“When someone becomes old then every part of the body too becomes old”: experiences of living with dementia in Kintampo, rural Ghana

Studies have suggested that in African countries, symptoms of cognitive decline are commonly seen as part of “normal ageing” or attributed to supernatural causes. The impact of causality beliefs upon help-seeking is unclear. Likewise, there is a lack of evidence relating to how families cope with living with an older resident with dementia. Our study aim was to explore the sociocultural beliefs, understandings, perceptions and behaviours relating to living with dementia in Kintampo, Ghana. We conducted in-depth interviews with a total of 28 people, using a series of case studies among 10 older people living with dementia and their families. Results revealed that symptoms of cognitive impairment were generally linked to inexorable bodily decline seen to be characteristic of “normal” ageing. Stigma was therefore perceived to be non-existent. Whilst managing the costs of care was often a challenge, care-giving was largely accepted as a filial duty, commonly shared among female residents of large compound households. Families experimented with biomedical and traditional medicine for chronic conditions they perceived to be treatable. Our findings suggest that whilst families offer a coherent approach to the needs of older people living with chronic conditions including dementia, health and social policies are at odds with this. In future, it will be important to develop policy frameworks that: acknowledge the continued social and economic potential of older people and strengthen the existing approach of families, optimising the management of non-communicable diseases within primary care.

Keywords: Dementia, qualitative research, ageing, help-seeking, Ghana
Background

Longer life expectancy and lower fertility are changing the demographic profile of sub-Saharan Africa (SSA), with the number of older people aged more than 65 expected to expand from 46 million in 2015 to 157 million by 2050 (I. A. Aboderin & Beard, 2015). Although the prevalence of dementia was once thought to be lower in SSA as compared with high income countries (Guerchet et al., 2010), a small but expanding epidemiological literature suggests that the prevalence may be similar across different world regions (M. Prince et al., 2013), with the number of people living with dementia forecasted to increase from 1.63 million in 2015 to 5.73 million by 2050 (Prince M, 2015).

There is a scarcity of knowledge relating to local understandings of dementia in sub-Saharan Africa. Studies have suggested that symptoms of cognitive decline are commonly perceived to be either a part of normal ageing (Ineichen, 2000) or attributable to supernatural causes (Mushi et al., 2014). It has been suggested that those who attribute dementia to the supernatural may be more likely to seek care from traditional and spiritual healers (Mushi et al., 2014; Uwakwe et al., 2009). Such explanatory models are also likely to influence coping behaviours of older people living with dementia and their families. Beliefs about causality may be linked to how communities perceive and interact with people with particular conditions. For example, in traditional societies, belief in supernatural causes has been linked to the stigmatisation of mental illness (Lauber & Rössler, 2007). Although in traditional societies, it has been observed that older people were honoured and respected (Chuks J Mba, 2007), there is some evidence that perceptions may be more ambivalent: although longevity is associated with knowledge and wisdom and thus deserving of respect, old age is simultaneously linked with sorcery and therefore associated with mistrust and suspicion (Faure-Delage et al., 2012).

Non-HIV-related dementia has been absent from public health and policy agendas in SSA. It is therefore important to consider the broader policy and practice context as this relates to older people in general, as the most relevant background to our work. Indeed, older people in SSA have generally been neglected by governments and non-governmental organisations alike (C. J. Mba, 2010). Although policy frameworks explicitly directed at ageing populations are beginning to emerge, these have yet to effect change in policy and practice: health and social systems therefore remain poorly equipped to meet the needs of older people. A lack of formal provision for the social and economic impacts of ageing means that family and household networks remain the key sources of social security in older age (Heslop & Gorman, 2002). However, it remains to be seen to what extent rapid socioeconomic change associated with “modernisation” is undermining the social processes which traditionally protect the material wellbeing as well as the social status of older people (Heslop & Gorman, 2002). For example, it has been suggested that transitions from subsistence farming to wage-based economies and an increased emphasis on formal education may have contributed to a devaluation of the role of older people and the level of support extended to them (I. Aboderin, 2004). Given that dementia is associated with high levels of dependence and complex needs for care (Sousa et al., 2009), it seems plausible that people living with dementia might be particularly vulnerable to any reduction in the level of family support extended to older people, particularly in settings like rural Ghana, where there is very little provision from the state.

