Machine learning shows association between genetic variability in PPARG and cerebral connectivity in preterm infants

Michelle L. Krishnan\textsuperscript{a}, Zi Wang\textsuperscript{a}, Paul Aljabar\textsuperscript{b}, Gareth Ball\textsuperscript{a}, Ghazala Mirza\textsuperscript{c}, Alka Saxena\textsuperscript{a}, Serena J. Counsell\textsuperscript{a}, Joseph V. Hajnal\textsuperscript{a, b}, Giovanni Montana\textsuperscript{b, c}, and A. David Edwards\textsuperscript{a, 1, 2}

\textsuperscript{a}Centre for the Developing Brain, King’s College London, St. Thomas’ Hospital, London SE1 7EH, United Kingdom; \textsuperscript{b}Department of Biomedical Engineering, King’s College London, St. Thomas’ Hospital, London SE1 7EH, United Kingdom; and \textsuperscript{c}Genomics Core Facility, National Institute for Health Research Biomedical Research Centre, Guy’s and St. Thomas’ National Health Service Foundation Trust, London SE1 9RT, United Kingdom

Preterm infants show abnormal structural and functional brain development, and have a high risk of long-term neurocognitive problems. The molecular and cellular mechanisms involved are poorly understood, but novel methods now make it possible to address them by examining the relationship between common genetic variability and brain endophenotype. We addressed the hypothesis that variability in the Peroxisome Proliferator Activated Receptor (PPAR) pathway would be related to brain development. We employed machine learning in an unsupervised, unbiased, combined analysis of whole-brain diffusion tractography together with genomewide, single-nucleotide polymorphism (SNP)-based genotypes from a cohort of 272 preterm infants, using Sparse Reduced Rank Regression (sRRR) and correcting for ethnicity and age at birth and imaging. Empirical selection frequencies for SNPs associated with cerebral connectivity ranged from 0.663 to zero, with multiple highly selected SNPs mapping to genes for PPARG (six SNPs), ITGA6 (four SNPs), and FXR1 (two SNPs). SNPs in PPARG were significantly overrepresented (ranked 7–11 and 67 of 556,000 SNPs; \( P < 2.2 \times 10^{-17} \)), and were mostly in introns or regulatory regions with predicted effects including protein coding and nonsense-mediated decay. Edge-centric graph-theoretic analysis showed that highly selected white-matter tracts were consistent across the group and important for information transfer (\( P < 2.2 \times 10^{-17} \)); they most often connected to the insula (\( P < 6 \times 10^{-17} \)). These results suggest that the inhibited brain development seen in humans exposed to the stress of a premature extraterine environment is modulated by genetic factors, and that PPARG signaling has a previously unrecognized role in cerebral development.

Preterm infants show abnormal structural and functional brain development, and have a high risk of long-term neurocognitive problems. The molecular and cellular mechanisms involved are poorly understood, but novel methods now make it possible to address them by examining the relationship between common genetic variability and brain endophenotype. We addressed the hypothesis that variability in the Peroxisome Proliferator Activated Receptor (PPAR) pathway would be related to brain development. We employed machine learning in an unsupervised, unbiased, combined analysis of whole-brain diffusion tractography together with genomewide, single-nucleotide polymorphism (SNP)-based genotypes from a cohort of 272 preterm infants, using Sparse Reduced Rank Regression (sRRR) and correcting for ethnicity and age at birth and imaging. Empirical selection frequencies for SNPs associated with cerebral connectivity ranged from 0.663 to zero, with multiple highly selected SNPs mapping to genes for PPARG (six SNPs), ITGA6 (four SNPs), and FXR1 (two SNPs). SNPs in PPARG were significantly overrepresented (ranked 7–11 and 67 of 556,000 SNPs; \( P < 2.2 \times 10^{-17} \)), and were mostly in introns or regulatory regions with predicted effects including protein coding and nonsense-mediated decay. Edge-centric graph-theoretic analysis showed that highly selected white-matter tracts were consistent across the group and important for information transfer (\( P < 2.2 \times 10^{-17} \)); they most often connected to the insula (\( P < 6 \times 10^{-17} \)). These results suggest that the inhibited brain development seen in humans exposed to the stress of a premature extraterine environment is modulated by genetic factors, and that PPARG signaling has a previously unrecognized role in cerebral development.

