 141-142 on a brief description of the *mandalay-ne”*. 

169
the end of the 19th century, a minority of leading members of the Saṅgha at Mandalay still resisted the formal examinations, and by extension the Mandalay approach to the study of texts.422 As a response to the ever-growing examination-orientated tradition in Mandalay, Hsayadaw U Gandhasāra, also known as Yeizgyo Hsayadaw, the leader of Pahkokku academic tradition, set up a monastery in Pahkokku in 1901. The pedagogical approach used at Pahkokku, also known as pahkokku-ne”, focuses on the independent study of Pāli canonical and post-canonical texts across all three collections, namely the whole Tipiṭaka and its commentaries, by digging through the root texts. This method is known in Burmese as kyan"gyi"hpauk, literally means ‘digging through the great texts’, because a student has to study the canonical Pāli text, alongside its commentaries and sub-commentaries, with minimal guidance from the teacher. The student has to dig through different layers of texts again and again until he becomes a real expert on the text. The Sunlun Tipiṭaka Hsayadaw Ven. U Sundara, who as a novice studied at Pahkokku, explained how he had to spend many hours digging through different layers of texts from aṭṭhakathā to ṭīkā to anuṭikā in order to find the correct interpretation of a Pāli word.423 In terms of the study of Paṭṭhāna in Pahkokku, like other vinaya and sutta texts, a student has to study by digging through the canonical paṭṭhāna text, along with its aṭṭhakathā, ṭīkā and anuṭikā.424 Once regarded as having dug through the great texts by the teacher, a student became known as kyan"gyi”pauk, ‘one who has dug through the great texts’, and in fact this term was a recognition of being a scholar. Pahkokku, like Taung-myo’,

422 Dhammasāmi 2004: 143. During my fieldwork, I encountered a well known paṭṭhāna teacher, Ven. U Paṇḍita, the current abbot of the Pa-htan”theikpan Sathintaik, who has not entered any examinations. This is because he regards the formalised examinations as of little value (Interviewed on 26 Nov 2011). In the current formalised examination-orientated educational system, his case is exceptional, rather than the rule.
423 Sunlun Tipiṭaka Hsayadaw, interviewed on 31 July 2012.
was regarded as ‘a city of learning’ and famed for its tradition of scholarship and pedagogy.

We have, then, evidence to suggest that from the late 19th century until World War II, Mandalay, Pahkokku, and Taung-myo’, were regarded as prestigious centres of the study of Buddhist texts, each specialising in different pedagogies and texts. It should be noted that World War II adversely affected the student population of teaching monasteries in the main learning centres such as Taung-myo’, Mandalay and Pahkokku.425 When World War II intervened, other aspects of monastic education were also affected. For instance, before World War II, the British government attempted to persuade monasteries to include secular subjects, such as arithmetic. In 1939, the Pahtamapyan Review Committee appointed by the governor, consisting of influential Hsaydaws from Pahkokku and Mandalay, recommended that novices should be taught arithmetic before they studied the Buddhist texts. The proposal was supported by many prominent monks because arithmetic was, and still is, regarded by the monks as a crucial part of the study of the Saṅkhya-vāra, ‘enumeration section’ (see Chapter 5). However, when WWII intervened, the whole development was abandoned.426

Despite the negative impact of WWII, in the first half of the 20th century, a student visited these cities, namely Mandalay, Pahkokku, and Taung-myo’, in order to learn and expand his textual knowledge. As Sunlun Tipiṭaka Hsayadaw explains, his teachers and their contemporaries had gone around Mandalay, Pahkokku and Taung-myo’, in order to acquire a range of specialised knowledge and literary skills. He adds, “a student began his study at Mandalay [after having basic training on Pāli grammar and the Abhidhammatthesaṅgaha at a village monastery (see 4.1.)] mastering the Pāli

---

425 See f.n. 417 on the reduction of the student population in the teaching monasteries at Taung-myo’ on the eve of WWII.
426 Dhammasāmi 2004: 283.
grammatical rules and analytical tools to study great texts. The student then moved to Pahkokku to undertake an in-depth study of a range of great texts, before going to Taung-myo’ to follow abhidhamma nya’wa courses”. However, the ever-increasing emphasis on formal examinations within Burmese monastic education over the years has other implications for the centres of monastic education, and by extension their scholarship and pedagogical philosophy. For instance, the pahkokku method is based on the philosophy of studying the texts to master them by in-depth reading of the great texts, rather than to prepare for the monastic examinations. As Burmese monastic education became examination-orientated, perhaps from the 1950s onwards, the pahkokku-ne” has declined. It has now almost disappeared as the elders of earlier generations who had been trained in Pahkokku die. This also means teaching monasteries in Pahkokku now adopt the examination-orientated pedagogies, namely the mandalay-ne”, and prepare their students to sit for various monastic examinations held by the government and non-government associations across the country.

The importance given to the formal examinations has also led to the replacement of Taung-myo’ method of nya’wa with Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw’s method of studying nya’wa subjects through tables. The former method emphasises detailed study of the abhidhamma nya’wa subjects, i.e. the Mātikā, the Dhātukathā, the Yamaka and the Paṭṭhāna, through recitation and memorisation of the ayakauk so-yo”. Therefore, the students, having studied each of these texts for about six months, become experts in abhidhamma nya’wa subjects under the former pedagogical approach. As monastic education in Burma becomes more examination-orientated, both teachers and students are under pressure to complete the syllabuses prescribed

---

427 Sunlun Tipiṭaka Hsayadaw, interviewed on 31 July 2012.
by different examination boards. Due to the time limit, difficult components of the paṭṭhāna text, for example, are glossed over quickly. This means a majority of the students do not undertake in-depth study of the abhidhamma nya’wa subjects. The Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw’s method has provided an approach for the students to acquire basic knowledge of the nya’wa subjects by rote-learning of the ayakauk so-yo” using tables. On the basis of Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw’s method, various pedagogical textbooks on the abhidhamma nya’wa subjects have been composed by abhidhamma teachers in contemporary Burma. These pedagogical textbooks also provide a shortcut to the study of the nya’wa subjects for the students. These three factors, namely the examination-orientated system of monastic education, the development of the innovative pedagogical approach by Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw and the production of pedagogical textbooks, have contributed to the popularity of Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw’s method in the present time. His pedagogical method is now used by abhidhamma teachers throughout the country, including abhidhamma teachers in Pahkokku. My visit to Pa-htan” Hsayadaw Ven. Paṇḍita, who now teaches the Paṭṭhāna through tables developed by the Pa-htan”thiek-pan Hsayadaw Ven. Indaka (1903-1988), a disciple of Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw, at the A-shei Taik in Pahkokku confirms this.

3.4. Summary

In this chapter, we have explored Abhidhamma literature in Burma briefly from the Pyu period to the present day drawing on certain authors and their works as examples of the literary trend in a given time period. Since the 17th century, there are

---

428 Dhammasāmi 2004: 56.
429 Pa-htan” Hsayadaw Ven. Paṇḍita, interviewed on 20 August 2012.
three turning points in the history of Abhidhamma studies in Burma. The production of abhidhamma ayakauk texts in the 17th-18th century made it easier to understand the canonical abhidhamma texts by explaining these texts in terms of more refined categories of dhammas. Thus, these are comprehensive handbooks on abhidhamma nya’wa subjects, namely the Mātikā, the Dhātukathā, the Yamaka and the Paṭṭhāna, written in a mixture of Pāli and Burmese. They form the basis for the abhidhamma nya’wa tradition.

We have also seen different academic traditions, namely the Taung-myo’ tradition, the Mandalay tradition, the Pahkokku tradition, flourished in the 19th-20th century Burma. Each scholarly tradition specialised in specific subjects or texts and developed its own pedagogical philosophy and approaches. Abhidhamma teachers from the Taung-myo’ tradition specialised in teaching abhidhamma nya’wa subjects from the late 19th century to the early 20th century. The Mandalay scholarly tradition focused on the study of Pāli grammar and commentarial methods of hermenutics, and developed a pedagogical method that came to be known as the mandalay-ne”. The mandalay-ne” is still widely used in Burmese monastic education. The Pahkokku academic tradition, which developed as a response to the shift from informal education paradigm towards formal examination-orientated paradigm, emphasised the detailed study of the whole of Tipiṭaka, and the commentaries and sub-commentaries with an aim to master all of the great texts. As the formal examination-orientated paradigm has gained popularity amongst both monastics and lay people, the Pahkokku pedagogical approach, i.e. the pahkokku-ne”, has become marginalised.

In terms of the study of Abhidhamma, this chapter has shown that ābhidhammikas such as Htan’”ta-bin Hsayadaw, Ledi Hsayadaw, U Ohn, Mahagandayon Hsayadaw and Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw have played crucial roles in promoting Abhidhamma studies amongst both monastics and lay people. Since the 1940s, Mula’
Pa-htan” Hsayadaw taught and published *abhidhamma* texts using tables. As mentioned above, his pedagogies of the study of *Paṭṭhāna* through tables have not only shortened the time it takes to study the *Paṭṭhāna*, but also it has replaced the older pedagogies from the Taung-myō’ and Pahkokku academic traditions. Thus while Burmese Buddhism pays great attention to retaining *Abhidhamma* expertise, it has not been static. Rather, it shows an ongoing process of innovation and adaption in the methods of writing, presenting and studying the subject. The next chapter will focus on the Burmese approach to the study of the *Paṭṭhāna*. 
CHAPTER 4

BURMESE PEDAGOGICAL APPROACHES FOR STUDYING *Paṭṭhāna*

When exploring the literary history of *Abhidhamma* and monastic academic traditions in Burma in the previous chapter, it was observed that the style of literature developed in response to changing pedagogical approaches. This chapter will examine Burmese pedagogical approaches to the study of the *Paṭṭhāna* and how they have changed over the years. As seen in chapter two and three, monastic education in Burma has undergone a series of changes, which successive administrations have implemented as a part of reform movements regarding religion. As the focus of monastic education shifts from an informal or localised paradigm to a formal, centralised examination-orientated paradigm, subjects and texts taught at teaching monasteries and nunneries have become more standardized and limited to the prescribed texts on the examination syllabuses set by different examination boards. Innovative Burmese pedagogical approaches for the study of *Abhidhamma* have emerged in response to these changes. For instance, the Burmese have adapted the old pedagogical techniques such as the *abhidhamma ayakauk* texts and represented them using tables and symbols in pedagogical textbooks.

I shall first discuss the importance of the *Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha* in the context of monastic education in Burma with a focus on how the *Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha* is studied through memorisation and mnemonic techniques. I shall then turn to its role in the Burmese pedagogical approaches for the study of the *Abhidhamma*. In particular, I aim to show a close relationship between the *Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha* and the Burmese pedagogical approaches to the study of the *Paṭṭhāna* in the modern period. I shall explore how the Burmese pedagogical
approaches to the study of the Paṭṭhana have developed and to what extent these approaches can be traced back to canonical and post-canonical texts.

4.1. The importance of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha (Thin"gyo) in Burmese pedagogical approach to Abhidhamma studies

The Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha is vital for studying Abhidhamma in Burma as mentioned in the previous chapter. For the Burmese, the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha is a pedagogical text providing pedagogical methods for the study of canonical abhidhamma texts, as well as vinaya and sutta texts. While the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha has been used as a pedagogical text for the study of other Buddhist texts, the Burmese have developed pedagogical approaches to study this abhidhamma manual because the terse verses in the text have to be studied with commentary and explanation given by the teacher, or studied alongside a pedagogical textbook on it.

This section is divided into three parts. First, I explain the roles of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha in relation to monastic education in Burma. I then examine the pedagogical approaches, including mnemonic techniques, applied in the study of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha. The third part discusses the roles of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha in relation to the abhidhamma ayakauk technique.

4.1.1. The Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha as a primer for Abhidhamma studies

The Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha is one of the three core texts that form the architecture of the Burmese monastic education. The other two texts are the Kaccāyanavyākaraṇa, the Pāli grammatical text ascribed to Kaccāyana, and the
Pātimokkha, the sutta listing the rules that govern the individual behaviour of monks and (fully-ordained) nuns. Since royal times, these three texts have been taught at monasteries to novices as primers for the three subjects known in Burmese as tha-da, grammar (sadda),\textsuperscript{430} thin"gyo, compendium/manual of Abhidhamma (saṅgha), and wi-ne", discipline (vinaya).\textsuperscript{431} They are considered vital preparation for the study of higher texts under both the informal and formal monastic education systems.

As Dhammasāmi observes, under the informal system of monastic education before the colonial period, there was some standardization of the curriculum. A foundation curriculum for novices included a devotional formula known in Burmese as aw-ka-tha (okaśa); accounts of the Buddha’s victory over Māra, ‘the personification of death’ or ‘the tempter’; lokanīti, ‘guidance for humanity’; some selected suttas – including the Siṅgālovāda-sutta; paritta texts; rules and regulations for novices (sāmaṇera); the Jātakas; and the three texts – i.e. the Abhidhammatthasaṅgha, the Kaccāyanavyākaraṇa, and the Patimokkha – that are regarded as essential for the study of the Buddhist literature.\textsuperscript{432} Thus, under the informal system, the three core texts were taught to students who had already completed three quarters of the foundation curriculum from the devotional formula to the Jātakas. “It was at this stage that some students, aged between fifteen and seventeen, whose parents were poor, often had to return to lay life to work with their parents”.\textsuperscript{433} Those who continued their study were taught the three core texts in order to equip them with necessary tools and approaches for the study of advanced texts. However, by the turn of the 20\textsuperscript{th} century

\textsuperscript{430} The literal meaning of the Pāli word ‘sadda’ is ‘word’ or ‘sound’. In the Burmese language, the word ‘saddā’ with a long ‘a’ in the end is conventionally translated as ‘grammar’. In Pāli the longer compound word sadda-sattha, which literally means ‘word-treatise’, has referred to grammatical texts since the Pāli commentarial period.

\textsuperscript{431} While these core texts and other Buddhist texts may have been taught to precept-nuns and laywomen perhaps at a young age, we do not have evidence to determine the extent of education for women in pre-colonial period. As the Pahtamapyan Examinations became open to precept nuns, laymen and laywomen in 1903, these core texts which are on Pahtamapyan syllabus would be taught at nunneries too.

\textsuperscript{432} Dhammasāmi 2004: 41-45.

\textsuperscript{433} Dhammasāmi 2004: 45.
as Burmese monastic education became more examination-oriented, the students were, and still are, taught the *Abhidhammatthasaṅgha*, the *Kaccāyanavyākaraṇā*, and the *Patimokkha* from the age of nine or ten. For instance, Mahagandayon Hsayadaw and Mogok Hsayadaw were taught the *Kaccāyanavyākaraṇā* and the *Abhidhammatthasaṅgha* from the age of ten and nine respectively. In the case of Mogok Hsayadaw, he began the study, or the memorisation, of the *Abhidhammatthasaṅgha* and the *Kaccāyanavyākaraṇā* in Pāli a couple of months after being ordained as a novice at his village monastery. It does not mean that the first three quarters of the foundation curriculum, i.e. from the devotional formula to the *Jātakas*, is discarded under the formal examination-orientated system. Due to the pressure to complete the examination syllabuses, the teaching on these aspects of the foundation course has been sidelined. It, therefore, seems that under the formal, centralised examination-orientated paradigm, the *Abhidhammatthasaṅgha*, along with the other two core texts, have become the focus of monastic education and have become “the architecture of the Burmese monastic high school level curriculum”.  

### 4.1.2. The study of the *Abhidhammatthasaṅgha*: the art of memory

Given the importance of memorisation in the Burmese monastic education, we shall discuss some aspects of an ‘art of memory’, i.e. mnemonic principles and techniques used in order to organise memory impressions of texts so as to improve recall, in relation to the study of the *Abhidhammatthasaṅgha*. In scholarly discussions of memory and memory systems in ancient and modern European cultures, the phrase ‘art of memory’ is used in a broader context to refer to a variety of mnemonic principles and techniques employed to memorise things, places and texts, organise

---

435 Dhammasāmi 2004: 45.
memory impressions, and improve recall. Frances A. Yates—who wrote a seminal book on trained memory and memory systems in ancient Greek and European cultures entitled The Art of Memory—says, “this art seeks to memorise through a technique of impressing ‘places’ and ‘images’ on the memory”.⁴³⁶ Here, I use the term ‘art of memory’ to refer to textual mnemonic techniques. I draw on scholarly discussions of memory systems in ancient Greek and European cultures in order to show parallels between the ancient theories of memorisation in those cultures and the mnemonic techniques used by the Burmese. In so doing, we shall see that the Burmese pedagogical approaches to the study of the abhidhamma texts are, in fact, ways to organise memory impressions of texts, and thus, improve recall of the texts. As we shall see below, the ability to remember and recall details from the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha is crucial for the study of other abhidhamma texts and for the ayakauk technique.

Turning specifically to the Burmese pedagogical approaches to the study of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha, there are two broad approaches. The first approach is mainly used by monastics. It entails committing to memory all 305 Pāli verses of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha,⁴³⁷ before the translation and explanation of the text are given by the teacher. They may then study the text using various commentaries and pedagogical textbooks written in Burmese for higher study, such as Mahagandayon Hsayadaw’s two important works on the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha, namely the A-hkyepyu’ Thin”gyo, the ‘Introduction to the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha’, and the Thin”gyo Ba-tha-ti-ka, the ‘Burmese commentary of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha’. The first one is for beginners, and the latter is for advanced students. I shall refer to this approach which emphasises memorisation of Pāli texts before learning the semantic meaning of

---

⁴³⁶ Yates 1966: 12.
⁴³⁷ This is based on Bhikkhu Bodhi’s edition of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha. See Bodhi (2010).
the texts as the ‘traditional’ pedagogical approach because the technique dates back
to ancient times (see below).

The second approach entails studying the text through pedagogical textbooks
written in Burmese. It has been used by lay people since the 1950s. I shall refer to this
approach as the ‘modern’ pedagogical approach because this approach to the study of
the *Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha* became popular as the U Nu government initiated
nationwide *Abhidhamma* examinations on the *Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha*, the
*Abhidhammatthavibhāvanī* and the *Visuddhimagga* for the laity in the 1950s.438 In the
modern pedagogical approach, memorisation of the Pāli verses is not emphasised, but
the meaning and explanation of the verses are. There are many different pedagogical
textbooks written specifically for lay students. Nun Daw ṇānē’s pedagogical
textbook on the *Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha* entitled the *Thin"gyo Thin-ne"thit*, the ‘New
Pedagogical Approach to the *Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha*’, is one example of a well known
textbook amongst lay students. The pedagogical approach presented in this book is
unique in that the *cittas*, *cetasikas* and *rūpas* are presented using symbols and diagrams
as mnemonic codes, which are different aspects of an ‘art of memory’. Thus,
memorisation is still important in the modern approach. In fact, memorisation has
played a crucial role in the study of *Abhidhamma*, as in the study of other Buddhist or
secular subjects, in Burma since ancient times.439

Based on the biography of Mogok Hsayadaw, it is clear that in the traditional
pedagogical approach novices were asked to commit the Pāli verses from the
*Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha* and the *Kaccāyanavyākaraṇa* to memory. Rote learning of
these two texts is still a requirement for the Burmese monastic education at the basic

438 Yujanañāṇī 2007: 3-4.
439 Although a detailed study and analysis of the roles of memory and memorisation has not be
undertaken in the context of Burmese monastic education, we can at least deduce – on the basis of
primary and secondary sources – that memorisation has been a vital part of Buddhist pedagogy in the
Burmese monastic culture since Pagan period.
level. It is important to note here that rote learning, or memorising the texts with precision, serves as a crucial basis for the higher level of study of Buddhist literature, and indeed, for preaching and giving dhamma talks etc. in the Burmese monastic culture. As we shall see below, at the higher level of study and in the context of giving dhamma talks, memorised knowledge may be applied in order to create useful ideas and experiences with added value.

For the Burmese, rote learning or memorisation of a text is achieved through reading, or reciting, the text out loud repeatedly. As Samuels – writing on learning and performing the paritta texts by novices in Sri Lanka – observes, a teacher recites the text in question line by line, and the students repeat it in unison.\textsuperscript{440} Through repeating the text with the teacher, the students learn where to break up Pāli sandhi, ‘conjunction of final and initial letters, or of letters within a word’,\textsuperscript{441} and how and where to stretch the Pāli syllables so as not to change the words’ meaning.\textsuperscript{442} With long texts such as the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha, the teacher divides the text into smaller portions making it easier for memorisation.

Once the students have received this kind of formal guidance from the teacher, the students recite the text individually or in small groups so as to imprint the text to memory. The description below captures a lively oral aspect of the traditional pedagogy at the Gwei”pin Tawya (forest monastery), where Mogok Hsayadaw stayed until he was 14 years old. Ghosita, the author of the biography of Mogok Hsayadaw, describes how the novices at the village monastery practised recitation of the Pāli verses of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha out loud as a part of their training to memorise the text.

At Gwei”pin forest monastery, Koyin [novice] Vimala is thoroughly enjoying the time with other novices memorising [sa-kyak in Burmese]
the texts. The noisy sounds of their recitation [of the texts] fill the whole monastery. . . . From time to time, they are memorising and taking mental notes [of the text] by shouting out loud [the Pāli verses such as],

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{Sammāsambuddham atulam}, \\
\text{Sasaddhammaganuttamam.} \\
\text{Abhivādiya bhāsissam,} \\
\text{Abhidhammatthasangaham}.^{443}
\end{align*}
\]

(Having respectfully saluted the Fully Enlightened One, the Peerless One, along with the Sublime Teaching and the Noble Order, I will speak the Manual of Abhidhamma - a compendium of the things contained in the Abhidhamma).^{444}

The above mentioned Pāli verse is the introductory verse of the Abhidhammatthasangaha. It highlights that the students have to commit the whole text, even the introductory verse, to memory. This account also demonstrates the living oral tradition of monastic education in Burma, which is an extremely common sight in monasteries and nunneries up to the present day.^{445}

Before we explore the process through which the students memorise the Abhidhammatthasangaha further, I would like to point out similarities between the understanding and practice of the memorisation process in medieval monastic culture in Europe and in modern monastic culture in Burma. I draw on Mary Carruthers’ work on the study of memory in European medieval culture,^{446} and the above quotation from Mogok Hsayadaw’s biography in order to highlight two issues related to memorisation techniques. The first issue is related to the use of imagery of food and processing/digesting the food with respect to memorisation of the text. I have translated the Burmese word ‘sa-kyak’, which literally means ‘cooking letter/character’ or ‘cooking food’, as ‘memorising’. The word ‘sa’ can mean either

\[\text{Ghosita 2002: 22-23.}\]
\[\text{Bodhi 2010: 23}\]
\[\text{See Mary Carruthers’ book entitled The Book of Memory: A study of Memory in Medieval Culture, first published in 1990, on the training and used of memory for a variety of purposes and contexts in European cultures during the Middle Ages.}\]
‘letter’ or ‘food’, and the verb ‘kyak’ is ‘to cook’. In the context of Burmese education system – whether monastic or secular – the phrase ‘sa-kyak’ is used to refer to the process of training memory to remember the texts. In this context, the phrase ‘sa-kyak’ has a sense of processing the text so that it can be committed to one’s memory. Other phrases such as ‘sa-pyan’, ‘ruminate text’, and ‘sa-an’, ‘regurgitate text’, are also used in relation to memorial activities in the Burmese monastic culture. The second issue, which is related to the first one, is concerned with reading the text aloud by mouthing the words as the text is imprinted on one’s memory. Thus, the Burmese’s relationship to the text, as with the medieval scholar’s relationship to his text in European tradition, is based on an oral aspect of learning. Carruthers writes,

The medieval scholar’s relationship to his texts is quite different from modern objectivity [in European culture]. Reading is to be digested, to be ruminated, like a cow chewing her cud, or like a bee making honey from the nectar of flowers. Reading is memorized with the aid of murmur, mouthing the words sub-vocally as one turns the text over in one’s memory.”447

Carruthers observes, “it is this movement of the mouth that established rumination as a basic metaphor for memorial activities”.448 Thus, the oral aspect of the memorisation process, i.e. mouthing the words sub-vocally or loudly, is important in monastic learning in both European medieval and Burmese modern traditions. Carruthers adds, “The process familiarizes a text to a medieval scholar, in a way like that by which human beings may be said to familiarize their food. It is both physiological and psychological, and it changes both the food and its consumer”.449 As in European medieval culture, we have seen that the Burmese also use the imagery of food and rumination when referring to the process of training memory and internalization of the text. Therefore, these two aspects, namely the use of rumination/digestion of food

---

447 Carruthers 2011: 205.
448 Carruthers 2011: 206.
as an imagery linked to the memorial activities, and the use of an oral aspect of learning by mouthing the words, are common in both medieval monastic culture in Europe and in modern monastic culture in Burma.

To return to the description of memorisation techniques used by novices in order to memorise the whole of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha, it is important to recall that under the formal examination-orientated system the core texts are to be memorised at a young age. Ghosita observes,

> At this age [i.e. nine or ten years old], they do not have other things on their mind. They follow their teacher’s instruction precisely: if they are told to memorise, they memorise; to count, they count; to recite, they recite without hesitation.\(^{450}\)

In this pedagogical approach, training one’s memory at a young age is very important as it normally leads to lifelong retention of the text in one’s memory. Here, it should be noted that counting, ‘twet’ as in ‘twet-hkyak’ in Burmese, is an important aspect of the learning of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha, and indeed other abhidhamma texts, because students may be asked to count the number of cittas, cetasikas etc. in detail by the teacher during abhidhamma nya’wa (see below). The teacher provides the ‘a-nek’, ‘semantic meaning’, of the text, only when the students have mastered the Pāli verses in that they are capable of reciting them in any order without a prompt. Occasionally, the teacher may explain the meaning by giving examples and analogies that young novices can understand. For instance, Gwei”pin Hsayadaw Ven. Jāgara, the abbot of the Gwei”pin forest monastery, explained the interdependence between the citta and the cetasika to the novices by using the analogy of asking for a cup of water. While one wants to drink water, one cannot leave behind the cup. Water has to be carried in the cup, and water cannot be separated from the cup. Thus, citta and cetasika cannot be separated.\(^{451}\)

\(^{450}\) Ghosita 2002: 23.

In addition to giving and explaining the semantic meaning of the texts during daytime, students may have lessons on the *Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha* at night. The term for these night-lessons is *nya’wa*. During *nya’wa* the teacher gives additional, detailed explanation and analysis of the fourfold category, i.e. *citta*, *cetasika*, *rūpa* and *nibbāna*, without looking at any book or text. The teacher also asks the students to give a detailed analysis of, for example, the twelve different types of unskilful *cittas*. Ghosita reports that Mogok Hsayadaw was asked to recollect all aspects of the twelve different types of unskilful *cittas* and recite them by his teacher during one of the lessons on the *Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha*.\(^\text{452}\) The transliteration of the Pāli listing the first two types of unskilful *cittas* and their translation are shown below.

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{Thaw}^\text{"m}a-na-tha \text{tha-ha-gok, dik-thi'ga-ta than-pa-yok, a'than-hka-ri'ka saik-ta-hku.} \\
\text{Thaw}^\text{"m}a-na-tha \text{tha-ha-gok, dik-thi'ga-ta than-pa-yok, tha'than-hka-ri'ka saik-ta-hku.} \\
\ldots
\end{align*}
\]

One consciousness accompanied by joy, associated with wrong-view, unprompted.
One consciousness accompanied by joy, associated with wrong-view, prompted.
\ldots

While I have shown only the first two unskilful *cittas* above, the recitation of all twelve unskilful *cittas* occurs in the same manner.\(^\text{453}\) An unskilful *citta* has three aspects in that it can be analysed in terms of feeling (*vedanā*), its association with (*sampayutta*) or dissociation from (*vippayutta*) certain *cetasika* and the nature of its arising – i.e. unprompted (*asaṅkhāra*) or prompted (*sasaṅkhāra*).\(^\text{454}\) These three aspects of the unskilful *cittas* are shown in Table 4.1.

---

\(^\text{453}\) It should be noted that the recitation of the text is pronounced according to the Burmese pronunciation of Pāli.
\(^\text{454}\) The *citta* which arises spontaneously, without prompting or inducement by expedient means, is called unprompted. The *citta* which arises with prompting or inducement by expedient means is called prompted. See Bodhi (2010: 36) for a detailed explanation of unprompted and prompted *cittas*.  

---
Table 4.1. A detailed analysis of the unskilful cittas in Pāli and in English.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Three aspects/characteristics</th>
<th>Vedanā (feeling)</th>
<th>Sampayutta/vippayutta (associated/dissociated)</th>
<th>Asaṅkhāra/sa-saṅkhāra (unprompted/prompted)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Somanassa-sahagata</td>
<td>diṭṭhigata-sampayutta</td>
<td>a-saṅkhārika</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>accompanied by joy</td>
<td></td>
<td>associated with wrong-view</td>
<td>unprompted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somanassa-sahagata</td>
<td>diṭṭhigata-sampayutta</td>
<td>a-saṅkhārika</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>accompanied by joy</td>
<td></td>
<td>associated with wrong-view</td>
<td>prompt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somanassa-sahagata</td>
<td>diṭṭhigata-vippayutta</td>
<td>a-saṅkhārika</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>accompanied by joy</td>
<td></td>
<td>dissociated from wrong-view</td>
<td>unprompted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Upekkhā-sahagata</td>
<td>diṭṭhigata-sampayutta</td>
<td>a-saṅkhārika</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>accompanied by equanimity</td>
<td></td>
<td>associated with wrong-view</td>
<td>unprompted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Upekkhā-sahagata</td>
<td>diṭṭhigata-sampayutta</td>
<td>a-saṅkhārika</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>accompanied by equanimity</td>
<td></td>
<td>associated with wrong-view</td>
<td>prompt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Upekkhā-sahagata</td>
<td>diṭṭhigata-vippayutta</td>
<td>a-saṅkhārika</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>accompanied by equanimity</td>
<td></td>
<td>dissociated from wrong-view</td>
<td>unprompted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Domanassa-sahagata</td>
<td>paṭigha-sampayutta</td>
<td>a-saṅkhārika</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>accompanied by displeasure</td>
<td></td>
<td>associated with aversion</td>
<td>unprompted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Domanassa-sahagata</td>
<td>paṭigha-sampayutta</td>
<td>a-saṅkhārika</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>accompanied by displeasure</td>
<td></td>
<td>associated with aversion</td>
<td>prompt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Upekkhā-sahagata</td>
<td>vicikicchā-sampayutta</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>accompanied by equanimity</td>
<td></td>
<td>associated with doubt</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

lobhamulacittāni (cittas rooted in greed)

dosamulacittāni (cittas rooted in hatred)

mohamulacittāni (cittas)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Three aspects/characteristics</th>
<th>Vedanā (feeling)</th>
<th>Sampayutta/vippayutta (associated/dissociated)</th>
<th>Asaṅkhāra/sa-asāṅkhāra (unprompted/prompted)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>rooted in delusion)</td>
<td>12 upekkhā-sahagata uddhacca-sampayutta</td>
<td>accompanied by associated with restlessness</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

We have, so far, seen the traditional pedagogical approach to the learning of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha in the Burmese monastic culture. In this approach, young novices engage in learning the text by rote. Only after completing the task of memorisation thoroughly, they begin to study the meaning of what they have memorised. In the traditional pedagogical approach to the study of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha, the students also are trained at night on how to retrieve specific aspects of the text and do detailed analysis of it (see above). Such systematic training of memory from an early age onwards ensures not only a precise recollection of the texts, but also a quick retrieval of specific information for analytical study of the Abhidhamma.

In the Burmese pedagogical approach to the study of Abhidhamma, it is important that the students know cittas, cetasikas and rūpas well enough to analyse them in terms of their detailed aspects, or characteristics. Sometimes the teacher may ask the student to count the number of cittas according to different types of vedanā. For example, in 2010, during one of my lessons on the citta section, i.e. chapter one, of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha with the Shwe-sin Tipiṭaka Hsayadaw, he asked me to count and list all the unskilful cittas according to different types of vedanā. I, therefore, had to retrieve the relevant pieces of information from the citta section and recited the list of the twelve unskilful cittas in terms of three different types of vedanā in a mixture of Pāli and Burmese. The translation of some parts of the recitation that I did is given below.
There are four cittas with joyful feeling. They are: one citta accompanied with joy, associated with wrong-view, unprompted, . . . These cittas are rooted in greed.\(^{455}\)

For clarity, I have shown the content of the whole recitation in Table 4.2.

Table 4.2. All the twelve unskilful cittas in terms of different types of feeling (vedanā).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of cittas in terms of feeling</th>
<th>Detailed list</th>
<th>Type of cittas in terms of roots</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4 cittas with joyful feeling</td>
<td>one citta accompanied by joy, associated with wrong-view, unprompted</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>one citta accompanied by joy, associated with wrong-view, prompted</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>one citta accompanied by joy, dissociated from wrong-view, unprompted</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>one citta accompanied by joy, dissociated from wrong-view, prompted</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 cittas with equanimous feeling</td>
<td>one citta accompanied by equanimity, associated with wrong-view, unprompted</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>one citta accompanied by equanimity, associated with wrong-view, prompted</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>one citta accompanied by equanimity, dissociated from wrong-view, unprompted</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>one citta accompanied by equanimity, dissociated from wrong-view, prompted</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>one citta accompanied by equanimity, associated with doubt</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>one citta accompanied by equanimity, associated with restlessness</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 cittas with unpleasant feeling</td>
<td>one citta accompanied by displeasure, associated with aversion, unprompted</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>one citta accompanied by displeasure, associated with aversion, prompted</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^{455}\) A lesson on the Abhidhammattha-saṅgaha with Shew-sin Tipiṭaka Hsayadaw in November 2010.
The main point in the above example was to recognise that there are four unskilful cittas with joyful feeling, six unskilful cittas with equanimous feeling, and two unskilful cittas with unpleasant feeling. It was also crucial that I remembered all the detailed aspects of the unskilful cittas, i.e. their associated or dissociated cetasikas, and their nature of arising. For instance, it was important to remember that five out of the twelve unskilful cittas arise spontaneously without prompting (a-saṅkhārika), while another five unskilful cittas arise with prompting (sa-saṅkhārika). It should be also remembered that there is no qualification in terms of prompted or unprompted attached to the description of the two cittas rooted in delusion.

As I have hinted above, in the Burmese monastic culture, education, as with education in other cultures, is a process with different levels of learning. At the basic level, rote learning is emphasised as seen in the case of novices memorising the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha and other core texts. The importance given at rote learning implies that the ‘rumination’ as in a deep engagement with the text so as to create new useful experiences and ideas may not occur at the basic level of learning in the Burmese monastic culture. For instance, novices who are memorising the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha at the age of nine and ten (see above) may not engage in such a reflexive part of the learning process. Nevertheless, as Shwe-sin Tipiṭaka Hsayadaw points out, at the advanced level of study such as undertaking written examinations on the Paṭṭhāna as a part of the Tipiṭakadhāra Examinations, it is crucial not only to remember and recall the canonical and post-canonical texts, but also to reconfigure and combine memorised knowledge in order to answer analytical questions.

Moreover, memorised knowledge, which has been reflected upon and internalized,

456 See f.n. 454 on an explanation of the prompted and unprompted cittas.
457 See Bodhi (2010: 38-39) for an explanation for this omission of prompted and unprompted qualifications in the description of the two cittas rooted in delusion.
458 Shew-sin Tipiṭaka Hsayadaw, interviewed on 21 December 2011.
serves as a basis for dhamma talks, sermons and lectures given by prominent, learned monks such as Mahagandayon Hsayadaw, Bamaw Hsayadaw and Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw. For instance, Bamaw Hsayadaw in his dhamma talks on the Paṭṭhāna not only demonstrates in-depth knowledge of the topic, but also draws upon memorised knowledge of paṭṭhāna and other topics to teach it in a useful and meaningful way for the audience.459

The implication is that memorised knowledge has been internalised through the process of meditation at the higher level of study. The term ‘meditation’, meditatio in Latin, in relation to the memorial activities refers to a process of memory-training in that one completely internalises what one has read or memorised.460 Carruthers reports that medieval scholars such as Quintilian and Martianus Capella recommend that texts to be learned are more usefully recited in a murmur.461 This is because the interior senses are engaged more fully in imprinting words into memory when memorisation is performed in a low voice. On the basis of my own experience in memorising the Paṭṭhāna, I can confirm that a murmur is helpful in the memorisation process. With a loud recitation, it is as if one cannot hear oneself think. Another benefit of a low voice recitation is that it conserves one’s energy, while a loud recitation makes the body tired. During my fieldwork, I observed that most monks and nuns who are studying for the Pahtamapyan Examinations corresponding to the basic and intermediate levels of study recite the texts in a loud voice. I also observed at a teaching nunnery, the Sakyadhītā Sathintaik, in Sagaing that nuns who are studying for the Dhammācariya Examinations recite the texts in a murmur, or form study groups to discuss the topics. Moreover, a couple of my informants report that

459 Kumārābhivamsa (05-14 June 2009). Bamaw Hsayadaw Ven. Dr. Kumārābhivamsa gave a ten-days dhamma talk on paṭṭhāna in 2009 in Yangon. In his dhamma talks, he draws on various canonical and post-canonical texts and his own experience in learning the Paṭṭhāna to explain the 24 conditions to lay audience.
460 Carruthers 2011: 203.
the Yaw Tipiṭaka Hsayadaw Ven. U Sīrinandābhivaṃsa (1943-) used ‘silent reading’ as a mnemonic technique in order to study for the Tipiṭakadhāra Examinations. As Carruthers notes, silent reading is the accompaniment and also the result of being attentive, of meditation, and memory, but it is evidently not incompatible with the vocal murmur. It, therefore, seems that different styles of reading and recitation have different purposes which help different aspects of memorising.

