



King's Research Portal

DOI:

[10.1192/bjp.2017.43](https://doi.org/10.1192/bjp.2017.43)

Document Version

Peer reviewed version

[Link to publication record in King's Research Portal](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Heslin, M., & Young, A. H. (2018). Psychotic Major Depression: Challenges in Clinical Practice and Research. *British Journal of Psychiatry*, 131-133. <https://doi.org/10.1192/bjp.2017.43>

Citing this paper

Please note that where the full-text provided on King's Research Portal is the Author Accepted Manuscript or Post-Print version this may differ from the final Published version. If citing, it is advised that you check and use the publisher's definitive version for pagination, volume/issue, and date of publication details. And where the final published version is provided on the Research Portal, if citing you are again advised to check the publisher's website for any subsequent corrections.

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the Research Portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognize and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the Research Portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the Research Portal

Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact librarypure@kcl.ac.uk providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Psychotic Major Depression: Challenges in Clinical Practice and Research

M. Heslin¹ & AH. Young²

1. Health Services and Population Research Department, Institute of Psychiatry, Psychology and Neuroscience, King's College London, London, UK.

2. Department of Psychological Medicine, Institute of Psychiatry, Psychology and Neuroscience, King's College London, UK; & South London and Maudsley NHS Foundation Trust, UK.

Abstract

Psychotic major depression is an under researched and under identified disorder. We highlight the major challenges both in clinical practice and in conducting research with people with this disorder. We also suggest which major issues need addressing to move treatment and knowledge of this disorder forward.

Declaration of interest

MH & AY both report grants from the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR). AY is funded by the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR) Biomedical Research Centre at South London and Maudsley NHS Foundation Trust and King's College London. The views expressed are those of the authors and not necessarily those of the NHS, the NIHR, or the Department of Health.

ICD-10¹ classifies a depressive disorder with the presence of delusions, hallucinations or depressive stupor as a severe depressive episode with psychotic symptoms: also known as psychotic major depression (PMD). Hallucinations and delusions may be mood-congruent (consistent with depressive themes, e.g. guilt, death, nihilism), or mood-incongruent (not consistent with depressive themes, e.g. persecution, delusions of control, thought insertion). Both DSM-IV-TR² and DSM-5³ have a similar definition.

The point prevalence of PMD in the general population has been estimated at around 0.4% (4/1000)^{4,5} compared to around 0.46% (4.6/1000) for schizophrenia.⁶ Some research suggests that PMD may have a similar⁷ or higher⁸ incidence compared to other psychotic disorders such as schizophrenia although other research challenges this and the discrepancy is likely to be due to methodological differences.⁹

Few studies have investigated long-term outcomes in people with PMD. Those that have highlighted similar¹⁰ or increased^{11,12} risk of mortality compared to people with schizophrenia and increased mortality compared to people with bipolar disorder.¹³⁻¹⁵ Further, research has found that PMD cases have an increase in suicide attempts compared to schizophrenia and bipolar disorder¹⁶ as well as an increased risk of completed suicide compared to schizophrenia^{17,18} and bipolar disorder.^{13,14,15,18} A more recent study conducted over 10 years reported that people with PMD had better social and service use outcomes compared to people with schizophrenia, but were more likely to attempt suicide or self-harm.¹⁹

This severe clinical picture highlights the need for prompt identification and treatment of PMD. However, this is exactly where there is a lack of knowledge and highlights an urgent need for more research.

Identification problems

The National Collaborating Centre for Mental Health²⁰ stated that PMD is often not diagnosed accurately because the psychosis may be “*subtle, intermittent or concealed*”. Rothschild and Schatzberg²¹ state that PMD is often confused with NPMD and other psychotic disorders and emphasized that patients with PMD are unlike other patients with psychosis as they frequently recognise that their thinking processes are flawed, are embarrassed, and keep their unusual thoughts and feelings to themselves.