Previously, our preliminary candidate gene and genomewide pathway-based studies have suggested an association between white-matter development and a number of metabolic pathways, with the strongest link to the Peroxisome Proliferator Activated Receptor (PPAR) pathway (12, 13), raising the hypothesis that the PPAR pathway modulates brain development in preterm infants. To test this, and to explore genetic influences on preterm brain development further, we collected a large cohort of linked diffusion MRI (d-MRI) and genomic data, and undertook an unsupervised, unbiased machine-learning analysis of whole-brain diffusion tractography together with genomewide, single-nucleotide polymorphism (SNP)-based genotypes.

Results

Participants. A cohort of 272 infants born at less than 33 wk gestational age (GA) (mean 29 wk + 4 d) had suitable imaging at term-equivalent age [mean age at scan (SA) 42 wk + 4 d] and allied genomic DNA available (SI Appendix, Supplementary Methods).

Population Stratification. Relatedness between individuals in the cohort was assessed by calculating pairwise identity by state (IBS) values and using this distance matrix to perform principal component analysis. This revealed a degree of stratification along the first two components, corresponding to parental self-reported ethnicity (SI Appendix, Fig. S1). The first principal component accounted for 20.4% of the total variation, while the second component accounted for 10.2% of the total variation.

Significance

Preterm birth affects 11% of births globally; 35% of infants develop long-term neurocognitive problems, and prematurity leads to the loss of 75 million disability adjusted life years per annum worldwide. Imaging studies have shown that these infants have extensive alterations in brain development, but little is known about the molecular or cellular mechanisms involved. This imaging genetics study found a strong association between abnormal cerebral connectivity and variability in the PPARG gene, implicating PPARG signaling in abnormal white-matter development in preterm infants and suggesting a tractable new target for therapeutic research.


The authors declare no conflict of interest.

This article is a PNAS Direct Submission.

This open access article is distributed under Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives License 4.0 (CC BY-NC-ND).

1G. Montana and A.D.E. contributed equally to this work.

2To whom correspondence should be addressed. Email: ad.edwards@kcl.ac.uk.

This article contains supporting information online at www.pnas.org/lookup/suppl/doi:10.1073/pnas.1704907114/-/DCSupplemental.
component of the IBS matrix was used as a covariate for adjustment of the phenotype.

**Sparse Reduced Rank Regression Selects a Consistent Cerebral Endophenotype.** White-matter tracts, defined as the edges in the tractography connectivity matrix, were ranked according to their selection probabilities in the Sparse Reduced Rank Regression (sRRR) model. Selection frequencies ranged from 0.817 to zero; Fig. 1 shows the 100 most frequently selected edges. Two separate approaches were employed to eliminate individual relationships between imaging and genetic data and achieve a set of null results: (i) permutation of individuals within the imaging dataset; and (ii) replacing the original phenotype matrix with a matrix of randomly generated values with standard normal distribution and the same dimensions. Fig. 1 shows the empirical distribution together with these two null sets. The random replacement, but not the permutation of individuals, produced a null distribution with uniformly low selection frequency, which demonstrates a level of similarity between individuals and a consistent endophenotype.

**Consistently Selected White-Matter Tracts Have a Significant Role in Information Flow.** To understand the cerebral endophenotype further, the 10 tractography connections selected most often in the sRRR model were visualized according to University of North Carolina Automated Anatomical Labeling atlas coordinates using BrainNet Viewer software (14), and the group median connectivity matrix was examined from an edge-centric perspective, applying graph theoretical measures to detect link communities (15). These tracts were distributed within middle-frontal, middle-temporal, and parahippocampal/entorhinal link communities (15), and integrated fractional anisotropy ranged from 0.06 to 0.2 (Fig. 1, *Inset* and SI Appendix, Figs. S3 and S4).

Their impact on information flow in the network was then studied using an “edge lesioning” strategy (15), in which the effect on global communicability of removing them was compared with the effect of removing other sets of 10 edges at random. Global communicability captures information flow in the network and accounts for both shortest paths and all other paths connecting two nodes (16). Removal of the top 10 tracts decreased global communicability from an unlesioned baseline of $1 - 0.858$, significantly more than in 1,000 random lesions (SI Appendix, Fig. S5, $P < 2.2 \times 10^{-17}$, Wilcoxon rank sum test), supporting the importance of highly selected white-matter tracts in the cerebral network architecture. The cortical regions linked by the 100 most highly selected tracts were extracted and counted (Fig. 2), with the insular cortex occurring significantly more frequently than predicted ($P < 6 \times 10^{-17}$, Fisher’s Exact Test).