In summary, we have discussed pedagogical approaches to the study of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha. In particular, we have examined the traditional pedagogical approach in relation to memory and mnemonic techniques used in the Burmese monastic culture. Along the way, we have seen some parallels between the understanding and the practice of memory and memorisation in the medieval European culture and the modern Burmese culture.

4.1.3. The Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha and the ayakauk technique

The kind of exercise in which asking the students to count, analyse and reconfigure the fourfold classification of dhammas, as we have seen in 4.1.2., aims to test whether they thoroughly know and remember different types of cittas, cetasikas and rūpas. It is also important that the students are able to analyse the dhammas in terms of different kinds of feelings, or other types of categories described in the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha. This pedagogical technique is known in Burmese as tha-yok-hkwe, literally means ‘analyse the essential nature’, which is a synonym of ayakauk. The Burmese word ‘tha-yok’ is a Pāli loanword. It comes from the Pāli word ‘sarūpa’, which is generally translated as ‘of the same form’ or ‘having a form’. In Burmese

---

462 Informants LW8 and LM2.
463 Due to limited space, I have not, however, assessed the modern pedagogical approach, which is mainly used by lay people studying for the Abhidhamma examinations.
Abhidhamma tradition, the word ‘sarūpa’ is used to refer to the essential nature of things or dhammas. In the Abhidhamma literature written in Burmese, a variety of terms are used interchangeably to refer to the pedagogical technique in which counting, analysing and reconfiguring a broader classification of dhammas in terms of a more refined presentation of the ultimate nature of things. Some of the terms that we find in abhidhamma pedagogical texts referring to the above mentioned pedagogical technique include: ‘ayakauk’, ‘pickup the essential meaning of dhammas’; ‘tha-yok-kauk’, ‘pickup the essential nature of dhammas’; ‘tha-yok-hkwe’, ‘analyse the essential nature of dhammas’; ‘tha-yok-kwe’, ‘having analysed the essential nature of dhammas’; and ‘ta-ya-ko-kauk’, ‘pickup the characteristics of dhammas’. In this thesis, I shall refer to this pedagogical technique as ayakauk technique because the term ‘ayakauk’ is the most frequently used term in the study of Abhidhamma in Burma. The ayakauk technique, therefore, is a pedagogical technique in which the student is asked to count, analyse and reconfigure a broader classification of dhammas, or a verb (see below), in terms of a more refined presentation of ultimate nature of things. I would suggest that it is a ‘pedagogical’ technique, rather than an analytical technique, because the ayakauk technique is employed in a broader context of teaching the Abhidhamma and other Buddhist texts. This technique is used within a classroom context in which an interaction between the teacher and the student occurs instantaneously (see 4.1.2.), as well as within an examination context.

The ayakauk technique, as we have seen in Chapter 3, is the foundation of the ayakauk texts on the Mātikā, the Dhātukathā, the Yamaka and the Paṭṭhāna. It is also a crucial pedagogical technique through which the canonical abhidhamma texts can be understood. This technique is used in the study of canonical and post-canonical texts such as the Vinaya Piṭaka, the suttas in the Aṅguttara Nikāya, and the Dhammapada and

---

its commentaries, which are on the curriculum of the Sāmaṇera Examinations. In Sāmaṇera Examinations, known in Burmese as the Thamanay-kyaw Examinations, one of many types of monastic examinations in Burma,\textsuperscript{465} two out of ten questions aim to test the candidate’s ability to interpret and analyse Pāli texts using the abhidhamma method and the ayakauk technique. The focus of these questions is on the interpretation of verbs and perhaps other Pāli words taken from suttas. For instance, the student may be asked to analyse the main verb of a Pāli text as follows.

Question: Analyse the main verb in this Pāli text, “Pūjāṃ katvā sāmikassa santike abhinibbattiṃ patthesi”, [“Having made offerings [to the monks], she prayed to be reborn in the presence of her former husband”], in terms of citta and cetasikas.\textsuperscript{466} This Pāli text is taken from the Patipūjakumārīvatthu in the Pupphavagga of the Dhammapada commentary.\textsuperscript{467} In this story, Patipūjakumārī – who remembered her past existence as a wife of Mālabhārin, a god (deva), in Tāvatiṃsa heaven – made offerings to monks and did skilful actions, and prayed to be reborn as the wife of Mālabhārin again as a result of these good actions. The main verb to be analysed using the ayakauk technique is ‘patthesi’. In this context, she ‘prayed’ (patthesi) to be reborn as a wife of Mālabhārin. This type of wish (chanda), according to the abhidhamma method, originates in greed (lobha). Therefore, when Patipūkakumārī prayed (patthesi), one of the eight cittas rooted in greed (lobhamūlaka-cittas) arose. Thus, the ayakauk of patthesi, in this case, is one of the eight cittas rooted in greed and its associated cetasikas. Out of the cetasikas, the mental factor ‘desire’, chanda-cetasika, is the predominate mental factor because of her desire to be reborn as the wife of

\textsuperscript{465} Kyaw 2012c.
\textsuperscript{466} This question is based on question number 3 of the Saddhammaddhaja Thilashin Kyaw Examination held at the Sakyadhī Tea ching nunnery in Sagaing in 2011. Sāmaṇera Examinations are also open to precept nuns, thilashin, and for the precept nuns, they are known as Thilashin Kyaw Examinations.
\textsuperscript{467} Since the candidate is expected to have read these Pāli texts thoroughly and thus know them very well, the name of the story is not given in the question. Taking Pāli sentences or fragments from the prescribed texts and setting questions from these sentences or fragments are not uncommon in monastic examinations in Burma. The Dhammācariya Examinations use the same question-setting method (Dhammasāmi 2004: 141).
Mālabhārin, and thus encouraging her to pray. Hence, a precise answer to the question is: the ayakauk of pathesi is any of eight cittas rooted in greed and its associated cetasikas, and chanda as the predominate cetasika. In the above example, the ayakauk technique is used as a hermeneutic technique in which canonical and post-canonical texts are interpreted from the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha viewpoint. In other monastic examinations, such as the Dhammācariya Examinations, there are questions asking the candidates to analyse texts using the ayakauk technique on the basis of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha perspective. Therefore, the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha and the schemes of classifications of dhammas in it have become hermeneutical tools in the study of vinaya, sutta and abhidhamma texts in Burma. We have, then, evidence to suggest that Buddhist scholarship in Burma in general has become a part of the ongoing process of intensification of Abhidhamma culture by employing the abhidhammic schemes and methods as prescribed in the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha as a hermeneutic to study and understand texts in all three collections of the Pāli canon.

Alongside its popularity in Buddhist scholarship, the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha is popular amongst the lay people. Like the Paṭṭhāna, or Pa-htan”, the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha, or more popularly known as Thin”gyo, is probably one of the most well known abhidhamma texts in Burma. In Burmese Abhidhamma tradition, the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha is considered as an essential abhidhamma manual that neatly captures the essence of the Abhidhamma Piṭaka. It should be noted that when the Burmese refer to the study of Abhidhamma in general, it is likely that they are talking about the study of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha. Heated debates on Abhidhamma may occur at teashops or pagoda compounds or monasteries. In such debates, lay people formulate their arguments on the basis of their knowledge of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha. This tradition of debates on the nature of dhammas from the perspective of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha may date back to the pre-colonial period.
The lay poet Sa-lay U Pon Nya (c. 1812-1866) during Mindon’s reign composed a satirical poem about how people would spend their time debating about the nature and characteristics of dhammas based on their knowledge of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha at communal events such as village offerings (dāna), ywa-ahlu in Burmese. In this poem, Sa-lay U Pon Nya mocks the people who would position themselves in the middle of a crowd at the communal event and raise their voices to show off how well they can analyse the dhammas, while snacking on pickled-tea salad (a traditional Burmese snack) provided by the sponsor of the event. This account reflects not only the popularity of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha, but also the pervasiveness of the knowledge of ayakauk technique, which is based on the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha’s schemes of classification of dhammas, amongst the Burmese.

4.2. The Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha and the Paṭṭhāna

Having explored the importance of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha in the context of Burmese monastic education, this section will examine the relationship between the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha and the study of the Paṭṭhāna. I shall discuss the pedagogical method for studying the Paṭṭhāna as described in the chapter eight of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha, namely the sixfold classification of how conditional relations are related, and the synthesis of the 24 conditions into four conditions. Along the way, based on my own study of the Paṭṭhāna in the Burmese scholarly tradition, I shall also demonstrate ways in which the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha provides pedagogical techniques for studying the Paṭṭhāna with specific examples.

469 Ghosita 2002: 27.
In the eighth chapter of the *Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha*, two laws of Buddhist causality, namely the law of dependent origination (*paṭiccasamuppada*) and the law of conditional relations (*paṭṭhāna*), are presented. Focusing on the conditional relations, we find that the 24 conditions are not explained in their original order. They are, in fact, classified into 6 different categories according to the nature of the conditional relations between different kinds of dhammas as shown in Table 4.3.

Table 4.3. The classification of the 24 conditions according to the nature of the conditional relations between different kinds of dhammas.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Conditioning states</th>
<th>Conditioned states</th>
<th>Conditioning forces</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 mentality (nāma)</td>
<td>mentality (nāma)</td>
<td>proximity condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>contiguity condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>repetition condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>association condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>absence condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>disappearance condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 mentality (nāma)</td>
<td>mentality and</td>
<td>root condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>materiality (nāmarūpa)</td>
<td>kamma condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>kammic result condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>jhana condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>path condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 mentality (nāma)</td>
<td>materiality (rūpa)</td>
<td>post-nascence condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 materiality (rūpa)</td>
<td>mentality (nāma)</td>
<td>pre-nascence condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 concepts (paññatti) and mentality and materiality (nāmarūpa)</td>
<td>mentality (nāma)</td>
<td>object condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>decisive support condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 mentality and materiality (nāmarūpa)</td>
<td>mentality and materiality (nāmarūpa)</td>
<td>predominance condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>co-nascence condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>mutuality condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>support condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>nutriment condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>faculty condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>dissociation condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>presence condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>non-disappearance condition</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As we can see from the above table, conditioning states and conditioned states are classified into three groups of dhammas: 1) mentality (nāma) – i.e. 89 cittas and 52 cetasikas; 2) materiality (rūpa) – i.e. 28 rūpas; 3) mentality-materiality conjoined – i.e. 89 cittas, 52 cetasikas, 28 rūpas, and concepts (paññatti). These classes of dhammas are then arranged in 6 permutations as shown in Table 4.3. In the first group, mentality is a condition for mentality by means of being a proximity condition. Similarly, the rest of the conditions in this group pertain to the conditional relations between mentality and mentality.

I shall now compare the explanation of the conditional relations given in the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha and the Burmese approach to the study of these relations with a specific example. In the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha, Anuruddha glossed over the explanation of the sixfold classification of conditional relations in fifteen verses (§12-27). Considering the object condition (ārammaṇa-paccaya) as an example, Anuruddha tersely describes it as follows.

\[
\text{Ārammanavasena upanissayavasena ti ca duvidhā paññatti nāmarūpāni nāmass’eva paccaya honti.}
\]
\[
\text{Tattha rūpādivasena chabbidham hoti ārammaṇaṁ.}\]

In two ways, concepts, and mentality and materiality are conditions for mentality by means of being object condition and decisive condition. Here, object is sixfold as visible form, etc.

(translation Bodhi 2010: 315)

Based on the above text, it is not clear how and which dhammas are conditioning states and conditioned states for the object condition. Drawing upon the Burmese Abhidhamma tradition and the abhidhamma ayakauk technique, we can identify various dhammas involved in the conditional relations. That is, each conditional relation can be analysed in terms of a detailed category of dhammas, namely cittas, cetasikas, rūpas, paññattis and nibbāna. For example, the conditional relation involving the object condition can be analysed in terms of more refined dhammas as shown below.

\[^{470}\text{Abhidh.-s. VIII, 17, Bodhi 2010: 314.}\]
Table 4.4. Conditioning states and conditioned states for the object condition on the basis of In"sein Hsayadaw’s pedagogical textbook on the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha.  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Conditioning states (ārammaṇa)</th>
<th>Conditioned states (ārammaṇika)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• 89 cittas</td>
<td>• 89 cittas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• 52 cetasikas</td>
<td>• 52 cetasikas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• 28 rūpas</td>
<td>all dhammas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• 6 kinds of sense-objects</td>
<td>all mentality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• nibbāna</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• concepts</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The object condition in simple terms is a condition in which conditioning states become the prop or support of conditioned states. By being a prop, or an object (ārammaṇa), conditioning states cause conditioned states to arise. For example, the visible object (rūpāyatana) is a conditioning state for the arising of eye-consciousness (cakkhu-viññāṇa) by means of being an object condition. Why do we have all dhammas and concepts as conditioning states and all mentality as conditioned states for the object condition? Considering the conditioned states or ārammaṇika, ‘that which takes an object’, we know that a citta, by definition, is so-called because it cognizes an object. And, every citta, along with its associated cetasikas, necessarily takes an object.  

We have all 89 cittas and 52 cetasikas as conditioned states of the object condition because they take an object. Since rūpa does not, and cannot, cognize an object, it cannot be a conditioned state of the object condition. In terms of conditioning states, or objects (ārammaṇas), the reference is to the six kinds of sense-objects - i.e. visible, sound, smell, taste, touch and mental objects. While the first five of the six sense-objects that a citta can take as an object belong to the present moment, the mental object can be from the past, present or future. In fact, the mind-consciousness (mano-viññāṇa) can have as its object anything - mental or material,

---

real or conceptual, past, present or future. For example, when worshipping the Buddha, the mind of a worshipper takes as its object the Buddha, whether he is present, dead, represented by an image or conceptual. Kyaw and Crosby observe, “It is the fact that a mental object is not confined to temporal and spatial boundaries that allows the believer to worship and gain merit from worshipping the Buddha whether he is currently accessible or theologically accepted as present in the images, or even if there is no Buddha image in front of the worshipper.” Thus, the field of operation of the object condition is so wide as to embrace not only the fundamental components of actuality, called dhammas – including nibbāna (asaṅkhata dhamma), but also conceptual constructs which have only a consensual reality. Hence, we have all dhammas and concepts as conditioning states, or objects, of the object condition.

Bodhi’s revision of Nārada Mahāthera’s edition of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha draws upon the works of Ledi Hsayadaw and Mula’ Pa-htan Hsayadaw to explain the verses (§12-27) on the conditional relations. In particular, he has provided a detailed analysis of the conditioning states and conditioned states of the 24 conditions based on Mula’ Pa-htan Hsayadaw’s work, which is a good source to find out about the details of the rest of the conditional relations. It is interesting to note that the ayakaук technique, which is predominately based on the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha’s categories of things, has been used by the Burmese as a pedagogical approach to unravel Anuruddha’s terse description of the conditional relations.

In addition to the sixfold classification of condition relations, Anuruddha – based upon the 5th century C.E. work the Abhidhammāvatāra, the ‘Introduction to the

---

475 Kyaw and Crosby 2013: 254-265.
476 Karunadasa 2010: 266.
477 For a detailed explanation of the sixfold classification of conditions, see Bodhi 2010: 305-322.
478 For a detailed analysis of the conditional relations, see Nārada 1996: 81-87; Khin Myint 2000: 71-78; Bodhi 2010: 308-311.
Abhidhamma’, by Buddhadatta⁴⁷⁹ – presented the synthesis of 24 conditions into four conditions in the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha as follows.

Āramman’-ūpanissaya-kamma-atthipaccayesi ca sabbe pi paccayā samodhānaṃ gacchanti.⁴⁸⁰

All conditions are included in the conditions of object, decisive support, kamma and presence.

(translation Bodhi 2010: 322)

Drawing upon Ledi Hsayadaw’s work, Bodhi explains how the 24 conditions and their varieties (see below) are synthesized into four conditions.⁴⁸¹ I, therefore, shall not go into the details of the synthesis. Nevertheless, I would like to point out the dual role of Abhidhamma, namely analysis and synthesis (see 1.3.2.), in relation to the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha’s classifications of conditions and the Burmese analytical approach to these classifications mentioned above. We have seen in 1.3.2. that five of the first six of the seven abhidhamma texts, i.e. the Dhammasaṅgī to the Yamaka with an exception of the Puggalapaññati, analyze entities and concepts into discrete dhammas, and the Paṭṭhāna synthesizes these dhammas by describing their interrelationships. We have also seen that the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha classifies and synthesizes the conditional relations in the sixfold method and the 24 conditions into four conditions. The Burmese approach then analyses these classifications in terms of a more refined categories of dhammas through ayakauk method, and thereby explicates the concise classification of the 24 conditions and their conditional relations. Therefore, the dual role of Abhidhamma, which is a distinctive feature of the canonical abhidhamma texts, continues to feature not only in the Sri Lankan commentarial tradition, but also in the contemporary Burmese Abhidhamma tradition.

⁴⁸⁰ Abhidh.-s. VIII, 27, Bodhi 2010: 322.
⁴⁸¹ On the explanation of the synthesis of the 24 conditions into four conditions, see Bodhi 2010: 322-324.
4.3. Pedagogies of Paṭṭhāna studies in Burma

We have, so far, explored pedagogical methods with reference to the study of the Abhidhammatthaśaṅgaha. This section will examine the pedagogical approaches specifically in relation to the study of the Paṭṭhāna in Burma. In particular, I shall describe the approaches to the study of the Paṭṭhāna developed by The"in" Hsayadaw, U Ohn, Masoyein Hsayadaw and Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw (see Chapter 3). In so doing, I aim to demonstrate an ongoing development of pedagogical approaches to the study of the Paṭṭhāna over the centuries. I shall then suggest that the current pedagogical approach in which the Paṭṭhāna is studied through the use of tables and the pedagogical textbooks reflects the demands of the formal examination system of modern monastic education in Burma.

Before turning to the Burmese pedagogical approach to the study of the Paṭṭhāna, it is important to explicate specific points regarding the 24 conditions and their subsidiary types of conditions. In particular, it is vital to provide information about the nature of these conditions and how the different conditions are understood to function within the Abhidhamma tradition. This is because classifying conditions in terms of their essential nature and their field of operation, i.e. the conditioning states and the conditioned states that can be related by a condition (see above), is a crucial part of the Burmese pedagogies of the study of the Paṭṭhāna. I therefore provide an explanation of the 24 conditions elucidating their nature and the workings of these conditions in the table below.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Conditions, paccayas</th>
<th>Explanation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Root condition, <em>hetupaccaya</em></td>
<td>It is a condition in which a conditioning state functions as a firm foundation of the conditioned states. This type of condition is compared to a taproot which gives a firm foundation and support for the growth of a tree. There are six roots in total, namely greed, hatred, delusion, non-greed, non-hatred and non-delusion. While the first three can be either skilful or indeterminate, the last three are exclusively unskilful.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Object condition, <em>ārammaṇa-paccaya</em></td>
<td>It is a condition where a conditioning state causes the conditioned states to arise taking it as their object. This means the conditioning state, as object, becomes the prop or support of conditioned states. The six kinds of sense-objects, i.e. visible, sound, smell, taste, touch and mental objects, are conditioning states, and their corresponding cittas and cetasikas are conditioned states.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Predominance condition, <em>adhipati-paccaya</em></td>
<td>It is a condition in which a conditioning state is the predominant factor for the conditioned states to arise. This type of condition is compared to an all-powerful emperor (<em>cakkavattī</em>) who, as head of state, lords over all his subjects. Similarly, the conditioning state dominates over the conditioned states and causes them to arise.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proximity condition, <em>anantara-paccaya</em></td>
<td>It is a condition in which mental states, i.e. <em>citta</em> and its associated cetasikas, arise in linear succession without interval. The reference is to the mental process (<em>cittavīthi</em>). The <em>citta</em> and its associated cetasikas which have just ceased are the conditioning states for the mental states which arise immediately afterwards.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contiguity condition, <em>samanantara-paccaya</em></td>
<td>It is a condition in which the conditioning mental states, i.e. <em>citta</em> and its associated cetasikas, cause the conditioned mental states to arise in linear succession without interval. According to the <em>Visuddhimagga</em> (XVII, § 74), proximity condition (<em>anantara-paccaya</em>) and contiguity condition (<em>samanantara-paccaya</em>) are different in name, but the same in meaning.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Co-nascence condition, <em>sahajāta-paccaya</em></td>
<td>It is a condition in which a conditioning state, on arising, causes the conditioned states to arise simultaneously with it. The word <em>sahajāta</em> literally means ‘born at the same time or together’. So, here both the conditioning state and the conditioned state occur together. This type of condition is compared to the flame of a lamp which, on arising, causes the light, colour, and heat to arise along with it.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Conditions, paccayas</th>
<th>Explanation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mutuality condition, aňañamaňña-paccaya</td>
<td>It is a condition in which a conditioning state and the conditioned state support each other simultaneously. The mutuality condition is a subsidiary type of the co-nascence condition, with this difference: here, the conditional relation between the conditioning state and the conditioned state occurs reciprocally. ‘A’ is a conditioning state by means of being the mutuality condition for the co-arising of the conditioned state, ‘B’. At the same time ‘B’ is a conditioning state by means of being the mutuality condition for the co-arising of ‘A’. This type of condition is compared to a tripod where each leg supports the other two legs reciprocally in enabling the tripod to stand upright.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support condition, nissaya-paccaya</td>
<td>It is a condition in which a condition state serves as the support for the arising of the conditioned states. This type of condition is compared to the way the earth supports trees and vegetation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decisive support condition, upanissaya-paccaya</td>
<td>It is a condition in which a conditioning state supports the conditioned states by being a powerful inducement or a decisive support. This type of condition is compared to the way rain acts as a strong, decisive support for trees and vegetation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pre-nascence condition, purejāta-paccaya</td>
<td>It is a condition in which a conditioning state that has arisen earlier becomes a support to the conditioned states which arise later. The reference here is to the conditional relations between mind (citta and its associated cetasikas) and matter (rūpa). Since the lifespan of matter is longer than that of mind, a rūpa that arises earlier causes mental states to arise after it by means of being the pre-nascence condition. This type of condition is compared to the father who supports the son.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post-nascence condition, pacchājāta-paccaya</td>
<td>It is a condition in which a conditioning state which having arisen later becomes a support to the conditioned state which has arisen earlier. Like the pre-nascence condition, it describes the conditional relations between mind and matter, but there is a difference. Here, the conditioning states are subsequently arisen mental dharmas, i.e. cittas and cetasikas, and the conditioned states are the material dhamma that has arisen earlier. This type of condition is compared to the son who supports the father.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conditions, paccayas</td>
<td>Explanation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Repetition condition, āsevana-paccaya</td>
<td>It is a condition in which a conditioning state causes the conditioning states to arise with greater power and efficiency after it has ceased. This type of condition is compared to learning by heart through constant repetition; the later recitation becomes gradually easier and easier. Similarly, the role of the repetition condition is to cause the conditioned states to gain more and more proficiency, so that succeeding states come to possess greater proficiency and strength. The reference is to the mental dhammas that occur in the javana-moments in a cognitive process.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kamma condition, kamma-paccaya</td>
<td>It is a condition in which a conditioning state causes the conditioned states to arise and perform their respective functions. This condition is of two types: the co-nascent kamma condition and the asynchronous kamma condition. While a conditioning state and the conditioned states arise concurrently in the co-nascent kamma condition, there is a temporal gap between the conditioning state and the conditioned states in the asynchronous kamma condition. This type of condition is compared to the seed of a plant which gives rise to the appropriate fruit.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kammic-result condition, vipāka-paccaya</td>
<td>It is a condition in which a conditioning state causes the conditioned states, which are the same type of mental and material dhammas as the conditioning state, to arise. The role of this type of condition is to exercise a tranquilising influence on the conditioned states and make them as passive and quiescent as the conditioning state.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nutriment condition, āhāra-paccaya</td>
<td>It is a condition in which a conditioning state maintains and supports the growth and development of the conditioned states. Here, the term ‘nutriment’ is used to refer to both material nutriment (rūpāhāra) and mental nutriment (nāmāhāra) that govern both biological and mental life. Just like the material nutriment, i.e. the nutritive essence of material food (kabaḷinkārāhāra), sustains the physical body, the three mental nutriments, i.e. contact, volition and consciousness, sustain the mental activities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faculty condition, indriya-paccaya</td>
<td>It is a condition in which a conditioning state has leadership, great control over the conditioned states within its own respective sphere. This type of condition is compared to a panel of ministers who govern their own districts or departments but cannot interfere with those of others.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conditions, paccayas</td>
<td>Explanation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jhana condition, jhāna-paccaya</td>
<td>It is a condition in which a conditioning state causes the conditioning states to participate in the close contemplation of an object. The conditioning state is one of seven jhāna factors, namely initial application (vitakka) sustained application (vicāra), zest (pīṭṭi), one-pointedness (ekaggatā), joy (somanassa), displeasure (domanassa) and equanimity (upekkhā). The conditioned states are the cittas and cetasikas associated with the jhāna factors, and the co-nascent material dhammas. The jhāna factors, by means of being the jhāna condition, enable the mind to closely contemplate its object.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Path condition, magga-paccaya</td>
<td>It is a condition in which a conditioning state relates to the conditioned states by causing them to function as a means of reaching a particular destination. The conditioning states are twelve path factors, namely right view (sammā-diṭṭhi), right intention (sammā-saṃkappa), right speech (sammā-vācā), right action (sammā-kammanta), right livelihood (sammā-ājīva), right effort (sammā-vāyāma), right mindfulness (sammā-sati), right concentration (sammā-samādhi), wrong view (micchā-diṭṭhi), wrong intention (micchā-saṃkappa), wrong effort (micchā-vāyāma) and wrong concentration (micchā-samādhi). The conditioned states are all types of rooted cittas, their associated cetasikas and the co-nascent material dhammas.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Association condition, sampayutta-paccaya</td>
<td>It is a condition in which a conditioning state causes the conditioned states to arise together with it and to remain inseparably associated. This type of condition is concerned with the conditional relation where only mental states are involved.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dissociation condition, vippayutta-paccaya</td>
<td>It is a condition in which a conditioning state is either a mental state, i.e. citta and its cetasikas, that assists the present material dhammas, or a material dhamma that assists the present mental dhammas. This condition refers to the conditional relationship where the conditioning state and the conditioned state are necessarily different types.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presence condition, atthi-paccaya</td>
<td>It is a condition in which a conditioning state helps the conditioned states to arise or persist in being during a time when the former exists along with the latter. It is not necessary for the conditioning and the conditioned states to arise together or cease together. All that is required is for them to overlap at a time when the conditioning state can support the conditioned state in some way.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conditions, paccayas</td>
<td>Explanation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Absence condition, natthi-paccaya</td>
<td>It is a condition in which a conditioning mental state, i.e. citta and its cetasikas, causes the conditioned state, i.e. another mental state, to arise because its absence gives an opportunity for the arising and presence of its conditioned state. This condition describes the linear sequence of citta where the immediately preceding one disappears before the emergence of the immediately succeeding one.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disappearance condition, vigata-paccaya</td>
<td>It is a condition in which a conditioning mental state, i.e. citta and its cetasikas, in ceasing gives an opportunity to the next mental state to arise immediately next to itself. The absence condition and the disappearance condition are identical in meaning and differing only in the letter.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-disappearance condition, avigata-paccaya</td>
<td>It is a condition in which a conditioning state helps the conditioned states to arise or persist in being for a time by the former's non-disappearance. This means the conditioning state exists along with the conditioned states. Like the presence condition, it is not necessary for the conditioning and the conditioned states to arise together or cease together. All that is required is for them to overlap at a time when the conditioning state can support the conditioned state in some way.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In 4.3.1., I shall describe the two types of classifications of the 24 conditions and their subsidiary conditions, namely the 8 leading conditions and the 9 categories of conditions. I shall then explore some of the pedagogical approaches to the study of the Paṭṭhāna in 4.3.2.

### 4.3.1. The 8 leading conditions and the 9 categories of conditions

According to the commentary of the Paṭṭhāna, the 24 conditions and their subsidiary types of conditions add up to 49 varieties of conditions (see Appendix F).\(^{483}\)

These 49 varieties of conditions are classified into eight leading conditions and nine categories of conditions. I shall explain what these two classifications of conditions

---

\(^{483}\) Nārada 1981: 62-63; Myint Swe 1979: 300-315.
are and the relationship between them. I shall also highlight their importance in the Burmese pedagogical approach to the study of the *Paṭṭhāna*, especially in the study of the enumeration sections (*saṅkhya-vāra*) of the *Paṭṭhāna* (see Chapter 5). Along the way, the nature of various conditions will be discussed in relation to the fourfold classification of the *dhammas*, i.e. *citta*, *cetasika*, *rupa* and *nibbana*, as given in the *Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha*. The information on the nature of the *Paṭṭhāna* and how the different conditions are understood to function is provided here as a background for the analysis of the pedagogical approaches of the *Paṭṭhāna* (see 4.3.2.) and the assessment of the *Saṅkhya-vāra*, ‘enumeration section’, in the next chapter.

The 8 leading conditions are: object (*ārammaṇa*), co-nascence (*sahajāta*), decisive support (*upanissaya*), pre-nascence (*purejāta*), post-nascence (*pacchājāta*), *kamma*, nutriment (*āhāra*), and faculty (*indriya*). These eight conditions are called leading conditions, *hkaung*”saung-pyit-se” in Burmese, because the other 41 varieties of conditions are subsumed under the 8 leading conditions. For example, the root condition is subsumed under the co-nascence condition. This is because any one of the six roots, i.e. *lobha*, *dosa*, *moha*, *alobha*, *adosa*, and *amoha*, as a conditioning state gives rise to the conditioned states, i.e. 71 rooted consciousness, 52 mental factors, rooted mind-produced matter and rooted rebirth-*kamma*-produced matter, which arise together with it (see 1.3.4. and 3.1.). The fact that the root condition causes the conditioned states to arise concurrently with the conditioning states, i.e. the roots, is the reason for it to be subsumed under the co-nascence condition. Moreover, using the *ayakauk* technique, we shall compare the detailed analysis of the number of conditioning states and conditioned states that are related by the root condition and those of the co-nascence condition in Table 4.6.

---

Table 4.6. A comparison of conditioning states and conditioned states of the root condition and those of the co-nascence condition.  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Conditioning states</th>
<th>Conditioned states</th>
<th>Conditioning force</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• 6 roots (lobha, dosa, moha, alobha, adosa, amoha)</td>
<td>• 71 rooted cittas (sahetukacittas)</td>
<td>root condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• 52 cetasikas, rooted mind-produced matter</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• rooted rebirth-kamma-produced matter</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) 89 cittas and 52 cetasikas and the co-nascent matter</td>
<td>(a) 89 cittas and 52 cetasikas and the co-nascent matter</td>
<td>co-nascence condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) 89 cittas, 52 cetasikas and the co-nascent matter</td>
<td>(b) 89 cittas, 52 cetasikas and the co-nascent matter</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) 4 great elements (mahābhūta)</td>
<td>(c) 4 great elements (mahābhūta)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(d) 4 great elements and derived matter (upādārūpa)</td>
<td>(d) 4 great element and derived matter (upādārūpa)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(e) 4 mental aggregates and heart-base (hadayavatthu)</td>
<td>(e) 4 mental aggregates and heart-base (hadayavatthu)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

We have seen the detailed analysis and explanation of the root condition in earlier chapters (see 1.3.4. and 3.1.). As for the co-nascence condition, it refers to a conditional relation in which the conditioning states and conditioned states occur concurrently. As Karunadasa summarizes, “The co-nascence condition operates in the following instances: (a) each mental state for the other mental states (citta and cetasika) that are associated with it, (b) each mental state in relation to the material phenomena which arise together with it, (c) each of the four great material elements in relation to the other three, (d) each of the four great material elements in relation to the material factors dependent on them, (e) at the moment of rebirth, the physical base of mind [i.e. heart-base] for the resultant (vipāka) consciousness and its concomitants”.  

486 Karunadasa 2010: 268.
involved, i.e. the conditioning states and conditioned states, in the conditional relations of the root condition are embraced within the conditioning states and conditioned states of the co-nascence condition. This means that the conditioning states of the root condition, i.e. 6 roots (which are cetasikas), are included in the conditioning states of the co-nascence condition, namely 52 cetasikas. In order words, the 6 roots are embraced within the 52 cetasikas. As for the conditioned states, the conditioned states of the root condition, i.e. 72 rooted cittas, 52 cetasikas, and rooted rūpas, can be found in the conditioned states of the co-nascence condition. Thus, the field of operation of the co-nascence condition is broader than that of the root condition. Therefore, we can deduce that one of the criteria for a leading condition is on the basis of the number of dhammas that can be related by it. A leading condition has a wider scope of conditional relations than that of its subsidiary conditions. 487

Out of the 24 conditions, some of them may be subsumed under two or more leading conditions. For example, the predominance condition (adhipati-paccaya), which has two subsidiary types of conditions, is embraced under the object condition and the co-nascence condition. This is because the predominance condition is of two types as object-predominance (ārammaṇādhipati) and co-nascence-predominance (sahajātādhipati). 488 In the Pañhāvāra, the subsidiary types of conditions are listed. Hence, we can find the following Pāli text regarding the two subsidiary types of the predominance condition:

\[ \text{Kusalo dhammo kusalassa dhammassa adhipatipaccayena paccayo.} \]
\[ \text{Ārammaṇādhipati, sahajātādhipati.} \] 489

A skilful state is a condition for a skilful state by means of being a predominance condition. [There are] object-predominance condition and co-nascence-predominance condition.

---

487 In”sein Hsayadaw, personal communication on 21 August 2013.
489 Paṭṭh 1.157.
Karunadasa explains, “The first is an extension of the object-condition, where it refers to an object which, as conditioning state, dominates over the mental states that take it as their object. In this case only those objects which have a strong appeal to the individual can become the conditioning state, because of the domineering influence they have on the mind”. 490 For instance, the 8 supramundane cittas (lokuttaracittas) take nibbāna as an object. 491 The 8 supramundane cittas, which pertain to the four stages of stream entry (sotāpatti), once-returning (sakadāgāmi), non-returning (anāgāmi) and arahantship (arahatta), transcend and lead to the attainment of liberation, nibbāna (see Appendix E). 492 Nibbāna, as a mental object, always has a strong appeal to the supramundane cittas. 493 Thus, nibbāna is an exceptionally important object for the supramundane cittas and their associated cetasikas. Therefore, nibbāna, as an object, becomes the conditioning state for the conditioned states, i.e. the supramundane cittas, by means of being object-predominance condition. This example above, then, demonstrates that the first type of the predominance condition, i.e. object-predominance, is subsumed under the object condition. This is because the conditioning states, which have a domineering influence on the conditioned mental states, are the objects of these mental states. The second type of the predominance condition, the co-nascence-predominance condition, refers to a conditional relation where the conditioning state exercises a dominant influence on the conditioned states, which arise together with it. The reference here is to one of the predominant factors, i.e. desire (chanda), energy (vīrya), consciousness (citta) and investigation (vimaṃsā). 495 Only one of these factors can take on the role of predominance condition

491 Bodhi 2010: 66.
492 On detailed explanation of the supramundane cittas, see Karunadasa 2010: 95-96; Bodhi 2010: 66-68.
493 Nārada 1995: 56.
494 In the Paññāvatī of the Paṭṭhāna, the Pāli term ‘garum’ is used in order to indicate such exceptional importance of an object to its corresponding cittas and cetasikas. See Paṭṭh 1.157-159.
495 Paṭṭh 1.2.
at a time. This is because the predominance condition wields supreme control over all the co-nascent mentality, i.e. cittas and cetasikas, and materiality, rūpas. It is compared to an all-powerful emperor (cakkavatti) who, as head of state, lords over all his subjects. Therefore, one of the four predominant factors exercises a dominant influence over the co-nascent conditioned states on a given occasion (see Chapter 5). This type of the predominance condition, i.e. co-nascence predominance, is subsumed under the co-nascence condition because the predominant factor, which is the conditioning state, and what is conditioned thereby are always co-nascent. Thus, the two subsidiary types of the predominance condition, which are object-predominance and co-nascence-predominance, are subsumed under the two leading conditions, namely the object condition and the co-nascence condition.