The difficulties with identification of PMD cases has been demonstrated by Rothschild and colleagues²² who examined patient notes and found that out of the 130 diagnoses made for 66 patients only 65% of diagnoses were correct. Moreover, none of the patients with an incorrect diagnosis were diagnosed with a psychotic disorder indicating it is the psychotic features rather than the depression which is being missed but also suggest it may not be that they are missing symptoms entirely but do not recognize them as delusional (guilt, poverty, persecution are common). This is clearly a problem in clinical practice as lack of identification will lead to inappropriate treatment and possibly allow symptoms to worsen.

There have been multiple ways suggested to overcome this from ask the patient about any ‘irrational worries’ as a way to illicit psychotic beliefs without labelling thoughts as such, thus making the patient more comfortable in disclosing,²³ to asking permission to speak to the patient’s family to try to elicit any unusual thoughts, unusual experiences or paranoia,²³ to using adapted assessment scales.²⁴⁻²⁶ However, the sensitivity and specificity of these have not been tested sufficiently.

Regardless of which method is used, these methods could aid not just secondary mental health services to identify patients with PMD and therefore, treat accordingly, but could also be used in primary care with any patients presenting with depression to rule out PMD.

Treatment gaps

There is a lack of evidence based treatment options for PMD. Crebbin et al.¹⁰ state that people with PMD are a largely under researched group. This lack of research on PMD is demonstrated by National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence (NICE) guidelines²⁷ in which the only paragraph on the treatment of PMD is:

“1.10.3.1 For people who have depression with psychotic symptoms, consider augmenting the current treatment plan with antipsychotic medication (although the optimum dose and duration of treatment are unknown)”.

The update in 2010²⁰ added a clinical summary that stated that there was no good quality evidence for pharmacological treatments of PMD as there are practical problems in recruiting sufficient numbers of patients with PMD and therefore, clinicians should consider lower levels of evidence, but the guidelines do not indicate what.

Parker et al.²⁸ conducted a meta-analysis of studies comparing combination antidepressant-antipsychotic therapies versus electroconvulsive therapy (ECT) versus antidepressant alone or antipsychotic alone for treating people with PMD. The authors reported a trend for ECT being more effective compared with combination drug therapy and significantly more effective compared to tricyclic drugs alone. Antidepressant-antipsychotic combinations were more effective than antipsychotic or antidepressant alone but not significantly so. A more recent study reported a 95% remission rate in people with PMD following bilateral ECT²⁹ and another reported that psychotic features in depressed patients were associated with remission (OR=7.18, p=.032) following treatment with ultrabrief right unilateral ECT.³⁰ However, neither of these studies compared ECT to antidepressant/antipsychotic medication thus limiting the conclusions about the best line of treatment.

Two decades on and the evidence base has progressed little. Farahani and Correll³¹ conducted a systematic review and meta-analysis of trials comparing antidepressant versus antipsychotic versus combination treatment for people with PMD. They concluded that antidepressant-antipsychotic co-treatment was superior to both monotherapies but could not comment on specific combinations. Leadholm et al.³² reviewed nine international treatment guidelines and found that they had contrasting opinions on the optimal treatment for PMD. Six suggested antidepressant-antipsychotic combination therapy and three recommend antidepressant monotherapy. Five recommend electroconvulsive therapy (ECT) to be equally as appropriate as medication as a first line treatment. In the latest guideline for treating depressive disorders from the British Association for Psychopharmacology,³³ an unspecified combination of antidepressant with antipsychotic is advised over antidepressant or antipsychotic alone, with a recommendation to consider ECT. The only guideline to mention the use of psychological therapies in people with PMD is the Canadian Network for Mood and Anxiety Treatments Clinical Guidelines³⁴ which states that *“psychological therapies are not indicated”* for people with PMD.

Conducting research on effective and cost-effective treatments for PMD is clearly going to be difficult while we are still struggling to identify people with PMD. However, this is also compounded by the issue of diagnostic stability.