**Genetic Variation Is Associated with the Preterm Cerebral Endophenotype.** Genetic associations with image features were identified using the sRRR method as previously reported (17, 18). Genomewide SNPs were ranked according to their selection probabilities in the sRRR model, and the empirical and null distributions were inspected. This revealed empirical selection frequencies between 0.663 and zero, with a steeper rate of decrease after the top 100 ranked SNPs, and uniformly low null distribution (Fig. 3). The top 100 SNPs were thus examined in more detail as a stringent subset of genetic variables most highly and stably associated with the tractography features (SI Appendix, Table S4). These top 100 SNPs mapped to 47 genes (SI Appendix, Table S1), mostly in linkage equilibrium with each other apart from three separate hotspots of linkage disequilibrium centered on the genes PPARG (six SNPs), Integrin Subunit Alpha 6 (ITGA6) (four SNPs), and Fragile X Mental Retardation, Autosomal Homolog 1 (FXR1) (two SNPs).

**SNPs in the PPARG Gene Are Most Highly Associated with Variability in Imaging Features.** SNPs in PPARG were significantly over-represented among the top 100 SNPs ($P < 2.2 \times 10^{-7}$, Fisher’s Exact Test), ranked by the sRRR model according to strength of association in positions 7–11 (rs17036282, rs6801982, rs4135334, rs4135336, rs4135342), and position 67 (rs6442313) of 556,000, with uniform selection frequencies of 0.663. The PPARG SNPs were mostly in intronic or regulatory regions (promoter flanking regions and open chromatin regions) (SI Appendix, Fig. S6), with predicted effects on processes including protein coding, retained introns, and nonsense-mediated decay (SI Appendix, Table S2).

**Highly Associated Genes Are Involved in Biological Processes Including Lipid Metabolism.** To explore the 47 top-ranked genes the Gene Ontology (GO) framework was surveyed using the Cytoscape tool ClueGO (19) to create a functionally organized GO term network (SI Appendix, Fig. S7). This revealed several significantly overrepresented themes of interest (hypergeometric test, adjusted $P < 0.05$ with Benjamini–Hochberg correction) including lipid metabolism (PPARG), neuron projection regeneration (ADM, PBRX1), response to nerve growth factor stimulation (BPTF, EP300), acetylcholine biosynthesis (CHAT), and presynaptic membrane assembly (PTPRD) (full annotation in SI Appendix, Table S3).

Given the significant overrepresentation of PPARG SNPs among the most highly ranked SNPs and our previous finding of association between lipid metabolism genes and white-matter integrity in preterms (12, 13), the top 100 SNPs were tested for significant overlap with a list of SNPs mapping to genes classified as...
with the GO term “lipid metabolism” (GO: 0006629), using the R package SuperExactTest (20). Four genes (PPARG, ADM, CHAT, and PNPL6) involved in lipid metabolism according to the GO classification were present among the top 100 SNPs ranked by sRRR, more than would be expected by chance ($P < 0.005$) (Fig. 4). As a null frame of reference, this result was compared with the overlap between the bottom-ranked 100 SNPs and the GO lipid list, which was not significant.

**Highly Associated Genes Are Associated with Neuropsychiatric Diseases.**

Given the uniform selection frequency of the top 100 ranked SNPs, we examined evidence in literature for all their mapped genes. A machine-learning-based text-mining strategy was employed, using the Agilent Literature Search tool in Cytoscape (21) to query text-based search engines and extract associations among the genes, visualizing them as a network with the sentences for each association forming the network edges (SI Appendix, Fig. S8). Mentions of at least 2 of the 47 genes of interest were found in 405 Pubmed-indexed abstracts, which were queried for the occurrence of disease terms using the tool pubmed.mineR (22). The most frequently occurring disease terms related to cancer, reflecting a known ascertainment bias in the literature (23). Once cancer-related terms were removed, the most frequently occurring disease terms were “autism spectrum disorder,” “intellectual disability,” and “schizophrenia” (SI Appendix, Fig. S9), neuropsychiatric conditions more common in the preterm population.