We have, so far, seen how the 24 conditions and their subsidiary types of conditions are subsumed under the 8 leading conditions, i.e. object, co-nascence, decisive support, pre-nascence, post-nascence, kamma, nutriment and faculty, with specific examples. We have also seen one of the possible criteria for a leading condition: the operational field, i.e. the number of dhammas involved in conditional relations, of a leading condition is wider than that of its subsidiary conditions. This is an important conclusion for the study of the enumeration section (saṅkhyaśvara) of the Paṭṭhāna based on the Burmese approach. This is because, as we shall see in the next chapter, it can tell us which conditions can be combined and that the combinations of conditions can relate certain sets of dhammas involved in conditional relations (see Chapter 5). I shall now briefly explain the relationship between the 8 leading condition and the 9 categories of conditions, before turning to some of the Burmese pedagogical approaches to the study of the Paṭṭhāna.

496 Karunadasa 2010: 274.
497 Sūriya 1934: 3; Nārada 1995: 159.
The 8 leading conditions and the 9 categories of conditions are closely related. The 9 categories of conditions are: object (ārammaṇa), co-nascence (sahajāta), proximity-decisive-support (anantarūpanissaya), natural-decisive-support (pakatūpanissaya), base-pre-nascence (vatthupurejāta), post-nascence (pacchājāta), kamma, material-nutriment (rūpāhāra) and material-life-faculty (rūpajīvitindriya) (see Appendix F).\(^{498}\) The latter is derived from the former with slight changes in configurations of the conditions. The differences between these two classifications are related to 1) decisive support condition, 2) pre-nascence condition, 3) nutriment condition, and 4) faculty condition. I shall explain these differences in the following section with an aim to show how the 9 categories of conditions are classified. It is interesting to note that while these classifications of conditions are listed in every pedagogical textbook on the Paṭṭhāna, very little explanation on how and why they are classified is given in Burmese sources. Therefore, I shall draw upon Karunadasa’s work on Abhidhamma and Bodhi’s edition of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha, along with Burmese sources, to explain the philosophical reasoning behind the classifications with specific examples below.

The first difference between the 8 leading conditions and the 9 categories of conditions is related to the decisive support condition (upanissaya-paccaya). The decisive support condition is of three types: object-decisive-support (ārammaṇūpanissaya), proximity-decisive-support (anantarūpanissaya) and natural-decisive-support (pakatūpanissaya). The first type, the object-decisive-support condition, is a variety of object condition,\(^{499}\) and it is thus subsumed under the object condition. Since the object condition is a leading condition, its field of operation is extensive (see. 4.2.). The subsidiary object-decisive-support condition has a narrower scope of operation. That is, only exceptionally desirable or important objects which

\(^{499}\) Karunadasa 2010: 269.
cause citta and its associated cetasikas to apprehend them are included in this category.\textsuperscript{500} The object-decisive-support condition thus refers to the conditional relationship where a conditioning state is an exceptionally desirable or important object which causes the conditioned states, i.e. the cittas and their cetasikas that apprehend it, to arise in strong dependence on it.\textsuperscript{501} Under the 9 categories of conditions, the second type, the proximity-decisive-support, is recognised as a separate category of conditions (see Appendix F). The proximity-decisive-support condition explains the linear succession of mental states in relation to the mental process (cittavīthi). When the conditioning and the conditioned states are related by the proximity-decisive-support condition, the preceding mental states cause the immediately succeeding mental states to arise because of their strong dependence on the cessation of the preceding conditioning states.\textsuperscript{502} In other words, the cessation of the preceding conditioning states serves as a decisive support for the arising of the succeeding conditioned states. The third type, the natural-decisive-support condition, is also recognised as a separate category of conditions. Its field of operation, like that of the object condition, is extensive. It could embrace as its conditioning factors all past mental and material dhammas, i.e. 89 cittas, 52 cetasikas and 28 rūpas, that become a strong influence for the arising of mental states, i.e. 89 cittas and 52 cetasikas, at a subsequent time.\textsuperscript{503} Thus, the natural-decisive-support condition means that all past mental and material dhammas as conditioning states give a strong support for the arising of mental states later. We have, therefore, seen that the decisive support (upanissaya) condition has been divided into two separate categories of conditions, namely the proximity-decisive-support (anantarūpanissaya) condition and the natural-

\textsuperscript{500} Nārada 1980: 7; Tilokābhivamsa 2000: 14; Karunadasa 2010: 269.
\textsuperscript{501} Bodhi 2010: 315.
\textsuperscript{502} Karunadasa 2010: 270.
\textsuperscript{503} Tilokābhivamsa 2000: 32.
decisive-support (pakatūpanissaya) condition, under the scheme of 9 categories of conditions (see Appendix F).

There are two types of pre-nascence condition: object-pre-nascence (ārammaṇa-purejāta) and base-pre-nascence (vatthu-purejāta). The first type is concerned with conditional relations in which each of the five sense-objects, i.e. visible, sound, smell, taste, touch and mental objects, serves as a condition by means of being pre-nascent to the cittas and cetasikas that arise in a given sense-door cognitive process. The object-pre-nascence condition is similar to the object condition in terms of its nature. Therefore, it is included under the category of object condition (see Appendix F). The second type, the base-pre-nascence condition, refers to the conditional relations in which the five physical sense-organs and the heart-base are conditions by means of being base-pre-nascent for their corresponding cittas. For instance, eye (cakkhāyatana) is a condition by means of being base-pre-nascent for the visual cognition (cakkhuviññāṇa). As for the heart-base, it is in relation to mind (mano) and mind-consciousness (manoviññāṇa). This means that the physical sense-organs having arisen earlier becomes a support to the corresponding consciousnesses which arise later. Under the scheme of 9 categories of conditions, the conditional relations in which the physical sense-organs and the hear-base serve as conditioning states for the arising of their corresponding consciousnesses are grouped as a separate category. Hence, this category is called the base-pre-nascence (vatthu-purejāta) (see Appendix F).

Another difference between the 8 leading conditions and the 9 categories of conditions is related to the nutriment condition (āhāra-paccaya). The nutriment condition is of two kinds: the material-nutriment (rūpāhāra) and the mental-nutriment (nāmāhāra). The latter consists of three mental factors, namely contact (phassa), mental volition (cetanā) and consciousness (citta). These three mental factors
are conditions for the mental and material dhammas that arise together with each nutriment by means of being nutriment condition (āhāra-paccaya). The fact that the conditioned states arise concurrently with the conditioning states means that this kind of nutriment is included under the co-nascence category. The material-nutriment consists of the nutritive essence of material food (kabāḷākārahāra or ojā). The nutritive essence of material food is a condition for the arising of all rūpas by means of being the material-nutriment condition (rūpāhāra).504 The material-nutriment condition, then, becomes a separate category.

In terms of the faculty condition (indriya-paccaya), there are three subsidiary types of faculty condition: co-nascence-faculty (sahajātindriya), base pre-nascence-faculty (vatthupurejātindriya) and physical-life-faculty (rūpajīvitindriya).505 The first type is related to the nine mental faculties (arūpindriya), namely mental-life-faculty (arūpajīvitindriya), mind (i.e. 89 cittas), feeling (vedanā), faith (saddhā), energy (viriya), mindfulness (sati), concentration (samādhi), and wisdom (paññā).506 The co-nascence faculty condition refers to a conditional relation in which mental faculties (arūpāindriya) are conditions for the mental associated with them and the material dhammas which arise simultaneously with them. The fact that the conditioning states and conditioned states are related by means of being the co-nascence faculty condition means this type of faculty condition is subsumed under the co-nascence condition. The second type, the pre-nascence faculty condition, refers to conditional relations in which the five physical sense-organs, i.e. eye, ear, nose, tongue, and body, are conditions for the five kinds of consciousness corresponding to them by means of being the pre-nascence condition. For example, eyes, as the organs of sight (cakkhu),

506 According to the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha, there are 22 faculties in total, and only 20 of them are elevated to the level of faculty condition. For a detailed explanation of the 22 faculties and the faculty condition, see Bodhi (2010: 273-274, 320) and Karunadasa (2010: 274-275).
having arisen earlier become a condition for the eye-consciousness (cakkhuviññāṇa) by means of being the pre-nascence condition. These physical sense-organs also have the quality of being faculty condition for their corresponding consciousness because they control the efficiency of the consciousness that takes it as a base. That is, the relative strength or weakness of the sense-organ reflects on the consciousness. For instance, good eyes produce strong eye-consciousness that cognizes the visible form clearly. Such clear cognition of the visible results in acute vision. Finally, the third type, the physical-life-faculty (rūpajīvitindriya), which is one of the 28 rūpas, is the factor that stabilizes and sustains kamma-originated matter (kammasamutṭhānarūpa). Here, the physical-life-faculty is a condition for the nine kamma-originated rūpas, which are inseparably associated with them by means of being the physical-life-faculty condition. This physical-life-faculty condition is the last of the 9 categories of conditions.

In summary, while the 24 conditions are listed in the first section of the Paṭṭhāna, the paccayuddesa, as we have seen, some of the 24 conditions have subsidiary types of conditions. In fact, there are ten out of the 24 conditions which have subsidiary types of conditions, namely predominance, support, decisive support, pre-nascence, kamma, nutriment, faculty, dissociated, presence and non-disappearance conditions. Some of these subsidiary conditions are explicitly stated in the paṭṭhāna text, while others are deduced from the text. In total, there are 49 varieties of conditions. According to the commentary of the Paṭṭhāna, these 49 varieties of conditions are classified into 8 leading conditions and 9 categories of conditions. It seems that the 8 leading conditions are identified by comparing the number of the conditioning states and the conditioned states that can be related by them. Their

507 There are 18 kinds of matter produced by kamma. On details of different types of kamma-originated matter, see Janakābhivaṃsa 1995: 502; Bodhi 2010: 247.
fields of operation are wider than those of their subsidiary conditions. Any remaining subsidiary condition which is not included in the 8 leading conditions is then classified as a separate category. For example, the base-pre-nascence (vatthupurejāta), material-nutriment (rūpāhāra), and physical-life-faculty (rūpajīvitindriya) conditions are classified as separate categories. We have, thus, the 9 categories of conditions. These 9 categories are important for the Burmese pedagogical approaches to the study of the Patṭhāna. In particular, they are crucial for the study of the enumeration section, the Sankhyāvāra, because only the conditions in the same category, i.e. with the same nature, can be combined.\textsuperscript{508} These multiple conditions can then have a joint impact on conditional relations (see Chapter 5). We shall now discuss some of the Burmese pedagogical approaches for Patṭhāna and the ways in which they have changed over the centuries.

4.3.2. Burmese pedagogical approaches to the study of the Patṭhāna

As mentioned in 3.2., The “in” Hsayadaw’s work, the Pa-htan” Nya’wa Thonsaung-twe (PNT), is one of the pedagogical textbooks produced in the early 19th century. The pedagogical approach taken in the PNT is based on the three main items of the 24 conditions, which in Burmese are called thon-hkyat-su, ‘three items of Patṭhāna’ (see 3.2.). The three items of conditions in this approach is slightly different from the three basic elements of conditional relations that I have examined in 1.3.4., namely the conditioning states (paccaya-dhammas), the conditioned states (paccayuppanna-dhammas) and the conditioning forces (paccaya-satti). In the thon-hkyat-su approach, the three items identified are the conditioning states (paccaya-dhammas), the conditioned states (paccayuppanna-dhammas) and the not-conditioned

\textsuperscript{508} Nārada 1980: 4.
states (paccāniya-dhammas). The first two items in this approach are the same as the conditioning states and the conditioned states that we have encountered previously (see 1.3.4. and above). The third item – the paccāniya-dhammas (paṭi-anīka = opposite + group) – refers to a group of dhammas that is opposite of the conditioned states in a given conditional relation. That is, they are the dhammas that are outside of the influence of a condition. Therefore, they are the remaining dhammas that are not included in the conditioning states and the conditioned states. Thus, the not-conditioned states are a different category. The not-conditioned states are found in the Paccayapaccāniya section of the Paṭṭhāna (see Figure 1.2.). By way of an example, the first part of the not-conditioned states (paccāniya-dhammas) of the root condition in the Paṭiccavāra is given as shown below.

Akusalaṁ dhamman paṭicca akusalo dhammo uppaññati nahetupaccayā.

An unskilful state arises dependent on an unskilful state, by not means of root condition.

Here, we have a conditional relation between unskilful dhamma and another unskilful dhamma which are outside the influence of the root condition. That is to say, these unskilful dhammas are not related to each other by the root condition, i.e. they are nā-hetupaccaya. In the PNT and other Burmese sources, the not-conditioned states have been analyzed through the ayakauk technique. Below is the translation of the thonhkyat-su hso-yo", recitation formula of the three items, pertaining to the conditional relation related by means of being the root condition, as given in the PNT.

For the root condition, there are three aspects [of the conditional relations]: the conditioning states, the conditioned states and the not-conditioned states. Of these three, the six roots - lobha, dosa, mohā, alobha, adosa, and amohā - are the conditioning states by means of being the root condition. The 71 rooted cittas (sahetukacittas), 52 cetasikas, rooted mind-produced rūpa, and rooted rebirth-kamma-produced rūpa are the conditioned states of the root condition. The 18 rootless cittas (ahetukacittas), 12 ethically variable cetasikas, rootless mind-produced rūpa,

---

510 Paṭṭh 1.35. It should be noted that this Pāli is from the Paṭiccavāra, the first of the seven chapters (see Figure 1.2.). I have, so far, used the Pāli text from the Paṁhāvārā as examples in previous chapter.
rootless rebirth-kamma-produced rūpa, external rūpa, nutriment-produced rūpa, temperature-produced rūpa, kamma-produced rūpa in the realm of non-percipient beings and kamma-produced rūpa during life time are the not-conditioned states of the root condition.\footnote{See Appendix I on explanation of the terms such as rootless mind-produced rūpa etc.}

Like the ayakauk hso-yo” (see Chapter 3), these recitation formulae have to be memorised by the student. For clarity, the three items of the root condition mentioned above are shown in Table 4.7.

Table 4.7. The three items, i.e. the conditioning states, the conditioned states, and the not-conditioned states, of the root condition on the basis of the PNT.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Conditioning states</th>
<th>Conditioned states</th>
<th>Not-conditioned states</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• 6 roots (lobha, dosa, moha, alobha, adosa, amoha)</td>
<td>• 71 rooted cittas (sahetukacittas) • 52 cetasikas • rooted mind-produced rūpa • rooted rebirth-kamma-produced rūpa</td>
<td>• 18 rootless cittas (ahetukacittas) • 12 ethically variable cetasikas • rootless mind-produced rūpa • rootless rebirth-kamma-produced rūpa • remaining rūpas</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In simple terms, the above example shows that the conditioning states, i.e. the 6 roots, are conditions by means of being the root condition for the arising the conditioned states, i.e. the dhammas in the second column. The not-conditioned states, i.e. the dhammas in the third column, are not influenced by the root condition. That is, these dhammas are not included in the field of operation of the root condition. In the PNT, the three items of all 24 conditions are identified in the same order as they are listed in the canonical paṭṭhāna text.\footnote{On the three items (thon-hkyat-su) of the 24 conditions, see Sūriya 1934: 5-15.}

Through this approach, the four sections, namely the Paccayānuloma, the Paccayapaccaniya, the Paccayānulomapaccaniya, the Paccayapaccaniyānuloma, of the

\footnote{Sūriya 1934: 5.}
*Paṭṭhāna* (see Figure 1.2.) can be studied in detail. This is because the first section, the *Paccayānuloma*, deals with the conditions positively explaining the conditional relations between the conditioning states and the conditioned states related by root condition (*hetu-paccaya*), *etc*. In the second section, the *Paccayapaccanīya*, the conditions are taken negatively – *i.e.* not-root condition (*na-hetupaccaya*), *etc*. The *Paccayapaccanīya* section therefore deals with the conditional relations which are not related by the root condition, *etc*. The latter two sections are a combination of the first two sections. Hence, through the *thon-hkyat-su* pedagogical approach, it is possible to undertake detailed study of more difficult sections of the *Paṭṭhāna*.

The "in" Hsayadaw’s pedagogical approach to the study of the *Paṭṭhāna* was probably one of the earliest approaches in Burma. Bamaw Hsayadaw, who had training from various 'abhidhammikas, recalls how he had to memorise the *thon-hkyatsu hso-yo" and the rest of the text in the PNT. The"in" Hsayadaw’s pedagogical approach requires the student to learn and memorise the three items of the 24 conditions first. Then, the student progresses to the section on finding common conditions that can relate the conditioning states and the conditioned states of a specific relation, which is known in Burmese as *pyit-se*"pyaing. Through the *pyit-se*"pyaing, the student studies the *Saṅkhya-vāra*, the ‘enumeration section’, of the *Paṭṭhāna*. The final section focuses on the way in which a condition may influence the mental processes (*cittavīthi*) pertaining to different realms. It is interesting to note that no direct reference to the canonical *paṭṭhāna* text is made in the PNT. As Bamaw Hsayadaw observes, while the PNT is a great commentary on the *Paṭṭhāna* written in the Burmese language, the student does not have direct access to the canonical *paṭṭhāna* text. Bamaw Hsayadaw adds that the *thon-hkyat-su* approach serves as a

---

514 Kumārābhivamsa (05 June 2009).
515 Nandobhāsa 1999: *hka’-ga’.
basis for the pedagogical innovations developed by later paṭṭhāna teachers for the study of the Paṭṭhāna.\textsuperscript{516}

On the basis of the thon-hkyat-su approach, paṭṭhāna teachers in the 20\textsuperscript{th} century, such as Masoyein Hsayadaw, have developed a pedagogical approach called nhik-hkyat-su, ‘two items of Paṭṭhāna.’ In the Paṭṭhāna-sarūpanayūpadesa, Masoyein Hsayadaw provides the nhik-hkyat-su hso-yo”, recitation formulae of two items of Paṭṭhāna. These recitation formulae include only the conditioning states and the conditioned states of the condition relations. The not-conditioned states (paccaṇīya-dhammas) are not emphasised in this approach. The recitation formulae are also arranged according to the 9 categories of conditions, rather than in the order of the 24 conditions as given in the canonical paṭṭhāna texts.\textsuperscript{517} In this nhik-hkyat-su approach, we observe, for the first time, a shift toward the pedagogical approach in which the conditional relations are studied according to the 9 categories of conditions at the outset.

Before turning to Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw’s approach, it is important to recall that there are seven chapters (vāras) in the canonical paṭṭhāna text, namely (1) the Paṭiccavāra, ‘dependent chapter’, (2) the Sahajātavāra, ‘co-nascence chapter’, (3) the Paccayavāra, ‘condition chapter’, (4) the Nissayavāra, ‘support chapter’, (5) the saṃsaṭṭhavāra, ‘conjoined chapter’, (6) the Sampayuttavāra, ‘association chapter’, and (7) the Pañhāvāra, ‘investigation chapter’ (see 1.3.3. and Figure 1.2.). In the Burmese pedagogical approaches, we find that the first six (cha) chapters (vāras) are grouped together, which is referred to as Cha-vāra, the ‘six-chapter’. Henceforth the phrase ‘Cha-vāra’ refers to the first six chapters of the Paṭṭhāna taken together. This is because there are two differences between these first six chapters and the seventh chapter,

\footnote{Nandobhāsa 1999: ga’.

\footnote{See Table 4.5. for the order in which the 24 conditions are arranged. See Appendix F for how the conditions are arranged in terms of the 9 categories.}
the Pañhāvāra. According to the Burmese sources, the Cha-vāra emphasises the conditioned states (paccayuppanna-dhammas), while the Pañhāvāra focuses on the conditioning states. Moreover, the Pañhāvāra gives a more comprehensive description of conditional relations between the conditioning states and the conditioned states than the Cha-vāra. Therefore, in the Burmese pedagogy of the study of the Paṭṭhāna, the first six chapters are studied together, and the final chapter is studied separately. This is why we find separate sections for the Cha-vāra and the Pañhāvāra in the paṭṭhāna pedagogical books. For example, U Ohn’s work, the the A-bi’da-ma Ta’nhkon, first deals with the Cha-vāra and then the Pañhāvāra in separate sections.

There are distinctive ways in which Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw’s approach is different from the previous approaches. In addition to representing the detailed analysis of the conditional relations using tables, his approach has taken key aspects of the Htan”ta-bin Hsayadaw’s paṭṭhāna ayakauk (HPA). In the HPA, the single enumeration (suddhasāṅkhya) section (see Figure 1.2.) is explicated using the ayakauk technique (see Chapter 5). This section in the HPA explicates all dhammas – i.e. the conditioning states and conditioned states – of the conditional relations related by a single condition. These explanations are known in Burmese as thok-da’thin-hkya hso-yo", or suddhasāṅkhya hso-yo", the recitation formulae of the suddhasāṅkhya. Htan”ta-bin Hsayadaw, in the HPA, explicates the single enumeration of the root condition, which is given as ‘hetuyā satta’, ‘seven by way of root’, in the Suddhasāṅkhya, as follows.

The recitation formula of the single enumeration (suddhasāṅkhya hso-yo”) of the root condition (hetupaccaya): the associated [mental] aggregates

---

518 U Ohn 1936: 399; Nandobhaśa 1999: ga”; Tilokābhivamsa 2000: 82. These sources and other Burmese pedagogical textbooks on the Paṭṭhāna that I have obtained do not mention the reason for the difference between the first six chapters and the final chapter.
519 Sisīvisadaṇṇa 1957: 7.
520 Paṭṭh 1.187.
(sampayuttakhandhā), rooted mind-produced matter (sahetuka-cittaja-rūpa) and rooted rebirth-kamma-produced matter (sahetuka-patīsāndhi-kammaja-rūpa) are conditioned by the six roots. These dhammas [i.e. conditioning states] are the root condition. Therefore, . . . these conditional relations are enumerated (sānkhya) as ‘by way of root, [there are] seven [types of conditional relationship]’ (hetuyā satta).521 In relation to the root condition, seven answers (vissajjana) are arrived at.522

In this example, both the conditioning states and the conditioned states are summarised in the recitation formula. It should be noted that although the ayakauk technique is applied here to explicate the enumeration, the conditioning states and the conditioned states are not expressed in terms of the fourfold classification of the ultimate realities, i.e. citta, cetasika, rūpa and nibbāna. In the recitation formula, the mental conditioned states, which arise together with the conditioning states, i.e. the roots, are expressed by the term the ‘associated aggregates’ (sampayuttakhandhā). The term ‘associated aggregates’ refers to both citta and cetasikas, namely 71 rooted cittas, and 52 cetasikas (see Table 4.5). Thus, this kind of recitation formula does not give a very detailed analysis of the conditional relations. Instead, it employs “informationally richer”523 phrases that compress a large amount of information into single markers. In the above example, the phrase ‘associated aggregates’ is “a brief and compendious summary”524 of all the mental states that can be conditioned by the root condition. Thus, these recitation formulæ provide a good overview of the conditions and the conditioned, and the number of ways in which they can be related.

In the example above, there are seven ways in which the conditioning states and the conditioned states are related, hence the enumeration is ‘hetuyā satta’ (see 5.1.1.). The information provided in the suddhasānkhya hso-yo” is sufficient for it to be used as a mnemonics code and a pedagogical tool. Hence, it increases mnemonic, recollective

521 On the detailed explanation of the Saṅkhyaśra, especially on the number enumerated in the example – i.e. hetuyā satta, see 5.1.1.
522 Nandamedha 2009: 442. For clarity, I have added Pāli words and Pāli loan words, which are used by Htan"ta-bin Hsayadaw, in parentheses. The square brackets are used to show my addition in order to give a fuller meaning of the enumeration listed in Pāli.
523 Carruthers 2011: 105.
efficiency. This is possibly why every paṭṭhāna teacher that I have encountered stresses the importance of these recitation formulae, and recommends that I should also memorise them.\footnote{During my fieldwork, I did memorise these recitation formula. I find that memory, especially textual memory, needs continuous practice, at least for me, in order to sustain it and be able to recollect it.}

In Mula’ Pa-htan’ Hsayadaw’s approach, Htan’ta-bin Hsayadaw’s version of the recitation formulae is adapted slightly (see 5.2.). For example, the suddhasaṅkhya hso-yo” of the Pañhāvāra are organised according to the order of conditions in the 9 categories in Mula’ Pa-htan’ Hsayadaw’s approach. With slight changes to the suddhasaṅkhya hso-yo”, they become a key pedagogical tool for the study of the Paṭṭhāna in Mula’ Pa-htan’ Hsayadaw’s approach. Moreover, in his approach, the overall layout follows the sections in the canonical paṭṭhāna text. For example, his work on the Paṭṭhāna, the Pa-htan”paragu, is arranged as follows: the Paccayaniddesa, the Pucchāvāra, the Cha-vāra (i.e. the first six chapters) and the Pañhāvāra (see Figure 1.2.). There are also direct references to the canonical paṭṭhāna texts. For instance, the Pāli text of the paccayaniddesa is summarised in a table, and the students are encouraged to memorise it using this table.\footnote{When I was preparing for the oral examination on the Paccayaniddesa and the Pañhāvāra-vibhaṅga at the APA in 2012, I was provided with a table describing the whole of the Paccayaniddesa on a single A4 sheet.}

In sum, on the basis of the earlier works such as the HPA and the PNT, Mula’ Pa-htan’ Hsayadaw’s pedagogical approach to the study of the Paṭṭhāna covers the whole of skilful triplet (kusalatika) of the Paṭṭhāna in its entirety with reference to both canonical and post-canonical paṭṭhāna texts. Through the use of tables, his approach provides visual representations of the canonical paṭṭhāna text and the paṭṭhāna ayakauk text. Such visual representations have come to be used not only as mnemonics, but also as shortcuts to the study of the Paṭṭhāna in the contemporary monastic education. For instance, the Pa-htan”theik-pan Hsayadaw of Sagaing, who
was a very well known *paṭṭhāna* teacher amongst the monastics, received this pedagogical approach from Mula’ Pa-htan’ Hsayadaw himself between 1935 and 1937 in Khin-oo, near Shwebo.\footnote{Aung Thein 1994: 4.} Pa-htan’’theik-pan Hsayadaw then taught the *paṭṭhāna* using this pedagogical approach to monks and nuns from various parts of the country. According to Ven. U Paṇḍita, a close disciple of Pa-htan’’theik-pan Hsayadaw, it took only three months to finish a course on the whole of the skilful triplet, halving the previous record from six months (see 3.3.).\footnote{Ven. U Paṇḍita, interviewed on 26 November 2011.}

In the previous chapter, I have shown that three factors are contributing to the popularity of Mula’ Pa-htan’’ Hsayadaw’s approach to the study of the *Paṭṭhāna* in contemporary context. These factors are: the examination-orientated system of monastic education, the development of the innovative pedagogical approach by Mula’ Pa-htan’’ Hsayadaw and the production of pedagogical textbooks. The examination-orientated system exerts a pressure to cover the exam syllabuses in a limited time. Mula’ Pa-htan’’ Hsayadaw’s approach provides the ‘technology’, i.e. an innovative modification of the organisation of the conditional relations through the use of tables, the 9 categories of conditions, the *suddhasaṅkhya hso-yo’*, to acquire basic knowledge of the *Paṭṭhāna* in a short time. This ‘technology’ also provides a framework to develop various pedagogical methods by individual *paṭṭhāna* teachers over the decades, which is reflected in the production of *paṭṭhāna* pedagogical textbooks. Some of the *paṭṭhāna* teachers have tailored their pedagogical textbooks for the *Pahtamapyan* examinations. Some of them also run intensive courses for monastics on the *Paṭṭhāna* and the *Yamaka*, two of the four *nya’wa* subjects, during summer holiday. For instance, In”sein Hsayadaw’s summer course on the *Paṭṭhāna* and the *Yamaka* in Yangon has been running since 1980. The course begins around mid-
April and lasts for 45 days. It attracts hundreds of monks and nuns from different parts of the country. Since the course has to be finished within 45 days, the pace is very fast and later sections, such as the enumeration sections (saṅkhyāvāra) of the Cha-vāra and the Pañhāvāra are glossed over very quickly. I would, therefore, suggest that such production of pedagogical textbooks and provision of intensive courses on the Paṭṭhāna reflects the demands of the formal monastic examinations system in contemporary Burma.

4.4. Summary

In this chapter, we have explored the important role of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha in monastic education in Burma. In particular, the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha is one of the core texts for the monastics; others being the Kaccāyanavyākaraṇā and the Paṭimokkha. I have explained how the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha is studied as a beginner through the memorisation of the whole text. Once the text is thoroughly memorised the semantic meaning is provided by the teacher. An advanced student may study the text further through handbooks and textbooks on the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha. We have also discussed some parallels between the understanding and the practice of memorisation and mnemonic techniques used by European medieval scholars and the Burmese monastics. In 4.1.3., I have demonstrated the role of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha in the Burmese pedagogical approaches, especially in the abhidhamma ayakauk technique. The ayakauk technique is a pedagogical technique in which the student is asked to count, analyse and reconfigure a broader classification of dhammas in terms of a more refined presentation of the ultimate nature of things. The popularity of the
Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha and the abhidhamma ayakauk technique has been so pervasive amongst the Burmese that it provoked a lay poet to compose a satirical poem about it.

We have also examined the relationship between the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha and the Paṭṭhāna. In the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha, the configuration of the 24 conditions is different in that they are organised according to the conditions pertaining to the six ways in which the mentality, the materiality, the mentality-and-materiality, and the concepts are related. We have seen how the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha synthesises the 24 conditions in terms of 4 conditions in 4.2. The synthesis and analysis that we have observed in the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha and the abhidhamma ayakauk technique reflect the dual nature of Abhidhamma, namely the synthesising function and the analysing function.

In the final section of the chapter, we turn to the Burmese pedagogical approaches to the study of the Paṭṭhāna. Before assessing various approaches, in 4.3.1., I have described the 8 leading conditions and the 9 categories of conditions. While the exact criteria used in the process of identifying these categories are not clear to me at the moment, it seems that the essential nature of conditions and their fields of operation are important criteria. The leading conditions, for example, have a wider field of operation than their subsidiary conditions. I have also explained that the 9 categories of conditions are important for the study of the Saṅkhya-vāra because conditions with the same kind of nature, i.e. those in the same category, can be combined and have an impact on the conditional relations (see Chapter 5).

Turning to the Burmese pedagogical approaches, we have traced the development from The”in” Hsayadaw in the 19th century to the paṭṭhāna teachers in the 20th century such as U Ohn, Masoyein Hsayadaw, Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw and Inn Sein Hsayadaw. The”in” Hsayadaw’s approach, the thon-hkyat-su, focuses on the three items of the conditional relations, i.e. the conditioning states, the conditioned
states and the not-conditioned states. In the early 20th century, Masoyein Hsayadaw developed the neik-hkyat-su approach in which the conditioning states and the conditioned states are emphasised. On the basis of the previous approaches and the paṭṭhāna ayakauk, Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw developed a new technology in which organisation of the conditional relations are modified through the use of tables, the suddhasaṅkhyā hso-yo”, the 9 categories of conditions. His innovative approach provides a framework for production of pedagogical textbooks and provision of intensive courses with an aim to train and prepare the monastics for the Pahtamapyan examinations. We have, then, evidence of an ongoing development in the pedagogical approaches to the study of the Paṭṭhāna, reflecting the demands of the formal monastic examination system in Burma.
CHAPTER 5

ENUMERATION OF PAṬṬHĀNA

This chapter will look at enumeration (one aspect of mathematics) and how it is used in order to represent the order to be found within the multiplicity of cause and effect. Enumeration is the focus of a particular section of the Paṭṭhāna, the Saṅkhyaśāra (see Figure 1.2.). This enumeration then acts as a basis for either descriptive or generative expositions of the ways that conditions and the conditioned can relate to each other. Thus enumeration is the basis of the more complex mathematics of combinatorics. The Saṅkhyaśāra enumerates the multiplicity of conditional relations using numbers. The brevity of enumeration in the Saṅkhyaśāra makes it difficult to comprehend the conditional relations that are enumerated. Therefore, it is regarded as the most difficult aspect of the Paṭṭhāna by the Burmese. Nevertheless, the Burmese paṭṭhāna teachers have developed various pedagogical approaches to study the Saṅkhyaśāra. In the previous chapter I mentioned the importance of the 9 categories of conditions in the study of the Saṅkhyaśāra of the Paṭṭhāna. Through the use of the 9 categories of conditions, Mula’ Pa-Htan” Hsayadaw Ven. Nārada’s approach to the study of the Saṅkhyaśāra can help us understand the numbers enumerated in it.

In this chapter, I shall first describe the place of the Saṅkhyaśāra in the Paṭṭhāna. I shall explain how enumeration is used as the basis for generative expositions of the conditional relations in which multiple conditions are acting as conditions for the conditioned. I shall then discuss the pedagogical approach by Mula’ Pa-Htan” Hsayadaw in relation to the study of the Saṅkyāvāra with specific examples. In so doing, I aim to show that Mula’ Pa-Htan” Hsayadaw’s approach to the study of
the Saṅkhyaśāra has created shortcuts to comprehend the most difficult aspect of the \textit{Paṭṭhāna} in a short time.

Previous chapters intimated that the conditional relationships between the conditioning states and the conditioned states are influenced by multiple combinations of the conditions (see 1.3.3. and 4.3.2.). The multiple combinations of conditions are found in the subsections of the \textit{Saṅkhyaśāra}, namely the Sabhāgasaṅkhyā, ‘common enumeration’, and the Ghaṭanāsaṅkhyā, ‘multiple enumeration’\footnote{The word ‘gṛhaṇa’, also spelt as ‘gṛhaṇa’, means combination or composition or putting together. In the case of the \textit{Saṅkhyaśāra} of the \textit{Paṭṭhāna}, the term ‘Ghaṭanāsaṅkhyā’ is used to refer to a subsection of the enumeration section where the conditional relations between conditioning states and the conditioned states are related by combinations of more than two conditions are enumerated. Thus, the term ‘Ghaṭanāsaṅkhyā’ literally means ‘enumeration of combinations of (more than two) conditions’. For clarity and the practical purpose of reference, I therefore use the phrase ‘multiple enumeration’ to refer to the ‘Ghaṭanāsaṅkhyā’.} (see below). Moreover, as mentioned in Chapter 1, there are combinations of dhammas in the \textit{Paṭṭhāna}. In the final section of this chapter, I reveal some of the mathematical aspects of the \textit{Paṭṭhāna}. I shall suggest some parallels between mathematics of the \textit{Paṭṭhāna} and mathematics of ‘combinatorics’.