Diagnostic issues

Estimates of prospective diagnostic stability for PMD are wide ranging from 24-100%³⁵⁻³⁶ compared to 50-100% for schizophrenia,³⁷⁻³⁸ around 40% for non-psychotic depression and around 35% for bipolar disorder.³⁹ This wide variation in prospective consistency is likely due to the large amount of heterogeneity of the studies (i.e. different diagnostic tools, widely varying follow-up lengths, differing samples and differing quality). Cases recruited from non-first episode samples are effectively sampling prevalence cases in treatment, biasing the investigation towards those who are more unwell. If only studies based on an incidence sample are included,^{10,40-43} the

prospective consistencies are 47-95% for PMD, compared with 73-96% for schizophrenia. However, these estimates were taken over 6 months to 10 years. As might be expected, the reliability of PMD as a diagnosis is directly linked the duration of follow-up with stability decreasing over time varying from 95% at 6 months to 48% at 10 years.^{10,40-43}

Diagnostic stability appears to be linked with age. A study on risk factors for conversion from PMD to bipolar disorder reported that as the age of onset increased, the chance of changing to bipolar decreased.⁴⁴ Another examined on the progression from unipolar depression to schizophrenia and reported the strongest predictor of progression to schizophrenia included younger age.⁴⁵

The diagnostic instability of PMD has implications for all research on PMD. When studying aetiology of a disorder, incidence samples are thought to be preferred because prevalence samples bias results towards those who are more unwell. However, when diagnostic instability is high, incident diagnoses are likely to change and therefore the results may no longer apply. Similarly, any study using baseline diagnoses are likely to be undermined when diagnostic change is taken into account.

This also raises the issue of what it means that PMD is diagnostically instability. It is beyond the scope of this article to review the evidence and hypotheses about the meaning of diagnostic instability in psychiatry, but is worth bearing in mind that diagnostic groupings are still a work in progress, and a major change in our categorisation of disorders could have major impacts on clinical decisions and research methodologies.

Measurement of severity

Measurement of severity of disorder is important as it allows monitoring of an individual and the progression of their disorder.⁴⁶ However, most instruments have been designed to evaluate one aspect of the disorder in PMD, psychosis or depression, but not both. In 2014, the Psychotic Depression Assessment Scale (PDAS) was created to measure the severity of PMD.²⁴ The scale was developed from relevant items from the 17-item Hamilton Depression Rating Scale and the Brief Psychiatric Rating Scale. The PDAS has shown clinical validity, responsiveness and unidimensionality in the measurement of PMD severity.²⁴ The tool has been shown to be able to detect statistically significant differences in treatment effects in studies of medication efficacy in people with PMD.²⁵ Additionally, the PDAS may be able to be used as a PMD detection tool among patients with depression.^{26, 47}

Where to go from here

There are many questions that clinicians and researchers might ask about PMD that are not covered here such as whether PMD is a subtype of psychosis or depression, or a completely separate entity that needs a distinct diagnostic category.^{21,23,48-54} However, it is clear, that there are some major challenges in advancing our knowledge about PMD. The major questions for clinical practice are: how do we better identify PMD and what are the most effective and cost-effective treatments. Current research challenges include the challenge of studying more representative samples, how to best identify people with PMD and how to improve diagnostic stability.