**Discussion**

The molecular and cellular events leading to abnormal brain development in preterm infants are poorly understood, but hypoxia, ischemia, and inflammation are all believed to play a role (11) and the host response to these external insults is modulated by the combined effects of multiple genes (24, 25). The present results are consistent with the hypothesis that changes in white-matter structure that predict adverse outcome are modulated by genetic variability in the PPAR signaling pathway.

The genetic imaging approach relies on heritability and an appropriate endophenotype. Common DNA sequence variation is estimated to account for up to 50% of additive genetic variation in complex traits, including neuroanatomical features (26) and neurocognitive disorders including ASD (27) and schizophrenia (28). Imaging cerebral endophenotypes generally have high heritability and relevance (29, 30): in the neonatal period 60% of the variability between individuals in d-MRI features can be attributed to genetic factors (31, 32), and d-MRI measures of white-matter structure predict neurodevelopmental outcome (33–35). Analysis of the cerebral connections selected by the
algorithm showed that they were stable within the group, and virtual lesioning showed that they are important for information transfer in the network. They thus represent structures that are highly relevant to long-term neurological function.

Machine learning using penalized regression provided an unsupervised, unbiased method to address the hypothesis. sRRR is specifically designed to deal with cohorts where the number of individuals is smaller than the number of features, and outperforms mass-univariate linear models when considering genetic effect sizes comparable to those expected here (17). The approach involves fitting a predictive model for the phenotype using all SNPs, while also ranking all SNPs based on their predictive value, and is of benefit in imaging genomics studies where there are many more features than individuals and the number of possible hypotheses is vast (17, 36). The strategy is not impacted by multiple testing concerns since sRRR is based on selecting the variables that contribute most to the relationship between predictors and responses within a multivariate model, rather than performing repeated univariate tests.

In addition to testing the primary hypothesis, the study produced further observations. First, other genes were found to be linked to the endophenotype: Integrin Subunit Alpha 6 (ITGA6) (four SNPs) which is involved in insulin-like growth factor 1 signaling, and Fraternal X Mental Retardation, Autosomal Homolog 1 (FRAX1) (two SNPs), while genes involved in lipid metabolism, various neural processes, and neuropsychiatric disease appear to be overrepresented among highly selected SNPs. Further work is needed to understand the significance of these observations. Second, insular cortex was more frequently involved in the top 100 ranked tracts than expected by chance. This is consistent with previous observations. This region is highly connected, receiving direct input from the somatosensory cortex and projecting outputs to both cortical and subcortical regions (37) and is part of the rich club in adults (38) and preterm infants (39). In individuals born preterm the volume, surface area, and folding of the insular cortex is reduced in infancy and early adulthood (40–42) accompanied by alterations in functional activation patterns (43, 44), visual function (45), and cognition (46, 47). Insular abnormalities have been implicated in ASD (48, 49) and attention-deficit hyperactivity disorder (50, 51) that are more prevalent in the preterm population, and the insula has recently been shown in preterms to be the source of spontaneous neuronal bursts (delta brushes) that are instructive in neuronal circuit development (52).

Tractography methods aim to provide an insight into in vivo macrostructural brain connectivity via the diffusion features of brain tissue (53–55). Deterministic tractography algorithms propagate streamlines from a seed region along the main estimated fiber orientation, voxel-by-voxel, with one fiber orientation measurement taken in each voxel. This strategy has been successfully employed in the study of a wide range of neurological and psychiatric diseases, but is typically challenged by areas of high uncertainty such as in approaching the gray matter where the anisotropy is typically lower; at areas of crossing fibers where there are fiber populations traveling in different directions; in tracts such as cortico-striatal projections where functionally related anatomical subdivisions of the striatum project to different cortical areas (information funneling); and in the developing brain where there is generally less myelination and lower anisotropy in the white matter (56), resulting in penalization of long-range connections. In our analysis we therefore used advanced probabilistic approaches that provide an integrated probabilistic analysis of whole tracts by estimating the orientation dispersion function at all points in the tract simultaneously (57, 58). This requires significant computing power but provides a much more robust approach, particularly for interhemispheric fibers and in the context of the higher water content and lower myelination of the developing brain (manifesting as much lower fractional anisotropy values in white matter compared with adults), since it allows tracking to overcome areas of high uncertainty (59), and we have previously applied this successfully to the preterm brain (34).