Ghana has one of the region’s largest populations of older people with 7 per cent of the population estimated to be aged over 60 in 2010, expected to increase to 12 percent by 2050 (C. J. Mba, 2010; WHO, 2013). People aged 70 years are eligible for free basic medical care under the National Health Insurance Scheme and are exempt from annual fees. Ghana has a National Ageing Policy, the main aims of which are to: strengthen community capacity to deliver healthcare for older people, expansion of palliative care, the integration of comprehensive healthcare for older people and...
incentivisation of specialist training in geriatrics and gerontology for medical students. However, little progress has been made in the implementation of this policy, and the Ghana Health Service lacks an implementation plan ((Kwankye, 2013; World Health Organisation, 2014). Little research related to ageing and mental health has been carried out in this setting. Building on the work of the Kintampo Health Research Centre (KHRC) and the work of the 10/66 Dementia Research Group (DRG), we carried out a cross-sectional survey with a nested qualitative study among people aged 70 years or older in the Kintampo Health Demographic Surveillance Site (KHDSS). Our aim was to explore sociocultural beliefs, understandings, perceptions, and behaviours relating to living with dementia in Kintampo. Based on gaps in the evidence base, we were particularly interested to explore: i) understandings and experiences of dementia, including beliefs about causality and stigma, help-seeking behaviours; ii) care arrangements and the impact of caregiving.

Methods

We conducted in-depth interviews with a total of 28 people using series of case studies among 10 older people living with dementia and their families. The overall aim was to obtain multiple perspectives on the experience of living with an older person with dementia (Crowe et al., 2011; Yin, 2009). This approach has been used successfully in the 10/66 DRG INDEP studies in Peru, Mexico, China, and Nigeria (Mayston et al., 2014), and by other research teams in Tanzania (Mayston et al., 2014) and Norway (Smebye, Kirkevold, & Engedal, 2012). The sampling frame was participants in our quantitative cross-sectional survey who were identified as cases of dementia through a preliminary processing of the data, using the 10/66 DRG short dementia diagnostic schedule (Stewart, Guerchet, & Prince, 2016). The 10/66 DRG algorithm has demonstrated excellent validity in identification of dementia cases in a wide range of low and middle income country settings (M. Prince et al., 2009). It was not feasible to obtain a clinical diagnosis in the context of this study. In settings where dementia is very rarely diagnosed in any part of the health system, a one-stage, culture- and education-fair screening tool is amongst the most feasible and valid means of identifying dementia cases for the purpose of epidemiological research (M. Prince et al., 2003). When compared against results of the original 10/66 DRG algorithm, the short-schedule version attained sensitivity and specificity in detecting dementia that were equivalent to the high levels obtained using the original algorithm (Stewart et al., 2016). Given the established validity of this approach, as we would expect, distribution of cognitive test scores between our qualitative sampling frame and study participants without dementia were consistent with differences identified in studies carried out elsewhere in sub-Saharan Africa (Guerchet et al., 2010).

Setting

Our study was carried out in collaboration with the KHRC, in the Kintampo Municipality. Kintampo is located in the middle belt of Ghana in the Brong Ahafo Region. It is a rural community, with farming as the main economic activity (Owusu-Agyei et al., 2012). Kintampo is made up of 11 ethnic groups with Akan the largest group, comprising 25.0% of the total population. The average size of a household is 5 families, commonly resident within a compound made up of up to 10 separate blocks clustered together. Researchers have begun to explore undertaking dementia research in the KHDSS, which resulted in the translation of some components of the 10/66 Dementia Research Group assessment prior to our work. However, ours is the first study to use these instruments to carry out population-based research in this setting.

Sampling

Using the KHDSS register as our sampling frame, we identified 4222 people aged over 70 years at the start of data collection. Our sample size calculation for the quantitative study (from which our
A qualitative sample was drawn based upon an anticipated dementia prevalence of 10 percent. In order to recruit the necessary 864 participants, we estimated that we would need to target older people aged 70 years and above within an 18km radius of the KHRC. Older people were eligible to participate if they: i) were verified in the KHDSS register as normally resident within catchment area during the study period, ii) understood information about the nature and purpose of the study, iii) agreed to participate and signed to acknowledge informed consent (thumb print with witness if lacking the literacy skills to be able to sign), iv) understood and spoke Twi. We excluded older people who were: i) not matched from the register, ii) verified in the KHDSS register but moved out of the study area or deceased.

NA, SN and 4 field supervisors visited households identified from the register and introduced the study. Information sheets and consent forms were verbally explained and left with households for 24 hours to enable potential participants to absorb and consider the information provided. Interviews were arranged with those who consented to participate. Participants were informed that their household might be selected to participate in a second qualitative interview. We completed quantitative interviews with 761 older people and their key informants. The 10/66 DRG short dementia diagnostic schedule identified 17 people with dementia (Stewart et al., 2016), which formed the sampling frame for the qualitative study.

We purposively selected 10 households based on characteristics that we thought might influence experiences of living with dementia, for example: sex, household size and structure, and age. Selection criteria were designed to maximise diversity among our sample. Our sample size was pragmatic, based on feasibility within the scope of our exploratory mixed methods study. We anticipated that this sample size would enable us to get close to saturation on our a priori topics of interest.