References

1. World Health Organization. The ICD-10 classification of mental and behavioural disorders: diagnostic criteria for research. World Health Organization; 1993 Nov 1.
2. American Psychiatric Association. Diagnostic and statistical manual, 4th edn, Text Revision (DSM-IV-TR). American Psychiatric Association, Washington. 2000.
3. American Psychiatric Association. Diagnostic and statistical manual of mental disorders (DSM-5®). American Psychiatric Pub; 2013 May 22.
4. Ohayon MM, Schatzberg AF. Prevalence of depressive episodes with psychotic features in the general population. *American Journal of Psychiatry*. 2002 Nov 1;159(11):1855-61.
5. Perälä J, Suvisaari J, Saarni SI, Kuoppasalmi K, Isometsä E, Pirkola S, Partonen T, Tuulio-Henriksson A, Hintikka J, Kieseppä T, Härkänen T. Lifetime prevalence of psychotic and bipolar I disorders in a general population. *Archives of general psychiatry*. 2007 Jan 1;64(1):19-28.
6. Saha S, Chant D, Welham J, McGrath J. A systematic review of the prevalence of schizophrenia. *PLoS medicine*. 2005 May 31;2(5):e141.
7. Baldwin P, Browne D, Scully PJ, Quinn JF, Morgan MG, Kinsella A, Owens JM, Russell V, O'callaghan E, Waddington JL. Epidemiology of first-episode psychosis: illustrating the challenges across diagnostic boundaries through the Cavan-Monaghan study at 8 years. *Schizophrenia Bulletin*. 2005 Jan 1;31(3):624-38.
8. Proctor SE, Mitford E, Paxton R. First episode psychosis: a novel methodology reveals higher than expected incidence; a reality-based population profile in Northumberland, UK. *Journal of evaluation in clinical practice*. 2004 Nov 1;10(4):539-47.
9. Kirkbride JB, Errazuriz A, Croudace TJ, Morgan C, Jackson D, Boydell J, Murray RM, Jones PB. Incidence of schizophrenia and other psychoses in England, 1950–2009: a systematic review and meta-analyses. *PloS one*. 2012 Mar 22;7(3):e31660.
10. Crebbin K, Mitford E, Paxton R, Turkington D. First-episode psychosis: an epidemiological survey comparing psychotic depression with schizophrenia. *Journal of affective disorders*. 2008 Jan 31;105(1):117-24.
11. Coryell W, Tsuang MT. Major depression with mood-congruent or mood-incongruent psychotic features: outcome after 40 years. *Am J Psychiatry*. 1985 Apr 4;142(4):479-82.
12. Opjordsmoen S. Long-term course and outcome in unipolar affective and schizoaffective psychoses. *Acta Psychiatrica Scandinavica*. 1989 Apr 1;79(4):317-26.
13. Black DW, Winokur G, Nasrallah M. Effect of psychosis on suicide risk in 1,593 patients with unipolar and bipolar affective disorders. *The American journal of psychiatry*. 1988 Jul 1;145(7):849.
14. Winokur G, Black DW, Nasrallah A. The schizoaffective continuum. *Reflections on Modern Psychiatry*. 1992:25.
15. Craig TJ, Ye Q, Bromet EJ. Mortality among first-admission patients with psychosis. *Comprehensive psychiatry*. 2006 Aug 31;47(4):246-51.