Further work is required to characterize the exact relationship between PPARG and preterm brain development, notably to determine whether the effect is brain specific or systemic. PPARs are ligand-dependent nuclear hormone receptor transcription factors that are highly involved in cell growth, differentiation, inflammation, lipid and glucose metabolism, and homeostasis (review in ref. 60). The PPARG gene is expressed in many tissues including the brain (61), within human white matter, and across brain cell types (SI Appendix, Fig. S10). PPARG gene expression is up-regulated in neurons in response to excitotoxicity and ischemia (62, 63), and modulates the microglial response to injury (64, 65). PPARG agonists improve neuronal and glial survival in a variety of animal models involving ischemia and inflammation (62, 66–69) and it has been suggested that they provide clinical improvement in children with autism (70). The availability of safe drugs modulating PPARG means that this finding has immediate clinical implications for research into neuroprotective strategies for preterm infants.

Methods

Diffusion MR Imaging. All MRI studies were supervised by an experienced pediatrician or pediatric nurse. Pulse oximetry, temperature, and heart rate were monitored throughout the period of image acquisition; ear protection in the 3Tm of silicone-based putty was placed in the external ear (President Putty, Colteon; Whaledent) and Minimuffs (Natus Medical Inc.) were used for each infant.

MRI was performed on a Philips 3-Tesla system (Philips Medical Systems) using an eight-channel phased-array head coil, with acquisition of T2-weighted and 32 direction d-MRI images. All MR images were assessed for the presence of image artifacts and severe motion. Acquisition parameters are in SI Appendix, Supplementary Methods. The T2-weighted MRI anatomical scans were reviewed to exclude subjects with extensive brain abnormalities, major focal destructive parenchymal lesions, multiple punctuate white-matter lesions, or white-matter cysts. All MR images were assessed for
the presence of image artifacts (inferior-temporal signal dropout, aliasing, field inhomogeneity, etc.) and severe motion. All exclusion criteria were designed so as not to bias the study but preserve the full spectrum of clinical heterogeneity typical of a preterm born population.

**Diffusion Tractography.** Tractography was performed on diffusion MR data using a modified version of probabilistic tractography that gives an idea of the diffusive transfer between voxels (57). Regions of interest for seeding tractography of cortico-cortical connections were obtained by segmentation of the brain based on a 90-node anatomical neonatal atlas (71), and the resulting segmentations were registered to the diffusion space using a custom neonatal pipeline (72). A weighted adjacency matrix of brain regions was produced for each infant, from which self-connections along the diagonal were removed and upon which symmetry was enforced, with removal of the redundant lower triangle.

Tractography data were linearly adjusted for main covariates (GA, SA, ancestry) and used to reconstruct weighted connectivity matrices for each individual. Each individual matrix was converted into a single vector of numerical values corresponding to edge weights, and appended to form the rows of a single group matrix of n individuals by q edges, where n = 272 and q = 4,005. This vectorized group connectivity matrix was then adjusted for the main covariates of GA, SA, and ancestry, and used as the phenotype in the model. Additionally, a group connectivity matrix was obtained from the median of all individual subject connectivity matrices (SI Appendix, Fig. S11) and used for selected downstream analyses. Another matrix of the same dimensions n × q made up of randomly generated, normally distributed values with mean zero and SD 1 was used as the null phenotype.

**Genomewide Genotyping.** Genetic predictors consisted of the genomewide genotyped SNPs recorded in terms of minor allele counts, including SNPs with lower allele frequency (MAF) <2.5% and 100% genotyping rate. Saliva samples were collected using Oragene DNA OG-250 kits (DNAGenotek Inc.), and genotyped on Illumina HumanOmniExpress-24 v1.1 chip (Illumina). Filtering was carried out using PLINK (73). SNPs with MAF ≥5%, 100% genotyping rate, and Hardy-Weinberg equilibrium exact test P = 1 × 10−6 were retained, resulting in 556,227 SNPs for further analysis. This genotype matrix was converted into minor allele counts.