Recruitment and data collection

After completion of quantitative data collection and preliminary processing of data, two health researchers (NA and SN), with backgrounds in social sciences (demography, qualitative research methods) returned to households selected for participation in the qualitative study to carry out in-depth interviews. In order to identify the key members of the household/family involved in practical care work, decision-making or economic support, we carried out a relationship mapping exercise with the head of household at the start of the interviews. We selected interviewees for participation on the basis of findings from this exercise, where possible our aim was to interview the older person themselves and the key people involved in their care. All interviews were audio recorded with the permission of participants. Field notes (key words, phrases, events, observations) were taken to supplement the data included in transcripts. Interviews were conducted from September to October 2015.

We used an adapted version of the 10/66 DRG INDEP study topic guide as a starting point for the development of our topic guide. The aim of INDEP was to study the economic impact and needs for care among older people in four low and middle income countries (Mayston et al., 2014). Given our focus on the lived experience of dementia, causality, care arrangements etc. we amended the INDEP topic guide to include Kleinman’s explanatory model interview questions (Kleinman, 1980), in order to elicit responses on these topics. We carried out interviews in a narrative style. We selected this approach as a naturalistic way for interviewees to “tell their story” about the onset, course and impact of dementia (Jovchelovitch & Bauer, 2000; Muylaert, Sarubbi Jr, Gallo, & Neto, 2014): described by interviewers as “problems with memory, concentration and thinking which are serious enough to affect day-to-day living”. We also included prompts to probe for responses related to any
a priori topics of interest that were not covered in the narratives or where the interviewer felt the expansion of a particular theme would offer helpful insights, for example: asking about whether they had sought help for the problems described and their experiences of help-seeking for dementia.

Ethical approval was sought and obtained from the King’s College London Research Ethic Committee (REC) and Kintampo Health Research Centre’s Institutional Ethics Committee (IEC).

Analysis

We transcribed all the interviews verbatim from the local language (Twi) directly into English using Microsoft word. We anonymised notes/transcripts from the field by redacting identifying details after transcription. The data were managed using Open Code 4.0 qualitative software (University of Umeå, 2013). NA and RM read the data repeatedly and familiarised themselves with the content. We used a framework approach for our analyses (Furber, 2010; Ritchie & Lewis, 2003). The framework approach facilitates use of a priori codes derived from literature as well as enabling new codes to emerge from the data. It also allows within case analysis as well as facilitates identification of crosscutting themes (Feilzer, 2010; Gale, Heath, Cameron, Rashid, & Redwood, 2013). Given our defined area of interest we were keen to look at similarities and differences in perspectives within families as well as identifying commonalities across households. We selected initial codes and sub-codes with reference to published literature and a priori topics of interest. NA developed the initial coding framework, discussed and agreed with RM. Both researchers then independently applied framework to the dataset. Additional codes that emerged during our analyses were added to the framework. NA and RM then met to discuss their frameworks and coding. NA consolidated coding according to this framework. NA and RM met to discuss and mapped out themes.

Results

See Table 1 for a description of the characteristics of the households selected for qualitative interviews. Table 2. Describes categories, themes and sub-themes identified in our analyses and described in detail in our results.

Table 1. Household characteristics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Household code</th>
<th>Sex</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Co-residents</th>
<th>Primary caregivers</th>
<th>Household structure &amp; arrangements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>AS 0552</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>Spouse, son, &amp; older grandson (not living in household)</td>
<td>Spouse, children &amp; grandchildren</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>NN 0133</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Spouse, &amp; eldest son</td>
<td>Spouse, sons, nieces &amp; other relatives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>NN 0081</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>All</td>
<td>Spouse, daughter-in-law, grandchildren</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>AS 0533</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Spouse &amp; son (not living in household)</td>
<td>Spouse &amp; tenant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>OP 0088</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Daughter and grandchildren</td>
<td>Daughters, grandchildren &amp; great grandchildren</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>BB 0731</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Daughter &amp; granddaughter</td>
<td>Granddaughters &amp; other tenants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>PP 0010</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Daughter and granddaughters</td>
<td>Daughters &amp; grandchildren</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>AB 0075</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Grandson</td>
<td>Daughter-in-law &amp; 4 grandsons</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 2. Categories, themes and sub-themes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CATEGORIES</th>
<th>THEMES</th>
<th>SUB-THEMES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SYMPTOMS</td>
<td>Cognitive problems</td>
<td>Problems with language, getting lost</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Physical co-morbidities</td>
<td>Mobility, aches and pains, stroke, blood pressure, hearing/sight</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNDERSTANDINGS OF COGNITIVE SYMPTOMS</td>
<td>Ageing</td>
<td>Cognitive have no specific name, part of overall decline</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Grief</td>
<td>Grief perceived to be a precursor to onset of cognitive decline</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Witchcraft</td>
<td>Bewitchment caused cognitive symptoms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HELP-SEEKING</td>
<td>Biomedical services</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Traditional services</td>
<td>Used in combination with biomedical/used because of perception of supernatural cause</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COURSE OF COGNITIVE ILLNESS</td>
<td>Irreversible</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CARE ARRANGEMENTS</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Decision-making</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Division of labour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECONOMIC IMPACTS OF CARE</td>
<td>Income generation</td>
<td>Generally limited impact</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Multiple demands upon household finances</td>
<td>Costs of care occur in context of other crises- sickness, poor harvest, essential building works</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Indirect healthcare costs</td>
<td>Even with insurance, transportation, herbal medicine costs are problematic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Uncertain illness trajectories</td>
<td>Future healthcare costs are unpredictable, which is problematic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STIGMA</td>
<td>Lack of stigma</td>
<td>Despite symptoms, older person is treated with respect</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Changing role