16. Radomsky ED, Haas GL, Mann JJ, Sweeney JA. Suicidal behavior in patients with schizophrenia and other psychotic disorders. *American journal of psychiatry*. 1999 Oct 1;156(10):1590-5.
17. Roose SP, Glassman AH, Walsh BT, Woodring S, Vital-Herne J. Depression, delusions, and suicide. *The American journal of psychiatry*. 1983 Sep.
18. Williams PV, McGlashan TH. Schizoaffective psychosis: I. Comparative long-term outcome. *Archives of general psychiatry*. 1987 Feb 1;44(2):130-7.
19. Heslin M, Lappin JM, Donoghue K, Lomas B, Reininghaus U, Onyejiaka A, Croudace T, Jones PB, Murray RM, Fearon P, Doody GA. Ten-year outcomes in first episode psychotic major depression patients compared with schizophrenia and bipolar patients. *Schizophrenia research*. 2016 Oct 31;176(2):417-22.
20. National Collaborating Centre for Mental Health (UK). Depression: the treatment and management of depression in adults (updated edition). British Psychological Society. 2010.
21. Rothschild AJ, Schatzberg AF. Psychotic depression--a newly recognized subtype. *Clinical Neuroscience*. 1993;1, 75-80.
22. Rothschild AJ, Winer J, Flint AJ, Mulsant BH, Whyte EM, Heo M, Fratoni S, Gabriele M, Kasapinovic S, Meyers BS. Missed diagnosis of psychotic depression at 4 academic medical centers. *The Journal of clinical psychiatry*. 2008 Aug;69(8):1293-6.
23. Rothschild AJ. Clinical manual for diagnosis and treatment of psychotic depression. American Psychiatric Pub; 2009 Feb 20.
24. Østergaard SD, Meyers BS, Flint AJ, Mulsant BH, Whyte EM, Ulbricht CM, Bech P, Rothschild AJ. Measuring psychotic depression. *Acta Psychiatrica Scandinavica*. 2014 Mar 1;129(3):211-20.
25. Østergaard SD, Meyers BS, Flint AJ, Mulsant BH, Whyte EM, Ulbricht CM, Bech P, Rothschild AJ, STOP-PD Study Group. Measuring treatment response in psychotic depression: the Psychotic Depression Assessment Scale (PDAS) takes both depressive and psychotic symptoms into account. *Journal of affective disorders*. 2014 May 31;160:68-73.
26. Park SC, Østergaard SD, Choi J, Kim JM, Jun TY, Lee MS, Kim JB, Yim HW, Park YC. Is the BPRS-5 subscale of the psychotic depression assessment scale a reliable screening tool for psychotic depression?: Results from the CRESCEND study. *Journal of affective disorders*. 2015 Mar 15;174:188-91.
27. National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence Depression: The treatment and management of depression in adults, NICE clinical guideline 90 (partial update of NICE clinical guideline 23) London, 2009).
28. Parker G, Roy K, Hadzi-Pavlovic D, Pedic F. Psychotic (delusional) depression: a meta-analysis of physical treatments. *Journal of affective disorders*. 1992 Jan 31;24(1):17-24.
29. Petrides G, Fink M, Husain MM, Knapp RG, Rush AJ, Mueller M, Rummans TA, O'connor KM, Rasmussen Jr KG, Bernstein HJ, Biggs M. ECT remission rates in psychotic versus nonpsychotic depressed patients: a report from CORE. *The journal of ECT*. 2001 Dec 1;17(4):244-53.
30. Loo CK, Mahon M, Katalinic N, Lyndon B, Hadzi-Pavlovic D. Predictors of response to ultrabrief right unilateral electroconvulsive therapy. *Journal of affective disorders*. 2011 Apr 30;130(1):192-7.

31. Farahani A and Correll CU. 2012. Are antipsychotics or antidepressants needed for psychotic depression? A systematic review and meta-analysis of trials comparing antidepressant or antipsychotic monotherapy with combination treatment. *J. Clin. Psychiatry*, 73, 486–496.
32. Leadholm AK, Rothschild AJ, Nolen WA, Bech P, Munk-Jørgensen P, Østergaard SD. The treatment of psychotic depression: Is there consensus among guidelines and psychiatrists?. *Journal of affective disorders*. 2013 Feb 20;145(2):214-20.
33. Cleare A, Pariante CM, Young AH, Anderson IM, Christmas D, Cowen PJ, Dickens C, Ferrier IN, Geddes J. Evidence-based guidelines for treating depressive disorders with antidepressants: A revision of the 2008 British Association for Psychopharmacology guidelines. *Journal of Psychopharmacology*. 2015 May;29(5):459-525.
34. Parikh, Sagar V., et al. "Canadian Network for Mood and Anxiety Treatments (CANMAT) 2016 clinical guidelines for the management of adults with major depressive disorder: section 2. psychological treatments." *The Canadian Journal of Psychiatry* 61.9 (2016): 524-539.
35. Forrester A, Owens DG, Johnstone EC. Diagnostic stability in subjects with multiple admissions for psychotic illness. *Psychological medicine*. 2001;31(01):151-8.
36. Schimmelmann BG, Conus P, Edwards J, Lambert M. Diagnostic stability 18 months after treatment initiation for first-episode psychosis. *The Journal of clinical psychiatry*. 2005 Oct 14;66(10):1-478.
37. Rice JP, Rochberg N, Endicott J, Lavori PW, Miller C. Stability of psychiatric diagnoses: an application to the affective disorders. *Archives of General Psychiatry*. 1992 Oct 1;49(10):824-30.
38. Videbech P, Gouliaev G. First admission with puerperal psychosis: 7–14 years of follow-up. *Acta Psychiatrica Scandinavica*. 1995 Mar 1;91(3):167-73.
39. Baca-Garcia E, Perez-Rodriguez MM, Basurte-Villamor I, Del Moral AL, Jimenez-Arriero MA, De Rivera JL, Saiz-Ruiz J, Oquendo MA. Diagnostic stability of psychiatric disorders in clinical practice. *The British Journal of Psychiatry*. 2007 Mar 1;190(3):210-6.
40. Amin S, Singh SP, Brewin J, Jones PB, Medley I, Harrison G. Diagnostic stability of first-episode psychosis. Comparison of ICD-10 and DSM-III-R systems. *The British Journal of Psychiatry*. 1999 Dec 1;175(6):537-43.
41. Baldwin P, Browne D, Scully PJ, Quinn JF, Morgan MG, Kinsella A, Owens JM, Russell V, O'Callaghan E, Waddington JL. Epidemiology of first-episode psychosis: illustrating the challenges across diagnostic boundaries through the Cavan-Monaghan study at 8 years. *Schizophrenia Bulletin*. 2005 Jan 1;31(3):624-38.
42. Whitty P, Clarke M, McTigue O, Browne S, Kamali M, Larkin C, O'callaghan E. Diagnostic stability four years after a first episode of psychosis. *Psychiatric Services*. 2005 Sep;56(9):1084-8.
43. Heslin M, Lomas B, Lappin JM, Donoghue K, Reininghaus U, Onyejiaka A, Croudace T, Jones PB, Murray RM, Fearon P, Dazzan P. Diagnostic change 10 years after a first episode of psychosis. *Psychological medicine*. 2015 Oct 1;45(13):2757-69.