5.1. \textit{The Saṅkhyaśāra in the Paṭṭhāna}

As we have seen in Chapter 1, the \textit{Saṅkhyaśāra} is found within each of the seven chapters of the \textit{Paṭṭhāna} (see Figure 1.2.). In the Burmese pedagogical approaches, the \textit{Saṅkhyaśāra} of the first six chapters, known in Burmese as sa-wa-ra-thin-hkya (cha-vāra-saṅkhyā in Pāli), are studied together, while the \textit{Saṅkhyaśāra} of the seventh chapter is studied separately (see 4.3.2.).\footnote{Nārada 1980: \textit{ka’. The \textit{Saṅkhyaśāra} of the first six chapters, i.e. the \textit{Cha-vāra-saṅkhyā}, and the \textit{Saṅkhyaśāra} of the \textit{Paṅhāvāra} are recognized as separate modules in the \textit{Abhidhamma} examinations syllabus at the APA. During my fieldwork, I have taken several lessons on the latter module taught by a laywoman \textit{paṭṭhāna} teacher, Daw Tin Yi, at the APA. Daw Tin Yi is a student of Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw, and has completed the whole of \textit{Abhidhamma} syllabus prescribed at the APA.} In this section, I shall focus on the latter, i.e. the \textit{Saṅkhyaśāra} of the the seventh chapter, the \textit{Paṅhāvāra}. I shall also
explain the place of the Saṅkhyāvāra in relation to the Vibhaṅgavāra, the ‘classification section’ (see 1.3.3. and Figure 1.2.). This is because the Vibhaṅgavāra gives a comprehensive description of conditional relations. The Saṅkhyāvāra then summarises the detailed description of the conditional relations through the enumeration. Therefore, it is important to explore the relationship between the Vibhaṅgavāra and the Saṅkhyāvāra in order to gain an understanding of the enumeration. I thus aim to provide background information on the enumeration in the Saṅkhyāvāra before turning to the pedagogical approach to the study of it in the Burmese Abhidhamma tradition.

The Pañhāvāra, as with the other six chapters, is divided into the Vibhaṅgavāra and the Saṅkhyāvāra. The Vibhaṅgavāra provides the detailed description of how the conditioning states (paccaya-dhammas) and their conditioned states (paccayuppana-dhammas) can relate to each other through the 24 conditions. The Saṅkhyāvāra enumerates the number of possible conditional relations. The Saṅkhyāvāra is divided into three subsections: (1) the Suddhasaṅkhyā, single (which literally means ‘simple’) enumeration, and (2) the Sabhāgasanāṅkhyā, ‘common enumeration’, and (3) the Ghaṭanāsaṅkhyā, ‘multiple enumeration’ (see Figure 1.2.). The Suddhasaṅkhyā lists the numbers of conditional relations when the conditioning states and the conditioned states are related by one condition (see below). Therefore, it is called the single enumeration. The Sabhāgasanāṅkhyā enumerates the number of relations between the cause and effect when there are two conditions. The Ghaṭanāsaṅkhyā gives the numbers of conditional relations when conditioning states and conditioned states are related by combinations of more than two conditions (see below). The subsections of the Saṅkhyāvāra, therefore, enumerate the number of possible relations between

---

531 In Burmese pedagogical textbooks on the Paṭṭhāna, the final two sections, i.e. the Sabhāgasanāṅkhyā and the Ghaṭanāsaṅkhyā, are referred to as the Missakasaṅkhyā, ‘mixed enumeration’, in order to show that the relations between the cause and effect can be related by more than one condition.
cause and effect which are related by one condition, or two conditions, or more than two conditions.

In the rest of 5.1., I aim to demonstrate the nature and structure of the Saṅkhya by describing the three subsections with specific examples. As far as I am aware, this is the first time that the nature of the Saṅkhya has been explained in any detail in Western scholarship.

5.1.1. Single enumeration (Suddhasaṅkhya)

The Suddhasaṅkhya section enumerates the types of conditional relationship between conditioning states and the conditioned states that can be related by a single condition. The Suddhasaṅkhya of the Pañhāvāra on the skilful triplet (kusalatika) is as shown below.

Hetuyā satta, ārammaṇe nava, adhipatiyā dasa, anantare satta, samanantare satta, sahajāte nava, aṅgamaṅhe tīṇi, nissaye terasa, upanissaye nava, purejāte tīṇi, pacchājāte tīṇi, āsevane tīṇi, kamme satta, vipāke ekaṃ, āhāre satta, indriye satta, jhāne satta, mage satta, sampayutte tīṇi, vippayutte pañca, atthiyā terasa, natthiyā satta, vigate satta, avigate terasa.532

[There are] 7 [ways in which conditioning states and conditioned states are related (i.e. types of conditional relationship)] in the case of root condition. 9 types of conditional relationship in the case of object condition, 10 types of conditional relationship in the case of predominance condition, 7 types of conditional relationship in the case of proximity condition, 7 types of conditional relationship in the case of contiguity condition, 9 types of conditional relationship in the case of co-nascence condition, 3 types of conditional relationship in the case of mutuality condition, 13 types of conditional relationship in the case of support condition, 9 types of conditional relationship in the case of decisive support condition, 3 types of conditional relationship in the case of pre-nascence condition, 3 types of conditional relationship in the case of post-nascence condition, 3 types of conditional relationship in the case of repetition condition, 7 types of conditional relationship in the case of kamma condition, 1 type of conditional relationship in the case of resultant condition, 7 types of conditional relationship in the case of nutriment condition, 7 types of conditional relationship in the case of faculty condition, 7 types of conditional relationship in the case of jhāna condition, 7 types of conditional relationship in the case of path condition, 3 types of conditional relationship in the case of association condition, 5 types of

532 Paṭṭh. 1.164.

This short section gives a list of numbers of conditional relations between conditioning states and their conditioned states by way of one condition. For example, there are seven ways in which the conditioning states and their conditioned states are related on the basis of the root condition.

In order to understand the enumeration in the *Suddhasaṅkhya*, it is important to look at the *Vibhaṅgavāra* because it gives a detailed description of different types of conditional relations. The *Suddhasaṅkhya* is a summary of the conditional relations described in the *Vibhaṅgavāra* through the enumeration. Thus, the numbers in the *Suddhasaṅkhya* comes from the *Vibhaṅgavāra*. For example, the following Pāli text from the *Vibhaṅgavāra* describes the ways in which conditioning states are related to the conditioned states by means of the root condition (hetupaccaya).

\[
\text{Kusalo dhammo kusalassa dhammassa hetupaccayena paccayo - kusalā hetū sampayuttakānaṃ khandhānaṃ hetupaccayena paccayo. Kusalo dhammo abyākatasā dhammassa hetupaccayena paccayo - kusalā hetū cittasamutthānānaṃ rūpānaṃ hetupaccayena paccayo.} \]

(3)\(^{533}\)

\[
\text{Akusalo dhammo akusalassa dhammassa hetupaccayena paccayo - akusalā hetū sampayuttakānaṃ khandhānaṃ hetupaccayena paccayo. Akusalo dhammo abyākatasā dhammassa hetupaccayena paccayo - akusalā hetū cittasamutthānānaṃ rūpānaṃ hetupaccayena paccayo. Akusalo dhammo akusalassa ca abyākatasā ca dhammassa hetupaccayena paccayo - akusalā hetū sampayuttakānaṃ khandhānaṃ cittasamutthānānañca rūpānaṃ hetupaccayena paccayo.} \]

(3)\(^{533}\)

\[
\text{Abyākato dhammo abyākatasā dhammassa hetupaccayena paccayo - vipākābyākata kiriyābyākatā hetū sampayuttakānaṃ khandhānaṃ cittasamutthānānañca rūpānaṃ hetupaccayena paccayo; paṭīsandhikkhane vipākābyākata hetū sampayuttakānaṃ khandhānaṃ kaṭṭattā ca rūpānaṃ hetupaccayena paccayo.} \]

(1)\(^{534}\)

---

\(^{533}\) The numbers in brackets after each paragraph summarise the numbers of ways the relevant conditioning states are related to the conditioned states (see below).

\(^{534}\) *Paṭṭh.* 1.132.
A skilful state is a condition for a skilful state by means of being a root condition. Skilful roots are conditions, by means of being the root condition, for the associated [mental] aggregates.

A skilful state is a condition for an indeterminate state by means of being a root condition. Skilful roots are conditions, by means of being the root condition, for the matter originating from the mind.

A skilful state is a condition for a skilful state and an indeterminate state by means of being a root condition. Skilful roots are conditions, by means of being the root condition, for the associated [mental] aggregates and the matter originating from the mind.

An unskilful state is a condition for an unskilful state by means of being a root condition. Unskilful roots are conditions, by means of being the root condition, for the associated [mental] aggregates.

An unskilful state is a condition for an indeterminate state by means of being a root condition. Unskilful roots are conditions, by means of being the root condition, for the matter originating from the mind.

An unskilful state is a condition for an unskilful state and an indeterminate state by means of being a root condition. Unskilful roots are conditions, by means of being the root condition, for the associated [mental] aggregates and the matter originating from the mind.

An indeterminate state is a condition for an indeterminate state by means of being a root condition. Resultant-type indeterminate roots and functional-type indeterminate roots are conditions, by means of being the root condition, for their associated [mental] aggregates and the matter originating from the mind. At the moment of conception, resultant-type indeterminate roots are conditions, by means of being the root condition, for the associated [mental] aggregates and the matter originating from kamma.

There are three ways in which the skilful dhammas (kusala-dhammas) as conditioning states are related to the conditioned states. They are the relationships between: (1) ‘skilful dhamma’ and ‘skilful dhamma’, (2) ‘skilful dhamma’ and ‘indeterminate dhamma’, and (3) ‘skilful dhamma’ and ‘skilful and indeterminate dhammas’. Similarly, there are three conditional relations concerning unskilful dhammas (akusala-dhammas), and one conditional relation involving indeterminate dhammas (abyākata-dhammas). In total, there are seven types of conditional relationship, which are enumerated as hetuyā satta, ‘by way of root, [there are] seven [types of conditional relationship]’. Here, the phrase ‘types of conditional relationship’ is used to refer to the possible combinations between different sets of dhammas. For example, a set of skilful dhammas, i.e. the 3 skilful roots (alobha, adosa, and amoha), can be related to another set of skilful dhammas, i.e. 21 skilful cittas, 38 associated cetasikas, by means of
being the root condition (see 3.1.). This set of skilful dhammas, i.e. the 3 skilful roots, and a set of indeterminate dhammas, i.e. the matter originating from the 21 skilful cittas and 38 associated cetasikas, can be related through the root condition. Finally, the same set of skilful dhammas, i.e. the 3 skilful roots, can give rise to both skilful dhammas and indeterminate dhammas, i.e. 21 skilful cittas, 38 associated cetasikas, and the matter originating from them. Therefore, the number 7 mentioned in the Suddhasaṅkhya encapsulates the relations between and within skilful dhammas, unskilful dhammas and indeterminate dhammas through the root condition that are described in the Vibhaṅgavāra in detail.

Depending on the condition under consideration, we have different types of conditional relationship. For instance, there are 13 types of conditional relations between conditioning states and conditioned states by way of the presence condition (atthipaccaya) and the non-disappearance condition (avigatapaccaya). Since the presence condition and the non-disappearance condition are essentially the same in nature, they have the same number of conditional relations, i.e. “atthiyā terasa”, ‘in the case of presence condition, [there are] 13 [types of conditional relationship]’, and “avigate terasa”, ‘in the case of non-disappearance condition, [there are] 13 [types of conditional relationship]’.

While we shall discuss the Burmese pedagogical approach to the study of the Saṅkhya in 5.2., it is important to recall here the important role of the

---

535 In this example, I have given the detailed analysis of the skilful dhammas and the indeterminate dhammas on the basis of Htan"ta-bin Hsayadaw’s ayakauk, which I described in 3.1.
537 Here, both the presence and non-disappearance conditions are explicitly stated, despite their identical nature in order to facilitate the complete, schematic presentation. In this regard, it is important to note that some of the 24 conditions are repeated under different name. Karunadasa observes that there are 3 pairs, namely (i) proximity condition and contiguity condition, (ii) presence condition and non-disappearance condition, (iii) absence condition and disappearance condition, and each of these pairs contains two identical conditions. By eliminating what is repeated we are left with 21 conditions. Karunadasa explains that the number of conditions was increased from 21 to 24 in order to facilitate their schematic presentation. He writes, “The number twenty-four, unlike the number twenty-one, is easily amenable to divisions, classifications, and combinations” (Karunadasa 2010: 281).
Suddhasaṅkhya in the Burmese pedagogies for the study of the Paṭṭhāna. The suddhasaṅkhya hso-yo”, ‘the recitation formulae of the Suddhasaṅkhya’, in the Htan “tabin Hsayadaw’s paṭṭhāna ayakauk, are an explication of the enumeration of the Suddhasaṅkhya using the ayakauk technique (see 4.3.2.). In Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw’s pedagogical approach, these suddhasaṅkhya hso-yo” are important pedagogical tools for the study of the Paṭṭhāna in its entirety (see 4.3.2. and below). This means these recitation formulae are used to study both the Vibhaṅgavāra and the other subsections of the Saṅkhyaṅvāra, namely the Sabhāgasaṅkhya and the Ghaṭanāsaṅkhya. I shall describe these two subsections below.

5.1.2. Common enumerations (Sabhāgasaṅkhya)

The Sabhāgasaṅkhya enumerates the number of ways in which conditioning states and the conditioned states are related by way of two conditions. The Pāli text of the Sabhāgasaṅkhya of the root condition is given as shown below.

Hetusabhāga – i.e. common [conditions] with root [condition]

Hetupaccayā adhipatiyā cattāri, sahajāte satta, aññamaññe tiṇī, nissaye satta, vipāke ekam, indriye cattāri, magge cattāri, sampayutte tiṇī, vippayutte tiṇī, aththiyā satta, avigate satta. (11)539

[There are] 4 [ways in which conditioning states and conditioned states are related (i.e. types of conditional relationship)] in the case of root and predominance conditions, 7 types of conditional relationship in the case of root and co-nascence conditions, 3 types of conditional relationship in the case of root and mutuality condition, 7 types of conditional relationship in the case of root and support conditions, 1 type of conditional relationship in the case of root and kammic-result conditions, 4 types of conditional relationship in the case of root and faculty conditions, 4 types of conditional relationship in the case of root and path conditions, 3 types of conditional relationship in the case of root and association conditions, 3 types of conditional relationship in the case of root and dissociation conditions, 7 types of conditional relationship in the case of root and

---

538 It should be noted that there are also separate suddhasaṅkhya hso-yo”, ‘recitation formulae of the Suddhasaṅkhya section’, for the Cha-vāra. As mentioned in f.n. 530, the Cha-vāra-saṅkhya is a separate module, and the recitation formulae for the Cha-vāra are slightly different from that of the Pañhāvāra.

539 Paṭṭh. 1.164.
presence conditions, 7 types of conditional relationship in the case of root and non-disappearance conditions.

The hetusabhāga section here, as in other subsections of the Saṅkhyaśāra, shows two aspects: (1) the conditions (paccayas) that can be paired with the root condition, and (2) the types of conditional relationship that can be related jointly by the paired conditions. The first aspect shows that there are eleven conditions (paccayas) out of the total of 24 which can be paired with the root condition. They are: predominance, co-nascence, mutuality, support, kammic-result, faculty, path, association, dissociation, presence and non-disappearance conditions (see above). The pair, i.e. root condition and one of the 11 conditions, then acts as conditions on the basis of which the conditioning states and the conditioned states are related. In the hetusabhāga section, the root condition then is taken as a reference, while the rest of the 11 conditions are taken as variants. As mentioned in the previous chapter, the conditions (paccayas) in the one category of conditions, which have the same kind of nature, can be paired (see 4.3.). This means that the root condition and the other eleven conditions are from the same category, namely the co-nascence category (sahajāta) (see Appendix F).\(^{540}\) By memorising the conditions in terms of the 9 categories, it is easier to recall the conditions that can be paired. This is why the 9 categories of conditions are important for the study of the Saṅkhyaśāra in the Burmese pedagogical approach.

The second element in the Sabhāgasāṅkhyā is about the types of conditional relationship that can be related by the paired conditions. For example, the phrase ‘hetupaccayā adhipatiyā cattāri’ indicates that there are four ways in which the

\(^{540}\) It should be noted that a condition cannot be paired with all the other conditions within a given category. For example, in the hetusabhāga section, only 11 out of the 15 conditions in the sahajāta category can be paired with the root condition. Therefore, there are 3 other conditions that cannot be paired with the root condition, namely kamma condition, nutriment condition, jhāna condition. This is because the root condition does not have common conditioning states with these three conditions (Nārada 1999: 139).
conditioning states and the conditioned states are related by means of being the root condition and the predominance condition. I shall explain what the four types of conditional relationship are later, in 5.2, because the process of how we can find these four conditional relations will be explored as a part of Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw’s pedagogical approach in that section.

5.1.3. Multiple enumeration (Ghaṭanāsaṅkhyā)

The Ghaṭanāsaṅkhyā is the final subsection within the Saṅkhya-vāra. It is also the longest subsection because it enumerates the numbers of conditional relations that are related by more than two conditions. In order to give an overview of the Ghaṭanāsaṅkhyā, I shall draw upon Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw’s classification of the multiple enumeration. Although we shall explore specific aspects of his pedagogical approach in 5.2., it is relevant and useful to draw on his classification of the multiple enumeration here.

Before explaining different kinds of multiple enumeration, it is important to recall that there are the 9 categories of conditions, and that some of the 24 conditions are embraced under more than one categories (see 4.2.). These two points are important for the understanding of the Ghaṭanāsaṅkhyā. For the Sabhāgasāṅkhyā, conditions (paccayas) can be paired only if they are in the same category (see above). For the Ghaṭanāsaṅkhyā, this ‘rule’ still applies, but there is this difference: conditions can be grouped if they are embraced under the same categories (see below). This second ‘rule’ is for the conditions with subsidiary types of conditions, which are embraced under more than one category.

With this in mind, we shall now turn to Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw’s classification of the multiple enumeration. On the basis of the commentary of the
Paṭṭhāna and the Htan‘ta-bin Hsayadaw’s paṭṭhāna ayakauk (HPA), Mula’ Pa-htan”
Hsayadaw classifies the Ghaṭanāsāṅkhyā into three kinds: 1) missaka-pakīṇṇaka-gaṭṭanā,
2) suddha-pakīṇṇaka-gaṭṭanā, and 3) sahaṭṭa-gaṭṭanā. The first kind, missaka-pakīṇṇaka-
gaṭṭanā, which literally means ‘mixed miscellaneous combinations’, refers to the
enumeration of conditional relations that involves combinations of conditions
(paccayas) in the co-nascence category and one of the other 8 categories.\textsuperscript{541} In this kind
of Ghaṭanāsāṅkhyā, conditions embraced under the co-nascence category must be
combined with conditions from another category. Without the co-nascence category,
the missaka-pakīṇṇaka-gaṭṭanā does not work.\textsuperscript{542} For example, the following Pāli text
shows the missaka-pakīṇṇaka-gaṭṭanā for the predominance condition.

\begin{quote}
Adhipati atthi avigatan-ti attha.
Adhipati nissaya atthi avigatan-ti attha.
Adhipati nissaya vippayutta atthi avigatan-ti cattāri.\textsuperscript{543}
\end{quote}

Predominance, presence and non-disappearance conditions make 8 [types
of conditional relationship].
Predominance, support, presence and non-disappearance conditions make
8 [types of conditional relationship].
Predominance, support, dissociation, presence and non-disappearance
conditions make 4 [types of conditional relationship].

As in the Sabhāgasāṅkhyā, two aspects are shown in the enumeration above, namely
the different types of conditional relationship expressed through numbers, and the
combinations of conditions which can relate the conditioning states and the
conditioned states. Due to limited space, I shall not explain the different types of
conditional relationship related by these multiple conditions. Nevertheless, I shall
briefly describe how various conditions can be combined with the predominance
condition. On the basis of the Pāli text, we can see that there are four conditions
which can be combined with the predominance condition, namely support,
dissociation, presence, and non-disappearance. We have seen that the predominance

\textsuperscript{541} Nārada 1980: 143. See Appendix F on different categories of conditions.
\textsuperscript{542} Nārada 1980: 143.
\textsuperscript{543} Paṭṭh. 1.166.
condition has two subsidiary types of conditions, i.e. object-predominance and co-nascence-predominance. Therefore, it is embraced under the object category and the co-nascence category (see 4.2.). The other four conditions are also embraced under the object category, the co-nascence category and other categories (see Appendix F). For example, the support condition is subsumed under three categories, namely the co-nascence category, the object category and the base-pre-nascence category. The fact that all five conditions are embraced under the object category and the co-nascence category means that we can find common conditioning states and the conditioned states which can be related jointly by these five conditions. Thus, the conditional relations related by these conditions are included as the missaka-paṭṭhaṇaka-ghaṭanā.

The second kind of Ghaṭanāsāṅkhya enumerates the types of conditional relationship that are related by conditions within a single category. Thus, it is called the suddha-paṭṭhaṇaka-ghaṭanā, ‘simple miscellaneous combinations’. The conditions which belongs to the co-nascence category are also excluded from this kind of multiple enumeration. An example of this is the multiple enumeration of the object condition, i.e. the ārammaṇa-ghaṭanā, as given below.

Ārammaṇa-dhipati upanissayanti satta.
Ārammaṇa purejāta atthi avigatanti tīni.
Ārammaṇa nissaya purejāta vippayutta atthi avigatanti tīni.
Ārammaṇa-dhipati upanissaya purejāta atthi avigatanti ekam.
Ārammaṇa-dhipati nissaya upanissaya purejāta vippayutta atthi avigatanti ekam.

Object, predominance, and decisive support conditions make 7 [types of conditional relationship]. Object, pre-nascence, presence, and non-disappearance conditions make 3 [types of conditional relationship]. Object, support, pre-nascence, dissociation, presence, and non-disappearance conditions make 3 [types of conditional relationship].

---

544 For a detailed explanation of the varieties of the support condition, see Karunadasa 2010: 269 and Bodhi 2010: 318-9.
546 Paṭṭh. 1.166.
Object, predominance, decisive-support, pre-nascence, presence, and non-disappearance conditions make 1 [type of conditional relationship].
Object, predominance, support, decisive-support, pre-nascence, dissociation, presence, and non-disappearance conditions make 1 [type of conditional relationship].

For the multiple enumeration of the object condition, there are eight conditions in total, which are embraced under the object category (see Appendix F).

The third kind of Ghaṭanāsaṅkhya, the sahajāta-ghaṭanā, which literally means ‘co-nascence combinations’, refers to the multiple enumeration of the conditional relations that are related by conditions in the co-nascence category (see Appendix F). Thus, it is concerned only with the co-nascence category. Hence, it is called the sahajāta-ghanṭanā, the ‘co-nascence multiple enumeration’. For example, the multiple enumeration of the mutuality condition, i.e. aṅñamaññaṭṭha-ghanṭanā, is shown below.

Aṅñamañña sahajāta nissaya atthi avigatanti tīni.
Aṅñamañña sahajāta nissaya sampayutta atthi avigatanti tīni.
Aṅñamañña sahajāta nissaya vippayutta atthi avigatanti ekaṃ. (avipaśa 3).

Aṅñamañña sahajāta nissaya vipāka atthi avigatanti ekaṃ.
Aṅñamañña sahajāta vippaka sampayutta atthi avigatanti ekaṃ.
Aṅñamañña sahajāta nissaya vippaka vippayutta atthi avigatanti ekaṃ. (savipaśa 3). \(^{547}\)

Mutuality, co-nascence, support, presence and non-disappearance conditions make 3 [types of conditional relationship].
Mutuality, co-nascence, support, association, presence and non-disappearance conditions make 3 [types of conditional relationship].
Mutuality, co-nascence, support, dissociation, presence, and non-disappearance conditions 1 [type of conditional relationship]. (without kammic-result 3).

Mutuality, co-nascence, support, kammic-result, presence, and non-disappearance conditions make 1 [type of conditional relationship].
Mutuality, co-nascence, support, kammic-result, association, presence, and non-disappearance conditions make 1 [type of conditional relationship].
Mutuality, co-nascence, support, kammic-result, dissociation, presence, and non-disappearance conditions make 1 [type of conditional relationship]. (with kammic-result 3).

In the example above, there are eight conditions in total, namely the mutuality, co-nascence, support, kammic-result, association, dissociation, presence,
and non-disappearance conditions. There are two distinctive features about the sahajāta-ghaṭanā. First, the sahajāta-ghaṭanā is of two groups: the first group is without kammic-result condition, i.e. avipāka, and the second is with kammic-result condition, i.e. savipāka. The difference between the first and the second group is this: the kammic-result condition in the former does not exercise its conditioning force (paccaya-satti) in order to relate conditioning states and the conditioned, while in the latter it exercises its conditioning force. In other words, the conditioning states and the conditioned states in the first group cannot be related through the workings of the kammic-result condition. The conditioning states and the conditioned states in the second group can be related by the workings of the kammic-result condition. In order to understand the conditional relations in this classification of the sahajāta-ghaṭanā, it is important to look at the workings of the kammic-result condition. The kammic-result condition is where “a conditioning state makes the conditioned states that arises together with it be as passive, effortless and quiescent as itself”.548 The conditioning states in this conditional relation are mental states, i.e. the resultant cittas and cetasikas, that arise as the results of mature kamma. The conditioned states are the same kind of resultant cittas and cetasikas, and the rūpas that have arisen together with them. What it essentially means is this: a group of resultant cittas and cetasikas causes the arising of another group of resultant cittas and cetasikas and the conascent material states, which are as passive and quiescent as the conditioning states. For example, in the mind of a person in deep sleep, the resultant bhavaṅga citta, literally means ‘life continuum’ consciousness,549 arises and passes away in constant succession, yet during this time no efforts are made for action by body, speech, or

548 Bodhi 2010: 313.
549 The bhavaṅga citta, ‘life-continuum’ consciousness, is a type of citta that explains continuity within life. The bhavaṅga is a resultant citta (vipāka-citta) that preserves the continuity of the individual existence whenever an active cognitive process subsides. It is, thus, a type of process-free citta (vīthimutta), i.e. a citta that is free from cognitive process and thus a passive condition. See Karunadasa (2010: 139) and Gethin (1994: 11-35) for a detailed explanation of the bhavaṅga citta.
mind.\textsuperscript{550} Since the conditioned states are the resultant \textit{cittas} during this time, there is no \textit{kamma} being made. In this example, the successive arising and cessation of the resultant \textit{bhavaṅga cittas} are connected by means of being the \textit{kammic-result condition}. It is in this context, i.e. the workings of the \textit{kammic-result condition}, that we should understand this distinctive feature of the \textit{sahajāta-ghaṭanā}.

Returning to our discussion of the \textit{sahajāta-ghaṭanā}, the \textit{kammic-result condition} (\textit{vipāka-paccaya}) does not take on its role as a conditioning force (\textit{paccaya-satti}) in the first group. This means all aspects of the conditioning states and the conditioned states of the conditional relations in the first group cannot be related by the \textit{kammic-result condition}. This is because some of the conditioning states in the first group do not lead to the arising of the resultant \textit{cittas} and \textit{cetasikas}, which are as passive and effortless as the conditioning states, by means of being the \textit{kammic-result condition}.\textsuperscript{551} In other words, some of the conditioning states in the first group lead to conditioned states that have \textit{kammic} results. The conditioning states in the first group can be related to the conditioned states by means of being the mutuality, co-nascence, support, association, dissociation, presence, and non-disappearance conditions. On the other hand, in the second group with \textit{kammic-result condition}, all aspects of the conditioning states and the conditioned states of the conditional relations can be related by the \textit{kammic-result condition}, along with other conditions.\textsuperscript{552} This means that the conditioning states in the second group by means of the \textit{kammic-result condition} lead to the arising of the conditioned states, which are resultant \textit{cittas} and \textit{cetasikas}, and the conascent material states. These conditioned states are as passive and quiescent as the conditioning states. This kind of classification, i.e. one group

\textsuperscript{550} Bodhi 2010: 313.
\textsuperscript{551} Nārada 1980: 196.
\textsuperscript{552} Nārada 1980: 197.
with the kammic-result condition and another without, is applicable to other multiple enumerations in the sahajāta-ghaṭanā.

The second distinctive feature of the sahajāta-ghaṭanā is concerned with the association and the dissociation conditions. As we can see from the above, the association condition and the dissociation condition appear in different lines, i.e. the association condition is in the second line, and the dissociation is in the third line in both groups. This means that the association condition and the dissociation condition cannot be combined to make a joint impact on a conditional relation. In other words, they cannot take on their roles as conditioning forces in the same type of conditional relationship. This is because they are of opposite nature: one is of association and another is of dissociation. Moreover, the association condition refers to the conditional relationship in which only mental states are involved, while the dissociation condition is about the relationship between mind and matter. The association condition is where mental states, i.e. cittas and cetasikas, as conditioning states relate to one another by being inseparably associated. The dissociation condition on the other hand is a condition in which the conditioning state and the conditioned states are of different types: “if one is matter the other must be mind; if one is mind the other must be matter”. Therefore, the association and dissociation conditions, as conditioning forces, cannot relate the same type of conditional relationship. Hence, each of the two conditions is grouped with the other seven conditions in the above example.

In summary, the Saṅkhyāvāra has three subsections, namely the Suddhasaṅkhya, the Sabhāgasaṅkhya and the Ghaṭanāsaṅkhya. These subsections provide enumeration of different types of conditional relations between conditioning states and the

---

553 For a detailed explanation of the association condition, see Karunadasa 2010: 276-277.
554 Bodhi 2010: 321. For a detailed explanation of the dissociation condition, see Karunadasa 2010: 277-278.
Conditioned states by way of a single condition, a pair of conditions and multiple conditions respectively. We have seen briefly about the relationship between the Suddhaāṅkhāyā and the Vibhaṅgavāra. The former summarises the detailed description of the conditional relations in the latter using numbers. In other words, the Vibhaṅgavāra shows the descriptive details through which we can gain an understanding of the enumeration in the Suddhaāṅkhāyā. In the Burmese pedagogical approaches, the Suddhaāṅkhāyā also plays an important role for the study of the Paṭṭhāna (see 4.3.2. and 5.1.1.). In particular, the recitation formulae of the Suddhaāṅkhāyā (suddhaāṅkhāhso-yo”), which were composed by Htan“ta-bin Hsayadaw in his paṭṭhāna ayakauk, have become a key aspect of Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw’s pedagogical approach. These recitation formulae function as a basis for descriptive expositions of the types of conditional relationship between cause and effect. For the Sabhāgasāṅkhāyā, only the conditions in the same category can be paired. The paired conditions act as conditions which cause the conditioned to arise.

Turning to the Ghaṭanāsāṅkhāyā, we have seen that it is of three types, i.e. the missaka-pakinnaka-ghaṭanā, the suddha-pakinnaka-ghaṭanā, and the sahajāta-ghaṭanā. The first type deals with the multiple enumeration of the conditional relations that are related by conditions in the co-nascence category and conditions in other categories. The second type is concerned with the multiple enumeration involving conditions from a single category, but conditions that are in the co-nascence category are excluded from this type. The sahajāta-ghaṭanā refers to the multiple enumeration of the relations involving conditions in the co-nascence category.

In this section, we have looked at the enumeration of the Paccayānulomā section (see Figure 1.2.). That is, the single and multiple enumeration mentioned

---

555 See 3.1. and 3.2. on the Paṭṭhāna pedagogical texts composed by the Burmese. Also, see Appendix D on the list of abhidhamma teachers mentioned in the thesis.
above show the conditional relations that can be related by conditions (paccayas) when they are taken positively (anuloma), e.g. root condition, object condition, etc. There are also single and multiple enumerations of the relations that can be related by conditions when they taken negatively (paccayapaccanīya). The Saṁkhya-vaśā of the Paccayapaccanīya shows the enumeration of the conditional relations that are related by not-root condition (na-hetu-paccaya), not-object condition (na-ārammaṇa-paccaya), etc. This means it enumerates different types of relationship that cannot be related by root condition, object condition, etc. Thus, it is the opposite of what we have seen in 5.1. I previously mentioned that enumeration is one aspect of mathematics. On the basis on the enumerations in these two sections, more complex mathematics of enumeration can be found in the Paccayunulomapaccanīya and the Paccayapaccanīyānuloma (see 1.3.3.). These two sections enumerate the conditional relations that can be related by various combinations of positive and negative conditions. The positive state of conditions (anuloma) and the negative state of conditions (paccanīya) are combined in a systematic manner in the Paccayunulomapaccanīya and the Paccayapaccanīyānuloma. For example, in the Paccayunulomapaccanīya, root condition (hetu-paccaya) is combined with not-object condition (na-ārammaṇa-paccaya), not-predominance condition (na-adhipati-paccaya), etc. Therefore, in these sections we find a more complex mathematics of combinations regarding the conditions.

In essence, the Saṁkhya-vaśā shows two aspects. First, we can identify the condition, or conditions, that are involved in the conditional relations between conditioning states and the conditioned states. Second, it enumerates the number of ways in which the conditioning states and the conditioned states are related, i.e. different types of conditional relationship, by using numbers.

556 See the Paccayunulomapaccanīya section of the Paññāvāra, i.e. Paṭṭh 1.209-1.277, for how the positive state of conditions are combined with the negative state of conditions.
5.2. The Burmese pedagogical approaches to the study of the Saṅkhyaśāstra

This section will explore the pedagogical approach to the study of the Saṅkhyaśāstra developed by Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw with a specific example. I aim to show that Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw’s approach provides pedagogical techniques in order to create descriptive expositions of the types of conditional relationship between cause and effect.

As mentioned previously, the 9 categories of conditions and the suddhasaṅkhya hso-yo”, the ‘recitation of formulae of the Suddhasaṅkhya’, are vital elements of Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw’s approach to the study of the Saṅkhyaśāstra. His pedagogical approach begins with the memorisation of the suddhasaṅkhya hso-yo”. In his approach, these recitation formulae are organised according to the order of conditions in the 9 categories (see Appendix F). The students are required to memorise these recitation formulae. The below is the suddhasaṅkhya hso-yo” of the co-nascence-predominance condition as shown in Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw’s work.

The recitation formula of the single enumeration (suddhasaṅkhya hso-yo”) of the predominance condition (adhipatipaccaya): the associated [mental] aggregates (sampayuttakhandhā), matter produced from predominant mind (sādhipati-cittajārūpā) are conditioned by one of the four predominant factors [i.e. desire, energy, consciousness and investigation]. These dhammas [i.e. conditioning states] are the co-nascence-predominance condition. [There are] the seven enumerations [i.e. types of conditional relationship] (saṅkhya satta). [There are] thirteen conditions [that can be paired]. Seven enumerations are: skilful and skilful, skilful and indeterminate, skilful and skilful-and-indeterminate, unskilful and unskilful, unskilful and indeterminate, unskilful and unskilful-and-indeterminate, indeterminate and indeterminate. Thirteen conditions [that can be paired] are: root, predominance, co-nascence, mutuality,

557 It is based on my own experience in attending the lessons on the Saṅkhyaśāstra taught by Daw Tin Yi. (see f.n. 530)
In this recitation formula, we have information about the conditioning states, the conditioned states, the conditioning force, the types of conditional relationship and the conditions that can be paired with the predominance. In this case, the types of conditional relationship that can be related by the co-nascence-predominance are listed as seven. This means that there are seven ways, as shown above, in which conditioning states and conditioned states can be related through the co-nascence-predominance condition. Moreover, the 12 conditions (excluding the predominance condition) that can be paired with the predominance condition are listed in the recitation formula.

Comparing this version of the recitation formulae with that of Htan’ta-bin Hsayadaw (see 4.3.2.), the types of conditional relationship and the conditions that can be paired are not included in Htan’ta-bin Hsayadaw’s version of the recitation formulae. Therefore, Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw’s version of the suddhaśaṅkhyā hso-yo” is more comprehensive than Htan’ta-bin Hsayadaw’s suddhaśaṅkhyā hso-yo”. Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw also rearranges the recitation formulae of the conditions in terms of the 9 categories. For example, the recitation formula of the predominance condition with two varieties – object-predominance and co-nascence-predominance – is rearranged in terms of the recitation formula of the object-predominance condition and of the co-nascence-predominance condition. The above cited recitation formula is concerned only with the co-nascence-predominance condition. The recitation formula of the object-predominance condition is omitted here. In Htan’ta-bin Hsayadaw’s recitation formula of the predominance condition, both the object-

---

558 Nārada 1980: 28. For clarity, I have added Pāli words and Pāli loan words, which are used by Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw, in parentheses. The square brackets are used to show my addition as to give a fuller meaning of the enumeration listed in Pāli.
predominance and the co-nascence-predominance conditions are included. Such rearrangement of the recitation formulae in terms of conditions in the categories is important for the study of the Śāṅkhyaśāstra. This is because, as mentioned above, only conditions in the same categories can be combined. So, by knowing the recitation formulae in the order of conditions in the categories, we can find different combinations of conditions (see above). It also means that on the basis of these recitation formulae descriptive expositions of the types of conditional relationship can be composed. It is important to recall that in the canonical Pāli text, the types of conditional relationship are expressed using numbers. For example, in the Sabhāgaśasāṅkhya of the root condition, the four types of conditional relationship that can be related through root and predominance conditions are enumerated as “Hetupaccayā adhipatiyā cattāri” (see 5.1.2.). On the basis of the suddhasāṅkhya hso-yo” of the root condition and the co-nascence-predominance condition, I aim to show how to compose descriptive expositions of these four types of conditional relationship.