| Value of older person as an advisor is reduced, physical work is replaced with more sedentary activities |

### Symptoms narratives

#### Mental decline

The most common problems reported by family members were difficulties in holding a conversation.

Caregivers of eight of our participants described changes in the ways in which older people conversed. Older relatives were more likely to: veer off topic or forget what they were talking about, lose concentration, say things that were perceived to be not meaningful or irrelevant to the conversation, or say things that were perceived to be disinhibited. For example:

“That was not how she was ... but now she has changed ... [paused ]... looking at how she used to be then and now are different ... also nowadays she says or does things that are not sensible ... some things that she would not say to anyone before, now she says them freely ...” [HH OP0088, Daughter of older participant]

“I can converse with her but sometimes she loses concentration and it is as if she has not heard what I have been saying or said at all or maybe she has forgotten what we were talking about...I don’t know...” [HH AB0075, Grandson of older participant]

Other problems reported included forgetting words for objects or being forgetful or confused (n=4), losing things (n=2), getting lost (n=2), failing to recognise family members (n=1), unable to dress/go to the toilet/wash (n=1). Despite the absence of some of the more severe symptoms of dementia (such as aggression), participants clearly found these symptoms troubling. For example:

“What is worrying is that he doesn’t sleep at night so we also don’t sleep. Often at times when there is a “dance” [music and drumming] going on at the town centre then he will want to go there and dance. When you are not awake or you do not see him going out then you are relying on outsiders to bring him back home when they see him outside at night ... [sighs] if nobody sees him then he walks around until someone who knows him brings him home.” [HH NN0081, wife of older participant]

#### Co-morbid physical health problems

Caregivers often listed symptoms of physical health problems which co-existed alongside those associated with cognitive decline, such as: mobility problems (n=3); aches and pains (n=3); stroke (n=1); blood pressure (n=1); problems with hearing/sight (n=1).

“At first she was able to go to farm and gather firewood even when you try to stop her, she will not mind you ... she was very strong ... she will fetch all the firewood a tractor brings as if three young men went to fetch that firewood. Now she cannot even come out of her room not to even talk of going to the farm to gather firewood. When you ask her, she complains of joint pains and that she cannot walk... that is how I got to know that she has changed ... then I already mentioned to you that when I tell her something immediately I come back to ask again she has forgotten about it. So that too I have seen that she has changed.” [HH BB0731, Daughter of older participant]

#### Making sense of mental and physical decline
Ageing was the factor most commonly understood to underlie cognitive symptoms, reported by caregivers in relation to eight older relatives. One family specifically related the onset of symptoms to the time of their mother’s menopause. There was an understanding that the passage of time inevitably led to the decline of the body and mind in humans, related with the wear and tear seen in objects or decay witnessed in other natural things:

“If there is a leaf which is very green and now it had turned yellow, you now start thinking ‘when will this leaf fall down’...we sometimes think...what will happen...but God alone knows the end”

[HH NN 0081; Wife of older participant]

When asked what they called the condition associated with cognitive symptoms (eg. Difficulties holding a conversation, losing thing, getting lost etc.) participants stated that they had no specific word for this condition or someone experiencing these kinds of symptoms, rather, “the only name we know is someone who has grown very old...‘hangyena’” (HH AS0815; son of older participant).