44. Østergaard SD, Straszek S, Petrides G, Skadhede S, Jensen SO, Munk-Jørgensen P, Nielsen J. Risk factors for conversion from unipolar psychotic depression to bipolar disorder. *Bipolar disorders*. 2014 Mar 1;16(2):180-9.
45. Musliner KL, Munk-Olsen T, Mors O, Østergaard SD. Progression from unipolar depression to schizophrenia. *Acta Psychiatrica Scandinavica*. 2017 Jan 1;135(1):42-50.
46. Østergaard SD, Rothschild AJ, Flint AJ, Mulsant BH, Whyte EM, Leadholm AK, Bech P, Meyers BS. Rating scales measuring the severity of psychotic depression. *Acta Psychiatrica Scandinavica*. 2015 Nov 1;132(5):335-44.
47. Park SC, Choi J, Kim JM, Jun TY, Lee MS, Kim JB, Yim HW, Park YC. Is the Psychotic Depression Assessment Scale a useful diagnostic tool?: The CRESCEND study. *Journal of affective disorders*. 2014 Sep 30;166:79-85.
48. Charney DS, Nelson JC. Delusional and nondelusional unipolar depression: further evidence for distinct subtypes. *The American journal of psychiatry*. 1981 Mar.
49. Frances A, Brown RP, Kocsis JH, Mann JJ. Psychotic depression: a separate entity. *Am J Psychiatry*. 1981 Jun;138(6):831-3.
50. Glassman AH, Roose SP. Delusional depression: a distinct clinical entity?. *Archives of General Psychiatry*. 1981 Apr 1;38(4):424.
51. Frangos E, Athanassenas G, Tsitourides S, Psilolignos P, Katsanou N. Psychotic depressive disorder: a separate entity?. *Journal of affective disorders*. 1983 Aug 31;5(3):259-65.
52. Parker G, Hadzi-Pavlovic D, Hickie I, Mitchell P, Wilhelm K, Brodaty H, Boyce P, Eyers K, Pedic F. Psychotic depression: a review and clinical experience. *Australian and New Zealand journal of psychiatry*. 1991 Jan 1;25(2):169-80.
53. Schatzberg AF, Rothschild AJ. Psychotic (delusional) major depression: should it be included as a distinct syndrome in DSM-IV?. *The American journal of psychiatry*. 1992 Jun 1;149(6):733.
54. Østergaard SD, Bille J, Søltoft-Jensen H, Lauge N, Bech P. The validity of the severity-psychosis hypothesis in depression. *Journal of affective disorders*. 2012 Sep 30;140(1):48-56.