By descriptive expositions of the types of conditional relationship, I mean the detailed description of the conditioning states and the conditioned states that can be related to each other. I aim to show how the terse enumeration of the conditional relations in Pāli, e.g. “Hetupaccayā adhipatiyā cattāri”, can be understood more fully in terms of the conditioning states and the conditioned states involved in such relations. In particular, I hope to demonstrate how the conditional relations (pertaining to the root condition and the predominance condition) can be written in terms of skilful states, unskilful states and indeterminate states, like the detailed exposition that we have seen in the Vibhaṅgavāra (see 5.1.1.). It essentially means that I shall find conditioning states and conditioned states that can be related jointly by the root

---

559 On the full version of the suddhasāṅkhya hso-yo” of all 24 condition in the HPA, see Nandamedhā 2006: 442-448.
condition and the co-nascence-predominance condition. I shall refer to such conditioning states and conditioned states as a common set of dhammas because these dhammas – conditioning and conditioned states – can be related by both conditions. I then aim to give the detailed description of the conditional relations that can related by these two conditions. In the following paragraphs, I give a step-by-step explanation of how the Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw’s suddhasaṅkhya hso-yo” are used within his pedagogical approach to enable the students to work out the detailed description of the conditional relations with a specific example.

In order to find a common set of the conditioning states and the conditioned states, I shall draw upon the Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw’s suddhasaṅkhya hso-yo” of the root condition and the co-nascence-predominance conditions. It is the co-nascence-predominance condition that can be paired with the root condition because both the root and co-nascence-predominance are subsumed under the co-nascence category. The object-predominance condition cannot be paired with the root condition because they are in different categories (see Appendix F).

Here, it is also useful to draw upon the detailed analysis of the conditioning states and the conditioned states by employing ayakauk technique, i.e. expressing these states in terms of cittas, cetasikas, and rūpas. This is because it is only when the characteristics of the conditioning states and the conditioned states are known that we can find a common set of dhammas which can be related both by the root condition and the co-nascence-predominance condition (see below). For clarity, the suddhasaṅkhya hso-yo” of the root condition and the co-nascence-predominance condition are shown in the table below.

---

560 See f.n. 540 for the conditions that can be paired with the root condition.
Table 5.1. An overview of conditioning and conditioned states of the root condition and the co-nascence-predominance condition.\textsuperscript{561}

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Conditioning force</th>
<th>Conditioning states</th>
<th>Conditioned states</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>root condition</td>
<td>6 roots (lobha, dosa, moha, alobha, adosa, amoha)</td>
<td>associated mental aggregates • 71 rooted cittas, 52 cetasikas - 21 skilful cittas, 38 cetasikas - 12 unskilful cittas, 27 cetasikas - 21 rooted resultant indeterminate cittas, 38 cetasikas - 17 rooted functional indeterminate cittas, 35 cetasikas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>rooted mind-produced matter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>rooted rebirth-kamma-produced matter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>co-nascence-predominance condition</td>
<td>4 predominant factors (chanda, víriya, citta, vimaṇsā)</td>
<td>associated mental aggregates • 52 predominant javana cittas, 50 cetasikas - 21 skilful cittas, 38 cetasikas - 10 faulty cittas, 26 cetasikas - 4 rooted resultant indeterminate cittas, 38 cetasikas - 17 rooted functional indeterminate cittas, 35 cetasikas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>matter produced from predominant mind</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The table above shows that the six roots are conditioning states, by means of being the root condition, for their associated mental aggregates, the matter produced from the rooted mind,\textsuperscript{562} and the matter produced from kamma that arises together with the rooted rebirth cittas (see 1.3.4., 3.1 and 4.3.1.). This conditional relation involving the root condition is labelled ‘No. A’. It also summarises the fact that the four predominant factors are conditioning states, by means of being the co-nascence-predominance condition, for their associated mental aggregates and the matter produced from predominant mind, i.e. cittas and cetasikas (see 4.3.1.). The detailed analysis of these conditioning and conditioned states are listed in terms of cittas,

\textsuperscript{561} Nandamedhā 2006: 387-396; Nārada 1996: 122.

\textsuperscript{562} See f.n. 216 and Appendix I on the definition of the rooted mind, which is also known as rooted citta.
cetasikas and rūpas. The conditional relation pertaining to the co-nascence-predominance condition is labelled ‘No. B’. As we shall see below, No. A and No. B are the objects of comparison. The following paragraphs will explain how we can find a common set of conditioning states and the conditioned states pertaining to the root condition and the co-nascence-predominance condition.

In order to find a common set of conditioning states and the conditioned states on the basis of Table 5.1., we first identify the common conditioning states that are found in the conditioning states of both conditions, i.e. No. A and No. B. Comparing the conditioning states (see the third column in Table 5.1.), we find that non-delusion (amoha) in the first line and investigation (vīmaṃsa) in the second line are common conditioning states. This is because non-delusion (amoha) is a synonym of wisdom (paññā). The predominant factor, vīmaṃsa, is also a synonym of wisdom (paññā) because it is another term for the cetasika ‘wisdom’ (paññā-cetasika). This means that amoha and vīmaṃsa are of the same nature. The implication is that amoha can be a conditioning state of the co-nascence-predominance condition (saḥajātādhipati-paccaya) because it is essentially a synonym of vīmaṃsa. Vīmaṃsa can also be a conditioning state of the root condition (hetu-paccaya) because it is a synonym of amoha. Therefore, the two dhammas, namely amoha and vīmaṃsa, are conditioning states by means of being the root condition and the co-nascence-predominance condition.

The next step is to find their corresponding conditioned states, i.e. the conditioned states of amoha and vīmaṃsā. Amoha as a conditioning state causes the arising of a set of conditioned states by means of being the root condition. Vīmaṃsa as a conditioning state also causes the arising of another set of conditioned states by

563 Bodhi 2010: 90.
564 Bodhi 2010: 275.
means of being the co-nascence-predomiance condition. How can we find their corresponding conditioned states? On the basis of the Abhidhammatthañgaṇa we can find the types of cittas and cetasikas that are conditioned by amoha and viṃsa. The compendium of roots (hetusaṅgaha) in the chapter three of the Abhidhammatthañgaṇa, describes that specific types of cittas and their associated cetasikas are conditioned by different types of roots. Non-delusion (amoha) is one of the six roots (see above). According to the Abhidhammatthañgaṇa, amoha causes the arising of the 47 (three)-rooted skilful and indeterminate cittas and the 38 associated cetasikas. There are material states, namely rooted mind-produced matter and rooted rebirth-kamma-produced matter, arising together with these 47 (three)-rooted cittas and their associated cetasikas. This means that amoha is a conditioning state, by means of being the root condition, for the 47 (three)-rooted skilful and indeterminate cittas, the 38 associated cetasikas and the matter produced from these mental states. As for investigation (viṃsa), we can also find the cittas and cetasikas that arise with viṃsa in the chapter seven of the Abhidhammatthañgaṇa, where the predominant factors are discussed. Investigation (viṃsa) as a predominant factor arises with and dominates the 34 predominant javana cittas and the 38 associated cetasikas. These predominant mental states also cause the arising of material states, which are called ‘predominant mind-produced matter’ (adhipati-cittaja-rūpa). Therefore, viṃsa is a conditioning state, by means of being the co-nascence-predomiance condition, for the 34 predominant javana cittas, the 38 associated cetasikas, and matter produced from these mental states. We have, thus, found two new sets of conditioning states and conditioned states that can be related by the root condition and the co-nascence-predomiance condition separately, which are shown in Table 5.2. For clarity, I have listed the mental states in a more refined cittas in Table 5.2.

566 Bodhi 2010: 121. See Bodhi 2010: 119-121 for the details of roots and their associated mental states.
567 Bodhi 2010: 275.
Table 5.2. Non-delusion (*amoha*) and investigation (*vīmaṇḍa*) as conditioning states and the corresponding conditioned states.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Conditioning states (<em>paccayadhamma</em>)</th>
<th>Conditioned states (<em>paccayuppanadhamma</em>)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>non-delusion (<em>amoha</em>)</td>
<td>47 three-rooted cittas and 38 associated cetasikas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- 4 sense-sphere skilful cittas associated with knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- 4 sense-sphere resultant cittas associated with knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- 4 sense-sphere functional cittas associated with knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- 9 sublime skilful cittas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- 9 sublime resultant cittas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- 9 sublime functional cittas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- 4 path cittas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- 4 fruit cittas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>rooted mind-produced matter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>rooted rebirth-kamma-produced matter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>investigation (<em>vīmaṇḍa</em>)</td>
<td>34 predominant three-rooted javaṇa cittas and 38 associated cetasikas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- 4 sense-sphere skilful cittas associated with knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- 4 sense-sphere functional cittas associated with knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- 9 sublime skilful cittas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- 9 sublime functional cittas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- 4 path cittas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- 4 fruit cittas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>predominant mind-produced matter</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It should be noted that Table 5.2. is derived from Table 5.1. First, we have identified the common conditioning states in Table 5.1., namely *amoha* and *vīmaṇḍa*. Then, we have found their corresponding conditioning states. The difference between Table 5.1. and 5.2. is the following. The conditioning states and the conditioned states in Table 5.1. are related by the root condition and the co-nascence-predominance condition separately. The conditioning states in Table 5.2., namely *amoha* and *vīmaṇḍa*, can be related by both the root condition and the co-nascence-predominance condition. The conditioned states in Table 5.2. (see the third column in
Table 5.2.) cannot be related by both the root condition and the co-nascence-predominance condition. We still need to find the common conditioned states that can be related by both conditions, which is shown in the following paragraph.

Based on Table 5.2., we find the conditioned states that are common to both sets, i.e. the conditioned states of amoha and those of vīmaṃsa. That is, we identify the conditioned states that are found in both sets, i.e. No. 1 and No. 2. Comparing the detailed list of cittas (shown in bullet points in Table 5.2.), we can see that the cittas in the second line – i.e. 4 sense-sphere skilful cittas associated with knowledge, 4 sense-sphere functional cittas associated with knowledge, 9 sublime skilful cittas, 9 sublime functional cittas, 4 path cittas, 4 fruit cittas – are also found in the first line. Thus, these 34 predominant javana cittas and their associated cetasikas are the mental conditioned states common to both sets.\footnote{Nārada 1980: 65.} In terms of material states, the matter that arises simultaneously from these predominant javana cittas and their associated cetasikas is the conditioned state which is common to both sets. This means that amoha is a conditioning state, by means of being a root condition, for the 34 predominant javana cittas, their associated cetasikas, and the matter produced from them. Similarly, vīmaṃsa is a conditioning state, by means of being a co-nascence-predominance condition, for the 34 predominant javana cittas, their associated cetasikas, and the matter produced from them. Here, it is important to recall that amoha and vīmaṃsa are synonymous and of the same nature. Thus, they can be used interchangeably. We can then write the conditional relations involving the root condition and the co-nascence-predominance condition as follows: ‘Investigation (vīmaṃsa) is a conditioning state, by means of being the root and co-nascence-predominance conditions, for the 34 predominant javana cittas, their associated cetasikas, and the matter produced from them’. It should be noted that since vīmaṃsa is essentially a
cetasika, it does not arise on its own. Vīmaṃsa arise together with the associated cittas, namely the 34 predominant javana cittas, and the 37 associated cetasikas. This means that vīmaṃsa and its associated mental states are conditioning states, by means of being the root condition and the co-nascence-predominance condition, for the associated conditioned states. In this case, the conditioning states arise together with the conditioned states. Thus, we have identified a common set of conditioning states, i.e. vīmaṃsa and its associated mental states, and the conditioned states, namely the 34 predominant javana cittas, their associated cetasikas, and the matter produced from them, that can be related by the root condition and the co-nascence-predominance condition.

We have, so far, traced the process of finding a common set of conditioning states and conditioned states that can be related by the root condition and the co-nascence-predominance condition. We have drawn on the detailed analysis of the conditioning states and the conditioned states of the root and co-nascence-predominance conditions separately, which are shown in Table 5.1. First, we identify the common conditioning state that is found in the conditioning states of both conditions. Second, we find the conditioned states of these common conditioning states and create two new sets of conditioning states and conditioned states, as shown in Table 5.2. Finally, we find the common conditioning states and conditioned states that can be related by both the root condition and the co-nascence-predominance condition. Here, finding a common set of the conditioning and conditioned states is similar to finding a ‘common factor’ in basic mathematics. The factor, or dhamma, found in the conditioning and conditioned states of both conditions is the common factor. In Table 5.1., amoha and vīmaṃsa are common factors that are found in both sets, i.e. No. A and No. B. It should be noted that both conditions, i.e. the root condition and the co-nascence-predominance condition, arise together with the associated cittas, namely the 34 predominant javana cittas, and the 37 associated cetasikas. 

---

condition and the co-nascence-predominance condition, must be able to relate the conditioning and conditioned states in the final common set. In the example above, the final common set of the conditioning and conditioned states is essentially the same as the dhammas found in the second line (i.e. No. 2) in Table 5.2. This means that the final common set of the conditioning and conditioned states is the set that contains all dhammas of No. 2 that also belong to No. 1. In other words, the final common set of the conditioning and conditioned states is the set of all dhammas that are members of both No. 1 and No. 2 in Table 5.2. Thus, finding a common set of dhammas is similar to finding an intersection of two sets of objects as given in set theory. In mathematics, the intersection of two sets P and Q is the set that conditions all elements of P that also belong to Q so that the elements inside the intersection are common to both sets. In the above example, such a common, or shared, value ensures that the conditioning state and the conditioned states in the final common set can be related by both the root condition and the co-nascence-predominance condition.

It is important to recall that the aim of finding the common set of conditioning states and the conditioned states, as we saw in the above example, is to show how the suddhasaṅkhya hso-yo”, the recitation formulae of the Suddhasaṅkhya, are used to work out a descriptive exposition of the conditional relations that can be related by both the root condition and the predominance condition. These conditional relations involving the root condition and the predominance condition are expressed as “Hetupaccayā adhipatiyā cattāri” in the Sabhāgaśaṅkhya. I shall explain and describe the conditional relations in terms of skilful states, unskilful states and indeterminate states below.

In order to write a descriptive exposition of the conditional relations, it is necessary to classify the conditioning states, i.e. vīmaṃsa and its associated mental states, and the conditioned states, i.e. the 34 predominant javana cittas, the associated
cetasikas, and their associated material states, namely the predominant mind-produced matter (see the second line in Table 5.2.), in terms of skilful dhamma, unskilful dhamma, and indeterminate dhamma. Since vipāma, which is a synonym of amoha, does not arise with unskilful cittas, the unskilful dhamma are excluded from the conditional relations that apply here. Moreover, vipāma arises only with the skilful cittas and function-indeterminate (kiriyābyākata) cittas (see Table 5.2.). Therefore, the conditioning states and the conditioned states can be classified in terms of the skilful dhamma and the indeterminate dhamma. In fact, we can find 4 types of conditional relation between the conditioning states and the conditioned states. The 4 types of conditional relation are between ‘skilful dhamma and skilful dhamma’, ‘skilful dhamma and skilful dhamma and indeterminate dhamma’, and finally, ‘indeterminate dhamma and indeterminate dhamma’ (see Table 5.3.).

Htan"ta-bin Hsayadaw in his Pa-htan"ayakauk gives a detailed description of these 4 conditional relations of the root condition and the (co-nascence-)predominance condition as follows:


Abyākato dhammo abyākatassa dhammassa hetupaccayena paccayo, adhipatipaccayena paccayo – vipākābyākata kiriyaśādhipati sampayuttakānaṁ khandhānaṁ cittasamuṭṭhānānaṁ rūpānaṁ hetupaccayena paccayo, adhipatipaccayena paccayo. (1)

(1) A skilful state is a condition for a skilful state by means of being a root condition and a predominance condition. Skilful predominant investigation is a condition, by means of being the root condition and the predominance condition, for the associated [mental] aggregates.

---

(2) A skilful state is a condition for an indeterminate state by means of being a root condition and a predominance condition. Skilful predominant investigation is a condition, by means of being the root condition and the predominance condition, for the matter originating from the mind.

(3) A skilful state is a condition for a skilful state and an indeterminate state by means of being a root condition and a predominance condition. Skilful predominant investigation is a condition, by means of being the root condition and the predominance condition, for the associated [mental] aggregates and the matter originating from the mind.

(4) An indeterminate state is a condition for an indeterminate state by means of being a root condition and a predominance condition. Result-type indeterminate and functional-type indeterminate predominant investigation\(^572\) is a condition, by means of being the root condition and the predominance condition, for their associated [mental] aggregates and the matter originating from the mind.

The above is the detailed description of the terse enumeration of the 4 types of conditional relation, i.e. “Hetupaccayā adhipatiyā cattāri”. This descriptive exposition of the conditional relations is the same kind of description that we saw in the Vibhaṅgavāra (see 5.1.1.). According to the Burmese paṭṭhāna teachers, every enumeration in the Saṅkhya-vāra can be written out in detail as shown above.\(^573\)

In addition to such descriptive expositions, these conditional relationships are analysed in terms of the fourfold classification of dhammas, namely cittas, cetasikas, rūpas and nibbāna, by using the ayakauk technique in the Burmese approach. For example, the detailed analysis of these relations in the Saṅkhya-vāra is given in the HPA and Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw’s work. Table 5.3. shows the detailed analysis of the 4 types of conditional relation between the root condition and the (co-nascence-) predominance condition on the basis of Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw’s work.

\(^{572}\) See Appendix I for an explanation of different types of indeterminate (abyākata).

Table 5.3. The 4 types of conditional relations related by the root condition and the co-nascence predominance condition.\textsuperscript{574}

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Conditioning states</th>
<th>Conditioned states</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>skilful dhamma</td>
<td>skilful dhamma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>vīmamsa and associated skilful cittas and cetasikas</td>
<td>associated skilful cittas and cetasikas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• 4 sense-sphere skilful cittas</td>
<td>• 4 sense-sphere skilful cittas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>associated with knowledge</td>
<td>associated with knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• 9 sublime skilful cittas</td>
<td>• 9 sublime skilful cittas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• 4 path cittas</td>
<td>• 4 path cittas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• their associated cetasikas</td>
<td>• their associated cetasikas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>skilful dhamma</td>
<td>indeterminate dhamma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>vīmamsa and associated skilful cittas and cetasikas</td>
<td>predominant mind-produced matter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• 4 sense-sphere skilful cittas</td>
<td>• 4 sense-sphere skilful cittas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>associated with knowledge</td>
<td>associated with knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• 9 sublime skilful cittas</td>
<td>• 9 sublime skilful cittas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• 4 path cittas</td>
<td>• 4 path cittas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• their associated cetasikas</td>
<td>• their associated cetasikas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>skilful dhamma</td>
<td>skilful dhamma and indeterminate dhamma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>vīmamsa and associated skilful cittas and cetasikas</td>
<td>associated skilful cittas and cetasikas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• 4 sense-sphere skilful cittas</td>
<td>• 4 sense-sphere skilful cittas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>associated with knowledge</td>
<td>associated with knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• 9 sublime skilful cittas</td>
<td>• 9 sublime skilful cittas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• 4 path cittas</td>
<td>• 4 path cittas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• their associated cetasikas</td>
<td>• their associated cetasikas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>indeterminate dhamma</td>
<td>indeterminate dhamma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>vīmamsa and associated indeterminate cittas and cetasikas</td>
<td>associated indeterminate cittas and cetasikas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• 4 sense-sphere indeterminate cittas and cetasikas</td>
<td>• 4 sense-sphere indeterminate cittas and cetasikas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>associated with knowledge</td>
<td>associated with knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• 9 sublime indeterminate cittas</td>
<td>• 9 sublime indeterminate cittas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• 4 fruit cittas</td>
<td>• 4 fruit cittas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• their associated cetasikas</td>
<td>• their associated cetasikas</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above table shows the 4 types of conditional relation between the conditioning and conditioned states using the \textit{ayakauk} technique. This means the conditioning and

\textsuperscript{574} Nārada 1980: 66-68.
conditioned states are expressed in terms of a detailed classification of cittas, cetasikas and rūpas.

This section demonstrates the way in which we can gain an understanding of more complex conditional relations enumerated in the Saṅkhyaśāstra through the Burmese pedagogical approaches. In particular, it shows the process through which we can ‘decode’ the terse enumeration of the conditional relations between the root condition and the con-nascence-predominance condition as an example. Drawing on Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw’s pedagogical approach and the ayakauk technique, we have identified the common set of the conditioning and conditioned states that can be related by both conditions. In the Burmese pedagogical approaches to the study of the Paṭṭhāna, the ability to use the ayakauk technique and give detailed descriptive expositions in terms of cittas, cetasikas, rūpa, and nibbāna is emphasised. Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw’s approach emphasises the ability to see the connections between the detailed analysis of the conditional relations, the suddhaṅkhyā hso-yo”, and the canonical Pāli texts. The above explanation regarding how to find a common set of conditioning and the conditioned states is based on my study of the conditional relations through the ayakauk technique. I have also traced the interconnections between the Vibhaṅga and the Saṅkhyaśāstra. In so doing, I have shown how students within the Burmese Abhidhamma tradition might write the descriptive exposition of the types of conditional relationship on the basis of the terse enumeration of the conditional relations found in the Saṅkhyaśāstra.

The example I have given above is much simpler than the conditional relations in the Ghaṭanāsaṅkhya of the Pañhāvāra. The combinations of conditions in the Ghaṭanāsaṅkhya are very complex as three or more conditions are combined. It is important to point out here that Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw has designed numerous tables in order to study more complex enumerations in the Ghaṭanāsaṅkhya of the
Pañhāvāra, which are in his Pa-htan’paragu, the ‘Perfected in the Paṭṭhāṇa’. Due to limited space, I shall not deal with them in this thesis. For those who are interested, Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw has described some of the complex enumerations of the Cha-vāra, the first ‘six chapters’ (see above), in the seventh chapter of the second volume of the Guide to Conditional Relations (Part 2) published (in English) by the Department of Religious Affairs, Yangon, in 1986.

5.3. The Saṅkhyaśāra and the mathematics of combinatorics

This section looks at some mathematical aspects of the Paṭṭhāṇa. In particular, it explores some aspects of the mathematics of ‘combinatorics’ that can be seen in the Paṭṭhāṇa. Combinatorics is the branch of mathematics concerned with “the theory of enumeration, or combinations and permutations, in order to solve problems about the possibility of constructing arrangements of objects which satisfy specified conditions”. Simply put, combinatorics is the area of mathematics concerned with counting strategies to calculate the ways in which finite objects can be arranged to satisfy given conditions. It also includes finding optimal combinations of objects. In the Paṭṭhāṇa, there are two types of combinations, namely combinations of dhammas and combinations of conditions (paccayas). I mentioned briefly about combinations of dhammas in Chapter 1 (see 1.3.3.). For example, the three dhammas of the skilful triplet (kusalatika), i.e. skilful dhamma, unskilful dhamma and indeterminate dhamma, are combined in a systematic order. The phrase ‘combinations of dhammas’ is used to refer to these combinations of individual dhammas within and between the triplet dhammas.

(tikadhammas) and duplet dhammas (dukadhammas) (see below). By ‘combinations of conditions’, I mean combinations of the 24 conditions (paccayas) according to specific rules (see above). Some aspects of ‘combinations of conditions’ are discussed above. For instance, we have explored the conditional relations between dhammas that can be related by one condition in the Suddhasaṅkhya, two conditions in the Sabhāgasāṅkhya, and multiple conditions in the Ghaṭanāsaṅkhya. In the Sabhāgasāṅkhya, we have binary combinations of conditions. That is, two conditions are paired given that they are in the same category of conditions (see 5.1.2.). In the Ghaṭanāsaṅkhya, we have multiple combinations of conditions in which three or more conditions are combined.

Before we explore some mathematical aspects of the Paṭṭhāna further, it is important to clarify the concepts of ‘combinations’ and ‘permutations’ in relation to the Paṭṭhāna. In mathematics, both terms ‘combinations’ and ‘permutations’ are used to refer to the act of “counting the number of ways in which some particular arrangements of objects can be achieved”.578 There is, however, a difference between these two concepts, which is this: while the term ‘combinations’ is used when the order of objects does not matter, the term ‘permutations’ refers to some particular arrangements of objects in which the order does matter. In the Paṭṭhāna, we can identify the notion of combinations in that there are combinations of dhammas (see below) and combinations of conditions in the canonical paṭṭhāna text. In this section, we shall return to these two types of combinations. I shall reveal that the notion of combinations, i.e. arrangements of objects where the order does not matter, is consistent with the concept of multiplicity of causes and effects from a philosophical perspective (see below). We shall also compare some parallels between them and the mathematics of combinatorics with specific examples.

In order to see the extensive use of combinations in the *Paṭṭhāna*, we shall turn to the *Pucchāvāra*, ‘question division’, of the *Paṭṭhāna* (see Figure 1.2.). In theory, the *Pucchāvāra* describes all possible questions regarding conditional relations between the 266 dhammas, i.e. the 22 triplets (tikadhammas) and the 100 duplets (dukadhammas), and their combinations. The *Pucchāvāra* puts forward questions as to whether these combinations of 266 dhammas, as conditioning and the conditioned, can be related by various combinations of the 24 conditions (paccayās). This is why calculations of the number of questions undertaken by the Burmese scholars amount to hundreds of billions of questions (see 1.3.3.). In this thesis, we shall not examine complex combinations of dhammas and combinations of conditions because of limited space. Nevertheless, we shall go through a step-by-step calculation of the total number of questions that can be formulated when there is a single condition (paccaya) relating the conditioning and the conditioned states. The following calculation and discussion aims to show: how dhammas are permuted, and a glimpse of why there might be innumerable numbers of questions in the *Paṭṭhāna*.

As an example, we shall look at the *Pucchāvāra*, ‘question section’, on the skilful triplet (kusalatika), which is given in the canonical *paṭṭhāna* text, in order to calculate the total number of questions that could be formulated when there is a single condition relating the conditioning states and the conditioned states. The Pāli text below is from the question section on the skilful triplet.

(1) Siyā kusalaṁ dhammaṁ paṭicca kusalo dhammo uppaţeyyā hetupaccayā.
(2) Siyā kusalaṁ dhammaṁ paṭicca akusalo dhammo uppaţeyyā hetupaccayā.
(3) Siyā kusalaṁ dhammaṁ paṭicca abyākato dhammo uppaţeyyāa hetupaccayā.
(4) Siyā kusalaṁ dhammaṁ paṭicca kusalo ca abyākato ca dhammā uppaţeyyām hetupaccayā.
(5) Siyā kusalaṁ dhammaṁ paṭicca akusalo ca abyākato ca dhammā uppaţeyyām hetupaccayā.
(6) Siyā kusalaṁ dhammaṁ paṭicca kusalo ca akusalo ca dhammā uppaţeyyām hetupaccayā.
The skilful triplet has three kinds of dhammas: (1) skilful dhamma (kusaladhamma), (2) unskilful dhamma (akusaladhamma), and (3) indeterminate dhamma (abyākatadhamma). The questions in the example above take the skilful dhamma as a conditioning state. These questions ask if a skilful dhamma, as a conditioning state, can be related to skilful dhamma, unskilful dhamma, indeterminate dhamma, and their combinations – i.e. skilful and indeterminate dhammas (see line 4 in the above example); unskilful and indeterminate dhammas (see line 5); skilful and unskilful dhammas (see line 6); skilful, unskilful and indeterminate dhammas (see line 7), by means of being the root condition (hetupaccaya). So far, we have seen how 7 questions can be formulated when we take skilful dhamma as a conditioning state, and then pair with other dhammas in the skilful triplet and their combinations, which are the conditioned states. In order to show how the remaining questions (in relation to the three dhammas of the skilful triplet) can be formulated, we shall draw on Pa-htan"theik-pan Hsayadaw’s table of the Pacchāvāra. On the basis of the table developed by Pa-htan"theik-pan Hsayadaw (see Appendix H for full transcript of the table in Romanized Pāli), we can represent a

---

579 Paṭṭh. 1.10.
complete set of pairings between conditioning states and conditioned states pertaining to the skilful triplet, as shown in Table 5.4.

Table 5.4. Pairings between conditioning state and conditioned state in the *Pucchāvāra* of the skilful triplet.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Conditioning state</th>
<th>Conditioned state</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>skilful dhamma</td>
<td>skilful dhamma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>unskilful dhamma</td>
<td>unskilful dhamma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>indeterminate dhamma</td>
<td>indeterminate dhamma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>skilful and indeterminate dhammas</td>
<td>skilful and indeterminate dhammas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>unskilful and indeterminate dhammas</td>
<td>unskilful and indeterminate dhammas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>skilful and unskilful dhammas</td>
<td>skilful and unskilful dhammas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>skilful, unskilful and indeterminate dhammas</td>
<td>skilful, unskilful and indeterminate dhammas</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Drawing on my interview with Ven. Paṇḍita in 2010, a close disciple of the Paḥtan"theik-pan Hsayadaw, I shall describe how the conditioning states and the conditioned states are combined in the *Pucchāvāra*. As we can see from the information in Table 5.4., there are 7 ways of pairing each conditioning state in column two with the conditioned state in column three. If we take skilful *dhamma* in column two as a conditioning state and keep it constant, it can be combined with 7 other *dhammas* and combinations of *dhammas* in column three, which are the conditioned states. Thus, we have 7 pairs of conditioning state and conditioned state. This is how the 7 questions that we have seen above can be formulated. Similarly, we can take unskilful *dhamma*, indeterminate *dhamma* etc. in column two as a conditioning state, and then pair with other *dhammas* and the combinations of *dhammas*, i.e. each row in column three, which are conditioning states. For example, if

---

580 During my first visit to the Paḥtan"theik-pan Sathintaik in Sagaing in July 2010, Ven. U Paṇḍita taught me how to recite the *Pucchāvāra* just from looking at the table shown in Appendix H.

581 See Appendix I on indeterminate *dhamma*. 

267
the ‘skilful, unskilful and indeterminate dhammas’, i.e. row No. 7 in column two, are taken as conditioning states, and pair with the combinations of dhammas in row No. 7 in column three, we can formulate a question such as this: “May skilful, unskilful and indeterminate dhammas arise dependent on skilful, unskilful and indeterminate dhammas by means of being a root condition?” In this case, the conditional relations between the conditioning states and the conditioned states are related by the root condition. Thus, each row in column two is paired with each of the 7 rows in column three. Therefore, a total of 49 (7 × 7) questions can be formulated regarding the conditional relations between the dhammas in the skilful triplet that are related by the root condition. These 49 questions essentially ask whether there are 49 types of conditional relationship between skilful dhamma, unskilful dhamma, and indeterminate dhamma that can be related by the root condition (hetupaccaya).

We can refer to these 49 questions pertaining to the root condition as ‘a set of questions’. Since there are 24 conditions, we then have ‘24 sets of questions’, and each set has 49 questions. For instance, there are 49 possible questions on the conditional relations between skilful dhamma, unskilful dhamma, and indeterminate dhamma that can be related by the object condition (ārammaṇapaccaya). It should be noted that in the canonical paṭṭhāna text, all 49 questions pertaining to the object condition are not given. Instead, only one question is explicitly stated, while the remaining 48 questions are abbreviated through the following phrase:

Yathā hetupaccayo vitthārito, evaṃ ārammaṇapaccayopi vitthāretabbo vācanāmaggena.

As expounded in detail for root condition so it can be expounded in full for object condition orally.

---

582 Paṭṭh. 1.13.
583 See Paṭṭh. 1.11-1.13, § 25-31 for all questions pertaining to the skilful triplet when the conditioning and conditioned states are related by the root condition.
584 Paṭṭh. 1.14.
The questions pertaining to other conditions are also abbreviated. By multiplying 24 with 49 (24 × 49 = 1176), we can calculate the total number of questions, i.e. 1176, regarding the conditional relations between dhammas in the skilful triplet that can be related by a single condition.\(^{585}\) As mentioned above, there are multiple combinations of conditions (paccayas) that can relate the conditioning states and the conditioned states. The implication is that the possible numbers of questions that can be asked become innumerable large, when we take into account of the impact of multiple combinations of conditions. Hence, the Burmese claim that if the Pucchāvāra, question section, is written out in full, it will amount to nine carts full of books (see 1.3.3.).\(^{586}\)

It is important to note, however, that while each of these questions in the Pucchāvāra may be asked, each does not have a positive answer. This is because some of the conditional relations between the conditioning and conditioned states cannot be related by a given condition (paccaya).\(^{587}\) For instance, a question – such as “May skilful, unskilful and indeterminate dhammas arise dependent on skilful, unskilful and indeterminate dhammas by means of being a root condition?” (shown above) – does not have a positive answer. The conditioned states, i.e. skilful, unskilful and indeterminate dhammas, do not arise dependent on the conditioning states, i.e. skilful, unskilful and indeterminate dhammas. It essentially means that ‘skilful, unskilful and indeterminate dhammas’, as conditioning states, cannot be related to ‘skilful, unskilful and indeterminate dhammas’ by means of being a root condition. Thus, while the number of questions is a relatively simple calculation, the combinations of the answers, i.e. the representation of actual causality according to whether each proposition is or is not possible, is far more complex. To present the issue in terms of

\(^{585}\) Aung Thein 1994: 279.
\(^{586}\) Ven. U Pândita, the current abbot of the Pa-htan’theik-pan Sathintaik, interviewed on 17 July 2010.
\(^{587}\) Tilokābhivamsa 2009: 11.
questions therefore in fact simplifies the representation by standardising it prior to the arrival at the more complex options that the answers generate.

We have, so far, traced through the calculation of possible numbers of questions that can be generated by relating the conditioning states and the conditioned states through one condition. In so doing, we have identified that in the *paṭṭhāna* individual *dhammas* of a triplet *dhamma* (*tikadhamma*) are arranged in a specific order. For example, the skilful *dhamma*, the unskilful *dhamma* and the indeterminate *dhamma* are permuted, as shown in Table 5.4. We have seen how questions can be formulated for the conditional relations between different combinations of *dhammas*. The combinations of *dhammas*, as conditioning states, imply that a multiplicity of *dhammas* can co-influence conditional relations. As mentioned in 1.3., we, thus, find explicit examples of how a multiplicity of *dhammas* can bring about a multiplicity of *dhammas*.

I would now like to take a further step in our investigation of combinations of *dhammas*. I aim to identify if any pattern is present in the combinations of *dhammas* in a given triplet *dhamma* (*tikadhamma*). We shall, therefore, explore how the three *dhammas* in the skilful triplet, namely skilful *dhamma*, unskilful *dhamma* and indeterminate *dhamma*, as an example can be combined. For our experiment, we permute these *dhammas* as shown in Table 5.5.
Table 5.5. Combinations of the skilful triplet (*kusaladhamma*)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Combinations of the skilful triplet</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>skilful</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Unskillful</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>indeterminate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>skilful unskillful</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>skilful indeterminate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Unskillful skilful</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Unskillful indeterminate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>indeterminate skilful</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>indeterminate unskillful</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>skilful unskillful indeterminate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Skilful indeterminate unskillful</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Unskillful skilful indeterminate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Unskillful indeterminate skilful</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>indeterminate skilful unskillful</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>indeterminate unskillful skilful</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5.5. shows all possible combinations that can be derived from the three individual *dhammas* of the skilful triplet. These combinations are not done just randomly. I have used the combinations of *dhammas* that I have identified in Table 5.4. (see above) as a basis. I have then written out the full combinations of *dhammas* as shown in Table 5.5. Therefore, for our discussion below, it is important to use both Table 5.4. and Table 5.5. It should also be noted that our discussion is concerned with co-existing *dhammas* that are combined rather than conditional relations between conditioning and conditioned *dhammas*.

We can identify from Table 5.5. that skilful *dhamma*, unskilful *dhamma* and indeterminate *dhamma* are combined in a specific order such that the combinations of
Dhammas are accumulative. That is, the sequence begins with a single dhamma, and
increases to a pair of dhammas, then to a triplet. Another finding is that although
there are 15 combinations of dhammas when they are written out in full as shown in
Table 5.5., in the Pucchāvāra the repeated combinations of dhammas are counted as
one. This is why we have 7 combinations of dhammas shown in Table 5.4. So, how do
we get from the 15 combinations to the 7 combinations in the canonical paṭṭhāna text?
It seems that the type of combinations used in the Paṭṭhāna is what in mathematics is
called ‘combinations without repetition’.