One caregiver of an older lady (her grand-son) clearly related her problems to deterioration over time of the brain:

“You know when you buy something new and you use it for a long time it becomes old...it does not remain like you bought it. I think that is how the human brain is...when you are young it works well but when you grow old it does not work well...so when someone becomes old then every part of the body too becomes old”

[HH AB 0075; Grandson of older participant]

Grief

Grief related to the recent deaths of close relatives was thought to contribute to the onset of cognitive symptoms according to three study participants (an older lady, and two caregivers for different older participants):

“It is not because I am aging that is why I am behaving this way...if you have eight children and four of them suddenly die...now you only have four of them what will you do? When this girl’s (referring to a toddler on lap) mother died, five days later another one who lives in Kintampo also passed away” 0089

Witchcraft

Witchcraft was identified as a causal factor underlying symptoms by three participants: two caregivers (for different older people) and one older participant. One of the caregivers believed that although the older person had experienced a stroke, this event had been caused because the older participant had been bewitched. The older person in question understood that his symptoms of suddenly not being able to walk or talk were caused by a neighbour. For another caregiver, his father’s problems also had a supernatural cause:
“hmmm what I can tell you is that at times he can go somewhere and someone will have to bring him back to the house. Then there are some things in this house that he cannot lift but I noticed that sometimes he will be filled with some powers and because he is not himself he tries to lift those things like some easy thing...sometimes too he will run and climb very tall trees. That was when I realized that something was wrong with him. So, I contacted my uncle at Baniantwe and he said that at first the dwarfs wanted to possess him and he did not like it, so that is why he sometimes behaves like that” 0533

Help-seeking

Biomedical services

Participants reported that all of the older people in our qualitative sample had visited the hospital since the onset of cognitive symptoms. Physical health symptoms were generally the impetus for accessing health services. Cognitive symptoms were not generally reported to healthcare workers: they were considered to be consistent with deteriorating health but not a sickness per se:

“As I said before we took him because he complains of the stomach ache, pains in his knees or if he has body pains ... that is what we go and tell health workers ... then they will give his medicine for the ailments ...we have never reported his behaviour to the doctor ... we think its old age ... it is not sickness so that is why we did not tell the doctor” [HH NN 0081; Wife of older participant]

One caregiver reported mentioning to the healthcare worker the problems their father was having with reasoning and conversation. The healthcare worker diagnosed high blood pressure, provided medication for this and advised that alcohol and salt should be reduced in his diet. The cognitive problems were not directly addressed and the family observed no improvements in these symptoms In fact it was rare for the older person to receive a diagnosis for any of the problems presented to the healthcare worker. More commonly, they were provided with medication without further advice or information..

Traditional medicine

In five households, traditional medicine (usually herbal) was used in lieu of or in combination with “white man’s medicine” to treat the older person’s health problems. Families evaluated both treatment models in a similar way. If herbal treatments were found to be ineffective, families might switch to biomedical treatments and vice versa. Sometimes herbal and biomedical treatments were used in combination, with the aim of addressing different aspects of the same problem:

“When it happened we were told that we can only use traditional medicine because of the nature of the fracture ... and that is what we did ... we were told to put some herbs on the affected area after we had massaged the area with a hot stone ...other times to I buy some drugs that works on the bones for her to swallow” [HH BB0731; Daughter of older participant]

In the two families who believed supernatural forces were the primary cause of cognitive symptoms, although biomedicine was accessed for physical illness, traditional medicine was believed to be the only appropriate treatment for this problem:

“When it started he could not talk or walk...we did not send him to hospital to treat this kind of illness...we only used the traditional medicine and we saw that there was an improvement because he could walk...”
Course of illness

Overall, it was generally acknowledged that improvements in symptoms of sickness of older relatives (including those with a supernatural cause) might be partial and that it might not be possible to halt natural decline. Generally, families aim was to treat what they could, in order to see an improvement in the level of comfort of their older relative:

“No...no...I don’t believe it will improve...it will get worse...but maybe if we get medicine for her she might feel okay” [HH AB 0075; Grandson of older participant]

Care arrangements

Gender

Female relatives were the hands on caregivers in all households. All of the men had wives who were the primary caregivers. All six of the female participants were widows. Where there was a man involved in day-to-day activities with the older person, they identified themselves as the primary caregiver; in these cases, they made decisions about care and treatment and were responsible for finances, arranged transport to healthcare appointments, supervised medication. But in each of these households, the wife of the older person and other women in the household assisted the older person with other activities of daily life: bathing, preparing food, dressing, toileting, ensuring they were not left alone (for fear of getting lost). Being a caregiver for a husband was an integral part of being a wife, and by extension, providing care for the older members of a husband’s family was a natural extension of this role as wife and daughter-in-law. Others became de facto caregivers because of their geographical proximity to the older person and the absence of possible candidates for the role. For example, a son who was a caregiver described how all of his siblings had relocated to the city, leaving him and his wife as the only suitable caregivers for his mother; for one grand-son who was a caregiver for his grandmother, the polygamous marriage of his father meant that he spent several months of the year in the North of the country:

“I can send her to the hospital and then call and tell him [his father] about it later...then he will tell me what I should do or he will come if he has to be here.”