**Assessment of Population Stratification.** Whole genome SNP data were used for IBS, based on pairwise Euclidean distance as implemented in PLINK 1.9 (73), to assess relatedness between individuals. Dimension reduction in the IBS distance matrix was carried out by principal component analysis (74), and the first principal component was used as a covariate in downstream analyses to adjust for population stratification. Information on self-reported ethnicity (as defined in ISB Standard DSCN 11/2008) was collected by asking mothers (and fathers when present) to define themselves according to a list of options. The terms were drawn from Ethnic Category National Codes as in Department of Health Guidance at the time. Parental self-reported ethnicity was summarized into broader categories for the purposes of data visualization by aggregating all White subcategories into a single group “White,” all Black subcategories into “Black,” and all Asian subcategories into “Asian.” In cases where either one parent self-reported as Mixed or if there was a discrepancy between maternal and paternal ethnicities, the term “Mixed” was applied. Where parents were both from an Association of Southeast Asian Nations member state (two cases), the individual was classified by the authors as “SE Asian.” These aggregated ethnic categories were used to label the datapoints of PCA plots of the first two principal components of the IBS variance-standardized relationship matrix (SI Appendix, Fig. S11). This illustrates the correspondence between the first two components of genetic ancestry and ethnicity, and provides an overview of the cohort population mixture as well as providing a means for phenotype adjustment.

**sRRR.** Genetic associations with image features were identified using the sRRR method for multivariate modeling of high-dimensional imaging responses (measurements taken over regions of interest or individual voxels) and genetic covariates (e.g., SNPs) that enforces sparsity in the regression coefficients. To improve the power to detect causal genetic variants associated with highly dimensional imaging responses (18), in the current work, genomewide SNPs were tested for association with white-matter tracts reconstructed by probabilistic tractography. We define an n × q matrix of phenotypes Y (where the q elements are the 4,005 vectorized edges from the tractography connectivity matrix), and an n × p matrix X of minor allele counts for p SNPs (where p = 556,227 SNPs). Selection frequencies for SNPs were ranked by the sRRR method over 1,000 subsamples of 2/3 of the individuals and convergence criterion = 1 × 10−6. Model parameters in SI Appendix, Supplementary Methods.

**Computational Literature Search.** When a query is entered (e.g., a list of genes), it is submitted to the user-selected search engine, and the retrieved results (documents) are fetched from their respective sources. Each document is then parsed into sentences and analyzed for protein-protein associations. Agilent Literature Search (21) uses a set of “context” files (lexicons) for defining protein names (and aliases) and association terms (verbs) of interest.

**Graph Theory Assessment of Top 10 Imaging Variables (Edges) Ranked by sRRR.** The 10 tractography edges ranked most highly by sRRR were assessed from an “edge-centric” perspective as previously described for the adult brain (15). In the current approach, the importance of selected edges for information flow in the brain is investigated by removing the edges of interest and assessing the impact of their loss on the “communicability” of the network, compared with removing the same number of other randomly selected edges over many iterations. The communicability measure was introduced (16) as a broad generalization of the concept of shortest path between two nodes in a network, incorporating the concept that information flow in a system can also follow routes other than the shortest path (75). Details in SI Appendix, Supplementary Methods.

**Data Availability.** sRRR model code and data are available from the authors upon request, subject to approval of future uses by the National Research Ethics Service. Publicly available data: U.K.BEC (www.brainae.org); RNA-seq data (76) web.stanford.edu/group/barres_lab/braint_maseq.html; GIANT (database giant.princeton.edu); Brainspan (www.brainspan.org).

The study was approved by the National Research Ethics Service, and written informed consent was given by all participating families.

**ACKNOWLEDGMENTS.** Our thanks to the children and families who participated in the study, and the nurses, doctors, and scientists who supported the project. MRI scans of preterm infants were in part obtained during an independent program of research funded by the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR) Programme Grants for Applied Research Programme (RP-PG-0707-10154). Further details will be published in the NIHR Journal. In addition, the authors acknowledge further support from the NIHR comprehensive Biomedical Research Centre Award to Guy’s & St. Thomas’ National Health Service (NHS) Foundation Trust in partnership with King’s College London and King’s College Hospital NHS Foundation Trust, as well as support from the Medical Research Council (MRC) through a Strategic Grant (to A.D.E.) and a Clinical Training Fellowship (to M.L.K.). The views and opinions expressed by authors in this publication are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect those of the National Health Service, the National Institute for Health Research, the Medical Research Council, the National Institute for Health Research Evaluation, Trials and Studies Coordinating Centre, the Central Commissioning Facility, the Programme Grants for Applied Research program, or the Department of Health.