For example, the combinations of dhammas in row No. 4 and row No. 6 are the same, but the dhammas are in a reverse order.
Similarly, the dhammas in row No. 5 and row No. 8 are the same, but the way in which
these dhammas are combined is in a reverse order. Other repeated combinations are
found in row No. 7 and row No. 9. From row No. 10 to row No. 15 show different
combinations of the three dhammas. In this case, the repeated combinations are
counted as one. Thus, we find the row No. 10 of Table 5.5., i.e. skilful, unskilful and
indeterminate dhammas, in Table 5.4. We, thus, have the combinations of dhammas
without repetition. The implication then is the order of dhammas does not really
matter when finding possible arrangements of dhammas. There is a philosophical
implication of this: as long as required or right dhammas, as conditions, are present in
any order, their effects will arise. The combinations of dhammas in this way also imply
that a more complex, dynamic interaction exists within a cluster of dhammas, which
we examined in Chapter 1. This example, therefore, illustrates that the concept of
combination is in line with the concept of multiplicity of causes and effects (see 1.2.
and 1.3.).

In the above example, the combinations of dhammas are concerned with only
the triplets (tikadhamma). In the Dukapāṭṭhāna, combinations of dhammas are

---

588 In basic mathematics, combinations of objects are often discussed in terms of ‘with repetition’ or
‘without repetition’ (Pierce 2011).
concerned with only the duplets (dukadhammas) (see Figure 1.2.). In the later parts of the Patṭhāna, the triplets and duplets are combined in the Tikadukapaṭṭhāna and the Dukatikapaṭṭhāna. Then, the triplets and duplets are combined each other in pairs in the Tikatikapaṭṭhāna and the Dukadukapaṭṭhāna (1.3.3.). In these cases, we have more complex combinations of the dharmas because the number of different dharmas available for combinations increases. In the Tikatikapaṭṭhāna, for example, there are 6 dharmas available for combinations as two triplets are paired. For instance, the first triplet, i.e. the skilful triplet (kusala), and the second triplet, i.e. the feeling triplet (vedanā) are combined in the Tikatikapaṭṭhāna.

Throughout this chapter, we have explored various mathematical aspects of the paṭṭhāna from enumerations to combinations of conditions to combinations of dharmas. Based on this evidence, I would suggest that there are parallels between the mathematical aspects of the Patṭhāna and the mathematics of 'combinatorics'. One of the parallels between the mathematical aspects of the paṭṭhāna and the mathematics of combinatorics is this. When we are calculating all the possible questions relating to the skilful triplet (kusala) in relation to a single condition, i.e. 1176, we are essentially counting strategies to find the ways in which questions might be formulated for more complex conditional relationships involving combinations of conditions. On the basis of such number, i.e. 1176, we can solve the problem of finding the rest of questions. As mentioned in 1.3.3., the Burmese paṭṭhāna teachers have calculated the total numbers of questions possible on the basis of methods given in the commentary and sub-commentary of the Patṭhāna. It, therefore, seems that at least by the commentarial period, commentators might have attempted at working out strategies to find an optimal number of questions. On the basis of Burmese sources, we finally have the maximum numbers of questions that can be formulated. That is, the method in the Pañcappakaraṇa-āṭṭhakathā gives 404,948,544,248 questions,
while the calculation based on the *Pañcappakaraṇa-mūlaṭīkā* gives 388,778,713,344 questions (see 1.3.3).\(^{589}\)

Another parallel between the two is that both the *Paṭṭhāna* and mathematics of combinatorics deal with finite numbers of objects. Although we know that multiple combinations of *dhammas* and conditions are innumerably large, they are not infinite. This implies that the mathematics of the *Paṭṭhāna* deals with a finite set of *dhammas*. The finite set of *dhammas* in the case of the *Paṭṭhāna* has 266 individual *dhammas*, i.e. 22 triplets and 100 duplets \[22 \times 3 + 100 \times 2\] = 266 (see 1.3.3.). However, as mentioned in Chapter 1, the *Paṭṭhāna* not only has multiple sections but also uses numerous methods. Therefore, it would require more advanced mathematical models and technical knowledge in order to investigate more fully so that we can acquire a comprehensive understanding of the mathematical aspects of the *Paṭṭhāna*. This picture indicates the degree to which the *Abhidhamma* tradition from the earliest times dedicated advanced mathematics to understanding all the possible combinations of *dhammas* and the relationships between them. The practitioners of *Abhidhamma* applied the most sophisticated possible technology, i.e. the mathematics of combinatorics, to explore the depths of causality, which is not only the underlying doctrine of Buddhism but also the mechanism to be addressed in practical terms in pursuing the path to enlightenment (see Chapter 1). It therefore implies that advanced mathematics is being applied to the most important question of all: how to overcome causality and attain *nibbāna*.

---

\(^{589}\) Nandamedhā 2006: *dha’* and *ṇa’*. 
5.4. Summary

This chapter has explored various mathematical aspects of the Paṭṭhāna - from enumerations (saṅkhya) to finding a common set of dhammas to combinations of dhammas and conditions. The first section has examined the Saṅkhyaśāra exploring its subsections, namely the Suddhasaṅkhyā, Sabhāgasaṅkhyā, and the Ghaṭanāsaṅkhyā. We have seen also see the link between the Saṅkhyaśāra and the Vibhaṅgavāra. Based on the enumeration in the Sabhāgasaṅkhyā, and the Burmese pedagogical approaches to the Paṭṭhāna - i.e. the ayakauk technique and the 9 categories of conditions, we have traced the steps to find a common set of conditioning and conditioned states that can be related by a pair of conditions. I have suggested that finding the common set of dhammas is similar to finding an intersection between two different sets of objects. Therefore, it is related to the mathematics of set theory.

The final section has looked at the mathematical aspects of the Paṭṭhāna with a specific focus on combinations of dhammas and combinations of conditions. In particular, I have used the Pucchavāra of the skilful triplet, as a basis in order to identify patterns in the combinations of dhammas. In so doing, we have explored in some detail a step-by-step calculation of the total number of questions regarding the conditional relations between dhammas in the skilful triplet that can be related by a single condition. I have suggested that such a calculation is a first step in finding ways to calculate the maximum number of questions that can be formulated. Moreover, as we have observed, the Paṭṭhāna incorporates the notion of combinations in order to arrange finite sets of dhammas and conditions (paccayas). Thus, there are parallels between the mathematical aspects of the Paṭṭhāna and the mathematics of combinatorics.
At the outset I pointed out that little scholarly attention had been paid to Theravāda Abhidhamma and virtually none had been paid to the living tradition. In particular, the Paṭṭhāna, although regarded as the most profound of the abhidhamma canonical works and the text believed to be the embodiment of the Buddha’s omniscient wisdom, had been the subject of only a few articles since the seminal works of the Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw Ven. Nārada in the late 1960s and 1970s. This thesis therefore set out to contribute towards addressing this imbalance in Theravāda studies. Although Abhidhamma is often described as Theravāda philosophy, and is regarded as only relevant to scholasticism by many scholars, I illustrated a range of applications of Abhidhamma in Burmese Buddhism with specific examples, namely the study of the Abhidhamma by both monastics and laity, the production of abhidhamma texts, the incorporation or appropriation of abhidhamma understanding of body and mind in indigenous Burmese medical traditions, the use of Abhidhamma as efficacious ritual texts, and the application of Abhidhamma in meditation. The thesis therefore addressed not only the imbalance in the representation of Abhidhamma, but also the absence of discussions of its pervasive role beyond scholasticism in Buddhist practice, a subject previously only addressed to some extent in relation to meditation. In addition to reporting on the pervasive role of Abhidhamma in Burmese Buddhism, I proposed that there is an ongoing intensification of Abhidhamma culture in Burma, which informs and is informed by the ever-increasing popularity of the Paṭṭhāna amongst both monastics and laity. I noted the centrality and relevance of Abhidhamma in Burmese Buddhist culture and society throughout the long history of Burma to the present day. Here, I shall summarise the contribution to knowledge that I believe I have made in this thesis, the first thesis – to my knowledge – to focus on the Paṭṭhāna
both as an analytical system and a living practice. I shall first summarise the contributions of the individual chapters before drawing together the overall picture of the findings of this thesis.

In Chapter 1, I drew together different ways of explaining causality in Theravāda, looking at how the Patṭhāna provides a more complex, sophisticated and full explanation than found in the more familiar, more studied doctrines of kamma and dependent origination. I showed how these two more familiar doctrines relate to the Patṭhāna with specific examples drawn from the canonical paṭṭhāna texts. I used this comparative analysis to draw out implicit points in the doctrines of kamma and dependent origination, which are made explicit in the Patṭhāna. Although Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw provided a discussion of the Patṭhāna and the workings of the conditions in his translations of and guide to the Patṭhāna published in 1969, 1979 and 1981, this material remained difficult to access without prior knowledge. The chapter therefore sought to explain the fundamentals of the Patṭhāna, including the three main components of the Patṭhāna, i.e. the conditioning state (paccaya-dhamma), the conditioned state (paccayuppanna-dhamma) and the conditioning force (paccaya-satti), the overall structure of the entire Patṭhāna, and the four main methods (nayas) of the Patṭhāna. While Nyanatiloka, Karunaratne and Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw have described and explained the structure of the entire Patṭhāna, I showed its entire structure visually and discussed the main components of it at various points in the thesis. I use this detailed analysis of the fundamentals of the Patṭhāna in order to explain the doctrine of non-self with reference to the innumerable, complex conditional relations between dhammas. The interdependence and interconnectedness between these dhammas and the way they condition and are conditioned by each other is the focus of the Patṭhāna. Thus, the Patṭhāna is the focal teaching that clarifies the nuances of Theravāda philosophy, causality and the doctrine of non-self. Chapter
Chapter 2 demonstrated the fundamental and pervasive importance of the *Abhidhamma* within Burmese Buddhism historically and in the present. In particular, the chapter illustrated the pervasive and significant role of the *Paṭṭhāna* as the most potent *abhidhamma* text with efficacious power to protect oneself and others against threat. I thereby related the significance of the *Abhidhamma*, on the larger scale, to the sociopolitical context within which the role of *Paṭṭhāna* in defending sāsana, the Buddha’s religion, and the well-being of the nation is emphasised. I also pointed out that the establishment of a formalised, examination-orientated monastic education system in Burma and its strengthening since the Konbaung period had contributed to the ever-increasing popularity of the study of canonical and post-canonical *abhidhamma* texts. I then showed how the beliefs regarding the *Paṭṭhāna* as the great defence against the decline of Sāsana and the sociopolitical framework at the national level filter down into and are mutually informed by extensive religious practices at the local level by both monastics and laity. Such religious activities include protective chanting of the *Paṭṭhāna* – from the list of the 24 conditions to the whole of the *Paṭṭhāna* – individually and as a communal activity. Moreover, I analysed the Burmese understanding and conception of the efficacy of *paṭṭhāna* and the recitation of it with specific examples drawn from my fieldwork. In addition to documenting previously undocumented practices, this account overturns assumptions that the *Abhidhamma* is only relevant to scholasticism.
In Chapter 3, I documented a long history of *Abhidhamma* and *Paṭṭhāna* literature in Burma, not only from the Pagan period but much earlier, in the Pyu period, an era of *Abhidhamma* scholarship overlooked by most scholars in academic writing. I analysed the development of such literature into the modern period including the apparent shift from the Pāli composition to the use of Burmese in the 17th century. I also pointed out that the increased production of *abhidhamma* texts composed in Burmese since the 17th century coincided with the promotion of the *Pahtamapyan* examination, in which *abhidhamma* texts were prescribed, by Bodawhpaya. Through the inclusion of the *abhidhamma* texts in the monastic examination syllabuses since Bodawhpaya’s reign, the popularisation of *Abhidhamma* expanded beyond high level monastic study. I examined the prestige of such expertise in Burma and the significance attributed to it, referring to the development of various branches of *Abhidhamma* learning dedicated to their own innovative methods of analysis and teaching. I illustrated the nature of these with reference not only to specific works and authors, but also to the popular reputation of the cities most associated with those different branches. I examined specific works by well known *abhidhamma* teachers, including the lay *abhidhamma* teachers, in order to give a taste of the variety of approach. The chapter illustrated how *Abhidhamma* practitioners in Burma—past and present—have paid great attention to retaining traditional *Abhidhamma* expertise and approach, while at the same time being innovative in the methods of writing, presenting and studying the subject. I showed how these interpretative innovations related to different pedagogical methods explored in more detail later in the thesis.

While I introduced conditionality in Chapter 1, it is in Chapter 4 in the context of analysing the pedagogical methods that I provided a detailed explanation of the individual conditions themselves. I paid close attention to the conditioning states and
the conditioned states in specific conditional relations, and how these are understood to function in the *Paṭṭhāna*. I did this both to explore the conditionality at the heart of *Paṭṭhāna* and in order to illustrate how *Paṭṭhāna* analysis and synthesis related to pedagogical methods and applications. In particular, I presented the conditions and their varieties in accordance with the classification of the conditions that is used in the Burmese pedagogical methods, which aim to ease the memorisation and the study of the *Paṭṭhāna*. On the basis of observation and personal engagement in the living pedagogical traditions of Burmese *Paṭṭhāna* study, I explained in detail different methods of memorisation, recall and application. Drawing on my fieldwork, I gave examples of specific teaching sessions on such detailed knowledge in Burmese practices. I related the memorisation techniques applied in Burmese *Abhidhamma* to the existing literature on memory and mnemonics in classical and Buddhist cultures. I thereby provided the first detailed examination of Theravāda memorisation techniques as a living practice. This comparison highlighted important parallels between classical and Buddhist memorisation practices including the fundamental role played by reading out loud. It also highlighted intriguing close parallels in the language of memorisation in both classical and Buddhist traditions, language that relates memorisation to the consumption and digestion of food. Underlying this examination of the mnemonics, teaching methods and applications was an account of the increasing role played by the *Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha* in Burmese Buddhism since at least the Konbaung period. I documented a number of different ways the *Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha* has been used in *Paṭṭhāna* study.

Chapter 5 took the examination of the *Paṭṭhāna* conditionality and pedagogy to a new level of detail and analysis. For the first time, the *Paṭṭhāna* was examined here through analysis of the mathematics that lie at the heart of its fundamental structure, function and application. The chapter focused on the section of the *Paṭṭhāna* that is
explicitly about the mathematical approach, namely the Saṅkhyaśāstra, ‘enumeration section’, in the Pañhaśāstra, ‘investigation chapter’. I examined three types of mathematics at the core of the Paṭṭhāna, namely enumeration, combinatorics, and set theory. While showing how the enumeration section teaches the listing of the conditional relations from the simplest level to a more complex level, I explored how this system was necessary as the basis of the ‘saṅgaha’ or ‘synthesis’ of the entire Paṭṭhāna. It is this saṅgaha, and therefore the Paṭṭhāna that presents it, which acts as the culmination of the entire analytical and synthetical processing of reality that is the raison d'être of the Abhidhamma. For it is through enumeration and combinations that the Paṭṭhāna expounds the conditionally related dhammas to each other in the complex web that forms reality according to the Abhidhamma understanding of causality. My exploration of the mathematics underlying Paṭṭhāna suggests the ongoing use of mathematics such as the mathematics of combinatorics to explore the depths of causality, which is not only the underlying doctrine of Buddhism but also the mechanism to be addressed in practical terms in pursuing the path to enlightenment. Previously in academic writings on the Paṭṭhāna the relevance of mathematics was implied when referring to the impossibility of writing out all the possible conditional relations in the Paṭṭhāna. This is the first thesis to examine the mathematical aspect in any depth. In particular, I demonstrated a step-by-step calculation of the number of possible questions pertaining to the conditional relations at the simplest level. Furthermore, this study here was not confined to textual consideration, but rather extended the investigation to the use of these types of mathematics in the living pedagogical system of the Paṭṭhāna in modern Burmese Theravāda. Finally, I applied a form of reverse engineering to the Paṭṭhāna in order to examine the type of combinations and patterns being used and to explore how ābhidhammika experts applied mathematics to plumb the depths of causality. This
mathematical analysis demonstrated close parallels between the mathematics of the 
Paṭṭhāna and the mathematics of ‘combinatorics’.

Overall, I hope that this thesis has significantly expanded the picture of 
Abhidhamma and Paṭṭhāna in Buddhist studies. I have discussed Abhidhamma as an 
ongoing tradition at the heart of Burmese Theravāda. I have examined its early 
presence in Burma, the extensive writings produced over the centuries, and the 
development of a range of branches of interpretative and pedagogical methods. I have 
shown that Burmese Abhidhamma is both traditional and innovative. It is traditional as 
it takes as its focus the Pāli canonical and commentarial texts on Abhidhamma. It is 
innovative in developing new methods for dealing with the enormity of the scope of 
Abhidhamma, especially the scope of Paṭṭhāna. It is also innovative in its methods of 
hermeneutics and its techniques for memorising, teaching and learning. In this 
context, I showed that there are parallels between Abhidhamma systems of 
memorisation and those described in studies of memorisation in relation to classical 
literature. I have explored how the emphasis on Abhidhamma within Burmese 
ābhidhammikas has been influenced by sociopolitical conceptions, developments and 
institutions. I have suggested this has led to an ongoing ‘Abhidhamma-isation’. I have 
examined the fundamental significance of mathematics, analysing the types of 
mathematics being used, and myself experimenting with those mathematics to 
further understand the nature of Paṭṭhāna. On the one hand, I have pursued an in-
depth analysis of the Paṭṭhāna, for example, by providing a detailed account of how 
conditions relate and analysing the components of the conditional relations in detail. 
On the other hand, I have stood back from such detail in order to examine the place of 
the Paṭṭhāna in Burmese Buddhism more broadly. I have provided multiple 
exemplifications of its place and prestige within living Theravāda not only in the 
scholarly tradition but also in the acquisition of status, in support of meditation and
as a part of daily practice, including in a range of protective practices. When I first undertook the research to examine the *Paṭṭhāna* in Burma, I had some awareness of its pervasive roles and importance in Burmese Buddhism. The fieldwork, personal engagement and in-depth analysis that I have undertaken for my thesis, supported by ābhidhammika experts across the range of Burmese *Paṭṭhāna* traditions, has revealed to me the fundamental importance of the *Paṭṭhāna* in understanding the core doctrine of causality, the ways in which Theravāda had continued to address the philosophical and practical concerns over continuity and non-self, and the ongoing importance of *Paṭṭhāna* across all dimensions of Buddhist practice in Burma.
Appendix A: Transliteration and Transcription Systems

Table (1): The Pāli alphabet – based on the Critical Pāli Dictionary – used for the Pāli transliteration system

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vowels</th>
<th>a ā i ĩ u ū e o</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Consonants</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Velars</td>
<td>k, kh, g, gh, ṇ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Palatals</td>
<td>C, ch, j, ḍh, ṇ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retroflex</td>
<td>t, th, d, dh, ṇ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dentals</td>
<td>T, th, d, dh, ṇ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labials</td>
<td>P, ph, b, bh, m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Semivowels</td>
<td>Y, r, l, l, l, v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fricatives</td>
<td>s, h</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table (2): The Burmese alphabet used for the Burmese transcription system. Burmese characters and Roman equivalents are shown.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Burmese character</th>
<th>Roman character</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>က</td>
<td>ka’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ခ</td>
<td>hka’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ဂ</td>
<td>ga’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>င</td>
<td>nga’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>စ</td>
<td>sa’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ဆ</td>
<td>hsa’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ဇ</td>
<td>za’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ည</td>
<td>nya’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ဋ</td>
<td>ta’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burmese character</td>
<td>Roman character</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ဗ ူ ့ ၊</td>
<td>၏/ a’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ဗ ူ ၃ က</td>
<td>ခ a’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ဗ ူ င ာ</td>
<td>က ို hpa’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ဗ ူ ဝ ေ က</td>
<td>ာ ba’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ဗ ူ း</td>
<td>း ya’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ဗ ူ ဦ</td>
<td>ဦ ya’/ ra’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ဗ ူ ဧ</td>
<td>ဧ la’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ဗ ူ ဩ</td>
<td>ဩ wa’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ဗ ူ ဪ</td>
<td>ဪ tha’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ဗ ူ ါ</td>
<td>ါ ha’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ဗ ူ ာ</td>
<td>ာ a’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table (3): Burmese syllables using ဗ / a’

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Burmese</th>
<th>Roman</th>
<th>Burmese</th>
<th>Roman</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ဗ ူ ့</td>
<td>a’</td>
<td>ဗ ူ ့ က</td>
<td>eik</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ဗ ူ ့</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>ဗ ူ ့ က</td>
<td>i’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ဗ ူ ့</td>
<td>a”</td>
<td>ဗ ူ ့ က</td>
<td>i’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ဗ ူ ့ ကေ က</td>
<td>an’</td>
<td>ဗ ူ ့ ကေ က</td>
<td>i”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ဗ ူ ့ က က</td>
<td>an</td>
<td>ဗ ူ ့ က က</td>
<td>in’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ဗ ူ ့ က က</td>
<td>an”</td>
<td>ဗ ူ ့ က က</td>
<td>in</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ဗ ူ ့ က က</td>
<td>at</td>
<td>ဗ ူ ့ က က</td>
<td>in”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ဗ ူ ့ က က</td>
<td>aing’</td>
<td>ဗ ူ ့ က က</td>
<td>ik</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ဗ ူ ့ က က</td>
<td>aing</td>
<td>ဗ ူ ့ က က</td>
<td>aw’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burmese</td>
<td>Roman</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>၍က္မား</td>
<td>ein</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>၍က္မား</td>
<td>ein”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>၍က္မား</td>
<td>ein’</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>၍က္မား</td>
<td>ein</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>၍က္မား</td>
<td>ein”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>၍က္မား</td>
<td>ein’</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>၍က္မား</td>
<td>ein</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>၍က္မား</td>
<td>ein”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table (4): Examples of some Burmese syllables
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Burmese</th>
<th>Roman</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ျပ</td>
<td>pya’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ပြား</td>
<td>pwa”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table (5): Tone-markers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tone-markers</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Example</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>’</td>
<td>single raised comma</td>
<td>creaky tone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>”</td>
<td>double raised comma</td>
<td>heavy tone</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table (6): Spacing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Style</th>
<th>Convention</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Burmese style:</td>
<td>At discretion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Convention used here:</td>
<td>Syllables joined, with hyphens where necessary; sense-groups spacing - i.e. separating words from each other by space</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table (7): Romanization conventions used in the thesis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>System</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Name of monks</td>
<td>Pāli transliteration system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Title of books in the Pāli language</td>
<td>Pāli transliteration system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Title of books in the Burmese language or with Pāli loanwords</td>
<td>Burmese transcription system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name of places - i.e. towns, cities, villages</td>
<td>Burmese transcription system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name of monasteries in the Pāli language</td>
<td>Pāli transliteration system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name of monasteries in the Burmese language or with Pāli loanwords</td>
<td>Burmese transcription system</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix B: Survey questions identifying the conception, ritualistic usage and the scholastic study of the Paṭṭhāna
(In English and Burmese)

The questionnaire (in Burmese) was distributed to monks, nuns, lay Paṭṭhāna teachers and students at chosen Buddhist institutions, and a few people who are not associated with any Buddhist institutions.

*********

Survey Questions for PhD Thesis at University of London

All information including your personal identity will be non-anonymised. If you want to anonymise any information, please indicate by putting a bracket on the question number.

Aim of the research: This study aims to explore how the Paṭṭhāna is used and studied by Burmese Buddhists in their Buddhist practices and what are the reasons.

1. Name of informant:

2. Name of organisation:

3. Post in the organisation: Educational qualifications:

4. Gender: Male ☐ Female ☐ Age: (Vāsa-age: ) Ethnicity:

5. Do you chant the 24 conditions – i.e. Paccayu-niddesa, or the pyit-sa-ya-neik-deidha – i.e. Paccaya-niddesa, or the longer version of Paṭṭhāna? If yes, how often do you chant?

6. When did you begin the chanting practice of the Paṭṭhāna? Why did you start this practice?

7. Have your reasons for chanting it changed overtime? Please explain your reasons.
8. Do you think chanting the Paṭṭhāna creates benefits for you? If yes, what are the benefits? If no, what are the reasons for your answer?

9. The Paṭṭhāna is known to be powerful, tanhko"kya"thi and nat-kyi"thi. In your opinion, what are the reasons that make the Paṭṭhāna powerful?

10. How do you understand the word Paṭṭhāna?

11. Have you ever participated in the ‘uninterrupted chanting ceremony of Paṭṭhāna’, also called a-than-ma-se"pa-htan"pwae? If yes, in what ways did you participate?

12. How often are these chanting ceremonies held in your area?

13. Have you ever donated or sponsored (dāna) any of these chanting ceremonies in your area? How much did you spend?

14. What are the reasons for doing such dāna (ahlu)?

15. Do you know of books, or audio sources or booklets on Paṭṭhāna? Please list your favourite.

16. Have you ever attended Abhidhamma classes or Paṭṭhāna classes? If yes, where did you attend and who was/were the teacher/s?

17. What are the reasons for attending these classes?

18. Do you think you have benefited from these classes? If yes, what are the benefits? If no, what are the reasons?

19. What do you think of the method(s) used in learning the Paṭṭhāna? Please give the advantages and disadvantages of the method(s).

20. Have you ever taught the Paṭṭhāna? If so, where and when have you taught?

21. Which books or whose method do you use?

22. What are the reasons for your choice of this teaching method?

23. Are there any issues you think I should have a look at concerning Paṭṭhāna chanting, Paṭṭhāna study and Paṭṭhāna usage in Burma? If so, what would be the issues?
Survey Questions for PhD Thesis at University of London

All information including your personal identity will be non-anonymised. If you want to anonymise any information, please indicate by putting a bracket on the question number.

1. Name -
2. Department/Division -
3. Employment/Title/
4. College/Institute/Department -
5. Date - (must be) Due by

Please ensure that all sections are completed to the best of your ability.

**********
၆. ဘယ္အခ်ိန္ကစ၍ပူးပေါ်ဇာမ်ားကိုပြလုပ္ခဲ့ပါသည်။မည္သည့္အကာင္းျကာစတင်ပြလုပ္ခဲ့ပါသည်။

၇. ပူးပေါ်ကိုပူးသည့္အခ်ိန္ၾကာလာတာႏွင့္အမွ်ပူးသည့္အေၾကာင္းအရင္းေျပာင္းလဲမႈရိွပါသလား။ဘယ္လိုေျပာင္းလဲသည္ဆိုတာေဖာ္ျပေပါ။

၈. ပူးနြတ္ဖတ္ပူးသည္သည္သင့္အတြက္အက်ဳိးေက်းဇူးမ်ားရရွိသည္ဟုယူဆပါသလား။မည္သည့္အက်ဳိးေက်းဇူးသက္ေရာက္မႈမရိွဟုယူဆပါကအဘယ္အေၾကာင္းေၾကာင့္ထိုသို႔ထင္ပါသနည္း။

၉. ပူးတရာ္ျမတ္သည္တန္ခိုးႀကီးသည္၊နတ္ႀကီးသည္ဟုေျပာေလ့ရိွပါသည္။မည္သည့္အေၾကာင္းေၾကာင့္တန္ခိုးႀကီးသည္၊နတ္ႀကီးသည္ဟုသင္ယူဆပါသနည္း။

၂၀၁၄. "ပူး"ဆိုတဲ့စကားကိုအသင္မည္သို႔နားလည္ပါသနည္း။

၁၂. အသံမစဲပူးပြဲမ်ားတြင္အသင္လုပ္အားျဖင့္ပါဝင္ကူညီေပးဖူးပါသလား။ဘယ္လိုနားရာ(သို႔)ဘယ္လိုတာဝန္မ်ဳိးယူၿပီးကူညီေပးခဲ့ရပါသလဲ။

၁၃. အသံမစဲပူးပြဲမ်ားတြင္အသင္ေငြအားျဖင့္အလႉဒါနမ်ားျပဳလုပ္ဖူးပါသလား။မည္မွ်ေလာက္အလႉေငြထည့္ခဲ့ပါသနည္း။

၁၄. မည္သည့္အေၾကာင္းေၾကာင့္ပူးပြဲမ်ားတြင္အလႉဒါနျပဳလုပ္ပါသနည္း။

၁၅. သင္သိေသာပူးတရာ္ျမတ္တြင္ချင်သူးစာအုပ္၊စာေစာင္၊တရာ္ျမ်ားကိုေဖာ္ျပေပါ။

၁၆. အဘိဓမၼာစာဝါ/သင္တန္း(သို႔)ပူးစာဝါ/သင္တန္းမ်ားကိုအသင္တက္ဖူးပါသလား။တက္ဖူးသည္ဆိုပါကဘယ္မွာတက္ေရာက္ခဲ့ပါသနည္း။

၁၇. မည္သည့္အေၾကာင္းမ်ားေၾကာင့္ထိုစာဝါ/သင္တန္းမ်ားကိုတက္ေရာက္ခဲ့ပါသနည္း။
၁၈။ ထိုစာဝါ / သင္တန္းမ်ားက သင့္အတြက္ အက်ဳိးေက်းဇူးမ်ား ရေစသည္ဟု ယူဆပါသလား။

မည့္ အက်ဳိးေက်းဇူးမ်ား ရရွိေစသည္ဟု ထင္ပါသနည္း။

၁၉။ ပ႒ာန္းတရာ္ျမတ္ကို ေလ့လာရာတြင္ အသံုးျပဳေသာ သင္ၾကားနည္းစနစ္မ်ားကို အသင္ ဘယ္လိုယူဆပါသနည္း။

ထိုသင္ၾကားနည္းစနစ္မ်ား၏ ေကာင္းခ်က္၊ ဆိုးခ်က္မ်ားကို ေဖာ္ျပေပးပါ။

၂၀။ အသင္ ပ႒ာန္းတရာ္ျမတ္ႀကီးကို အျခားသူမ်ားအား သင္ၾကားေပးဖူး ပါသလား။

ဘယ္ေနရာ ႏွင့္ ဘယ္အခ်ိန္က သင္ၾကားေပး ဖူးပါသနည္း။

၂၁။ အသင္ ပ႒ာန္းတရာ္ျမတ္ႀကီးကို သင္ၾကားရာတြင္ မည့္ စာအုပ္၊ မူ ကိုအသံုးျပဳပါ သနည္း။

၂၂။ မည့္ အေၾကာင္းအရာမ်ား ထိုမူကို သင္အသံုးျပဳပါ သနည္း။

၂၃။ ယခုေမးခြန္းမ်ား ႏွင့္တကြ ကၽြန္မ၏ စာတမ္း အတြက္ အေထာက္အကူျပဳမည့္ အေၾကာင္းအရာမ်ားရွိသည္ဟု ထင္ပါက ေဖာ္ျပေပးပါ။
Appendix C: Details of Informants