[HH AB 0075; Grandson of older participant]

Decision-making

Whilst decision-making was a primary component of the role of male caregivers, some female caregivers were both decision-maker and hands-on carer (usually daughters of the older person). Some primary caregivers made unilateral decisions about treatment, informing those family members not resident in the compound, but who might be expected to contribute financially to the care of the older person, after the decision had been made and treatment accessed:

“I will usually send him to the hospital first and then inform my other siblings later on...I will have to look for money and send him...at times too my other siblings can bring a car from Kintampo to send him to the hospital...we also have other relatives who help when papa is unwell. However, here in this village I take care of everything and even his insurance.”

[HH AS 0533; Son of older participant]
In other cases, the approach to treatment and care was discussed by the family, with roles and responsibilities, including financing, hands-on care and decision-making about treatment was jointly agreed:

“One person cannot decide on this issue. It was the decision of the family members that, where Grandpa’s age has gotten to it is important we take good care of him. I mentioned this earlier on that those who have travelled contribute their monies and send the foodstuffs we buy to them. My grandmother is there with other family members so those living with him help him with his daily activities ... when it comes to bathing, my grandmother is responsible; for his meals, it is my grandmother. My uncle and my aunties ... they share those responsibilities and make sure that it’s been taken care of...”

[HH AS 0052; Grandson of participant]

Division of labour

In general, caregiving was a collective activity, with hands on care duties shared among the female members of the large compound households in which the older people lived. Sometimes these arrangements were co-ordinated by a primary caregiver but more commonly these arrangements appeared to be more organic, with those most involved in care able to rely on supplementary support as and when this was necessary:

“Yes...since there are many of her grandchildren around the duties have been shared amongst them. Initially when you tell them to prepare food they will be looking at each other not knowing who to do what...when you do not mention someone’s name then they will be sitting down...so I met with them and apportioned duties for each of them. The schedule is changed every three days to ensure that each and every one is doing something”

[HH BN 0089; Daughter of older participant]

Economic impact

Income generation

Where care needs were minimal and practical care was shared among many, the impact upon income generating or subsistence activities was perceived to be limited:

“Maame’s condition has not reduced the work I do in any way...even if I go to farm there is someone who helps to care for her...we are many here so every time there is someone at home so if you are not at home you are not worried. Maame also has many grandchildren it is not a problem to leave her for a while and go to the farm to work...they take care of her needs...she can also do some things for herself”

[HH OP 0088; Daughter of older participant]

Multiple demands

Taking care of the older person occurred in the context of multiple demands upon family finances, with the children of the older person commonly supporting their own young families. Given this backdrop of already stretched finances, crises, such as poor harvest, sickness of a family member or essential building works, were particularly challenging and commonly necessitated requests for funds from family members outside the immediate household:
“As you can see these days money is difficult to get...all of my other siblings are married and have children to take care of...they pay school fees and other things so in terms of money it is very difficult to come by...but when this building almost collapsed it was my sister who gave us money to rebuild and maintain it. When I also fell sick my sister gave me money to go to the hospital and they told me it was high fever...you see when we were rebuilding the house I roofed the house and a nail pricked me the time I was doing it but I did not tell anyone...my foot swelled and I could not wear a shoe...”

[HH AS 0533; Son of older participant]

Indirect costs

Most of the older people we interviewed had public health insurance (although in at least one case this had lapsed). This was generally perceived positively by the families. However, transport and herbal medicine remained a significant cost. Some of those who were uninsured reported that economic constraints limited access to treatment:

“I am talking of the means...that is money to send her somewhere for her condition to be treated...we don’t have it...I am even talking about her eye problem, if I send her to the hospital they can treat her...but I don’t have the means...if I had, I would look for treatment for her eye problem to go away so that she can see well”

[HH AS 0815; Son of older participant]

Uncertain trajectories

For this family, the uncertainty of the trajectory of the health of the older lady and the management of future costs associated with illness was a source of concern:

“we know that she will not live forever and she will die one day...she can live very long or even die tomorrow but when she grows very old and has all kinds of small, small illnesses that is where the problem can be...we don’t know when she will tell us this part is paining her and we two we don’t have the means”

[HH AS 0815; Daughter-in-law of older participant]

Stigma

When prompted as to whether they felt that they or the older person had ever been treated badly because of the condition of the older person, participants universally responded that the community treated the older person well and with respect. This was felt to be manifest in friends and neighbours greeting the older person, asking how they were doing, coming to visit, sit and talk with them. Getting lost, difficulties in having conversations, forgetfulness were accepted as symptomatic of ageing when exhibited among older people, rather than “madness”. As such, older people displaying these behaviours might experience some “teasing” from small children, but this was not felt to violate the respect that was felt to be owed to older people:

“Son: Sometimes some of the young people tease him but they are not disrespectful...”

Interviewer: “Please in what ways do they tease him?”

Son: “The way he speaks...always calling death and saying he will die, he will die, something small then he will say he will die. I keep on telling him that he will not die. If he will die, then on the spot he will die....right now we do not consider anything he says...even when he is asking you for money he
will say give him “Simpoa” [previous currency that was being used]...so they make fun of him. Had it not been that he is old we will say he is mad”

[HH AS 0533; Son of older participant]

Older people with these symptoms were routinely referred to as “childlike” by interviewees.

Changing role of the older person

This was linked to the transition in role of the older person, from being someone who was valued as a confidante and advisor to being someone who needed to be taken care of and whose opinion was regretfully no longer trusted or valued. This change was experienced as a loss by close family members:

“When she was a bit younger, I used to come to her for advice which was very useful when I followed it...but now if I come and ask her for advice...what she will say does not bring anything good in my life...I have realized I do not have anyone who will advise me again ...when I think about these things then I begin to cry...that is why I say I am worried about her condition now”

[HH AS 0815; Son of older participant]

Other aspects of the transition in the role of the older person appeared easier for families to manage. For example, although it was recognised that it was no longer possible for the older person to carry out farming or go to market as they once did, the value of occupation was recognised by families and older people were encouraged and supported to carry out alternative meaningful activities:

“...she can do a lot of things on her own with her hands and when she is sitting down...you can see her de-husking the maize for the poultry...”

[HH AB 0075; Grandson of older participants]

Discussion

Our study was designed to examine experiences of dementia. However, we found that it was not always possible or appropriate to separate experiences of dementia from those of other chronic conditions. Consistent with qualitative research carried out in Tanzania (Mushi et al., 2014), participants reported that they had no specific term for people living with dementia, rather they were referred to as “hangyena”, translated as “very old”. Comparable with the metaphor of an old car identified in a different qualitative study carried out among traditional and faith healers in Tanzania (Hindley et al., 2016), participants in our study conceptualised problems associated with ageing as accumulated “wear and tear” over time due to usage. Although within this holistic model, participants sometimes made a distinction between body and mind (Patel, 1995) (linking symptoms of cognitive impairment with wear and tear of the brain) dementia was not always the salient element of participants’ experience. Participants viewed the health of older people holistically, describing the overall collection of symptoms observed and responding to needs for treatment and care (to which dementia contributed) as they arose. This reflects experiences of health and sickness of older people and their families around the world, where multi-morbidity is common and broad outcomes such as disability and needs for care are more salient and important to older people and their families than diagnosis and aetiology.

Perceived aetiology did however play a role in shaping the character of help-seeking. As has been found elsewhere, families who believed witchcraft to be the primary cause of cognitive symptoms opted for traditional healing in the first instance (Dale & Ben-Tovim, 1984). However, families who
identified “ageing” as the primary cause tended to experiment with biomedical and traditional treatments, switching services when a particular treatment was found to be ineffectual. Ultimately, many of the symptoms of old age were understood to be untreatable and characteristic of inexorable decline. Participants commonly located cognitive symptoms in this category. However, in a setting where there is low recognition of chronic conditions associated with old age among health professionals (de-Graft Aikins, Addo, Ofei, Bosu, & Agymang, 2012), it is difficult to ascertain what role this lack of services played in determining attitudes to help-seeking for chronic conditions, including cognitive impairment. The impact of the absence of appropriate services and the perhaps concomitant perception of the un-treatability of cognitive symptoms may have contributed to a lack of focus upon cognitive deficits in interview narratives.

Some of our findings provide an interesting contrast with those from the 10/66 Dementia Research Group INDEP study. In our site in rural Ghana, the work of caring appeared to be more seamlessly absorbed into the daily tasks of the women within large family compounds than for women in Latin America, China and Nigeria. Unlike among participants in our sites in urban Latin America, where some women were beginning to challenge their de facto role as caregivers to older family members (Mayston et al., 2014), none of the female caregivers we interviewed in Kintampo questioned their status. In addition, in other settings, the stresses and strains of being a caregiver and attempting to meet the costs of care were strong themes (Martin Prince, 2004; M. Prince et al., 2012), whereas in Kintampo, although participants expressed concern for the health of their family member, any adverse effects upon their own wellbeing were largely absent from our interviews. Only a minority of our interviewees described caregiving as a major constraint on their income generation activities. There are some obvious factors that may have contributed to these differences. It seems possible that traditional gendering of roles and the salience of seniority and filial obligations remain more strongly intact in this setting, retaining their influence in ordering relations and social actions (Udvardy & Cattell, 1992). Certainly, from our interviews, it seems clear that compound household structures facilitated amicable distribution of care duties among many. Interviewer field notes suggest that although most of the older people interviewed displayed symptoms of cognitive impairment, many of the signs and symptoms associated with severe dementia (e.g. agitation, aggression, incontinence) found to be particularly associated with strain elsewhere, appeared to be absent (Ferri, Ames, & Prince, 2004). This may explain why cognitive symptoms did not appear to significantly change the shape of care arrangements.