Anthropological research method is one of the methods employed in this thesis. The following table shows brief ethnographic data gleaned during my fieldwork. There are a total of 71 informants, including well known Hsayadaws. These prominent Hsayadaws are shown by their ordination names and titles. Apart from these Hsayadaws, I have maintained anonymity of other informants. Some informants, e.g. LM1, LM2, and LW6, did not provide full information, and thus blank cells reflect unavailability of the data.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code/Name</th>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>Place</th>
<th>Position/Job</th>
<th>Educational qualifications</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Age (vāsa)</th>
<th>Ethnic</th>
<th>Dates of Interview/Contact</th>
<th>Methods of Contact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Bamaw Hsayadaw Ven. Dr. U Kumārabhivamaśa</td>
<td>Bamaw Pariyatti Sathintaik</td>
<td>Mandalay</td>
<td>The Chairman of the State Saṅgha Mahānāyaka Committee</td>
<td>D.Litt., B.A. and M.A. in Buddhism; Saṅghaṭaṃsaxa (The Crown of the Dhamma Teachers of the Sakyasīha)</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>83 (63)</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>23/12/2011</td>
<td>Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Rector Hsayadaw Ven. Dr. U Nandāmalābhivamsa</td>
<td>The International Theravāda Buddhist Missionary University (ITBMU)</td>
<td>Yangon</td>
<td>The Rector of ITBMU</td>
<td>M.A. and Ph.D. in Buddhism</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>73 (53)</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>Oct 2011 – Sept 2012</td>
<td>Participant-observation and interviews</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The In&quot;sein Hsayadaw Ven. U Tilokābhivaṃsa</td>
<td>In&quot;sein Ywama Pariyatti Sathintaik</td>
<td>Yangon Abbot</td>
<td>Sakyasīhadhammācariyavaṭāṃsakā (The Crown of the Dhamma Teachers of the Sakyasiha)</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>75 (55)</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>April 2011 – Sept 2013</td>
<td>Participant-observation and interviews</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Tipiṭaka Hsayadaw Ven. U Silakkhandhābhivaṃsa</td>
<td>Nikae Kyaungtaik</td>
<td>Yangon Tipiṭakadhāra and Abbot</td>
<td>Tipiṭakakovidā Tipiṭakadhara Dhammabhaṃḍāgarīka (Holder and Expert of the Tipitaka and the Dhamma Treasure)</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>49 (29)</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>24/02/2012</td>
<td>Interview</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ven. U Paṇḍita</td>
<td>Pa-ḥtan” Theikpan Sathintaik</td>
<td>Sagaing Paṭṭhāna teacher and Abbot</td>
<td>(Has not done any type of examinations.)</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>July 2010 and 26/11/2011</td>
<td>Interviews</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Tipiṭaka Hsayadaw Ven. U Abhijātābhivamṣa</td>
<td>Subhodārāma Pariyatti Sathintaik</td>
<td>Sagaing</td>
<td>Tipiṭakadhāra and Abbot</td>
<td>Tipiṭakakovida Tipiṭakadhara Dhammabhaṇḍāgarika (Holder and Expert of the Tipiṭaka and the Dhamma Treasure)</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>34 (14)</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>06/02/2012</td>
<td>Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M1</td>
<td>Yankin Taung</td>
<td>Mandalay</td>
<td>Abbot</td>
<td>Sāsanadhajadhammācariya (B.A. in Buddhism)</td>
<td>M</td>
<td></td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>16/01/2011</td>
<td>Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M2</td>
<td>Pajjodārāma Pariyatti Sathintaik</td>
<td>Monywa</td>
<td>Paṭṭhāna teacher</td>
<td>Sāsanadhajadhammācariya (B.A. in Buddhism)</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>46 (26)</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>06/01/2012</td>
<td>Participant-observation, interview, and questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M3</td>
<td>Visuddhārāma Bārāṇasī Pariyatti Sathintaik</td>
<td>Pyay</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>Sāsanadhajadhammācariya (B.A. in Buddhism)</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>65 (45)</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>01/12/2011</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M4</td>
<td>Jotikārāma Pariyatti Sathintaik</td>
<td>Pyay</td>
<td>Teacher/Assistant Abbot (Member of the State Saṅgha Council)</td>
<td>Sirīṇavaradhammācariya, Vinayapālipāragū (B.A. in Buddhism, M.A. in Vinaya)</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>66 (46)</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>12/12/2011</td>
<td>Interview and questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ID</td>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Position</td>
<td>Language</td>
<td>Region</td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M5</td>
<td>Jotikārāma Pariyatti Sathintaik</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>63 (43)</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>Teacher (Member of Pyay Saṅgha committee)</td>
<td>12/12/2011</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M6</td>
<td>Visuddhārāma Bārāṇaśī Pariyatti Sathintaik</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>70 (50)</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>12/12/2011</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M7</td>
<td>Visuddhārāma Bārāṇaśī Pariyatti Sathintaik</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>37 (17)</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>Administrator/Manager of kitchen</td>
<td>12/12/2011</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M8</td>
<td>Visuddhārāma Bārāṇaśī Pariyatti Sathintaik</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>52 (32)</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>Member of Pyay Saṅgha Committee</td>
<td>12/12/2011</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M9</td>
<td>Jotikārāma Pariyatti Sathintaik</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>52 (32)</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>12/12/2011</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M10</td>
<td>Jotikārāma Pariyatti Sathintaik</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>33 (14)</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>12/12/2011</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M11</td>
<td>Myasetkya Pariyatti Sathintaik</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>22 (3)</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>Student</td>
<td>28/02/2012</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Occupation</td>
<td>Qualification</td>
<td>Age</td>
<td>Language</td>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Type</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M12</td>
<td>Myasetkya Pariyatti Sathintaik</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Student</td>
<td>Higher level at Pahtamapyan Examinations (10&lt;sup&gt;th&lt;/sup&gt; Standard with 5 distinctions at State school)</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>22 (2)</td>
<td>28/02/2012</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M13</td>
<td>Myasetkya Pariyatti Sathintaik</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Student</td>
<td>Higher level at Pahtamapyan Examinations</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>23 (2)</td>
<td>28/02/2012</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M14</td>
<td>Myasetkya Pariyatti Sathintaik</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Student</td>
<td>Sāsanadhajadhammācariya (B.A. in Buddhism)</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>39 (19)</td>
<td>28/02/2012</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M15</td>
<td>Myasetkya Pariyatti Sathintaik</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>Sāsanadhajadhammācariya (B.A. in Buddhism) + Thamanay-kyaw</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>28 (8)</td>
<td>28/02/2012</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M16</td>
<td>Myasetkya Pariyatti Sathintaik</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>Sāsanadhajadhammācariya (B.A. in Buddhism) + B.A. in English</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>27 (7)</td>
<td>28/02/2012</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M17</td>
<td>The International Theravāda Buddhist Missionary University (ITBMU)</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Assistant Lecturer</td>
<td>Sāsanadhajadhammācariya (B.A. in Buddhism) + M.A. in Buddhist Studies</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>39 (19)</td>
<td>19/03/2011</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Location</td>
<td>Position</td>
<td>Examinations</td>
<td>Age</td>
<td>Language</td>
<td>Period</td>
<td>Method</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N1</td>
<td>Sakyadhītā Thilashin Sathintaik</td>
<td>Sagaing</td>
<td>Assistant Abbess/Abhidhamma teacher</td>
<td>Higher level at Pahtamapyan Examinations</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>47 (34)</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>Oct 2011–Sept 2012</td>
<td>Participant-observation and interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N3</td>
<td>Sakyadhītā Thilashin Sathintaik</td>
<td>Sagaing</td>
<td>Student/Assistant teacher</td>
<td>Dhammācariya</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>29 (15)</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>29/11/2011</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N4</td>
<td>Sakyadhītā Thilashin Sathintaik</td>
<td>Sagaing</td>
<td>Student/Assistant teacher</td>
<td>Dhammācariya</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>29 (11)</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>30/11/2011</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N5</td>
<td>Sakyadhītā Thilashin Sathintaik</td>
<td>Sagaing</td>
<td>Student/Assistant teacher</td>
<td>Higher level at Pahtamapyan Examinations Third level at Thilashin-kyaw Examinations</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>27 (12)</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>Oct 2011–Sept 2012</td>
<td>Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N6</td>
<td>Yangon</td>
<td>Yangon</td>
<td>Student</td>
<td>Higher level at Pahtamapyan Examinations</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>22 (8)</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>21/05/2011</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N7</td>
<td>Taw-taik Da-ma-yeik-tha Kyaung-taik</td>
<td>Yangon</td>
<td>Student</td>
<td>Higher level at Pahtamapyan Examinations, B.A. (Myanmar), B.A. (Buddhist Studies)</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>33 (5)</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>24/05/2011</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Institution/University</td>
<td>Position</td>
<td>Qualification</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Age</td>
<td>Nationality</td>
<td>Date of Interview</td>
<td>Method of Data Collection</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LM1</td>
<td>International Institution of Abhidhamma (IIA)</td>
<td>Co-founder/ Pro Rector (Retired Ambassador)</td>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>June 2012 – August 2012</td>
<td>Participant-observation and interview</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LM2</td>
<td>The International Theravāda Buddhist Missionary University (ITBMU)</td>
<td>Professor</td>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>18/12/2011</td>
<td>Interview</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LM3</td>
<td>Abhidhamma Propagation Association (APA)</td>
<td>Teaching and Examinations Coordinator, and Abhidhamma teacher</td>
<td>B.Sc (Chemistry)</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>Nov 2011 – Sept 2012</td>
<td>Interview, and questionnaire</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LM4</td>
<td>Abhidhamma Propagation Association (APA)</td>
<td>Account and Abhidhamma teacher</td>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>28/01/2012</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LM5</td>
<td>Abhidhamma Propagation Association (APA)</td>
<td>Abhidhamma teacher</td>
<td>B.Sc (Geology)</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>12/12/2011</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Code</td>
<td>Institution/Group</td>
<td>Location</td>
<td>Role</td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Age</td>
<td>Race</td>
<td>Date Range</td>
<td>Methodology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LM6</td>
<td>Abhidhamma Propagation Association (APA)</td>
<td>Yangon</td>
<td>Chairman</td>
<td>10th Standard</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>Dec 2011 – Jan 2012</td>
<td>Interview and questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LM7</td>
<td>T.care Dental Clinic</td>
<td>Yangon</td>
<td>Security</td>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>17/12/2011</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LM8</td>
<td></td>
<td>Yangon</td>
<td>Businessman</td>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>Chinese</td>
<td>17/12/2011</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LM9</td>
<td>Myanmar Export &amp; Import</td>
<td>Yangon</td>
<td>Assistant Manager (Retired)</td>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>17/12/2011</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LM10</td>
<td></td>
<td>Yangon</td>
<td>Retired</td>
<td>10th Standard</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>20/10/2011</td>
<td>Interview and questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LW1</td>
<td>Millionaire Group</td>
<td>Yangon</td>
<td>Managing Director</td>
<td>B.Sc. (Physics)</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>Burman-Chinese</td>
<td>July 2010</td>
<td>Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LW3</td>
<td>Abhidhamma Propagation Association (APA)</td>
<td>Yangon</td>
<td>Abhidhamma student</td>
<td>B.A. (Law) LL.B</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>Feb 2012 – Sept 2012</td>
<td>Interview and questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LW4</td>
<td>Abhidhamma Propagation Association (APA)</td>
<td>Yangon</td>
<td>Abhidhamma student</td>
<td>B.Sc.</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>Feb 2012 – Sept 2012</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LW5</td>
<td>Abhidhamma Propagation Association (APA)</td>
<td>Yangon</td>
<td>Abhidhamma student</td>
<td>B.Sc. (Zoo)</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>Feb 2012 – Sept 2012</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LW6</td>
<td>Abhidhamma Propagation Association (APA)</td>
<td>Yangon</td>
<td>Abhidhamma student</td>
<td></td>
<td>F</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>17/12/2011</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LW8</td>
<td>Maṅgala Byūhā Association and ITBMU</td>
<td>Yangon</td>
<td>Abhidhamma teacher</td>
<td>B.Sc (Maths), M.A. (Buddhist Studies)</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>Dec 2011 – Sept 2012</td>
<td>Participant-observation, interview, and questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LW9</td>
<td>Abhidhamma Propagation Association (APA)</td>
<td>Yangon</td>
<td>Abhidhamma teacher</td>
<td>B.A. (Myanmar)</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>28/01/2012</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LW10</td>
<td>Abhidhamma Propagation Association (APA)</td>
<td>Yangon</td>
<td>Abhidhamma student</td>
<td>B.Sc</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>28/01/2012</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LW11</td>
<td>Abhidhamma Propagation Association (APA)</td>
<td>Yangon</td>
<td>Abhidhamma teacher</td>
<td>B.A. Dip. Education</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>28/01/2012</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LW12</td>
<td>University of Pyay</td>
<td>Pyay</td>
<td>Associate Professor of Chemistry</td>
<td>M.Sc.</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>12/12/2011</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LW13</td>
<td>Association of Protective Chanting (Yankin)</td>
<td>Yangon</td>
<td>Dependent</td>
<td></td>
<td>F</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>Chinese</td>
<td>17/12/2011</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LW14</td>
<td>Ministry of Health</td>
<td>Yangon</td>
<td>Retired</td>
<td>B.Sc.</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>17/12/2011</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LW15</td>
<td></td>
<td>Pyay</td>
<td>Novelist</td>
<td>9th Standard</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>12/12/2011</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LW17</td>
<td>Myat-ratana Dhamma School</td>
<td>Yangon</td>
<td>Abhidhamma student</td>
<td>10th Standard</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>02/11/2011</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LW18</td>
<td>Myat-ratana Dhamma School</td>
<td>Yangon</td>
<td>Abhidhamma student</td>
<td>B.A. (Eco.)</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>02/11/2011</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LW19</td>
<td>Myat-ratana Dhamma School</td>
<td>Yangon</td>
<td>Abhidhamma teacher</td>
<td>MB.BS (Mandalay Med. School), Ph.D.</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>02/11/2011</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Code</td>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Place</td>
<td>Position</td>
<td>Degree</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Age</td>
<td>Language</td>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Type</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LW20</td>
<td>Myat-ratana Abhidhamma School</td>
<td>Yangon</td>
<td>Student</td>
<td>B.A. (History)</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>02/11/2011</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LW21</td>
<td>Myat-ratana Abhidhamma School</td>
<td>Yangon</td>
<td>Student</td>
<td>B.Sc (Chemistry)</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>02/11/2011</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LW22</td>
<td>Myat-ratana Abhidhamma School</td>
<td>Yangon</td>
<td>Student</td>
<td>M.Sc.</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>02/11/2011</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LW23</td>
<td>Ministry of Health</td>
<td>Yangon</td>
<td>Retired</td>
<td>M.A.</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>26/05/2011</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LW24</td>
<td>University of Lwaing-kaw</td>
<td>Yangon</td>
<td>Retired</td>
<td>10th Standard</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>24/05/2011</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LW25</td>
<td></td>
<td>Yangon</td>
<td>Retired</td>
<td>B.A. (History)</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>30/11/2011</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LW26</td>
<td>Pa Pa Kyaw Trading</td>
<td>Mandalay</td>
<td>Businesswoman</td>
<td></td>
<td>F</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>29/07/2012</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LW27</td>
<td>High School 10 (Mandalay)</td>
<td>Mandalay</td>
<td>High school teacher</td>
<td>B.A.</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>Burman</td>
<td>29/07/2012</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Appendix D: A List of selected Abhidhamma teachers mentioned in the thesis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Honourific Title</th>
<th>Ordination Name</th>
<th>Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Taungbila Hsayadaw</td>
<td>Ashin Munindaghosa</td>
<td>1579-1652</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nan&quot;kyuang Hsayadaw (aka) Myouk-kyuang Hsayadaw</td>
<td>Ashin Aggadhamma</td>
<td>c. 1598-?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taung-bi&quot;lu&quot; Hsayadaw</td>
<td>Ashin Anantadhaja</td>
<td>?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Htan&quot;ta-bin Hsayadaw (aka) Bodhi Kyaung Hsayadaw</td>
<td>Ashin Nandamedha</td>
<td>c. 1708</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The&quot;in&quot;thathana-paing</td>
<td>Ashin Sūriya</td>
<td>1782-1819</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dok-hlan&quot; Hsayadaw (The first)</td>
<td>Ashin Candamālā</td>
<td>1823-?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U Hpo Hlaing</td>
<td></td>
<td>1829-1883</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ledi Hsayadaw</td>
<td>Ashin Nāṇa</td>
<td>1846-1923</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hsaya-gyi U Ohn</td>
<td>Ashin Adicca</td>
<td>1846-1925</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mo&quot;hynin&quot; Hsayadaw</td>
<td>U Sumana</td>
<td>1873-1964</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Masoyein Hsayadaw</td>
<td>Ashin Sūriyābhivaṃsa</td>
<td>1880-1957</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mula'Pa-htan&quot; Hsayadaw</td>
<td>Ashin Nārada</td>
<td>1898-1983</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pa-htan&quot; Hsayadaw (Masoyein)</td>
<td>Ashin Visuddhābhivaṃsa</td>
<td>1899-1961</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mogok Hsayadaw</td>
<td>U Vimala</td>
<td>1899-1962</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mahagandayon Hsayadaw (aka) Taung Myo'Hsayadaw (aka) Bhāsā-ṭīkā Hsayadaw</td>
<td>Ashin Janakābhivaṃsa</td>
<td>1900-1977</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pa-htan&quot; Theikpan Hsayadaw</td>
<td>Ashin Indaka</td>
<td>1903-1988</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pa-htan&quot; Daw Khin Myint</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>1909-1982</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tipitakadhāra Mingun Hsayadaw</td>
<td>U Vicittābhivaṃsa</td>
<td>1911-1993</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saddhammaransī Hsayadaw</td>
<td>Ashin Kuṇḍalabhivaṃsa</td>
<td>1921-2011</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bamaw Hsayadaw, (9th)</td>
<td>Ashin Kumārābhivaṃsa</td>
<td>1930-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pa-Auk Hsayadaw</td>
<td>Ashin Āciṇṇa</td>
<td>1934-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In&quot;sein Hsayadaw</td>
<td>Ashin Tilokābhivaṃsa</td>
<td>1938-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Ashin Nandamālābhivaṃsa</td>
<td>1940-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunlun Tipiṭaka Hsayadaw</td>
<td>Ashin Sunadara</td>
<td>1955-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shwe Sin Tipiṭaka Hsayadaw</td>
<td>Dr. U Gandhamālālaṅkāra</td>
<td>1968-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix E: The fourfold classification of dhammas on the basis of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha.

Classification of citta-dhamma
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total Cittas</th>
<th>Mundane Cittas</th>
<th>Rootless Cittas</th>
<th>Skilful Cittas</th>
<th>Resultant Cittas</th>
<th>Functional Cittas</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>89</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cittas</td>
<td>Rootless Cittas</td>
<td>Skilful Cittas</td>
<td>Resultant Cittas</td>
<td>Functional Cittas</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sense-realm citta (kāmāvacara-citta)</td>
<td>12 unskilful citta (akusala-citta)</td>
<td>8 citta rooted in greed (lobhamūla-citta)</td>
<td>2 citta rooted in hatred (dosamūla-citta)</td>
<td>2 citta rooted in delusion (mohamūla-citta)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>18 rootless citta (ahetuka-citta)</td>
<td>7 unwholesome resultant citta (akusalavipāka-citta)</td>
<td>8 wholesome resultant citta (kusalavipāka-citta)</td>
<td>3 rootless functional citta (ahetukakiriya-citta)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-sense realm citta (mahaggata-citta)</td>
<td>24 beautiful sense-sphere citta (kāmāvacara-sobhana-citta)</td>
<td>8 skilful citta (kulasa-citta)</td>
<td>8 resultant citta (vipāka-citta)</td>
<td>8 functional citta (kriyā-citta)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>15 material realm citta (rūpāvacara-citta)</td>
<td>5 skilful citta (kulasa-citta)</td>
<td>5 resultant citta (vipāka-citta)</td>
<td>5 functional citta (kriyā-citta)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>12 immaterial realm citta (arūpāvacara-citta)</td>
<td>4 skilful citta (kulasa-citta)</td>
<td>4 resultant citta (vipāka-citta)</td>
<td>4 functional citta (kriyā-citta)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Path citta (magga-citta)</td>
<td>path citta of stream entry (sotāpatti-maggacitta)</td>
<td>path citta of one-returning (sakadāgāmi-maggacitta)</td>
<td>path citta of non-returning (anāgāmi-maggacitta)</td>
<td>path citta of arhatship (arahatta-maggacitta)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4 ‘fruit’ (= culmination) citta (phala-citta)</td>
<td>fruit citta of stream entry (sotāpatti-phalacitta)</td>
<td>fruit citta of one-returning (sakadāgāmi-phalacitta)</td>
<td>fruit citta of non-returning (anāgāmi-phalacitta)</td>
<td>fruit citta of arhatship (arahatta-phalacitta)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Classification of Cetasika-Dhamma

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>13 Ethically Variable Cetasika</th>
<th>14 Unskillful Cetasika</th>
<th>25 Beautiful Cetasika</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>(aññasamāna-cetasika)</em></td>
<td><em>(akusala-cetasika)</em></td>
<td><em>(sobhana-cetasika)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contact (phassa)</td>
<td>Delusion (mohā)</td>
<td>Faith (saddhā)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feeling (vedanā)</td>
<td>Shamelessness (ahirika)</td>
<td>Mindfulness (sati)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perception (saññā)</td>
<td>Fearlessness of doing wrong (anottappa)</td>
<td>Shame (hiri)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Volition (cetanā)</td>
<td>Restlessness (uddhacca)</td>
<td>Fear of doing wrong (ottappa)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One-pointedness (ekaggatā)</td>
<td>Greed (lobha)</td>
<td>Non-greed (alobha)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Life faculty (mental aspect of ensuring of the continuity of life) (jivitindriya)</td>
<td>Wrong view (diṭṭhi)</td>
<td>Non-hatred (adosa)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attention (manasikāra)</td>
<td>Conceit (māna)</td>
<td>Neutrality of mind (tatramajjhantatā)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initial application (vitakka)</td>
<td>Hatred (dosa)</td>
<td>Tranquillity of mental body (kāyapassaddhi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sustained application (vicāra)</td>
<td>Envy (issā)</td>
<td>Tranquillity of consciousness (cittapassaddhi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decision (adhimokkha)</td>
<td>Avarice (macchariya)</td>
<td>Lightness of mental body (kāyalahutā)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Energy (vīriya)</td>
<td>Worry (kukkucca)</td>
<td>Lightness of consciousness (cittalahutā)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zest/delight (pīti)</td>
<td>Sloth (thīna)</td>
<td>Malleability of mental body (kāyamudutā)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Desire (chanda)</td>
<td>Torpor (middha)</td>
<td>Malleability of consciousness (cittamudutā)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>6 Particular Cetasika</th>
<th>8 Decision and Evaluation Cetasika</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>(pakīṇṇaka-cetasika)</em></td>
<td><em>(siddhi-cetasika)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doubt (vicikicchā)</td>
<td>Wieldiness of mental body (kāyakammaññatā)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wieldiness of consciousness (cittakammaññatā)</td>
<td>Proficiency of mental body (kāyapāguññatā)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proficiency of consciousness (cittapāguññatā)</td>
<td>Rectitude of mental body (kāyujukatā)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rectitude of consciousness (cittujukatā)</td>
<td>Right speech (sammāvācā)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Right action (sammākammanta)</td>
<td>Right livelihood (sammā-ājīva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compassion (karuṇā)</td>
<td>Appreciative joy (muditā)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wisdom faculty (paññā)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Classification of rūpa-dhamma

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rūpa group</th>
<th>Name of rūpa dhamma</th>
<th>Numbers of rūpa</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Concretely produced matter (nipphannarūpa)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The great elements (mahābhūta)</td>
<td>earth (pathavī), water (āpo), heat (tejo), air (vāya)</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The sense organs (pasādarūpa)</td>
<td>eye (cakkhu), ear (sota), nose (ghāna), tongue (jivhā), body (kāya)</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The sense objects (gocararūpa)</td>
<td>visible form (rūpa), sound (sadda), smell (gandha), taste (rasa), {tangibility is analysed further into earth, heat, air and thus is not enumerated here separately}</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The gender distinctions (bhāvarūpa)</td>
<td>femininity (itthibhāva), masculinity (pumbhāva)</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The physical base of the mind</td>
<td>heart-base (hadayarūpa)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The physical aspect of ensuring the continuity of life</td>
<td>life faculty (jivitindriya)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The sustenance</td>
<td>nutriment (kabajiṅkārāhāra)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-concretely produced matter (anipphanna rūpa)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The matter of limitation</td>
<td>space (ākāsadhātu)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The aspects of communication (viññattirūpa)</td>
<td>bodily intimation (kāyaviññatti), vocal intimation (vacīviññatti)</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The mutable phenomena (vikārarūpa)</td>
<td>lightness (lahutā), malleability (mudutā), wieldiness (kammaññatā)</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The characteristics of materiality (lakkhānarūpa)</td>
<td>production (upacaya), continuity (santati), decay (jaratā), impermanence (aniccatā)</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total numbers of rūpa</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>28</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix F: 49 varieties of conditions and the 9 categories of conditions as given in the commentary of the Paṭṭhāna

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>49 conditions (paccayas)</th>
<th>8 leading conditions</th>
<th>9 categories of conditions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>object (ārammaṇa)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>predominance-object (ārammanaḍhipati)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>object-decisive support (ārammanūpanissaya)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>object-pre-nascence (ārammaṇapurejāta)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>object-pre-nascence-presence (ārammaṇapurejātatthi)</td>
<td>OBJECT (ĀRMMAṆA)</td>
<td>OBJECT (ĀRMMAṆA)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>object-pre-nascence-non-disappearance (ārammaṇapurejāta-avigata)</td>
<td>OBJECT (ĀRMMAṆA)</td>
<td>OBJECT (ĀRMMAṆA)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>base-object-pre-nascence-support (vatthārammaṇa-purejāta-nissaya)</td>
<td>OBJECT (ĀRMMAṆA)</td>
<td>OBJECT (ĀRMMAṆA)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>base-object-pre-nascence-dissociation (vatthārammaṇa-purejāta-vippayutta)</td>
<td>OBJECT (ĀRMMAṆA)</td>
<td>OBJECT (ĀRMMAṆA)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>root (hetu)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>co-nascence-predominance (saḥajātādhipati)</td>
<td>OBJECT (ĀRMMAṆA)</td>
<td>OBJECT (ĀRMMAṆA)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>co-nascence (saḥajāta)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>mutuality (aṅñanaṁña)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>support (nissaya)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Kamma</td>
<td>CO-NASCENCE (SAHAJĀTA)</td>
<td>CO-NASCENCE (SAHAJĀTA)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>kammic-result (vipāka)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>nutriment (āhāra)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>co-nascence-faculty (saḥajātātindriya)</td>
<td>OBJECT (ĀRMMAṆA)</td>
<td>OBJECT (ĀRMMAṆA)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>jhāna</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Path (magga)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Arabic</th>
<th>English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>association (sampayutta)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>co-nascence-dissociation (sahajāta-vippayutta)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>co-nascence-presence (sahajātāththi)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>co-nascence-non-disappearance (sahajāta-avigata)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>proximity (anantarā)</td>
<td>PROXIMITY-DECISIVE-SUPPORT (ANANTARŪPANISSAYA)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>contiguity (samanantarā)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>proximity-decisive-support (anantāpanissaya)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>repetition (āsevana)</td>
<td>DECISIVE-SUPPORT (UPANISSAYA)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>proximity-kamma (anantarā-kamma)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>absence (natthi)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>disappearance (vīgata)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>natural-decisive-support (pakkatūpanissaya)</td>
<td>NATURAL-DECISIVE-SUPPORT (PAKATŪPANISSAYA)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>strong-asynchronous-kamma (balavanānākkhanika-kamma)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>base-pre-nascence-support (vatthu-purejāta-nissaya)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>base-pre-nascence (vatthu-purejāta)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>base-pre-nascence-faculty (vatthu-purejātindriya)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>base-pre-nascence-dissociation (vatthu-purejāta-vippayutta)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>base-pre-nascence-presence (vatthu-purejātāththi)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>base-pre-nascence-non-disappearance (vatthu-purejāta-avigata)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>post-nascence (pacchājāta)</td>
<td>POST-NASCENCE (PACCHĀJĀTA)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>post-nascence-dissociation (pacchājāta-vippayutta)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>post-nascence-presence (pacchājāta-atthi)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>post-nascence-non-disappearance (pacchājāta-avigata)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Notes:**
- Each row in the table represents a term from the Arabic text, followed by its English translation and any additional context in parentheses.
- The table is organized in a way that groups related terms together, with definitions and supports listed for each entry.
- The table does not include numbers for each term, as they are not relevant to the content.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>KAMMA</th>
<th>KAMMA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>balavadubba-nānākkhaṇika-kamma</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>material-nutriment (rūpa-āhāra)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>material-nutriment-presence (rūpa-āhāra-atthi)</td>
<td>NUTRIMENT (ĀHĀRA)</td>
<td>MATERIAL-NUTRIMENT (RŪPA-ĀHĀRA)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>material-nutriment-non-disappearance (rūpa-āhāra-avigata)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td>material-life-faculty (rūpa-jīvitindriya)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>material-life-faculty-presence (rūpa-jīvitindriya-atthi)</td>
<td>FACULTY (INDRIYA)</td>
<td>FACULTY (INDRIYA)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49</td>
<td>material-life-faculty-non-disappearance (rūpa-jīvitindriya-avigata)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix G: A catalogue of selected paṭṭhāna texts written by the Burmese from the 16\textsuperscript{th} century to the present

A note on sources:

I have used the list of abhidhamma texts complied by Ven. Visuddhābhivāṃsa \textit{et. al.} (1987) and my own collection of the paṭṭhāna texts over several years in order to compile this catalogue of paṭṭhāna texts written in the Burmese language. The title, author and date of publication/composition are given. Some of the earlier texts have not been published. Also, some of the hardcopies that I have collected do not give publication date and/or do not state edition or reprint. Therefore, and for the sake of space, I have decided not to include the place of publication and publisher. However, those referenced are given in the bibliography with full publication detail. Because of the lack of publication and of publication information, the dates given below are based on the list of abhidhamma texts complied by Visuddhābhivāṃsa \textit{et. al.} (1987) and hardcopies that I have obtained.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Date of composition or publication</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Paṭṭhānasāra dīpanī tiṅkā pāli</td>
<td>Ashin Saddhammālaṅkāra</td>
<td>943 Bu. Era; 1581</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Paṭṭhānavanāṇānī tiṅkā pāli</td>
<td>Ashin Tilokaguru</td>
<td>977 Bu. Era; 1614</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Paccayatthapakāsanī pāli</td>
<td>Ashin Jambudhaja (Hsayadaw U Bok')</td>
<td>1182 Bu. Era; 1819 (?)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Paccaghaṭanapakāsanā pāli</td>
<td>Ashin Jambudhaja (Hsayadaw U Bok')</td>
<td>1183 Bu. Era; 1820</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Paṭṭhānuddesa dīpanī pāli</td>
<td>Ashin Nāṇa (Ledi Hsayadaw)</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Pāli–Burmese Nissaya:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Date of composition or publication</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Pahtan&quot;palitaw nithaya (Paṭṭhāna pāli nissaya)</td>
<td>Ashin Munindaghosa (Taungbila Hsayadaw)</td>
<td>991 – 1010 Bu. Era; 1630 – 1647</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Pahtan&quot;palitaw nithaya (Paṭṭhāna pāli nissaya)</td>
<td>Ashin Aggadhamma (Nankyaung Hsayadaw)</td>
<td>c. 985 Bu. Era; 1622</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Pahtan &quot;palitaw nithaya&quot; (Paṭṭhāna pāli nissaya)</td>
<td>Author</td>
<td>Date</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Pahtan &quot;palitaw nithaya&quot;</td>
<td>Ashin Anantadhaja (Taungbi &quot;lu&quot; Hsayadaw)</td>
<td>c. 1034 Bu. Era; 1671</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Pahtan &quot;palitaw nithaya&quot;</td>
<td>U Nāna (Taung-twin &quot;Khin-kyi&quot; Pyaw)</td>
<td>c. 1124 Bu. Era; 1761</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Pahtan &quot;palitaw nithaya&quot;</td>
<td>Ashin Nandamedha (Htan &quot;tabin Hsayadaw)</td>
<td>c. 1138 Bu. Era; 1775</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Pahtan &quot;palitaw nithaya&quot;</td>
<td>Taw-ya U Dipa (U Aung Baw)</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Pahtan &quot;palitaw nithaya&quot;</td>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Pahtan &quot;palitaw nithaya&quot;</td>
<td>Ashin Jambudīpadhaja</td>
<td>c. 1200 Bu. Era; 1837</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Pahtan &quot;palitaw nithaya&quot;</td>
<td>Ashin Jāgara (Moe Hti)</td>
<td>1924 (first edition)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Paccayatthpakāsani nissaya</td>
<td>Hsayadaw U Bok'</td>
<td>1181 Bu. Era; 1818</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Paṭṭhānuuddesa dipani nissaya</td>
<td>Ashin Aggavaṃsa</td>
<td>1285 Bu. Era; 1922</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Pahtan &quot;palitaw nithaya&quot;</td>
<td>Ashin Osadha (Shwe-kyat-yat Hsayadaw)</td>
<td>2006</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Miscellaneous:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Pahtan &quot;ayakauk-kyan&quot; (Explication of the Paṭṭhāna)</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Pahtan &quot;thon&quot;hkyek-su (Three aspects of the Paṭṭhāna)</td>
<td>Ashin Sūriya (The &quot;in&quot;thathana-paing)</td>
<td>1125-1201 Bu. Era; 1762-1838</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Pahtan &quot;pyitsi&quot;pyaing (Comparisons of conditions in the Paṭṭhāna)</td>
<td>Ashin Sūriya (The &quot;in&quot;thathana-paing)</td>
<td>1125-1201 Bu. Era; 1762-1838</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Pahtan &quot;ya-thi-su (Groups of the Paṭṭhāna)&quot;</td>
<td>Ashin Sūriya (The &quot;in&quot;thathana-paing)</td>
<td>1125-1201 Bu. Era; 1762-1838</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Satu-wi-thati (Pahtan &quot;kyan&quot;)</td>
<td>Ashin Sunadara (Pyay)</td>
<td>1250 Bu. Era; 1887</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Author</td>
<td>Year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Pahtan&quot;amei&quot;aphyei (Questions and Answers on the Paṭṭhāna)</td>
<td>Ashin Paṇḍita (Ledi)</td>
<td>1288 Bu. Era; 1925</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Pahtan&quot;anuganṭhi (Glossary of the Paṭṭhāna)</td>
<td>U Kyi” Hpei (Pahtama-kyaw)</td>
<td>1300 Bu. Era; 1937</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Pahtan&quot;hon&quot;hkyek-su-hkeksik (Explaination of Three Aspects of the Paṭṭhāna)</td>
<td>Ashin Visuddha (Taung hkwin thathana-paing)</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Pahtan&quot;pyitsi&quot;pyaing-adipae (Meaning of Comparisons of Conditions in the Paṭṭhāna)</td>
<td>Ashin Visuddha (Taung hkwin thathana-paing)</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Pahtan&quot;hon&quot;hkyek-su ganṭhi (Glossary of Three Aspects of the Paṭṭhāna)</td>
<td>Ashin Kalyāṇavamsa</td>
<td>1259 Bu. Era; 1896</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>Pahtan&quot;pyitsi&quot;pyaing-ga-nhta (Glossary of Comparisons of Conditions in the Paṭṭhāna)</td>
<td>Ashin Kalyāṇavamsa</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Pahta-natha-rupa-nayupa-deitha kyan&quot;</td>
<td>Ashin Sūriya (Masoyein Hsayadaw)</td>
<td>1311 Bu. Era; 1948</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Pahtan&quot;a-ya-kauk-akyin&quot;hkyok (Essence of Analysis of Paṭṭhāna)</td>
<td>Association of Masoyein Nya’wa</td>
<td>1960</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Pahtana-naya dipani (Exposition of the Paṭṭhāna Methods)</td>
<td>Ashin Sobhita</td>
<td>1341 Bu. Era; 1978</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Pahtana-thara vibavani (Commentary of Essence of the Paṭṭhāna)</td>
<td>Ashin Visadañana</td>
<td>1317 Bu. Era; 1954</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Pahtan&quot;ponpyin (The Paṭṭhāna Story)</td>
<td>Ashin Visuddhābhivamṣa (Pahtan” Hsayadaw - Masoyein)</td>
<td>1322 Bu. Era; 1959</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Pyitsayakara’ dipani than-pauk (Verse of Conditional Methods)</td>
<td>Ashin Cakkinda (Hsayadaw U Bok’)</td>
<td>1183 Bu. Era; 1820</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Pyitsaya’pa’kathani-kyan” (Explanation of Conditions)</td>
<td>Ashin Ketumālā</td>
<td>1257 Bu. Era; 1894</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Author</td>
<td>Year/Notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td><em>Pyitsaya'hta'pa'kathani-kyan</em> (Meaning and Explanation of Conditions)</td>
<td>U Tiloka (Thek-khyaung Taung Hsayadaw)</td>
<td>1275 Bu. Era; 1912</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td><em>Pyitsaya-vi'bagathankheipa-kyan</em> (Abstract of Categories of Conditions)</td>
<td>Ashin Paññāvamsa</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td><em>Pyitsayu-deitha'dipani</em> (Exposition of Conditions)</td>
<td>Ashin Vicāra (Mya Taung Hsayadaw)</td>
<td>1287 Bu. Era; 1924</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td><em>A-bida-ma'tan'hkown kyan' hnin' yamaka-wi'htiyin-za-ri kyan</em> (Banner of Abhidhamma and garland of mental process in Yamaka)</td>
<td>Sayakyi U Ohn</td>
<td>1936 (fourth reprint)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td><em>Nya'wa tan'hkown kyan'-pahtama hnin' du-ti-ya twee</em> (Banner of Abhidhamma night-class–Vol. 1 &amp; 2)</td>
<td>Ashin Dhammasāmi (Mingala Taik-thik Hsayadaw)</td>
<td>1936</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td><em>Wi'ht'i'hnin'thon-hkyat-su'ba-tha-ti-ka</em> (Vithi and Three Groups: sub-commentary of mental process and Paṭṭhāna in Burmese).</td>
<td>Ashin Janakābhiṣaṃsa</td>
<td>1300 Bu. Era; 1938 (first print)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td><em>Pyitsaya-misi'ri-kyan</em> (A garland of conditions)</td>
<td>Ashin Paṇḍita (Ledi U Maung Kyi&quot;)</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td><em>A-bida-ma pa-htan'ku-hton-kyan</em> (Medical Treatment based on Abhidhammic Paṭṭhāna)</td>
<td>U Aung Ba</td>
<td>1956</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td><em>Pa-htan&quot;thara-wi-bawa-ni</em> (Paṭṭhānasārabhāvanī: exposition of essence of the Paṭṭhāna)</td>
<td>U Vīriya (Saddhammodaya Hsayadaw)</td>
<td>1957</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td><em>Nya'wa A-kyin A-lin&quot;pya'kyan&quot; (Light for concise Nya'wa: ayakauk text)</em></td>
<td>Ashin Sumana (Mo&quot;hnyin&quot; Hsayadaw)</td>
<td>1962</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Page</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Author</td>
<td>Year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>Pahtana naya' dipani: Pahtan&quot;pya'ne&quot; nitha'ye&quot; (Paṭṭhāna Dīpanī: nissaya on method of Paṭṭhāna)</td>
<td>Ashin Sobita</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>Tha-ba-wa-theik-pan hnin' Bok-da 'a-bi' da-ma kyan&quot; (Natural Science and Buddha's Abhidhamma)</td>
<td>U Kan Hkyon</td>
<td>1977</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54</td>
<td>Pa-htan&quot; Theik-pan Kyan&quot; – ta-ti'ya'twe (Paṭṭhāna Science – Vol. 3)</td>
<td>Ashin Indaka (Pa-htan&quot; Theik-pan Hsayadaw)</td>
<td>1979</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56</td>
<td>Paṭṭhāna-atṭhakathā-bhāsāṭikā (Sub-commentary on the commentary of the Paṭṭhāna)</td>
<td>Ashin Janakābhivamsa</td>
<td>1342 Bu. Era; 1980 (first print)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>58</td>
<td>Pa-htan&quot; wi'pa-tha-na kyin'sin tayatawkyi&quot; (Paṭṭhāna and vipassana practice)</td>
<td>Ashin Sumana (Mohnyin&quot; Hsayadaw)</td>
<td>1982</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>62</td>
<td>Ok-kan Pahtan“ne&quot;pyakyan&quot; (Ok-kan Approach to the Paṭṭhāna)</td>
<td>Ashin Nandobhāsa (Ok-kan Hsayadaw)</td>
<td>1999</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Author and Edition</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>63</td>
<td>Pahtan “paragu” (Perfected in the Paṭṭhāna)</td>
<td>Ashin Nārada (Mula’ Pahtan” Hsayadaw)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>64</td>
<td>Pahtan “thin-ne’ akyin” “hkyok” (Essence of Teaching methods of Paṭṭhāna)</td>
<td>Ashin Sūriya (Masoyein Hsayadaw)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65</td>
<td>Thin “gyo-ko’ paing” “tha-yok-hkwe” “za-ya” (Analysis of 9 parts of Abhidhammatthasangaha, along with tables on the Paṭṭhāna)</td>
<td>Pa-htan” Daw Khin Myint (Adapted from Ven. U Nārada, Mula’ Pahtan” Hsayadaw)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>66</td>
<td>Pahtan “lan’ pya” (A Guide to the Paṭṭhāna)</td>
<td>U Nārada (Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>67</td>
<td>Pahtan “maha” (The Great Paṭṭhāna)</td>
<td>U Myint Swe</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>68</td>
<td>A-than-hpan”Pahtan” Po’hkya’zin-kyan” - Pa-hnya-wa-ra’thin-hkya (Recording of the Paṭṭhāna lectures: Enumeration of Investigation Chapter - Vol. 1)</td>
<td>U Nārada (Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>69</td>
<td>Pa-htan” passaya ni deitha pat-thama paing (Paṭṭhāna-paccayaniddesa)</td>
<td>U Nārada (Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70</td>
<td>A-than-hpan” Pahtan” Po’hkya’zin-kyan” - Pa-hnya-wa-ra’thin-hkya (Recording of the Paṭṭhāna lectures: Enumeration of Investigation Chapter - Vol. 2)</td>
<td>U Nārada (Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Author</td>
<td>Year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>71</td>
<td><em>A-than-hpan</em>&quot; Pa-htan&quot; Po'kya'zin-kyan&quot;: <em>Pa-hnya-wa-ra'wi'banga</em> (Recording of <em>Paṭṭhāna</em> lectures: investigation chapter).</td>
<td>U Nārada (Mula’ Pa-htan” Hsayadaw)</td>
<td>1995</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>72</td>
<td>Pahtana’ pan”kon&quot; (Garlands of the <em>Paṭṭhāna</em>)</td>
<td>Ashin Kumāra</td>
<td>1996</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>73</td>
<td><em>Paṭṭhānapajjotaka</em> (Light of the <em>Paṭṭhāna</em>)</td>
<td>Ashin Nandimālnākāra</td>
<td>1996</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>74</td>
<td><em>Pa-htan&quot; haw-sin</em> (Lecture on <em>Paṭṭhāna</em>: No. 2)</td>
<td>U Setṭhila</td>
<td>1999</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75</td>
<td>*Pa-htan&quot; a-hkyaei-hkan thin-tan&quot;kyan&quot; (Foundations of the <em>Paṭṭhāna</em>)</td>
<td>Ashin Paṇḍava</td>
<td>1999</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>76</td>
<td>Pahtana naya’ than-khepa’kyan&quot;(Concise method on the <em>Paṭṭhāna</em>)</td>
<td>Ashin Vajirabuddhi</td>
<td>2000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>77</td>
<td><em>Pa-htan&quot; A-lin&quot;yaung</em> (The <em>Paṭṭhāna</em> light)</td>
<td>Ashin Tejaniya</td>
<td>2000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>78</td>
<td>*Pa-htan&quot; Thin-kya&quot;ne&quot; (Pedagogical methods for the <em>Paṭṭhāna</em>)</td>
<td>Ashin Kheminda</td>
<td>2003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>79</td>
<td>Pa-htan” ayakauk hnит anugañthi (Explication and Glossary of the <em>Paṭṭhāna</em>)</td>
<td>Ashin Sūriya (Masoyein Hsayadaw) (‘Purified and modified’ version of Htan”tabin Hsayadaw’s work)</td>
<td>2006 (edition unknown)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80</td>
<td>Aung-pwe-ya’shwe-pahtan” (Success in golden <em>Paṭṭhāna</em>)</td>
<td>Ashin Kusala</td>
<td>2008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Page</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Author</td>
<td>Edition Notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>82</td>
<td>Pahtan”let-saung (The Gift of the Paṭṭhāna)</td>
<td>Ashin Tilokābhivamsa (In”sein Ywama Hsayadaw)</td>
<td>2009 (fourth reprint)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>83</td>
<td>Ok-kan Pa-htan”ne”pya-kyan”-Sa-thin-tha”kaing (Ok-kan Approach to the Paṭṭhāna: for student)</td>
<td>Ashin Nandobhāsa (Ok-kan Hsayadaw)</td>
<td>2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>84</td>
<td>Pa-htan”pyit-sa-ya-ni-dei-tha’Po’hkya-haw”kya”hkyatmya” (Lectures on Paccayaniiddeesa)</td>
<td>Ashin Jotika</td>
<td>2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>85</td>
<td>Pa-htan”Po’hkya’sin (Lecture on Paṭṭhāna)</td>
<td>Ashin Dhammadavilaśa</td>
<td>2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>86</td>
<td>Pañhāvāraviḥaṅga Mhat-su (Notebook on the Investigation Chapter)</td>
<td>U Tin Win (Daik-U)</td>
<td>2012</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Popular Paṭṭhāna Books:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Edition Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>87</td>
<td>Pa-htan”a-hkyei-hkan wi’pattha-na (Paṭṭhāna: Basic Insight (Vipassanā)Mediation)</td>
<td>Ashin Visuddhābhivamaśa (Pahtan” Hsayadaw)</td>
<td>1980 (third reprint)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>88</td>
<td>A-than-ma-se”Pahtan”pu-zaw-pwae (Festival of non-stop chanting of the Paṭṭhāna)</td>
<td>Ashin Paññasāmi (Māgadhī)</td>
<td>1996 (third reprint) 1983 (first print)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>90</td>
<td>Pahtan”nhit Vipassanā (Conditional Relations and Insight Meditation) Vol. 1 and Vol. 2.</td>
<td>Ashin Kuṇḍalabhivamaśa (Saddhammaransī Hsayadaw)</td>
<td>2002 (first edition)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>91</td>
<td>Pahtan”tan-hko”let-twe’a-kyo” (Practical Benefit of Power of the Paṭṭhāna)</td>
<td>Ashin Sīri</td>
<td>2002 (third edition)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Author(s)</td>
<td>Editor/Publisher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>92</td>
<td>Aye-myashin-lan Myat-pahtan (Cool and Fresh Paṭṭhāna)</td>
<td>Editorial board of Thuraja Magazine</td>
<td>2003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>93</td>
<td>A-hkyei-pyu pahtan&quot;taya&quot;taw (Sermons of Basic the Paṭṭhāna)</td>
<td>Ashin Janakabhumisa</td>
<td>2004 (fourth edition)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>94</td>
<td>Yaung-sonyok-pya’pahtan&quot;- (24) pyit-se&quot;nyin’shin-hkyatmya (Coloured Illustration of the Paṭṭhāna: 24 Conditions and Explanations)</td>
<td>(S.S.) Khin Maung Aye</td>
<td>2004 (fourth edition)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95</td>
<td>Pahtan’ passaya ni’deitha palitaw hnin’ a-ya-kauk a-deikpae (Analytical exposition of Paṭṭhāna and its meaning)</td>
<td>Ashin Jānaka (Tisarana Vihāra London)</td>
<td>2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>96</td>
<td>Na’ya’ta-ga’ra’ Pahtan”tayataw (Oceans of Methods: The Paṭṭhāna)</td>
<td>Sein Lin (Oncologist and Surgeon)</td>
<td>2006 (first edition)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>97</td>
<td>Pahtan” adeikpae shin”lin”hkek nhti amaeiapheii’apheii (The Paṭṭhāna: the definition, and questions and answers)</td>
<td>Khin Cho Htun (ed.)</td>
<td>2008 (first edition)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>98</td>
<td>Pahtan”taya”daw (The teaching of the Paṭṭhāna)</td>
<td>Ashin Kumārābhivamsa</td>
<td>2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>99</td>
<td>Pa-htan’ hnin’ Pa-tat-sa-thamu-pat (Paṭṭhāna and Paṭiccasamuppada)</td>
<td>U Obhāsa</td>
<td>2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product No</td>
<td>Product Title</td>
<td>Author</td>
<td>Year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100</td>
<td>Pa-htan” Wi-pa-tha-na Ta-ya&quot;taw - a-mhat 12, 13, 14, and 16 (Dhamma talk on Paṭṭhāna and Insight meditation – no. 12, 13, 14, and 16) (ပ႒ာန္း ဝိပႆနာ တရာ္ - အမွတ္ ၁၂၊ ၁၃၊ ၁၄၊ ႏွင့္ ၁၆)</td>
<td>Ashin Indobhäsa</td>
<td>2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>101</td>
<td>Bok-da’yi-hman “Myat-pa-htan” (The Great Paṭṭhāna with the Buddha in mind)</td>
<td>Ashin Sunanda (Dhammaransí Hsayadaw)</td>
<td>2011(first print)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>103</td>
<td>Gan-mi-ra-pa-htan (Profound Paṭṭhāna)</td>
<td>Ashin Paññasihäbhivaṃsa</td>
<td>2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>104</td>
<td>Neik-ban twa &quot;lam&quot;myat-pa-htan&quot; (A road to Nibbāna: the great Paṭṭhāna)</td>
<td>Ashin Saṃvarālaṅkāra</td>
<td>2011(second reprint) 2008 (first print)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>105</td>
<td>Hlin-myan-thwek-lek a-kyo&quot;pet&quot;htet-aung pa-htan” pu-zaw-ne” (Super effective method on paṭṭhāna chanting)</td>
<td>U Kovida (Yei-sa-kyo)</td>
<td>2011</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix H: The Pāli text in the Pucchāvāra presented in a table designed by Pa-htan” Theik-pan Hsayadaw of Sagaing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Column 1</th>
<th>Vāra</th>
<th>Column 2</th>
<th>Paccaya-satti</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Paccaya</td>
<td></td>
<td>Paccayuppana</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Row 1</td>
<td>Siyā</td>
<td>Kusalaṃ dhammaṃ</td>
<td>1) hetupaccaya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Paṭicca</td>
<td>2) ārammanāpaccaya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Siyā</td>
<td>Akusalaṃ dhammaṃ</td>
<td>3) adhipatipaccaya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Paṭicca</td>
<td>4) anantarapaccaya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Row 3</td>
<td>Siyā</td>
<td>Avyākataṃ dhammaṃ</td>
<td>5) samanantarapaccaya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Paṭicca</td>
<td>6) sahajātapaccaya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Siyā</td>
<td>Kusalaṅca avyākataṅca dhammaṃ</td>
<td>7) aṅñamaṅñaapaccaya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Paṭicca</td>
<td>8) nissayapaccaya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Row 5</td>
<td>Siyā</td>
<td>Kusalaṅca avyākataṅca dhammaṃ</td>
<td>9) upanissayapaccaya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Paṭicca</td>
<td>10) purejātapaccaya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Siyā</td>
<td>Akusalaṅca avyākataṅca dhammaṃ</td>
<td>11) pacchājātapaccaya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Row 7</td>
<td>Siyā</td>
<td>Kusalaṅca akusalaṅca dhammaṃ</td>
<td>12) āsevanapaccaya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Paṭicca</td>
<td>13) kammapaccaya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Siyā</td>
<td>Kusalaṅca akusalaṅca dhammaṃ</td>
<td>14) vipākapaccaya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Paṭicca</td>
<td>15) āhārapaccaya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Siyā</td>
<td>Kusalaṅca akusalaṅca dhammaṃ</td>
<td>16) indriyapaccaya</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A note on how to read the table:
- For the questions pertaining to the root condition (hetupaccaya):
  - pair Row 1 in Column 1 with Row 1 in Column 2, and thus we have “Siyā kusalaṃ dhammaṃ paṭicca kusalo dhammo uppajjeyya hetupaccaya”.
  - keep Row 1 in Column 1 constant, and pair it with Row 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, and 7 in Column 2.