Finally, given that the primary activities in the region are farming and small trade, with low participation in formal labour, particularly among women, the kinds of economic activities caregivers were carrying out were more flexible and likely to be closer to home than the jobs and careers of women living in urban Peru, Mexico and China (Mayston et al., 2014). Finally, health insurance appeared to mitigate the worst impacts of the costs of chronic conditions for some. It was clear that not all families were reaping the potential benefits of health insurance, although the reasons for this were unclear. Although the Government of Ghana’s aim is equitable and universal access to a package of essential healthcare, like elsewhere, coverage remains stubbornly low: less than 50% among people aged older 70 years (World Health Organisation, 2014). Contributory factors include: a large non-formal healthcare sector, rural communities made up of small towns with poor roads, telecommunications which inhibit health service access (Agyepong & Adjei, 2008). Further research is necessary to understand the specific barriers to accessing health insurance among older people, although lack of awareness of fee exemption of those over 70 years from fees and equity of enrolment for poorer people have been highlighted as potential concerns (Lagomarsino, Garabrant, Adyas, Muga, & Otoo, 2012).
Although it was our aim to interview older people and their family members and older people consented to participate, their voices are largely absent from narratives. Despite the fact that research ethics committees commonly stipulate that researchers should ensure privacy during research interviews, this is often not possible, due to a lack of private space and the cultural inappropriateness of separating family members, particularly older people, for interview. In our case, interviews were largely carried out as a collective activity. Our results inevitably reflect this, with the Head of Household and main caregiver often the strongest voices. Although some older people did contribute (and sometimes contradicted other family members), in general, family members spoke on behalf of older people, even though, in many cases, it was clear to the interviewer that the older person understood and was capable of participating in the interview. In our view, this situation is unavoidable and is therefore something that researchers need to be aware of as a potential influence on results rather than something that they should necessarily seek to change. A key potential limitation of our study is the lack of clinical diagnosis of dementia among our participants. We were unable to select participants on the basis of important clinical characteristics such as sub-type and duration, which may have important effects upon the experiences of caregivers and older participants. It is difficult for us to separate experiences which are a product of culture from those which are a result of cognitive impairment. Nonetheless, given the proven validity of the algorithm and its constituent instruments in other low income settings, we are confident that the older participants in the qualitative study were, in fact, living with dementia. The symptoms of cognitive impairment described in qualitative narratives by participants triangulate the results of the 10/66 DRG short dementia diagnostic schedule. In a region where despite rapidly rising numbers of older people, and there is very little qualitative work designed to understand experiences of health in older age, we believe that our exploratory study is an important initial contribution to the evidence-base which will be necessary to develop effective policies and services in coming years.

Conclusions

Our findings demonstrate that families in Ghana have a coherent explanatory model for health problems associated with older age, characterised as natural decline, within which beliefs about symptoms related to cognitive impairment are nested. Alongside other related belief systems such as gender roles and beliefs about the importance of seniority and filial duty, beliefs about health, sickness and personhood in old age guide approaches to caregiving, help-seeking and the role of older people. In contrast, social policies and the health system are at odds with the experience and needs of older people and their families (World Health Organisation, 2014). It is important that policies acknowledge the continuing social and economic potential of older people, including those living with dementia, for example, the continued roll-out of social pensions, which have been found to have a positive impact upon the socioeconomic status of the entire household where the older person is resident (Heslop & Gorman, 2002). Specific challenges in the health system in Ghana include: the lack of guidelines for chronic disease care, erratic supply of essential drugs and equipment at facilities, lack of old age specialists, poorly trained healthcare workers with insufficient knowledge of common chronic diseases (de-Graft Aikins et al., 2012). There is emerging evidence that effective care for chronic diseases associated with old age, including dementia, can be delivered by non-specialist workers providing outreach to older people’s home from primary healthcare centres in low and middle income country settings (Guerra, Ferri, Fonseca, Banerjee, & Prince, 2011; Jotheeswaran et al., 2015). This approach is one potentially cost-effective means to rapid scale-up of the services that will be needed to address the increase in chronic disease that will inevitably accompany rapid population ageing.
References


S0140-6736(14)61602-0 [pii]


1471-2288-11-100 [pii]


000335626

de-0002-0084 [pii]