---

• then, move to Row 2 in Column 1, and pair it with Row 2, 1, 3, 4, 5, 6, and 7 in Column 2.
• repeat the same pairing process with Row 3, 4, 5, 6, and 7 in Column 1 with the rows in Column 2.
• the total number of questions with the root condition is 49.
• For the questions pertaining to the object condition (ārammanapaccaya), it is the same process as the root condition, which gives another set of 49 questions.
• Repeat the same process with other conditions (paccayas).
• The information given in the table can be used to formulate a total of 1176 (7 × 7 × 24 = 1176) questions regarding the conditional relations between dhammas in the skilful triplet that can be related by a single condition.
• See 5.3. for an explanation of a step-by-step calculation of how to arrive at 1176 questions.
APPENDIX I: GLOSSARY (PĀLI-BURMESE-ENGLISH)

Notes regarding texts in the table below.

1) The Burmese transcription column has two types of transcription. Firstly, the transcription of Pāli words is with the stem form, which is the convention used in the western scholarship. This is shown without brackets. Second transcription shows actual usages of Pāli words by the Burmese people. People in Burma are more familiar with normative form of Pāli words. For example, ‘adhipati-paccayo’ (a-di’pa-ti’pyit-sa-yaw”), a compound ends with a nominative case, is a common usage amongst the Burmese.

2) In Burma, usage of titles are important both in monastic and secular domains. In particular, titles come crucial when one is addressing monks, who are venerated throughout Burma. There have been a variety of titles used in public domains – both by monks when they are referring to themselves, and by lay people when they are referring to monks. The following are some of the more common titles found in the public domain: ‘Ashin’ (‘အသ်င’ or ‘အရွင’)592, ‘Shin’ (‘သ်င’ or ‘ရွင’), ‘U’ (‘ဦ’ or ‘ဥ’) and ‘Sayadaw’ (‘ဆရာတာ’). The table below includes a range of other titles.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Burmese Transcription (Burmese actual usages in brackets)</th>
<th>Burmese Script</th>
<th>Pāli</th>
<th>English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a-bi’da-ma pitaka’ (A-bi’dama)</td>
<td>အဘိဓမၼပိဋက</td>
<td>Abhidhamma Piṭaka</td>
<td>The third collection of the Pāli Canon.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a-bi’da-mi’ka</td>
<td>အာဘိဓမၼိက</td>
<td>abhidhammik a</td>
<td>A learned person in the Abhidhamma.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-bi’dama Taungtha Hsei'pyin-nya-ahpwe'</td>
<td>အာဘိဓမၼာေတာင္သပိတာ အဖြဲ႕</td>
<td>Abhidhamma Taungtha Medical Association. It is one of the most well known indigenous medical groups in Burma, and draws on the Abhidhamma in developing their medical texts and practice.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

592 ‘အသ်င’, ‘သ်င’ and ‘ဥ’ are older forms of spelling, while ‘ဆရာတာ’, ‘ရွင’ and ‘ဦ’ are modern forms of spelling.
<p>| ara-ba-ka-ta | adhipati-paccaya | 'indeterminate'. It has a sense of 'kammically neutral', i.e. neither determined as kammically skilful nor as unskilful. There are two types of indeterminate consciousness (abyakata-citta): kammic-results (vipaka-citta) and functional (kiriya-citta). |
| a-di’pa-ti’ pyit-sa-ya (a-di’pa-ti’ pyit-sa-yaw”) | adhipati-cittaja-rūpa | predominance condition |
| a-di’pa-ti’ seit-ta-za-yok | adhipati-cittaja-rūpa | predominant mind-produced matter'. This is matter originating from predominant mental states, namely the 52 javana cittas. |
| a-ga’ma-ha-pandi’ta | Aggamahā-pandita | A title given to an eminent monk in Burma. |
| a-ha-ya’ pyit-sa-ya (a-ha-ya’ pyit-sa-yaw”) | āhāra-paccaya | nutriment condition |
| a-ha-ya’za-yok | āhāraja-rūpa | nutriment-produced rūpa, i.e. a matter originating from nutriment. |
| a-heik-pa-tait-tha-de-kan-ma-za-yok | ahetuka-pātisandhi-kammaja-rūpa | ‘rootless rebirth-kamma-produced matter’. This is a matter originating from kamma at the rebirth moment. It arises together with one of the two rootless rebirth consciousnesses. |
| a-heik-seit | ahetuka-citta | ‘rootless mind’. This is a citta, which does not have roots principle, or roots. 18 cittas are without roots. |
| a-heik-seit-ta-za-yok | ahetuka-cittaja-rūpa | ‘rootless mind-produced matter’. This is a matter originating from rootless consciousness. |
| a-nan-da (Ashin A-nan-da) | Ananda | The Buddha’s personal assistant. |
| a-nan-ta na-yà-tha-man-ta’ | ananta-naya-samanta | all-encompassing infinite methods |
| a-nan-ta-ra’ pyit-sa-ya (a-nan-ta-ra’ pyit-sa-yaw”) | anantara-paccaya | proximity condition |
| a-nat-ta’ | anatta | not-self |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>缅語</th>
<th>漢譯</th>
<th>英譯</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a-nya-man-nya pyit-sa-ya (a-nya-man-nya pyit-sa-yaw&quot;)</td>
<td>အနီမည်ပစ္စည်း (အနီမည်ပစ္စည်း)</td>
<td>aṅnamañña-paccaya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a-paw&quot;da-tu (a-paw&quot;dat)</td>
<td>အဝိဇနာ (အဝိဇနာ)</td>
<td>āpo-dhātu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a-ra-hat (ya-han&quot;da)</td>
<td>အရဟာ (အရဟာ)</td>
<td>arahat/arahan t</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a-ran-ma-na pyit-sa-ya (a-ran-ma-na pyit-sa-yaw&quot;)</td>
<td>အရဟာ (အရဟာ)</td>
<td>ārammaña-paccaya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a-thei-ya-na' pyit-sa-ya (a-thei-ya-na' pyit-sa-yaw&quot;)</td>
<td>အသခၤတာ (အသခၤတာ)</td>
<td>āsevana-paccaya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a-thin-nya-that kan-ma'za-yok</td>
<td>အဆောက်သုတ်ပြုစု</td>
<td>asaṅñasatta-kammajā-rūpa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a-wi-za</td>
<td>အဝိဇနာ (အဝိဇနာ)</td>
<td>avijjā</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a'da-pyt-sa-ya-ta</td>
<td>အဝိဇနာ (အဝိဇနာ)</td>
<td>idappaccayatā</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a'daw&quot;tha'</td>
<td>အဝိဇနာ (အဝိဇနာ)</td>
<td>adosa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a'law&quot;ba'</td>
<td>အဝိဇနာ (အဝိဇနာ)</td>
<td>alobha</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a'maw&quot;ha'</td>
<td>အဝိဇနာ (အဝိဇနာ)</td>
<td>amoha</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a'thin-hka-ta datu (a'thin-hka-ta' dat)</td>
<td>အဝိဇနာ (အဝိဇနာ)</td>
<td>asaṅkhata-dhātu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a'wi-ga-ta' pyit-sa-ya (a'wi-ga-ta' pyit-sa-yaw&quot;)</td>
<td>အဝိဇနာ (အဝိဇနာ)</td>
<td>avigata-paccaya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ashin</td>
<td>အဝိဇနာ (အဝိဇနာ)</td>
<td>a prefix used before the ordination name of a monk.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>at-thi' pyit-sa-ya (at-thi' pyit-sa-yaw&quot;)</td>
<td>အဝိဇနာ (အဝိဇနာ)</td>
<td>atthi-paccaya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ayakauk</td>
<td>အဝိဇနာ (အဝိဇနာ)</td>
<td>pick up essential meaning of dhammas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ba-hi-ya-yok</td>
<td>bāhira-rūpa</td>
<td>external rūpa, including all rūpas except the five sense-organs. In the commentarial texts, although other rūpas occur within the physical body, they are not as distinctive as the sense-organs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ba-wa’</td>
<td>bhava</td>
<td>existence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baw-di-that-ta (pha-ya”a-laung”)</td>
<td>Bodhisatta</td>
<td>Buddha-to-be</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>da-ma-a-nu-law”ma’</td>
<td>dhammānuloma</td>
<td>dhamma expressed according to positive method, e.g. skilful, unskilful and indeterminate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>da-ma-a-nu-law”ma’pyit-sani-ya</td>
<td>dhammānuloma ma</td>
<td>dhamma expressed according to positive—negative method, e.g. skilful—not-skilful, unskilful—not-unskilful, indeterminate—not-indeterminate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>da-ma’</td>
<td>dhamma</td>
<td>phenomenon, state</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>da-ma’pyit-sani-ya-a-nu-law”ma’</td>
<td>dhammapacca niyānuloma</td>
<td>dhamma expressed according to negative—positive method, e.g. not-skilful—skilful, not-unskilful—unskilful, not-indeterminate—not-indeterminate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>da-ma’pyit-sani-ya’</td>
<td>dhammapacca niyāya</td>
<td>dhamma expressed according to negative method, e.g. not-skilful, not-unskilful, and not-indeterminate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>da-tu (dat)</td>
<td>dhātu</td>
<td>element or essence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daw</td>
<td>dosa</td>
<td>a prefix used before name of a woman, which is similar to the English ‘Ms’.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>daw’tha’</td>
<td>dosa</td>
<td>hatred</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>du-ka-pa-hta-na (du-ka-pa-htan”)</td>
<td>dukapatt hāna</td>
<td>condition relations concerning duplets. It is a division in the Paṭṭhāna where conditional relations between the duplet dhammas are described.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ei-kan-da pyitsaaya</td>
<td>ekantapaccaya</td>
<td>ineluctable cause</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ei-kan-da pyitsa-yok-panna</td>
<td>ekantapaccayuppāna</td>
<td>ineluctable effect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ein-da-ri-ya pyitsa-ya (ein-da-ri-ya pyitsa-yaw)</td>
<td>indriyapaccaya</td>
<td>faculty condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>haw-han-ka”</td>
<td></td>
<td>This is how it is taught [by the Buddha]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hei-tu’ pyitsa-ya (hei-tu’ pyitsa-yaw”)</td>
<td>hetu-paccaya</td>
<td>root condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hsayadaw</td>
<td></td>
<td>‘royal teacher’. It is used to refer to a senior monk or an abbot of a monastery or a meditation centre. It is used as a post-fix with honorific titles, names of monastery/meditation centre, or names of (birth) places of the monk.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hsayalay</td>
<td></td>
<td>a prefix to refer to a nun.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hsei-hsay</td>
<td></td>
<td>‘teacher of medicine’. It is used as a prefix to address someone who is an expert on medicine.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hta-na’</td>
<td>ṭhāna</td>
<td>condition, cause</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ik-za-ta-yok</td>
<td>ajjhattikarūpa</td>
<td>internal rūpa, i.e. the five sense-organs. According to commentarial tradition, the sense-organs are extremely valuable as media through which mind encounters with their objects. Thus, they are called ajjhattikarūpa.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ka-ya-wi-nyat-te (ka-ya-wi-nyat)</td>
<td>kāya-viññatti</td>
<td>bodily intimation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>kan-ma’ (kan)</td>
<td>kamma</td>
<td>karma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>kan-ma’ pyitsa-ya (kan-ma’ pyitsa-yaw”)</td>
<td>kamma-paccaya</td>
<td>kamma condition</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ki-ri-ya-byā-ka-ta ကြာရွန်းဗ်ာကတာ  kiriyābyākata  ‘functional-type indeterminate’.

Koyin ကြာ်ရာ  a prefix used to address a Buddhist novice.

kyan”gyi”hpauk ကြာရွန်းဗ်ာကတာ  ‘digging through the great texts’. It is a pedagogical method used at the Pahkokku school of thought in Burma.

law”ba’ လော  lobha  greed

ma-ha-vi’ha-ra မဟာဝိဟာ  Mahāvihāra  Mahāvihāra commentarial tradition which came to dominate Sri Lankan and Burmese Theravāda Buddhism from the 12th century to the present day.

mag-ga’pyit-sa-
ya (mag-ga’pyit-sa-
yaw”) မဂာပစၥယ  maggapaccaya  path condition

maw”ha’ မဟာ  moha  delusion

mu-hkya’pyit-sa-
yaw” မိုးမဂၢပစၥယ  mukhyapaccaya  actual cause

mu-la’ မုံ  mūla  root

nan-ma’ru-pa’ (nam-yok) နန်းမဟာနိဗ်ာန္းေပ  nāmarūpa  mentality-materiality

nat-hti’pyit-sa-
ya (nat-hti’pyit-sa-
yaw”) နတၱိပစၥယ  nathipaccaya  absence condition

neik-ban နိဗ်ာန္းေပ  nibbāna  nirvana

ni-tha-ya pyit-sa-
ya (ni-tha-ya pyit-sa-
yaw”) နာမ္ရုပ္ေပ  nissayapaccaya  support condition

pa-da-na’ ပတ္ေ  padhāna  prominent, chief

Pa-hta-na (Pa-
htan”) ပေါဟာေ  Paṭṭhāna  conditional relations

pa-hta-wi-dā-tu (pa-hta-wi-dat) ပေါဟာော်  pathavī-dhātu  earth element; one of the four material elements that is characterised by hardness.

pa-mu-hkā pyit-
sa-yaw” ပမုံမဂၢေပ  pamukhapaccaya  chief cause

pa-ra-ma-hta da-
ma’ ပရမတၱိးေ  paramattha-
dhamma  ultimate realities

pa-ta-ta-sa-tha-mu-
pa-da (pa-ta-ta-
tha-mok-pat) ပတ္ခြားသမုပၸါဒ္ေ  paticcasamuppāda  dependent origination
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Myanmar</th>
<th>Pali</th>
<th>English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>pa-ti-da-na</td>
<td>patti-dāna</td>
<td>transference of merit; giving of the acquired merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pa-vat-ti-kan-ma’za-yok</td>
<td>pavatti-kammajā-rūpa</td>
<td>kamma-produced rūpa, i.e. a matter originating from kamma during lifetime</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pha-tha’</td>
<td>phassa</td>
<td>contact</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pu-rei-za-ta’ pyit-sa-ya (pu-rei-za-ta’ pyit-sa-yaw”)</td>
<td>purejātapaṭcaya</td>
<td>pre-nascence condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pyit-sa-ya (pyit-sa-yaw”)</td>
<td>paccaya</td>
<td>cause, condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pyit-sa-ya-a-nulaw”ma’</td>
<td>paccayānulomā</td>
<td>conditions expressed according to positive method, e.g. root condition, object condition etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pyit-sa-ya-a-nulaw”ma’pyit-sa-ni-ya</td>
<td>paccayānulomā apaccanīya</td>
<td>conditions expressed according to positive—negative method, e.g. root condition—not-object condition, root condition—not-predominance condition etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pyit-sa-ya-pyit-sa-ni-ya’</td>
<td>paccayapacca- nīya</td>
<td>conditions expressed according to negative method, e.g. not-root condition, not-object condition etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pyit-sa-ya’da-ma’</td>
<td>paccaya- dhamma</td>
<td>conditioning states</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pyit-sa-ya’pyit-sa- ni-ya-a-nulaw”ma’</td>
<td>paccayapacca- niyānuloma</td>
<td>conditions expressed according to negative—positive method, e.g. not-root condition—object condition, not-root condition—predominance condition etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pyit-sa-yok-panna da-ma’</td>
<td>paccayuppana- dhamma</td>
<td>conditioned states</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pyit-sa-za-ta pyit-sa-ya (pyit-sa-za-ta pyit-sa-yaw”)</td>
<td>pacchājātapaṭcaya</td>
<td>post-nascence condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ru-pa’ (yok)</td>
<td>rūpa</td>
<td>matter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sathintaik</td>
<td>cetanā</td>
<td>intention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sei-da-na</td>
<td>cetasika</td>
<td>mental factors, mental concomitants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sei-ta-thī’ka (sei-ta-theik)</td>
<td>cetasika</td>
<td>mental factors, mental concomitants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>seit-ta (seit)</td>
<td>citta</td>
<td>consciousness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ta-hta-ga-ta</td>
<td>Tathāgata</td>
<td>Thus Gone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burmese</td>
<td>Pali</td>
<td>English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>တရားကိုယ္ေကာက္</td>
<td>dhammas</td>
<td>characteristics of dhammas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>တဏွာတဏ္ဍား</td>
<td>tanha</td>
<td>craving</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>တဏ္ဍားနှုန်း</td>
<td>tanhā</td>
<td>heat element; one of the four material elements that is characterised by heat/temperature.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>တီးေတား (တီးေတား)</td>
<td>sahaññatañana</td>
<td>omniscience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>တားေတားေဆား (တားေတားေဆား)</td>
<td>sahajātapaccaya</td>
<td>co-nascence condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>တီးေတားေဆားေတားေတား (တီးေတားေဆား)</td>
<td>sahetukapatisandhikammajarūpa</td>
<td>'rooted rebirth-kamma-produced matter'. This is a matter originating from kamma at the rebirth moment. It arises together with the rooted rebirth consciousness.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>တီးေတားေဆားေနတား (တီးေတားေဆား)</td>
<td>sahetukacitta</td>
<td>'rooted mind'. This is a citta, which has skilful, unskilful and indeterminate roots as its principle causes or roots. 71 out of 89 cittas are with roots.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>တီးေတားေဆားေနတားေတားေတား (တီးေတားေဆား)</td>
<td>sahetukacittajarūpa</td>
<td>'rooted mind-produced matter'. This is a matter originating from rooted consciousness.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>သီနႏၲရပစၥယ</td>
<td>saḷāyatana</td>
<td>six sense bases</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>သီနႏၲရပစၥေယာ</td>
<td>samanantarapaccaya</td>
<td>contiguity condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>သီၸယုတၱပစၥယ</td>
<td>sampayuttapaccaya</td>
<td>association condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>သာသနာစစာ</td>
<td>sāsanā</td>
<td>the dispensation of the Buddha; the Buddhist religion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>သရုပ္ခြဲ</td>
<td>analysē</td>
<td>analyse visible characteristics of dhammas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>သရုပ္ေကာက္</td>
<td>pick up</td>
<td>pick up visible characteristics of dhammas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>သရုပ္ကြဲ</td>
<td>having analysed</td>
<td>having analysed visible characteristics of dhammas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pali</td>
<td>Burmese</td>
<td>English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>than-tha-ra</td>
<td>သံသရာ</td>
<td>the round of rebirth/cyclic existence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>that-ti’</td>
<td>သတော့င်</td>
<td>force, power</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>thin-hka-ra’</td>
<td>သံလက်</td>
<td>volitional formation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thok-ta pi’ta-kat (Thok)</td>
<td>သံလက်နှင့်သတော့င်  (သံလက်)</td>
<td>Sutta Piṭaka, The Basket of Teachings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thu’da-ma-gaing</td>
<td>သံလက်နှင့်သတော့င်  (သံလက်)</td>
<td>The largest sect of the Burmese saṅgha. Thu’da-ma-gaing came to be recognised by the royal as a separate sect at the end of the 18th century under the reign of Bodawhpaya.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ti-ka-du-ka-pahta-na (ti-ka-du-ka-pa-htan&quot;&quot;)</td>
<td>သံလက်နှင့်သတော့င်  (သံလက်)</td>
<td>conditional relations concerning triplets and duplets. Conditional relations between triplet dhāmannas and duplet dhāmannas are described.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ti-ka-pa-hta-na (ti-ka-pa-htan&quot;&quot;)</td>
<td>သံလက်နှင့်သတော့င်  (သံလက်)</td>
<td>conditional relations concerning triplets. It is a division in the Paṭṭhāna in which conditional relations between the triplet dhāmannas are described.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ti-ka-ti-ka-pahta-na (ti-ka-ti-ka-pa-htan&quot;&quot;)</td>
<td>သံလက်နှင့်သတော့င်  (သံလက်)</td>
<td>conditional relations concerning triplets and triplets. This division describes conditional relations between triplet dhāmannas and triplet dhāmannas.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U</td>
<td>ဗာ</td>
<td>a prefix used before the ordination name of a monk, or name of a man, which is similar to the English 'Mr'.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>u-pa-dan-na’ (u-padan)</td>
<td>ဗာ</td>
<td>clingling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>u-pa-neik-tha-ya’ pyit-sa-ya (u-pa-neik-tha-ya’ pyit-sa-yaw&quot;)</td>
<td>ဗာ</td>
<td>strong support condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>u-tu-za-yok</td>
<td>ဗာ</td>
<td>temperature-produced rūpa, i.e. a matter originating from temperature.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>wa-si-wi-nyat-ti (wa-si-wi-nyat)</td>
<td>ဗာ</td>
<td>vocal intimation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>wa-yaw”da-tu (wa-yaw”dat)</td>
<td>ဗာ</td>
<td>wind element; one of the four material elements that is characterised by strengthening.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>wei-da-na</td>
<td>ဗာ</td>
<td>feeling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>Pali</td>
<td>Meaning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>wein-nya-na (wein-nyan)</td>
<td>viññāna</td>
<td>consciousness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>wi’ga-da’ pyit-sa−ya (wi’ga-da’ pyit-sa−yaw”)</td>
<td>vigata-paccaya</td>
<td>disappearance condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wi’na-ya’ pi’ta-kat (Wi-ni)</td>
<td>Vinaya Piṭaka</td>
<td>The Basket of Discipline</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>wi’pa-ka-bya-ka-ta</td>
<td>vipākābyakatā “kammic-result-type indeterminate”.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>wi’pa-ka’ (wi’pak)</td>
<td>vipāka</td>
<td>kammic result</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>wi’pa-ka’ pyit-sa−ya (wi’pa-ka’ pyit-sa−yaw”)</td>
<td>vipāka-paccaya</td>
<td>kammic-result condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>wi’pa-yok-ta’ pyit-sa−ya (wi’pa-yok-ta’ pyit-sa−yaw”)</td>
<td>vippayutta-paccaya</td>
<td>dissociation condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>wi’pat-tha-na</td>
<td>vipassanā</td>
<td>insight meditation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>za-na’ pyit-sa’ya (za-na’ pyit-sa’yaw”)</td>
<td>jhāna-paccaya</td>
<td>jhāna condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>za-ti’</td>
<td>jāti</td>
<td>birth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>za-va-na-seit-ta (zaw”seit)</td>
<td>javana-citta</td>
<td>’javana citta’. Javana literally means ‘running swiftly’. It is a technical term used to refer to the active phase of the cognitive process, and it is often left untranslated.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>za’ra ma-ra-na’</td>
<td>jarāmarana</td>
<td>ageing and death</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Pāli Sources


Burmese Sources


Janakābhivamṣa, Ashin. (2002). Wi-htí hnin’ thon-hkyat-su’ ba-tha-ti-ka (Burmese commentary on viññi (mental process) and Three lists of the Paṭṭhāna). Amarapura: Na-yu”ba”ma” Pi-ta-kat Pon-hneik-taik. (3rd reprint; 1st published 1938).


Minn Tin Mon, Dr. (1992). *Bok-da’ a-bi’da-ma a-hnit-hkyot* (Essence of Buddha’s *Abhidhamma*). Yangon: Ya-ta-na Min Sa-pei. (3rd Reprint).


Sūriya, Ashin (The”in” Hsayadaw). (1934). *Pa-htan” nya’wa-thon”saung-twe* (Three works of the *Paṭṭhāna*). Yangon: Han-tha-wa-ti Pi’ta-kat Sa-pon-hnik-taik.


**Burmese-English Sources**


**English Sources**


Crosby, Kate. (2014). *Traditional Theravada Meditation and its Modern Era Suppression*. Hong Kong: Centre for Buddhist Studies, Hong Kong University Press.


Yujanañāṇī, Daw. (2008). ‘The Vital Role of Abhidhamma as Buddhist Ethics in the development of Mind Culture.’ Presented at the 1st Conference of the
International Association of Buddhist Universities (IABU),
Mahachulalongkornrajvidyalaya University, Ayutthaya, Thailand.

Introduction to Abhidhamma Evening lessons in Myanmar.’ Presented at the 2nd
Conference of the Association of Theravada Buddhist Universities (ATBU),
Sitagu International Buddhist Academy, Sagaing, Myanmar.

Tradition and its impacts.’ Presented at the International Conference on
‘Introspection on Buddhist Traditions’, Gautam Buddha University, Greater
Noida, Uttar Pradesch, India.

Audio Sources

Bodhi, Bhikkhu. (Summer 1981). Lecture on Dependent Origination. (Accessed from
http://www.bodhimonastery.net/bm/about-buddhism/audio/83-the-
buddhas-teaching-as-it-is.html on 29/10/2010).

Kumārābhivaṃsa (Bamaw Hsayadaw), Ashin. (05-14 June 2009). Myat pa-htan” dethana
hnin’ wi’pathana nyansin (Teaching of the Great Paṭṭhāna and Knowledges of
Vipassana). Yangon. (Accessed from
&id=258&Itemid=78 on 16/09/2010).

Video Sources

Khin Hla Tin, Daw. (24 January 2004). A-hkye-hkan pahtan kyinsin (Basic Applied
Paṭṭhāna). Yangon. (Accessed from
http://www.dhammadownload.com/DhammaByuharDawKhinHlaTin-
Video.htm on 04/02/2011).

Lin, K. (01 January 2011). Athan mase Pahtan pwae, Pyay (Uninterrupted Recitation
Ceremony of the Paṭṭhāna, Pyay) (Accessed from an informant on 10/01/2011)

Dīpankara, Hsayalay. - ref. Pa-auk Sayadaw
http://www.youtube.com/watch?v= _t6UlUTjK_g - @ 1.25-2.50 mins

Websites

http://trove.nla.gov.au/work/8355261?q&l-
language=Burmese&c=article&versionId=9632985

http://www.abhidhamma.com/
http://abhidhamma-apa.org/index.htm